

Cambridge University Press 978-1-009-09859-5 — The Law As a Conversation among Equals Roberto Gargarella Table of Contents More Information

CONTENTS

	Preface page xv Acknowledgments xviii
1	Constitutionalism and Democracy 1 An Institutional Problem of Structural Nature
	1.1 The Democratic Objection is Still There 5
	1.2 Of History and Ideas 8
	1.3 Three Clarifications 12
2	The Law As Conversation among Equals 16
	2.1 Immigrants in the "Promised Land" 16
	2.2 Six Basic Elements of a Conversation among Equals 21
	2.3 "Constitutional Moments" As Collective Conversation 25
	2.4 Autonomy, Self-Government, Rights, and Democracy in the Conversation of Equals 29
	2.5 Autonomy and Self-Government 29
	2.6 Rights and Democracy 30
3	"Democratic Dissonance" 32 Elitism Translated into Institutions
	3.1 Three Great Jurists from the Age of Revolutions: Madison, Alberdi, and Bello 32
	3.2 Madison 33
	3.3 Alberdi 35
	vii



viii

Cambridge University Press 978-1-009-09859-5 — The Law As a Conversation among Equals Roberto Gargarella Table of Contents More Information

		CONTENTS
	3.4	Bello 36
	3.5	Elitist Discourse in an Exclusive Framework: Constitutions Conceived for Another Time 38
	3.6	Political Sociology 39
	3.7	Elitism Translated into Principles and Institutions 40
	3.8	Assumptions, Principles, Institutions 41
	3.9	What Has Stayed the Same and What Changed in Constitutional Terms: The "Fact of Democracy" 45
	3.10	"Democratic Dissonance" and the Tight-Fitting Suit of Constitutionalism 48
4		onstitution Marked by a "Discomfort with locracy" 51
	4.1	Madison and "Factions" 51
	4.2	Direct Democracy 53
	4.3	Motivations 54
	4.4	Violations of Rights 54
		Majorities and Minorities: The Construction of a Counter-Majoritarian Constitution 55
		A Constitution Made to Protect Minorities 57
		Exactly Which of the Minorities Warrant Protection? 59
		So What to Do About Majority Factions? (Another) Counter-Majoritarian Response 61
5		ivations and Institutions 66 Ien Were Angels"
		How Far Off Were the Radical Republicans? 69



Cambridge University Press 978-1-009-09859-5 — The Law As a Conversation among Equals Roberto Gargarella Table of Contents More Information

CONTENTS ix

	5.2	Egoism As "Fuel" for and the "Endogenous Product" of the Institutional System 71
	5.3	No System Is "Neutral" 75
	5.4	The Economic Preconditions of Political Self-Government 77
6	The	e Structural Difficulties of Representation 82
	6.1	The Bristol Debates 82
	6.2	Do We Need to "Filter" the Citizen Voice? 87
	6.3	The Problems of the Predominant Model: Isolation, "Capture," Ignorance 90
	6.4	From "Virtual" Representation to Representation As "Mirror": Representation and "Presence" 91
	6.5	The Structural Difficulty of Representation 94
7	The	e Rise and Fall of Popular Control 98
	7.1	Citizens and Representatives 98
	7.2	On Institutions Sensitive to Popular Will in Radical English Thought 100
	7.3	Instructions, Rotation in Positions, Annual Elections: Different Forms of "Popular" Control 102
	7.4	The Gradual Elimination of "Popular" Controls 104
8	The	e Periodic Vote, or "Electoral Extortion" 108
	8.1	Regular Voting As the Only Bridge Standing between Citizens and Representatives 108
	8.2	"Electoral Extortion" 109
	8.3	Elections from the Representative's Point of View: Voting and Interpreting the Vote 115
	8.4	From the Agora to the Dark Booth: The Absence of Dialogue 118
	8.5	"Paper Stones" 119



X

Cambridge University Press 978-1-009-09859-5 — The Law As a Conversation among Equals Roberto Gargarella Table of Contents More Information

