

CLEAN AIR AT WHAT COST?

China's green transition is often perceived as a lesson in authoritarian efficiency. In just a few years, the state managed to improve air quality, contain dissent, and restructure local industry. Much of this was achieved through top-down, "blunt force" solutions, such as forcibly shuttering or destroying polluting factories. This book argues that China's blunt force regulation is actually a sign of weak state capacity and ineffective bureaucratic control. Integrating case studies with quantitative evidence, it shows how widespread industry shutdowns are used, not to scare polluters into respecting pollution standards, but to scare bureaucrats into respecting central orders. These measures have improved air quality in almost all Chinese cities, but at immense social and economic cost. This book delves into the negotiations, trade-offs, and day-to-day battles of local pollution enforcement to explain why governments employ such costly measures, and what this reveals about a state's powers to govern society.

DENISE SIENLI VAN DER KAMP is Associate Professor in the Political Economy of China at Oxford University. Originally from Hong Kong, she received her PhD from UC Berkeley, and has lived and worked in China, Tajikistan, Canada, the United States, and the UK.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Founded in 1997, Cambridge Studies in Law and Society is a hub for leading scholarship in socio-legal studies. Located at the intersection of law, the humanities, and the social sciences, it publishes empirically innovative and theoretically sophisticated work on law's manifestations in everyday life: from discourses to practices, and from institutions to cultures. The series editors have longstanding expertise in the interdisciplinary study of law, and welcome contributions that place legal phenomena in national, comparative, or international perspective. Series authors come from a range of disciplines, including anthropology, history, law, literature, political science, and sociology.

Series Editors

Mark Fathi Massoud, *University of California, Santa Cruz*

Jens Meierhenrich, *London School of Economics and Political Science*

Rachel E. Stern, *University of California, Berkeley*

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.

CAMBRIDGE
STUDIES IN
LAW AND SOCIETY

CLEAN AIR AT WHAT COST?
The Rise of Blunt Force Regulation
in China

Denise Sienli van der Kamp
University of Oxford



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-15266-2 — Clean Air at What Cost?
Denise Sienli van der Kamp
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009152662

DOI: 10.1017/9781009152655

© Denise Sienli van der Kamp 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Van der Kamp, Denise Sienli, 1985- author.

Title: Clean air at what cost? : the rise of blunt force regulation in China / Denise Sienli van der Kamp.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2022. |

Series: Cambridge studies in law and society | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022044496 (print) | LCCN 2022044497 (ebook) | ISBN 9781009152648 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009152662 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009152655 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Air–Pollution–Government policy–China. | Air–Pollution–Law and legislation–China. | Environmental policy–Economic aspects–China.

Classification: LCC HC430.A4 V36 2022 (print) | LCC HC430.A4 (ebook) | DDC 363.739/20951–dc23/eng/20220923

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022044496>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022044497>

ISBN 978-1-009-15264-8 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-15266-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-15266-2 — Clean Air at What Cost?
Denise Sienli van der Kamp
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Deirdre van Dijk-van der Kamp and Mak Shui Ping

CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures</i>	page viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiv
1 Introduction: Clean Air at What Cost?	1
2 Blunt Force Regulation	28
3 Why Blunt Force Regulation?	49
4 Blunt Force Regulation and Bureaucratic Control	64
5 The Impact of Blunt Force Regulation	86
6 What Are the Alternatives?	106
7 Managing the Risks	131
8 Comparative Implications	160
9 Conclusion	183
<i>Appendix</i>	195
<i>Bibliography</i>	202
<i>Index</i>	225

FIGURES

1.1 Growth in institutional resources for conventional regulation, 2005–16	<i>page</i> 9
1.2 Growth in expenditure for conventional regulation – inspections, 2007–16	10
2.1 Efficiency and effectiveness of blunt force regulation vs. other regulatory approaches	35
4.1 The logic of blunt force regulation	75
4.2 Variation in forced industrial reductions ordered by MIIT, by city, 2010–15	78
5.1 Industrial pollution levels (SO ₂) in urban China – national aggregate, 2009–15	93
5.2 Year-on-year percent change in pollution levels (SO ₂) in urban China – national aggregate, 2009–15	93
5.3 Distribution of percent change in SO ₂ levels for all Chinese cities, 2010–15	94
5.4 Distribution of blunt force regulation (millions of tons reduced) for all cities, 2010–15	96
5.5 Effect of inspections and fines on SO ₂ levels (with standardized variables)	101
5.6 Effect of pollution compliance score on SO ₂ levels (with standardized variables)	102
7.1 Proportion of large firms targeted in blunt force regulation nationwide, 2010–15	144
7.2 Proportion of blunt force regulation undertaken by large firms at the city level	145
7.3 Statistics on disproportionate targeting of non-SOEs in blunt force regulation	146
7.4 Proportion of blunt force regulation carried out by SOEs in Lüliang and Yulin, 2010–15	147
8.1 Four cases of blunt force regulation, classified by national governments' resource capabilities and despotic power	165

