

Music, Subjectivity, and Schumann

The concept of subjectivity is one of the most popular in recent scholarly accounts of music; it is also one of the obscurest and most ill-defined. Multifaceted and hard to pin down, subjectivity nevertheless serves an important, if not indispensable purpose, underpinning various assertions made about music and its effect on us. We may not be exactly sure what subjectivity is, but much of the reception of Western music over the last two centuries is premised upon it. *Music, Subjectivity, and Schumann* offers a critical examination of the notion of musical subjectivity and the first extended account of its applicability to one of the composers with whom it is most closely associated. Adopting a fluid and multivalent approach to a topic situated at the intersection of musicology, philosophy, literature, and cultural history, it seeks to provide a critical refinement of this idea and to elucidate both its importance and limits.

BENEDICT TAYLOR is Reader in Music at the University of Edinburgh and editor of *Music & Letters*. His publications include *The Melody of Time: Music and Temporality in the Romantic Era* (2015) and, as editor, *Rethinking Mendelssohn* (2020) and *The Cambridge Companion to Music and Romanticism* (2021).

Cambridge University Press
978-1-009-15808-4 — Music, Subjectivity, and Schumann
Benedict Taylor
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Music, Subjectivity, and Schumann

BENEDICT TAYLOR
University of Edinburgh



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009158084
DOI: 10.1017/9781009158091

© Benedict Taylor 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Taylor, Benedict, 1981– author.

Title: Music, subjectivity, and Schumann / Benedict Taylor.

Description: [1.] | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021055094 (print) | LCCN 2021055095 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009158084 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009158091 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Schumann, Robert, 1810–1856. Criticism and interpretation. | Music – 19th century – Philosophy and aesthetics. | Music – 19th century – Analysis, appreciation. | Subjectivity. | Self (Philosophy)

Classification: LCC ML410.S4 T139 2022 (print) | LCC ML410.S4 (ebook) | DDC 780.92–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021055094>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021055095>

ISBN 978-1-009-15808-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of Examples [page vii]

Acknowledgements [x]

List of Abbreviations [xii]

PREAMBLE [1]

Schumann, Subjectivity [3]

PROSOPOPOEIC PRELIMINARIES [17]

1 Defining Subjectivity [19]

PART I HEARING SUBJECTS [55]

2 Hearing the Self [57]

3 Hearing Selves [86]

PART II HEARING PRESENCE [121]

4 Presence of the Self [123]

5 Presence of the Other [155]

PART III HEARING ABSENCE [189]

6 Absence of the Other [191]

7 Absence of the Self [230]

PART IV HEARING OTHERS [267]

8 Hearing Another's Voice [269]

9 Hearing Oneself as Another [302]

EPILOGUE [333]

10 Hearing Ourselves [335]

Bibliography [348]

Index [364]

Examples

- 2.1 Schumann: ‘Sphinxes’, *Carnaval*, Op. 9 No. 9 [page 63]
- 2.2a Schumann: ‘Préambule’, *Carnaval*, Op. 9 No. 1, bb. 92–8 [65]
- 2.2b Schumann: ‘Marche des “Davidsbündler” contre les Philistins’, *Carnaval*, Op. 9 No. 22, bb. 107–12 [66]
- 2.3 Schumann: *Davidsbündlertänze*, Op. 6 No. 14, opening [73]
- 2.4 Schumann: *Fantasie* in C, Op. 17, i, end of exposition, bb. 77–83 [74]
- 2.5 Schumann: Piano Concerto in A minor, Op. 54, ii, link into finale, bb. 103–8 [80]
- 2.6 Schumann: Violin Concerto in D minor (1853), i, development section, bb. 183–203 [81]
- 3.1 Schumann: ‘Eusebius’, *Carnaval*, Op. 9 No. 5 [87]
- 3.2 Schumann: end of ‘Florestan’ leading into ‘Coquette’, *Carnaval*, Op. 9 Nos. 6 & 7 [89]
- 3.3a Schumann: *Kreisleriana*, Op. 16 No. 1 (1838 version), opening [99]
- 3.3b Schumann: *Kreisleriana*, Op. 16 No. 1, opening, bass shifted half a bar forward [99]
- 3.4 Schumann: *Kreisleriana*, Op. 16 No. 8, opening [101]
- 3.5 Schumann: *Kreisleriana*, Op. 16 No. 3, opening [103]
- 3.6 Schumann: ‘Im wunderschönen Monat Mai’ (Heine), *Dichterliebe*, Op. 48 No. 1 [113]
- 4.1 Schumann: Symphony No. 1 (‘Spring’), Op. 38, ii, bb. 40–6 [124]
- 4.2 Schumann: *Symphonic Etudes*, Op. 13, *Anhang*: Variation V [128]
- 4.3 Schumann: ‘Sehnsucht nach der Waldgegend’ (Kerner), *Zwölf Gedichte von Justinus Kerner*, Op. 35 No. 5 [132]
- 4.4 Schumann: ‘Aus den hebräischen Gesängen’ (Byron), *Myrthen*, Op. 25 No. 15 [135]
- 4.5 Schumann: ‘Stille Liebe’ (Kerner), *Zwölf Gedichte von Justinus Kerner*, Op. 35 No. 8 [139]
- 4.6 Schumann: *Fantasie* in C, Op. 17, i, end [148]
- 4.7a Schumann: Symphony No. 2, Op. 61, finale, new lyrical theme following development section impasse [152]
- 4.7b Schumann: Symphony No. 2, Op. 61, finale, *An die ferne Geliebte* theme at start of coda [152]

