

Cambridge Elements =

Elements in the Structure and Dynamics of Complex Networks
edited by
Guido Caldarelli
Ca' Foscari University of Venice

DESCRIPTIVE VS. INFERENTIAL COMMUNITY DETECTION IN NETWORKS

Pitfalls, Myths, and Half-Truths

Tiago P. Peixoto Central European University, Vienna







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009113007 DOI: 10.1017/9781009118897

© Tiago de Paula Peixoto 2023

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/9781009118897 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly. When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009118897

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-009-11300-7 Paperback ISSN 2516-5763 (online) ISSN 2516-5755 (print)

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Descriptive vs. Inferential Community Detection in Networks

Pitfalls, Myths, and Half-Truths

Elements in the Structure and Dynamics of Complex Networks

DOI: 10.1017/9781009118897 First published online: May 2023

Tiago P. Peixoto Central European University, Vienna

Author for correspondence: Tiago P. Peixoto, peixotot@ceu.edu

Abstract: Community detection is one of the most important methodological fields of network science, and one which has attracted a significant amount of attention over the past decades. This area deals with the automated division of a network into fundamental building blocks, with the objective of providing a summary of its large-scale structure. Despite the importance and widespread adoption of community detection there is a noticeable gap between what is arguably the state-of-the-art and the methods that are actually used in practice in a variety of fields. This Element attempts to address this discrepancy by dividing existing methods according to whether they have a "descriptive" or an "inferential" goal. While descriptive methods find patterns in networks based on context-dependent notions of community structure, inferential methods articulate a precise generative model, and attempt to fit it to data. In this way, they are able to provide insights into the mechanisms of network formation, and separate structure from randomness in a manner supported by statistical evidence. We review how employing descriptive methods with inferential aims is riddled with pitfalls and misleading answers, and thus should be in general avoided. We argue that inferential methods are more typically aligned with clearer scientific questions, yield more robust results, and should be in many cases preferred. We attempt to dispel some myths and half-truths often believed when community detection is employed in practice, in an effort to improve both the use of such methods as well as the interpretation of their results. This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

Keywords: community detection, stochastic block models, network clustering, statistical inference, Bayesian inference

© Tiago de Paula Peixoto 2023

ISBNs: 9781009113007 (PB), 9781009118897 (OC) ISSNs: 2516-5763 (online), 2516-5755 (print)



Contents

1	Introduction	1
2	Descriptive vs. inferential community detection	2
3	Modularity maximization considered harmful	22
4	Myths, pitfalls, and half-truths	29
5	Conclusion	65
References		66