

Kuhn's *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* at 60

Thomas Kuhn's *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* has sold over a million copies since its publication in 1962, is one of the most cited academic books of all time, and continues to be read and studied today. This volume of new essays evaluates the significance of Kuhn's classic book in its changing historical context, including its initial reception and its lasting effects. The essays explore the range of ideas that Kuhn made popular with his influential philosophy of science, including paradigms, normal science, paradigm changes, scientific revolutions, and incommensurability; and they also look at less-studied themes in his work, including scientific measurement, science education, and science textbooks. Drawing on the latest scholarship as well as unpublished material in the Thomas Kuhn Archives at MIT, this volume offers a comprehensive way into Kuhn's philosophy and demonstrates the continuing relevance of his ideas for our understanding of science.

K. Brad Wray is Associate Professor at the Centre for Science Studies, Aarhus University. His recent publications include *Interpreting Kuhn: Critical Essays* (Cambridge University Press, 2021) and *Kuhn's Intellectual Path: Charting "The Structure of Scientific Revolutions"* (Cambridge University Press, 2021).

Cambridge Philosophical Anniversaries

The volumes in this series reflect on classic philosophy books from the second half of the twentieth century, assessing their achievements, their influence on the field, and their lasting significance.

Titles Published in This Series

Kuhn's *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* at 60

Edited by K. Brad Wray

Kripke's *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* at 40

Edited by Claudine Verheggen

MacIntyre's *After Virtue* at 40

Edited by Tom Angier

Rawls's *A Theory of Justice* at 50

Edited by Paul Weithman

Cavell's *Must We Mean What We Say?* at 50

Edited by Greg Chase, Juliet Floyd, and Sandra Laugier

This list can also be seen at www.cambridge.org/cpa

Kuhn's *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* at 60

Edited by

K. Brad Wray

Aarhus University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-11402-8 — Kuhn's The Structure of Scientific Revolutions at 60
Brad Wray
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009114028

DOI: 10.1017/9781009122696

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

First paperback edition 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-009-10070-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-11402-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

This book is dedicated to
Pablo Melogno[†]
1979–2023
Friend and Scholar

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page ix
<i>List of Tables</i>	x
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
 Introduction: The Impact of <i>The Structure of Scientific Revolutions</i>	 1
K. BRAD WRAY	
 Part I Writing Structure	
1 “... I probably would never have written <i>Structure</i> ”	21
RICHARD CREATH	
2 The Influence of Science Funding Policy on Kuhn’s <i>Structure of Scientific Revolutions</i>	37
JAMIE SHAW	
 Part II Normal Science and Science Education	
3 Kuhn’s “Fifth Law of Thermodynamics”: Measurement, Data, and Anomalies	55
ALISA BOKULICH AND FEDERICA BOCCHI	
4 Normal Science: The Rise and Fall of Scientific Traditions	79
PABLO MELOGNO [†]	
5 “Textbook Science” before and after <i>Structure</i>	95
ALEXANDRA BRADNER	
6 Thomas Kuhn, Normal Science, and Education	121
HASOK CHANG	
	vii

Part III Incommensurability, Progress, and Revolutions

7	Kuhn on Translation	137
	ALEX LEVINE	
8	Paradigm Shifts and Group Belief Change	147
	HAIXIN DANG	
9	The Puzzle of Promise, aka “Kuhn’s Problem”	165
	CHRIS HAUFE	
10	The Orwellian Dimension of Scientific Progress	182
	K. BRAD WRAY	
11	Essential Tensions in Twenty-First-Century Science	197
	HANNE ANDERSEN	

Part IV Kuhn’s Impact on the Philosophy, Sociology, and History of Science

12	The Ambiguous Legacy of Kuhn’s <i>Structure</i> for Normative Philosophy of Science	217
	JONATHAN Y. TSOU	
13	Thomas Kuhn and the Strong Programme: An Appropriate Appropriation?	235
	MARKUS SEIDEL	
14	Kuhn and the History of Science	254
	VASSO KINDI	
	<i>Bibliography</i>	275
	<i>Index</i>	301

Figures

3.1	Birge’s 1941 table showing the clustering of the five earlier experimentally measured values for the speed of light	<i>page 69</i>
3.2	Recommended values for the speed of light from 1929 to 1973	69
3.3	Comparison of the new 2018 values for twenty-seven fundamental physical constants with the previously recommended 2014 values for those constants	75
3.4	Measurement of the gravitational constant, G , from 1982 through 2014, involving seven different experimental methods	76
11.1	Types of team organization	209

Tables

3.1 Values of the speed of light based on different experimental determinations	<i>page 63</i>
5.1 Epistemological differences between textbook science and scientific practice	107
5.2 Binns’ traditional versus broad views of scientific methodology	108

Contributors

HANNE ANDERSEN is a Professor in the Department of Science Education at the University of Copenhagen.

FEDERICA BOCCHI is completing her PhD in the Department of Philosophy at Boston University.

