

## The Dreadful Word

This book, the first comprehensive study of criminal speech in eighteenth-century New England, traces how the criminalization, prosecution, and punishment of speech offenses in Massachusetts helped to establish and legitimate a social and cultural regime of politeness. Analyzing provincial statutes and hundreds of criminal prosecutions, Kristin A. Olbertson argues that colonists transformed their understanding of speech offenses, from fundamentally ungodly to primarily impolite. As white male gentility emerged as the pre-eminent model of authority, records of criminal prosecution and punishment show a distinct cadre of politely pious men defining themselves largely in contrast to the vulgar, the impious, and the unmanly. "Law," as manifested in statutes as well as in local courts and communities, promoted and legitimized a particular, polite vision of the king's peace and helped effectuate the British Empire. In this unique and fascinating work, Olbertson reveals how ordinary people interacted with and shaped legal institutions.

Kristin A. Olbertson is Associate Professor in the Department of History at Alma College. She was previously a fellow at the Hurst Summer Institute.





See the Studies in Legal History series website at http://studiesinlegalhistory.org/

### Studies in Legal History

#### **EDITORS**

Holly Brewer, University of Maryland, College Park Lisa Ford, University of New South Wales Thomas McSweeney, William & Mary Law School Reuel Schiller, University of California, Hastings College of the Law Taisu Zhang, Yale Law School

### Other books in the series:

Edgardo Pérez Morales, Unraveling Abolition: Legal Culture and Slave Emancipation in Colombia

Lyndsay Campbell, Truth and Privilege: Libel Law in Massachusetts and Nova Scotia, 1820–1840

Sara M. Butler, Pain, Penance, and Protest: Peine Forte et Dure in Medieval England

Michael Lobban, Imperial Incarceration: Detention without Trial in the Making of British Colonial Africa

Stefan Jurasinski and Lisi Oliver, The Laws of Alfred: The Domboc and the Making of Anglo-Saxon Law

Sascha Auerbach, Armed with Sword and Scales: Law, Culture, and Local Courtrooms in London, 1860–1913



- Alejandro de La Fuente and Ariela J. Gross, Becoming Free, Becoming Black: Race, Freedom, and the Law in Cuba, Virginia, and Louisiana Elizabeth Papp Kamali, Felony and the Guilty Mind in Medieval
- Elizabeth Papp Kamali, Felony and the Guilty Mind in Medieval England
- Jessica K. Lowe, Murder in the Shenandoah: Making Law Sovereign in Revolutionary Virginia
- Michael A. Schoeppner, Moral Contagion: Black Atlantic Sailors, Citizenship, and Diplomacy in Antebellum America
- Sam Erman, Almost Citizens: Puerto Rico, the U.S. Constitution, and Empire
- Martha S. Jones, Birthright Citizens: A History of Race and Rights in Antebellum America
- Julia Moses, The First Modern Risk: Workplace Accidents and the Origins of European Social States
- Cynthia Nicoletti, Secession on Trial: The Treason Prosecution of Iefferson Davis
- Edward James Kolla, Sovereignty, International Law, and the French Revolution
- Assaf Likhovski, Tax Law and Social Norms in Mandatory Palestine and Israel
- Robert W. Gordon, Taming the Past: Essays on Law and History and History in Law
- Paul Garfinkel, Criminal Law in Liberal and Fascist Italy
- Michelle A. McKinley, Fractional Freedoms: Slavery, Intimacy, and Legal Mobilization in Colonial Lima, 1600–1700
- Karen M. Tani, States of Dependency: Welfare, Rights, and American Governance, 1935–1972
- Stefan Jurasinski, The Old English Penitentials and Anglo-Saxon Law Felice Batlan, Women and Justice for the Poor: A History of Legal Aid, 1863–1945
- Sophia Z. Lee, The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right
- Mitra Sharafi, Law and Identity in Colonial South Asia: Parsi Legal Culture, 1772–1947
- Michael A. Livingston, *The Fascists and the Jews of Italy: Mussolini's Race Laws*, 1938–1943



# The Dreadful Word

Speech Crime and Polite Gentlemen in Massachusetts, 1690–1776

KRISTIN A. OLBERTSON

Alma College





# **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009098908 DOI: 10.1017/9781009106535

© Kristin A. Olbertson 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-009-09890-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To Sharon Hull Olbertson, who also has seen the other side of the mountain



### **Contents**

List of Tables  Acknowledgments		page xi
		xii
I	Introduction	I
	Methodology	8
	Speech and the Law	17
	(Im)politeness and the Law	23
2	A Politer Peace	35
	The Refinement of Massachusetts	35
	From Sinful to Impolite Speech	46
3	Sensibility	62
	Noise	65
	Threats	80
	Profane Swearing	92
4	Civility	127
	Contempt	129
	Cursing	135
	Defamation and Satire	144
5	Credibility	181
	Credit	185
	Lying	202
	False Swearing and Perjury	216
	False Reports	227
	Mumpers	240
6	Cacophony	252
	Impolite Speech and the Imperial Crisis	252
	The Criminal Law and Creating Social Order	256

ix



x	Contents
7 Respectability	270
Sedition and Sensibility	271
The Speech of Citizens	277
Bibliography	287
Index	311



# **Tables**

3.1 Threats	page 83
3.2 Profane swearing	103
4.1 Cursing	140
4.2 Defamation	148



# Acknowledgments

This book has been part of my life, in one way or another, for many years. One of the best aspects of finally publishing it is the opportunity to express my appreciation for all the friends, colleagues, and connections that were instrumental to the researching and writing process. It was born at the University of Michigan, where the Dual Degree Program in Law and History offered unique opportunities for interdisciplinary study. At the Law School, coursework with Don Herzog, Bill Miller, and Catharine MacKinnon provided analytic frameworks for thinking about the regulation of speech, about trials and society, and about the construction of gender (respectively) from legal perspectives. At Rackham Graduate School, Sue Juster and Carol Karlsen were superb teachers and mentors for a recovering medievalist venturing into colonial America. Fellow graduate students Ellen Hartigan-O'Connor, Ruth Hartman, and Anna Lawrence furnished great insight, encouragement, and levity.

