

GOOD GOVERNING

Good Governing: The Police Power in the American States is a deep historical and legal analysis of state police power, examining its origins in the founding period of the American republic through the twentieth century. The book reveals how American police power was intended to be a broad, but not unlimited, charter of regulatory governance, designed to implement key constitutional objectives and advance the general welfare. It explores police power's promise as a mechanism for implementing successful regulatory governance and tackling societal ills, while considering key structural issues like separation of powers and individual rights. This insightful book will shape understanding of the neglected state police power, a key part of constitutional governance in the United States. This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

Daniel B. Rodriguez is the Harold Washington Professor of Law at Northwestern University Pritzker School of Law. In addition to Northwestern, Professor Rodriguez has held tenured positions at the University of Texas, the University of San Diego, and the University of California, Berkeley and has held visiting positions at Harvard, Stanford, and Columbia. His scholarship focuses on public law, including constitutional law, administrative law, and regulation.

Good Governing

THE POLICE POWER IN THE AMERICAN STATES

DANIEL B. RODRIGUEZ

Northwestern University Pritzker School of Law

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-009-12305-1 — Good Governing

Daniel B. Rodriguez

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009123051

DOI: 10.1017/9781009127370

© Daniel B. Rodriguez 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781009127370 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0>

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009127370

First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Rodriguez, Daniel B., 1962– author.

TITLE: Good governing : the police power in the American states / Daniel B. Rodriguez, Northwestern University, Illinois.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2024. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2023054656 (print) | LCCN 2023054657 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781009123051 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009127370 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Police power – United States. | Police regulations – United States. | Constitutional law – United States.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KF4695 .R59 2024 (print) | LCC KF4695 (ebook) |

DDC 342.73/0418–dc23/eng/20231204

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2023054656>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2023054657>

ISBN 978-1-009-12305-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-12421-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

| | |
|--|-----------------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | <i>page vii</i> |
| Introduction | 1 |
| PART I POWER FOR THE PEOPLE: CREATING THE MODERN POLICE POWER | |
| 1 State Constitutions and the Governance Project | 17 |
| 2 The Police Power in Our Republic’s First Century | 42 |
| 3 “The Power to Govern Men and Things”: The Police Power Evolves to Meet New Conditions | 84 |
| 4 The Shape of the Police Power in the Modern Era | 133 |
| PART II STRUCTURAL CONSIDERATIONS | |
| 5 Separating and Distributing Powers and Functions | 173 |
| 6 Constitutional Rights | 200 |
| 7 Turning Inside Out: Resolving Conflicts over the Scope of the Police Power | 237 |
| 8 The Police Power and Federalism | 261 |

| | | |
|----|--|-----|
| vi | <i>Contents</i> | |
| | PART III THE POLICE POWER’S PROMISE | |
| 9 | Spheres of Regulatory Governance | 283 |
| 10 | Techniques of Regulatory Intervention: New Legal Tools to Solve Wicked Problems | 318 |
| | Conclusion | 331 |
| | <i>Index</i> | 333 |

Acknowledgments

This book reflects a deep dive into one key constitutional principle and power, but it reflects a wider amount of thinking about state constitutionalism and its form and function. Some of this thinking has resulted in published research, some has been sketched in various public lectures at law schools, and the rest has emerged rather organically from discussion in courses with terrific law students at various law schools where I have taught. And yet most of it is new with the work on this book. A number of prominent academics and judges, most recently the Hon. Jeff Sutton of the US Court of Appeals, have urged the academy to look beyond the US Constitution and federal constitutional law, to the myriad issues that arise in the context of state constitutions and state constitutional law. Hopefully this book responds to this call. State constitutions are at center stage of the most difficult debates and controversies in modern American politics, and I am hopeful that this book will be joined by a growing number of works to go onto the proverbial state constitutional law bookshelf.

In developing the book's central ideas, I have drawn upon earlier presentations and lectures. In 2020, I gave the Victor Johnson Lecture at Vanderbilt Law School, and that helped me in organizing many of the themes in this book. Before that, I had given a number of endowed lectures that helped to develop and sharpen various ideas here. These include the Jefferson Memorial Lectures at the University of California, Berkeley, the William Brennan Lecture on State Constitutional Law at Oklahoma City University Law School, the Rutgers State Constitutional Law Lecture, and the Nathaniel Nathanson Memorial Lecture at the University of San Diego. Thanks to the colleagues who invited me to give these lectures and to the participants who contributed their thoughts. I am thankful for good comments at faculty workshops and symposia at the law schools at New York University, University of San Diego, Texas A&M University, the University of Kentucky, and the University of Bologna. Late in the life of this manuscript, I had the benefit of a roundtable on this book, organized by Northwestern's Center on Law and Business, under the direction of my colleague Alex Lee, and with the valuable help of Derek Gundersen. A number of leading scholars participated in this meeting and made this book appreciably

better. They include Bridget Fahey, Lee Fennell, Tom Gaylord, Joanna Grissinger, Jamila Jefferson-Jones, Anthony Michael Kreis, Alex Lee, Gregory Mark, Jonathan Marshfield, Ajay Mehrotra, Jim Rossi, Nadav Shoked, and Justin Weinstein-Tull.

Special thanks to early mentors at University of California, Berkeley, where I began my academic career and where my interest in issues of federalism, structural constitutional law, and state constitutional law was stoked. They include Jesse Choper, Robert Cooter, Robert Post, Ed Rubin, Harry Scheiber, Martin Shapiro, and Jan Vetter. Two other great scholars deserve mention. Mat McCubbins (who passed away in the summer of 2021) and Barry Weingast, my teachers, good friends, and frequent co-authors, have both helped me to better understand puzzles in American constitutional politics and regulation and have modeled for me and others what first-rate interdisciplinary scholarship is.

Thanks to a great group of Northwestern research assistants, including Abigail Kuchnir, Paul Piazza, Christian Flowers, Adam Hitti, Quinn Bessette, and Immer Chriswell, for help at various stages. Tom Gaylord of our wonderful law library has been, and continues to be, an excellent resource in many ways. I appreciate the support of the two deans who have been at Northwestern during the duration of this book's work, Jim Speta and Hari Osofsky. Thanks to the great editorial and production team at Cambridge University Press, including Matt Galloway, a champion of this project from the early stages, and also Jadyn Fauconier-Herry.

Last but not least, I am incredibly grateful for the support of my wife (and colleague), Leslie Oster, in various ways, including as an occasional editor, and also to my growing Texas family. This book is dedicated to my parents, living and deceased, whose support and impact has been immeasurable.