- 5.1 Schumann: Piano Quartet in E flat, Op. 47, iii, opening [156]
 5.2 Schumann: 'Der Himmel hat eine Träne geweint' (Rückert),
Liebesfrühling, Op. 37 No. 1 [168]
 5.3 Schumann: 'Schön ist das Fest des Lebens' (Rückert), *Liebesfrühling*, Op.
 37 No. 7, opening [171]
 5.4 Schumann: 'So wahr die Sonne scheint' (Rückert), *Liebesfrühling*, Op.
 37 No. 12, first verse [172]
 5.5 Schumann: 'Seit ich ihn gesehen' (Chamisso), *Frauenliebe und Leben*,
 Op. 42 No. 1, first verse [175]
 5.6 Schumann: 'Lied der Suleika' (von Willemer/Goethe), *Myrthen*, Op. 25
 No. 9, third verse [181]
 5.7 Schumann: 'Intermezzo' (Eichendorff), *Liederkreis*, Op. 39 No. 2 [184]
 6.1a Schumann: Piano Trio No. 2 in F major, Op. 80, i, start of development,
 bb. 106–18 [192]
 6.1b Schumann: Piano Trio No. 2, Op. 80, i, start of coda, bb. 379–86 [193]
 6.2 Schumann: *Novellette*, Op. 21 No. 8, Trio II with the *Stimme aus der*
Ferne, bb. 157–229 [199]
 6.3a Schumann: 'Ihre Stimme' (von Platen), *Lieder und Gesänge* vol. IV, Op.
 96 No. 3, opening [202]
 6.3b Schumann: 'Ihre Stimme', Op. 96 No. 3, bb. 16–21 [203]
 6.4 Schumann: 'Abegg' Variations, Op. 1, finale, bb. 195–7 [207]
 6.5 Schumann: *Papillons*, Op. 2, finale, closing bars, bb. 195–8 [208]
 6.6 Schumann: *Etudes after Paganini's Caprices*, Op. 3, preface [208]
 6.7 Schumann: 'Des Sennen Abschied' (Schiller), *Lieder-Album für die*
Jugend, Op. 79 No. 23, bb. 36–43 [211]
 6.8a Schumann: 'Die Sennin' (Lenau), *Sechs Gedichte von N. Lenau und*
Requiem, Op. 90 No. 4, first verse [212]
 6.8b Schumann: 'Die Sennin', Op. 90 No. 4, close, bb. 32–45 [214]
 6.9 Schumann: 'Auf das Trinkglas eines verstorbenen Freundes' (Kerner),
Zwölf Gedichte von Justinus Kerner, Op. 35 No. 6 [218]
 6.10 Schumann: *Manfred*, Op. 115 No. 10, 'Beschwörung der Astarte' [224]
 7.1 Schumann: 'Die Fensterscheibe' (Lenau), *6 Gesänge*,
 Op. 107 No. 2 [231]
 7.2 Schumann: 'Ballade vom Haideknaben' (Hebbel), *Ballads for*
Declamation, Op. 122 No. 1, opening [237]
 7.3a Schumann: *Humoreske*, Op. 20, *Innere Stimme*, bb. 251–74 [240]
 7.3b Schumann: *Humoreske*, Op. 20, bb. 447–89 [242]
 7.4 Schumann: 'In der Fremde' (II) (Eichendorff), *Liederkreis*, Op. 39 No. 8,
 verses 1 & 2 [254]
 7.5 Schumann: 'Im Walde' (Eichendorff), *Liederkreis*, Op. 39 No. 11 [257]

