Elements in Epistemology
edited by
Stephen Hetherington
University of New South Wales, Sydney

HIGHER-ORDER EVIDENCE
AND CALIBRATIONISM

Ru Ye
Wuhan University
Higher-Order Evidence and Calibrationism

Elements in Epistemology

DOI: 10.1017/9781009127332
First published online: January 2023

Ru Ye
Wuhan University

Abstract: The higher-order evidence debate concerns how higher-order evidence affects the rationality of our first-order beliefs. This Element has two parts. The first part (Sections 1 and 2) provides a critical overview of the literature, aiming to explain why the higher-order evidence debate is interesting and important. The second part (Sections 3 to 6) defends calibrationism, the view that we should respond to higher-order evidence by aligning our credences to our reliability degree. The author first discusses the traditional version of calibrationism and explains its main difficulties, before proposing a new version of calibrationism called ‘Evidence-Discounting Calibrationism’. The Element argues that this new version is independently plausible and that it can avoid the difficulties faced by the traditional version.

Keywords: higher-order evidence, epistemic rationality, conditionalization, evidence, defeat

© Ru Ye 2023

ISBNs: 9781009124195 (PB), 9781009127332 (OC)
ISSNs: 2398-0567 (online), 2514-3832 (print)
Contents

1 Introduction 1

2 Major Positions in the Higher-Order Evidence Debate 9

3 Calibrationism and its Main Motivations 18

4 The Problem of Ignoring Evidence 26

5 The Conflict with Conditionalization 33

6 Evidence-Discounting Calibrationism 44

7 Conclusion 59

References 61