ALISA BOKULICH is a Professor in the Department of Philosophy at Boston University.

ALEXANDRA BRADNER is a Visiting Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Kenyon College.

HASOK CHANG is Hans Rausing Professor of History and Philosophy of Science at the University of Cambridge.

RICHARD CREATH is President's Professor of Life Sciences and of Philosophy, and the director of the program in history and philosophy of science, at Arizona State University.

HAIXIN DANG is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Nebraska Omaha.

CHRIS HAUFE is the Elizabeth M. and William C. Treuhaft Professor of the Humanities at Case Western Reserve University.

VASSO KINDI is a Professor of Philosophy of Science at the National and Kapodistrian University of Athens.

ALEX LEVINE is Professor and Chair in the Department of Philosophy at the University of South Florida.

PABLO MELOGNO[†] was a Professor at the University of the Republic in Uruguay.

MARKUS SEIDEL is a Senior Lecturer in the Center for Philosophy of Science (ZfW) at the Westfälische Wilhelms-Universität Münster, Germany.

xii List of Contributors

JAMIE SHAW is a Postdoctoral Fellow at the Leibniz Universität Hannover.

JONATHAN Y. TSOU is a Professor of Philosophy and the Marvin and Kathleen Stone Distinguished Professor of Humanities in Medicine and Science at the University of Texas at Dallas.

K. BRAD WRAY is an Associate Professor at the Centre for Science Studies at Aarhus University in Denmark. He is also an Associate Fellow at the Aarhus Institute of Advanced Studies.

Acknowledgments

This book is the result of the efforts of many people and a number of organizations. I want to acknowledge my gratitude to them here.

Hilary Gaskin of Cambridge University Press originally approached me with the idea of taking on the project of editing a volume of papers in celebration of Thomas Kuhn's influential book *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* (SSR) as part of a new series intended to celebrate key books in philosophy on the anniversary of their publication. This seemed like a great idea, and a great opportunity to foster scholarship on Thomas Kuhn and SSR.

After planning the volume, I was encouraged by Paul Hoyningen-Huene to run a conference in 2022, in celebration of the sixtieth anniversary of the publication of SSR, as well as in honor of the hundredth year since Kuhn's birth. A number of happy coincidences occurred that made running such a conference feasible. First, I had the good fortune to be appointed as an Associate Fellow at the Aarhus Institute of Advanced Studies (AIAS) in 2021. AIAS is an exciting interdisciplinary research environment organized to encourage fruitful interactions between scholars across traditional disciplinary lines. Further, AIAS provided some financial support for a conference, as well as wonderful facilities in which to host the conference. I want to thank the director of AIAS, Søren Rud Keiding[†], for his support, as well as the staff at AIAS. In addition, with the help of my colleague Kristian Hvidtfelt Nielsen, I applied for and was awarded a conference grant from the Carlsberg Foundation. I want to thank the director and staff at AIAS for their help in organizing and running the conference, as well as the Carlsberg Foundation for their generous support (Grant No. CF21-0698). The conference allowed me to invite a number of the contributing authors to Aarhus to present their papers, as they worked on them, as well as other Kuhn scholars. The excitement and energy at the conference was wonderful. And the constructive exchanges of ideas are reflected in a number of the pieces in the volume. I want to thank all those who participated in

xiv Acknowledgments

the conference for making the event so successful and enjoyable. Paul deserves a special thanks for encouraging me to organize the event.

I also thank Lori Nash for working with me on preparing the volume for production, preparing an index and a comprehensive bibliography, and for proofreading the proof pages with me. The production of the book, in particular, Lori's work on the book, was supported by a publication grant from the Aarhus Universitets Forskningsfond (AUFF), grant number AUFF-E-2022-4-34. AUFF has been very supportive over the last five years, supporting four of my book projects.

I thank Hilary and Abi Sears at Cambridge University Press for their work on this volume, from its conception to its final production. I also thank Thomas Haynes from CUP for seeing the book through production.

Finally, I thank the contributors for their thoughtful papers on Kuhn's *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*. It is a testament to the vigor and creativity of scholarship on Kuhn and his remarkable book. It has been an honor and privilege to work with these colleagues on this volume.

Abbreviations

Thomas Kuhn's Books

BBT (1978). *Black-Body Theory and the Quantum Discontinuity, 1894–1912*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

CR (1957). *The Copernican Revolution: Planetary Astronomy in Development of Western Thought*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

ET (1977). *The Essential Tension: Selected Studies in Scientific Tradition and Change*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

- “Preface,” pp. ix–xxiii (1977a).
- “The Relations between the History and the Philosophy of Science,” pp. 3–20 (1976/1977b).
- “Mathematical versus Experimental Traditions in the Development of Physical Science,” pp. 31–65 (1976/1977a).
- “The History of Science,” pp. 105–126 (1968/1977).
- “The Relations between History and History of Science,” pp. 127–161 (1971/1977).
- “The Function of Measurement in Modern Physical Science,” pp. 178–224 (1961/1977).
- “The Essential Tension: Tradition and Innovation in Scientific Research,” pp. 225–239 (1959/1977).
- “Second Thoughts on Paradigms,” pp. 293–319 (1974/1977).
- “Objectivity, Value Judgment, and Theory Choice,” pp. 320–339 (1973/1977).