- 7.6 Schumann: 'In der Fremde' (I) (Eichendorff), *Liederkreis*, Op. 39 No. 1 [260]
- 8.1 Schumann: Cello Concerto in A minor, Op. 129, i, link into slow movement, bb. 280–5 [270]
- 8.2 Schumann: *Szenen aus Goethes Faust*, Part I, No. 2, 'Gretchen vor dem Bild der Mater dolorosa', bb. 38–44 [270]
- 8.3 Schumann: Piano Sonata in G minor, Op. 22, finale (1838 version), secondary theme, bb. 27–63 [271]
- 8.4 Schumann: *Märchenerzählungen*, Op. 132 No. 1, *Lebhaft, nicht zu schnell*, opening [282]
- 8.5 Schumann: *Märchenerzählungen*, Op. 132 No. 3, *Ruhiges Tempo, mit zartem Ausdruck*, opening [285]
- 8.6 Schumann: *Gesänge der Frühe*, Op. 133 No. 1, *Im Ruhigen Tempo* [294]
- 8.7 Schumann: 'Abendlied' (Kinkel), *6 Gesänge*, Op. 107 No. 6, bb. 1–20 [297]
- 8.8 Schumann: 'Nachtlied' (Goethe), *Lieder und Gesänge* vol. IV, Op. 96 No. 1 [299]
- 9.1 Schumann: Violin Concerto in D minor (1853), ii, opening [303]
- 9.2a Schumann: 'Vogel als Prophet', *Waldszenen*, Op. 82 No. 7, opening [307]
- 9.2b Schumann: 'Vogel als Prophet', central chorale, bb. 18–25 [307]
- 9.3 Schumann: 'Alte Laute' (Kerner), *Zwölf Gedichte von Justinus Kerner*, Op. 35 No. 12, opening verse [310]
- 9.4 Schumann: 'Ballade vom Haideknaben' (Hebbel), *Ballads for Declamation*, Op. 122 No. 1, bb. 59–66 [314]
- 9.5a Schumann: 'Der Spielmann' (H. C. Andersen), *5 Lieder*, Op. 40 No. 4, opening [320]
- 9.5b Schumann: 'Der Spielmann', Op. 40 No. 4, verse 3 [322]
- 9.6 Schumann: *Thema mit Variationen*, WoO 24 (1854), theme [328]

Acknowledgements

This book has slumbered for longer than I probably intended before reaching the light of day. The first ideas go back to a train journey home from Edinburgh in July 2013, a time during which I was just finishing my second book, *The Melody of Time*. Slowly, what might have been a superfluous chapter treating the seemingly opaque idea of subjectivity in relation to time grew into a book in its own right. That such reckless expansion might occur was an eventuality foreseen by me at the time, but I foolishly dismissed it as unlikely to happen; of course, it did in the end, as I knew deep down it always would. I'm still not entirely sure whether this was a good idea, but at least I don't have to go through all the work of writing it again. I recall from these early stages a stimulating discussion with Michael Phillips that convinced me that the subject was worth tackling, though the precise details of what we came up with faded from my memory before I had time to make note of them; then again, the philosophical ambition of those ideas was such that it was probably easier this way. Conversations with Julian Johnson over several breakfasts in Cambridge, Massachusetts in early 2015 also proved inspiring and helped me crystallise the design of the resulting book.

The chapters were finally written between 2016 and 2019, a time in which many things in the world seem to have taken a decided turn for the worse, and several who were with us then are now no more. Still, there are fond memories of people who have contributed to the formation of this book. Daniel Chua offered generous hospitality and stimulating discussion in Hong Kong in August 2016; Dean Sutcliffe similarly provided valuable observations on the historical application of the idea of subjectivity, and Scott Burnham was ever supportive and helpful. A wine-fuelled evening in Edinburgh with Ceri Owen led to an unplanned co-edited special issue of *19th-Century Music*, for which I was opportunely forced to bring together several of my ideas relating to Eichendorff, Schumann, and the problem of subjectivity. The resulting article was intended to form part of the larger book I was then planning to write, though in the end the overlap was slighter than originally assumed, probably to the benefit of both pieces. I am especially grateful for the Institute for Advanced Study Berlin for

giving me a much needed respite from six years of emails, administration, and teaching through a fellowship at the *Wissenschaftskolleg* in the leafy haven of Grunewald in 2019–20, which finally allowed me to complete the book. I would like to extend my particular gratitude to Achille Varzi, who generously read the whole manuscript and offered much helpful advice on the philosophical side of things, as well as Karol Berger and Michael Steinberg.

Parts of this work were presented at the International Musicological Society Conference in Tokyo, March 2017, and at colloquia and lectures in Queen's University Belfast, King's College London, Heidelberg, Berlin, and Leipzig, and I would like to thank all those who offered comments and suggestions on these occasions. Finally, Kate Brett has been a constantly supportive and encouraging editor at Cambridge University Press, and without her desire to see this book to print it might have been kept hidden from sight for at least another decade, if not forever.

Abbreviations

- Briefwechsel* Clara and Robert Schumann, *Briefwechsel: Kritische Gesamtausgabe*, ed. Eva Weissweiler, 3 vols. (Basel and Frankfurt: Stroemfeld/Roter Stern, 1984–2001).
- GS Robert Schumann, *Gesammelte Schriften über Musik und Musiker*, ed. Martin Kreisig, 2 vols. (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1949).
- Neue Folge* Robert Schumann, *Briefe: Neue Folge*, ed. Gustav Jansen, 2nd ed. (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1904).
- SB Clara and Robert Schumann, *Schumann Briefedition*, ed. Michael Heinemann, Thomas Synofzik, et al., 50 vols. (Cologne: Dohr, 2008–[25]).
- Tagebücher* Robert Schumann, *Tagebücher*, ed. Georg Eismann and Gerd Nauhaus, 3 vols. (Leipzig: Deutsche Verlag für Musik, 1971–82).

All citations from letters have been given from *SB* where available. In the case of the correspondence between Clara and Robert Schumann, these have been supplemented by the relevant *Briefwechsel* page numbers. Letters not yet released in the ongoing *SB* edition are cited from the earlier *Neue Folge* or other specific source used.