

Capitalism, Jacobinism and International Relations

This book offers a radical reinterpretation of the development of the modern world through the concept of Jacobinism. It argues that the French Revolution was not just another step in the construction of capitalist modernity, but produced an alternative (geo)political economy - that is, "Jacobinism." Furthermore, Jacobinism provided a blueprint for other modernization projects, thereby profoundly impacting the content and tempo of global modernity in and beyond Europe. The book traces the journey of Jacobinism in the Ottoman Empire and Turkey. It contends that until the 1950s, the Ottoman/Turkish experiment with modernity was not marked by a peripheral or statist capitalism, as conventionally presumed, but by a historically specific Jacobinism. Asserting this Jacobin legacy then leads to a novel interpretation of the subsequent transition to and authoritarian consolidation of capitalism in contemporary Turkey. As such, by tracing the world historical trajectory of Jacobinism, the book establishes a new way of understanding the origins and development of global modernity.

EREN DUZGUN is Assistant Professor at the University of Nottingham, China Campus. His research focuses on historical sociology, political economy and international relations. His work has appeared in the European Journal of International Relations, the Review of International Studies, the Journal of International Relations and Development and the European Journal of Sociology, among other scholarly outlets.



LSE INTERNATIONAL STUDIES

SERIES EDITORS

George Lawson (Lead Editor)

Department of International Relations, London School of Economics

Kirsten Ainley

Department of International Relations, London School of Economics

Ayça Çubukçu

Department of Sociology, London School of Economics

Stephen Humphreys

Department of Law, London School of Economics

This series, published in association with the Centre for International Studies at the London School of Economics, is centred on three main themes. First, the series is oriented around work that is transdisciplinary, which challenges disciplinary conventions and develops arguments that cannot be grasped within existing disciplines. It will include work combining a wide range of fields, including international relations, international law, political theory, history, sociology and ethics. Second, it comprises books that contain an overtly international or transnational dimension, but not necessarily focused simply within the discipline of International Relations. Finally, the series will publish books that use scholarly inquiry as a means of addressing pressing political concerns. Books in the series may be predominantly theoretical, or predominantly empirical, but all will say something of significance about political issues that exceed national boundaries.

Previous books in the series:

Before the West: The Rise and Fall of Eastern World Orders Ayşe Zarakol How the East Was Won: Barbarian Conquerors, Universal Conquest and the Making of Modern Asia Andrew Phillips

The World Imagined: Collective Beliefs and Political Order in the Sinocentric, Islamic and Southeast Asian International Societies Hendrik Spruyt

Socioeconomic Justice: International Intervention and Transition in Post-war Bosnia and Herzegovina Daniela Lai

Culture and Order in World Politics Andrew Phillips and Christian Reus-Smit (eds.)

On Cultural Diversity: International Theory in a World of Difference Christian Reus-Smit



Capitalism, Jacobinism and International Relations

Revisiting Turkish Modernity

EREN DUZGUN
University of Nottingham





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009158343

DOI: 10.1017/9781009158367

© Eren Duzgun 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Duzgun, Eren, 1981- author.

Title: Capitalism, Jacobinism and international relations: revisiting Turkish modernity / Eren

Duzgun, University of Nottingham.

Other titles: Property, state and geopolitics

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021. Series: LSE International Studies | Revised version of the author's thesis (doctoral)-York University, 2016, titled Property, state and geopolitics: re-interpreting the Turkish road to modernity. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021051137 (print) | LCCN 2021051138 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781009158343 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009158350 (paperback) |

ISBN 9781009158367 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Capitalism-Turkey-History. | Kemalism. | Radicalism-Turkey-History. | Civilization, Modern-19th century. | Civilization, Modern-20th century. | Historical sociology. | Turkey-Politics and government-19th century. | Turkey-Politics and government-20th century. |

Turkey-Foreign relations. | France-History-Revolution, 1789-1799-Influence. | BISAC:

POLITICAL SCIENCE / International Relations / General

Classification: LCC DR475 .D89 2021 (print) | LCC DR475 (ebook) |

DDC 327.561-dc23/eng/20220215

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021051137

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021051138

ISBN 978-1-009-15834-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Destine Celal, my mother.





Contents

Acknowledgments		page 1x
1	Introduction The Plan of the Book	1 13
2	Modernity, Historicity and Transdisciplinarity Historicizing Modernity: Beyond Fragmented Methodologies From Marx to Marxism: Unifying the "Political" and	16 17
	the "Economic" International Historical Sociology: Unifying the "Social" and	26
	the "International"	35
	Uneven and Combined Development: Modernity, Temporality, Multilinearity	41
	Renewing International Historical Sociology Conclusion	48 52
3	Capitalism, Absolutism, Jacobinism: The International Relations of Modernity	54
	The "Great Divergence" in Post-Feudal Europe: England	
	versus France The (Geo)politics of Capitalist Modernity: "The Improvement	57
	of Property" The (Geo)politics of Absolutist Modernity: "The Improvement	64
	of the Public"	70
	The French Revolution and the Rise of the Jacobins Property and the Terror: Beyond Capitalism and Socialism Substituting Capitalism: The "Citizen-Soldier" and "Public School" as Keys to Understanding Alternate	76 82
	Routes to Modernity Conclusions: Rethinking the Jacobin Model and the "International"	88 94
4	Disputing Ottoman Modernity (1839–1918)	99
	The (Geo)politics of Ottoman Centralization Attempts	102