LW (2022). *The Last Writings of Thomas S. Kuhn: Incommensurability in Science*, ed. Bojana Mladenovic. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

QPT (2021). *The Quest for Physical Theory: Problems in the Methodology of Scientific Research*, ed. George A. Reisch. Boston: MIT Libraries.

xvi List of Abbreviations

- RSS (2000). *The Road since Structure: Philosophical Essays, 1970–1993, with an Autobiographical Interview*, ed. J. Conant and J. Haugeland. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- “The Road since *Structure*,” pp. 90–104 (1991/2000).
 - “The Trouble with the Historical Philosophy of Science,” pp. 105–120 (1992/2000).
 - “Afterwords,” pp. 224–252 (1993/2000).
 - “A Discussion with Thomas S. Kuhn” (with Aristides Baltas, Kostas Gavroglu, and Vasso Kindi), pp. 253–323 (1997/2000).
- SSR *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- First edition (1962). SSR-1
 - Second edition, includes “Postscript-1969” (1962/1970), pp. 174–210. SSR-2
 - Third edition, includes “Postscript-1969” (1962/1996), pp. pp. 174–210. SSR-3
 - Fourth edition, 50th anniversary edition, with an introductory essay by Ian Hacking (1962/2012), “Postscript-1969,” pp. 173–208. SSR-4

TSK Archives–MC240

The following are documents from the Thomas Kuhn Archives at the Institute Archives and Special Collections, MIT Libraries, Cambridge, MA. They are cited according to date.

- (1959). Lectures, General, 1957–1959, box 3, folder 12.
 (1961b). *Proto-Structure*. Unpublished early manuscript of *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*.
 (1964). Lectures, General, 1960–1964, box 3, folder 13.

No Abbreviations Used

The following are papers of Kuhn’s that do not appear in one of the above books. They are cited according to date.

- (1952). “Robert Boyle and Structural Chemistry in the Seventeenth Century.” *Isis* 43, 1: 12–36.
 (1961a). Letter from Thomas S. Kuhn to James B. Conant. Berkeley, CA, June 29. Harvard University Archives.

List of Abbreviations

xvii

- (1963). “The Function of Dogma in Scientific Research.” In A. C. Crombie (ed.), *Scientific Change: Historical Studies in the Intellectual, Social and Technical Conditions for Scientific Discovery and Technical Innovation, from Antiquity to the Present*, pp. 347–369. London: Heinemann; New York: Basic Books.
- (1970a). “Logic of Discovery or Psychology of Research?” In I. Lakatos and A. Musgrave (eds.), *Criticism and the Growth of Knowledge*, pp. 1–23. London: Cambridge University Press.
- (1970b). “Reflections on My Critics.” In Imre Lakatos and Alan Musgrave (eds.), *Criticism and the Growth of Knowledge*, pp. 231–278. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- (1971). “Notes on Lakatos.” In R. C. Buck and R. S. Cohen (eds.), *PSA 1970: In Memory of Rudolf Carnap*, pp. 137–146. Dordrecht: Reidel.
- (1972). “Scientific Growth: Reflection on Ben-David’s Scientific Role.” *Minerva* 10: 166–178.
- (1974). “Discussion.” In F. Suppe (ed.), *The Structure of Scientific Theories*, pp. 500–517. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- (1976). “Mathematical versus Experimental Traditions in the Development of Physical Science.” *Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 7, 1: 1–31.
- (1979). “Foreword.” In Ludwik Fleck, *Genesis and Development of a Scientific Fact*, ed. T. J. Trenn and R. K. Merton, trans. F. Bradley and T. J. Trenn, pp. vii–xi. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- (1980). “The Halt and the Blind: Philosophy and History of Science.” *British Journal for the Philosophy of Science* 31: 181–192.
- (1983). “Reflections on Receiving the John Desmond Bernal Award.” *4S Review* 1, 4 (Winter): 26–30.
- (1984). “Professionalization Recollected in Tranquility.” *Isis* 75, 1: 29–32.
- (1986). “The Histories of Science: Diverse Worlds for Diverse Audiences.” *Academe* 72, 4: 29–33.
- (1989/1993). “Foreword.” In Paul Hoyningen-Huene, *Reconstructing Scientific Revolutions: Thomas S. Kuhn’s Philosophy of Science*, pp. xi–xiii. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

xviii List of Abbreviations

- (2016). “The Nature of Scientific Knowledge: An Interview with Thomas Kuhn (conducted by Skúli Sigurdsson).” In A. Blum et al. (eds.), *Shifting Paradigms. Thomas S. Kuhn and the History of Science*, pp. 17–30. Berlin: Max-Planck-Institute for the History of Science.