TABLES

4.1	Descriptive statistics of forced reductions in industrial output	78
4.2	Effect of per capita revenue on bureaucratic environmental compliance	80
4.3	Effect of bureaucratic noncompliance on blunt force regulation	82
5.1	Effect of enforcement measures on air pollution levels	99
7.1	Statistics on SOE output and blunt force regulation in Lüliang and Yulin	148
A4.1	Definition of variables for Chapter 4	195
A5.1	Effect of enforcement measures on air pollution levels (with standardized variables)	198
A5.2	Definition of variables for Chapter 5	200

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book began on the slopes of Mount Diablo in California where, gasping for breath during a much-needed water break, I began to see a thread that could pull together almost a decade of observations. That moment, and this book, would not have been possible without the mentorship of Kevin O'Brien, whose thoughtful scholarship has shaped my approach to Chinese politics, even before I began my doctoral studies at Berkeley. I am grateful for his wisdom, not least in getting PhD students to hike up the hills of Walnut Creek as they work through their tangled thoughts.

This book has also benefited from the intellectual rigor and incomparable guidance of my dissertation committee – Ruth Collier, Peter Lorentzen, Alison Post, Rachel Stern, and Steven Vogel, each of whom challenged me to be a better scholar in their own distinctive ways. I am grateful for the mentorship I have received from them over the years.

I was lucky enough to spend a year as postdoctoral fellow at the University of Pennsylvania's Center for the Study of Contemporary China, which gave me the time to transform my dissertation into a book. I thank Avery Goldstein and Jacques deLisle, the Directors of the Center, for their support and feedback as this project evolved over the years. Wendy Leutert kept me laughing – and drove me to go further – with her incomparable wit, determination, and generosity. Thank you also to Yuanyuan Zeng for her kind assistance and Neysun Mahboubi for drawing me into a wonderful network of scholars on Chinese law and regulation. My book conference – made possible through the Center's generous support – marked a turning point in the writing process. Thank you to the discussants – Matthew Amengual, Cary Coglianese, Roselyn Hsueh, and Andrew Mertha – for drawing out the comparative insights and reminding me of the violence of regulation. Their comments have transformed this project.

I owe a debt to many individuals in China for sharing their expertise and setting me on the right path. I am grateful to Jennifer Holdaway for introducing me to the network at FORHEAD and opening doors for

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

research on Hebei's air pollution. I was also fortunate to work alongside Wang Wuyi and Yang Linsheng at the Institute of Geography and benefited greatly from their guidance. Thanks also to Yang Lichao at Beijing Normal University for sharing her insightful work on the plight of laid-off workers, and the team at FORHEAD for their support and feedback throughout my time in Beijing. Conversations with Cao Mingde at China University of Political Science and Law deepened my understanding of China's environmental law, while Phil Boxell has been a friend and mentor throughout my time in the field. The team at the Centre for Legal Aid to Pollution Victims unlocked some key insights into the role of environmental lawyers, and colleagues at environmental NGOs continue to inspire me with their frontline efforts to combat pollution. Finally, I thank Fan Laoshi and the old team at Forestry for giving me a firsthand experience of campaign-style mobilization, and Samantha Woods and Fan Xianying (Maggie) for their decades-long support in my research and other endeavors.

Unnamed in the list are the many individuals who agreed to be interviewed for this project, whom I reference only by code. I am immensely grateful to them for taking time out of their busy schedules to speak frankly to this outsider about insider matters. These factory owners, entrepreneurs, officials, street-level bureaucrats, journalists, academics, activists, and experts all play an integral part in China's journey to greener growth. I can safely say that this book would not exist if they had not shared their experiences with me. I have done my best to tell their stories fairly – and I hope my musings on this topic may one day be of use to them too.