vii



V111		Contents
	French Revolution and the Ottoman Empire: Between the Ayans and the Peasantry	106
	The Tanzimat as a Combined Project: Between Jacobinism and Capitalism (1838–1876)	110
	Sharecroppers, Peasants and Landlords: Toward a Market-Dependent Society?	118
	From the Constitution to the Revolution: The Rise of Jacobinism (1876–1908) From Abdülhamid II to the Young Turks: Inventing	126
	a Jacobin Islam and a Jacobin Public The Geo(politics) of Revolution: Reimagining the "People"	134 139
	The Young Turk Revolution, War and the Jacobin "Terror" (1908–1918) Conclusion: A Substitute Jacobin Route to Modernity	143 155
5	Kemalism as the Ultimate Turkish Substitution	133
	for Capitalism (1923–1945)	160
	The Prelude to the Republic: The (Geo)politics of Sharecropping Industrialization, Monopolization, Peasantization (1923–1945):	g 162
	Kemalism as State Capitalism? The Army, the School and the "Terror": Redefining Property	167
	and the Citizen-Turk	179
	Conclusion: Kemalism as a Turkish-Jacobin Synthesis	187
6	Reinterpreting Capitalist Modernity à la Turca Land and Democracy: World War II and the Prelude to	190
	Multiparty Politics New World Order, Petty Commodity Production and the	192
	Transition to Capitalism A Failed Jacobin Coup and Its Legacy: The 1961 Constitution	196
	and "Social Republic" Planners, Oligopolists and Workers: Contradictions	203
	of a Capitalist–Jacobin Compound Capitalism of the Oppressed: Reinterpreting the National	210
	View Movement Turkey's (Not-So) Great Transformation, 1980–2002:	222
	Secularism against Capitalism Consolidation of Capitalist Modernity: From Neo-Ottoman	231
	Commonwealth to Capitalist Authoritarianism	244
7	Conclusion	258
Bibliography		269
Ind	dex	304



Acknowledgments

This book is the revised version of a doctoral thesis I embarked on about ten years ago at York University, Toronto. The Political Science Department at York was an intellectual heaven driven by curiosity, skepticism and progressive politics, which I most gratefully acknowledge. In a cutthroat PhD market that prioritizes research with immediate "relevance" and "impact," York provided me with the financial and intellectual resources to ask "big" questions, explore "large processes" and make "huge comparisons" in a way perhaps only a few places would dare to encourage their students today.

At York, I am most indebted to my supervisor Hannes Lacher. Hannes was the sharpest critic as well as the most generous supporter of this project. Indeed, the very idea of this book crystallized in his graduate seminars, and I have tried to build on and reformulate some of the theoretical questions Hannes raised in his own doctoral project. Ellen Meiksins Wood, whom I was very lucky to have on my dissertation committee for a while, was a continuous source of inspiration until the final penning of this book. Ellen fell ill and passed away before the completion of my thesis, but anyone who reads this book will understand the extent of my debt to Ellen from the frequency of references to her work, and from my critical endorsement of her particular interpretation of historical materialism. Upon Ellen's illness, I was fortunate that George Comninel accepted her place. George offered numerous invaluable insights, while saving me from making a couple of embarrassing errors about early modern European history. Kamran Matin, my external examiner, provided extensive comments that not only forced me to formulate my arguments much more clearly, but also guided the future development of my work, especially in connection to the field of International Relations. During my viva, Feyzi Baban and Greg Albo also made several important suggestions for improvement, which I have integrated into the revising of the book. More recently, Benno Teschke, Stephen Miller, Ruben Gonzales-

ix



Acknowledgments

X

Vicente, Alp Yücel Kaya, Spencer Dimmock and Görkem Akgöz were all very kind to agree to read various draft chapters of the book; I benefited immensely from their comments and critiques. I am also indebted to George Lawson, the lead editor of this book series, for encouraging and supporting this project, as well as the two anonymous reviewers who provided helpful advice on the content and presentation of the argument. Thanks also go to John Haslam, Hannah Weber, Toby Ginsburg, Jane Bowbrick and Abigail Neale at Cambridge University Press and Vinithan Sedumadhavan at Straive for skillfully guiding me through the publication process.

Over the longue durée, I have received help, feedback and encouragement from many people at different stages of my academic life. Adam David Morton, Alexander Anievas, Andreas Bieler, Baran Gürsel, Can Cemgil, Ceren Ergenç, Charles Post, Claire Vergeiro, Ece Kocabıçak, Faruk Yalvaç, Galip Yalman, Gjovalin Macaj, Jeroen Duindam, Joseph Bryant, Jonathan London, Meliha Altunışık, Mustafa Türkeş, Necati Polat, Pınar Bedirhanoğlu, Ray Bush, Sabine Dreher, Sam Knafo, Sam Putinja, Sümerjan Bozkurt, Şebnem Oğuz and Zülküf Aydın deserve much thanks. On a more personal level, I am very lucky to have met some wonderful friends along the way. Special thanks are due to Aziz Güzel, Barbara Calvo, Ezgi Doğru, Erdem Akbaş, Frantz Gheller, Jessica Evans, Julian Germann, Licianny Matos, Lilian Yap, Lucy Angus, Nicole Swerhun, Rengin Ataç, Serdar Sözübek, Thomas Chiasson-Lebel, Vedat Altun and Zeynep Kaşlı. Fulya, my partner, witnessed the final stages of the completion of this book; I thank her for the love and joy she has brought into my life. Finally, to my family: Destine, Baran, Elif, Deniz and Woolly. Thank you so much for years of support, generosity and constantly reminding me what matters most. I love you so much.