I would not have even thought of becoming a historian were it not for my undergraduate history professors Cliff Clark and Phil Niles. They both challenged and encouraged me, and ensured that I had access to every opportunity. I will always aspire to provide the same sort of support and encouragement to my own students.

Conducting the research for this project meant spending so much time with a particular microfilm reader that I began to think of it as my own. It wasn't, of course, but one of several graciously made available for use by the local Church of Latter-day Saints (LDS). The LDS also shipped many rolls of microfilm from Utah to Michigan, and their local research library staff was endlessly helpful and welcoming. Research also meant time in Boston, where staff at the Harvard Law Library and

xii



### Acknowledgments

xiii

the Massachusetts Historical Society generously shared their expertise. The Massachusetts State Archives made their rather complex collection of colonial legal records accessible and navigable. The librarians at Alma College, particularly Angie Kelleher, went above and beyond, tirelessly and efficiently tracking down many, many interlibrary loan requests and even hand-delivering books to my home in the midst of a pandemic. My local public library, the Grace A. Dow Memorial Library, provided a spectacular and quiet place to work when open. When it temporarily closed due to a 500-year flooding event, the staff diligently obtained materials and provided curbside pickup.

All of this research was made possible by generous support from other sources. The Society for Colonial Dames and the University of Michigan provided lift at the very beginning of this project. The Hurst Summer Institute made it possible for me to spend two productive and rewarding weeks in Madison, learning from legal scholars such as Bob Gordon and Dirk Hartog as well as my fellow participants: Christopher Beauchamp, Margot Canaday, Jonathan Chausovsky, Lianna Farber, Angela Fernandez, Bernie Jones, Melissa Murray, Yvonne Pitts, Mitra Sharafi, Hilary Soderland, and Kyle Volk. The Littleton-Griswold Research Grant from the American Historical Association funded additional work in Boston. Alma College granted a fourth-year leave and then two sabbaticals, which gave me the uninterrupted time for travel, research, and writing.

Even with this support, this project has taken much longer to complete than I ever anticipated. On the course of this long journey, I have been lucky to receive assistance from a long list of friends and colleagues. Bill Novak invited me to present portions of the book at the Legal History Workshop at University of Michigan Law School and asked really tough questions that pushed me to clarify my arguments and assumptions. While presenting various segments of this book at several annual meetings of the American Society for Legal History (ASLH), the Omohundro Institute, and the Society for Early Americanists, I've received helpful feedback from commentators such as Michael Grossberg, as well as from audience members. Other ASLH folk who have expressed interest and encouragement include Dan Ernst, Chuck Grench, Bruce Mann, and Richard Ross. Several Alma colleagues in a writing group also read portions of the book and responded with great insight.

The person who has probably read this book more times than anyone besides me has to be Tom Green, my teacher and mentor. He set me on the path to becoming a legal historian, then guided me



xiv

Cambridge University Press 978-1-009-09890-8 — The Dreadful Word Speech Crime and Polite Gentlemen in Massachusetts, 1690–1776 Kristin A. Olbertson Frontmatter More Information

Acknowledgments

through the dissertation process, revising, and a long and convoluted route to publication. Every time he cheerfully read the manuscript (and there were many times), he provided detailed, substantive feedback. Every time I encountered a setback (and there were many times of that, too), he was sympathetic and steadfast in his encouragement. Tom is the very model of mentorship, and I'm deeply grateful for everything he has done to help bring this project to fruition.

One of Tom's best suggestions was that I seek out Holly Brewer as an editor. Holly has been incredibly patient and resourceful in shepherding this book to publication in the midst of a pandemic. She secured readers who supplied constructive and helpful feedback; the comments from Lisa Ford and the anonymous reader have made this book much better. Holly also read numerous iterations of this book with great care, made suggestions for improvement that were transformative, and saved me from several major errors. Phil Deloria also graciously read several sections of the book and helped me think through some of the analysis of speech and native peoples. Any blunders remaining after all this assistance are of course my responsibility alone.

The good people who deliver food and groceries helped me keep my family fed while I was completing revisions. I am deeply grateful to my children's caregivers, who bailed while I rowed so that the household stayed afloat throughout this project. Cate Denial and my Omohundro Institute Coffeehouse colleagues extended an extraordinary gesture of support that lifted my spirits at a critical moment.

I have been sustained throughout this project by my good friends in book club, who were always willing to experiment with the cathartic powers of profanity. Jodi McFarland Friedman supplied reliable good humor and talked me through contemporary issues of information, social media, and press freedoms. And Kate Blanchard, longtime colleague and partner in many crimes, cheered me on and cheered me up.

My family has been instrumental as well. All three of my kids were born during the time I have been working on this project, so they have grown up with it; the two oldest even accompanied me to the Hurst Institute as a toddler and a baby. It has been both fascinating and hilarious to observe them learning and inventing their own dreadful words. My husband has lived with this enterprise even longer, and has ever reminded me that there's more to life than books. Both of my parents, John and Sharon Olbertson, have always cared deeply about language. And my mother, a career teacher, remains my first and best writing instructor. It is to her that this book is dedicated.