The fieldwork for this book was made possible by generous funding from the National Science Foundation (SES-1560166), UC Berkeley's Institute for International Studies and Center for Chinese Studies, and the China Times Cultural Foundation. Grants from the Research Grants Council of Hong Kong (project 9048143) and City University (project 7200634) also provided crucial support during the writing of this book. Guo Yihua, Kang Xiaoyan, Lu Ye, and Xu Chengwu offered excellent research assistance through the Undergraduate Research Apprenticeship Program at Berkeley. I also thank my wonderful, hard-working research assistants at City University of Hong Kong: He Miao, Xu Jinghong, Catherine Kwok Mei Ting, Li Qinshi, and Vito Wong Hoi Yi. Portions of Chapters 3, 4, and 6 of this book originally appeared as articles in *Governance* and *Comparative Politics*. I thank the editors for allowing me to include excerpts from those articles here. Kelley Friel

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

provided excellent copy editing under a tight deadline, while Joe Ng and Gemma Smith at Cambridge ensured that the publication process went smoothly. Three anonymous readers offered exceptionally valuable comments and critiques. Of course, all errors contained in this book are strictly my own.

Over the years, my research has flourished under the advice and support of senior colleagues: Genia Kostka, whose groundbreaking work on China's environment continues to inspire me; Andrew Mertha, who always steers me to the bigger story behind the data; Roselyn Hsueh and John Yasuda (of the so-called Berkeley school of regulation), who break new ground and offer such pithy insights as I shape my own thoughts on these issues. I also thank Rachel Stern for inspiring this line of work and being a staunch ally throughout the project, and Ruth Collier, who keeps me on my toes with her unerring ability to identify the heart issue – even on topics where I am supposedly the expert. A special thanks to Peter Beattie, Iza Ding, Jessica Teets, Rory Truex, Benjamin van Rooij, and Boliang Zhu for their written feedback on earlier drafts. I am also grateful to Yue Hou, Junyan Jiang, Thomas Johnson, Pierre Landry, Ning Leng, Yifei Li, Lizhi Liu, Carlos Lo Wing-Hung, Dan Lynch, Dan Mattingly, Sara Newland, Samantha Vortherms, Alex Wang, Xuehua Zhang, Guobin Yang, Yu Zeng, and my colleagues at AIS at CityU for their comments and feedback on this project over the years (and apologies to anyone I have left off the list).

A special mention goes out to Iza Ding, Coraline Goron, and Deborah Seligsohn, my fellow travelers in this past decade of research on China's environmental governance. Thanks also to Ji Yeon (Jean) Hong and Franziska Keller for folding me into a vibrant network of China scholars in Hong Kong and providing crucial support during the upheaval of 2019 and beyond. I also owe a great debt to Rhea Myerscough, the sharpest writing partner I have come across, for her uncanny ability to divine what I am trying to argue and then show me how to get there.

Finally, I thank my family and friends for their unerring, unconditional support throughout this process. A special thanks to Elsa Massoc, Rhea Myerscough, and Christian Dyogi Phillips for all that OLC wisdom. Also to Donghyun Danny Choi, Mathias Poertner, and Molly McKay for being on call to share stories and provide advice whenever, and wherever. To Komaresan, for bringing me back to what matters in life. To my parents Jake and Mei Chi, for giving me their

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

passion for politics and the courage to embrace big change. To my siblings Jess, Luke, John, Thea, to little Jude, Naomi, and all my Hong Kong family, thank you for keeping me going with coffee, ice cream, beach time, and moments of magic during the long days of writing. And finally, to my grandmothers, Oma and 婆婆, for teaching me patience and giving me a sense of history. This book is dedicated to them.

ABBREVIATIONS

APEC	Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation
BFR	blunt force regulation
CCDI	Central Commission for Discipline Inspection
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
DENR	Department of Environmental and Natural Resources (Philippines)
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency (USA)
EPB	Environmental Protection Bureau (China)
FDI	foreign direct investment
GDP	gross domestic product
KME	key monitored enterprises
MEE	Ministry of Environment and Ecology
MEP	Ministry of Environmental Protection (old name for MEE until 2018)
MIIT	Ministry of Industry and Information Technology
NBS	National Bureau of Statistics
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NRDC	National Reform and Development Commission
PITI	Pollution Information Transparency Index
RMB	renminbi (Chinese Currency)
SME	small and medium firms
SO ₂	sulfur dioxide
SOE	state-owned enterprises
USD	United States dollars