	CONTENTS
	8.6 Irrational Voters or Dysfunctional System? 120
9	Checks and Balances 124 Combining "Institutional Means and Personal Motives"
	9.1 The Key to Modern Constitutionalism: "Checks and Balances" 124
	9.2 Institutionally Channeling "Civil War" 127
	9.3 Erroneous Antidemocratic Logic 129
10	Presidentialism 136 Busting the Checks and Balances
	10.1 Creating the Leviathan 139
	10.2 A Poorly Designed Institutional System 140
	10.3 The Problem with the Pact 141
	10.4 An "Unbalanced" System of "Checks and Balances": The "Alberdian Error" 143
	10.5 The Political Left and Presidentialism 146
11	Rights 149 Citizenship As Repository of Rights
	11.1 Natural and Self-Evident Rights: Rights As "Planets" 151
	11.2 Bentham and the Idea of "Natural Rights" As "Nonsense upon Stilts" 155
	11.3 Rights versus Democracy 158
	11.4 Rights As "Trump Cards" against Majorities 160
	11.5 Rights and the "Sphere of the Undecidable" 162
12	Social Rights and the "Engine Room" 166
	12.1 The "Exorbitant" Mexican Constitution of 1917 166



Cambridge University Press 978-1-009-09859-5 — The Law As a Conversation among Equals Roberto Gargarella Table of Contents **More Information**

хi

		CONTENTS
	12.2	The Mexican Constitution of 1917: A "Conservative Moment" in the Revolutionary Movement 167
	12.3	The Animal Stirs: From the Fourteenth Amendment to "Social Authoritarianism" in Latin America 172
	12.4	The "New Latin American Constitutionalism": Constitutionalism That Was Already Old at Birth 176
	12.5	Rights versus "Engine Room" 177
	12.6	Rights As Bribes? Another Take on Rights versus Democracy 179
13	,	cial Review 183 eems Something of an Insult"
	13.1	The "Democratic Objection" and Hamilton's Defense of the Judiciary 183
	13.2	The Most Famous Court Case in History: <i>Marbury</i> v. <i>Madison</i> 187
	13.3	Judicial Review and Democracy: Failed Arguments 190
	13.4	The "Interpretative Gap" Argument 193
	13.5	Law Goes Global: International Courts 197
14		stitutional Interpretation 202 on the "Interpretative Gap" Widens
	14.1	What Interpretation Is Not 204
	14.2	The Multiplicity of Interpretative Theories 205
	14.3	Look to the Past or Think in the

Present?

Results

210

213

14.4 Looking to Past or Present for Often Opposite



xii

Cambridge University Press 978-1-009-09859-5 — The Law As a Conversation among Equals Roberto Gargarella Table of Contents More Information

	CONTENTS
	14.5 Radicalizing the Critique of Constitutional Interpretation 216
	14.6 Constitutional Interpretation in a Community of Equals (or "from How to Who?") 223
15	Constitution Making 232 Speaking with One Voice in Multicultural Societies
	15.1 Ulysses and the Constitution 232
	15.2 Constitutions That Speak with One Voice in Multicultural Societies 234
	15.3 A Plebiscite for Everything Aggravates the Problem The "Hourglass" 240
	15.4 Inclusive Constituent Assemblies 242
16	The Birth of Dialogical Constitutionalism 246
	16.1 The <i>Grootboom</i> Case in South Africa 247
	16.2 The "Notwithstanding Clause" in Canada 250
	16.3 The Spaces for Dialogue Expand: "Public Hearings,""Prior Consultation," and "Meaningful Engagement" 252
	16.4 The Potential of the Incipient DialogicalConstitutionalism 255
17	Why We Care About Dialogue 258
	17.1 The Debate Over Abortion in Argentina 258
	17.2 Why We Are Interested in Dialogue 260
	17.3 What Kind of Dialogue Are We Talking About, When We Talk About Dialogue? 263
	17.4 "Real-Life" Constitutional Dialogue 266
18	"Democratic Erosion" 270
	18.1 An Autobiographical Note 270



19

Cambridge University Press 978-1-009-09859-5 — The Law As a Conversation among Equals Roberto Gargarella **Table of Contents More Information**

xiii

CONTENTS	XII
18.2 "Democratic Erosion": A Previously Unidentified Species? 273	
18.3 Too Slow a Death: From the Crisis of Rights to the Crisis of Democracy 275	
18.4 Repairing a Ship at Sea: Restoring Democratic Controls 278	
18.5 "The Final Stop": Congress As the Best Democracy Can Do? 283	
18.6 Between Mill's "Best Judge" and Aristotle's "Wise Crowd" 286	
The New Deliberative Assemblies 290	
19.1 The "Pots and Pans Revolution" 290	
19.2 The Era of Assemblies: A Short Initial Balance Sheet 297	
19.3 The Problem of "Capture": When the Past Holds Back the Present, and the Old Will Not Let in the New 305	

- 20 Conclusion 308 For a Conversation among Equals
 - 20.1 The Different Pieces of "Institutional Decoupling" 311
 - 20.2 What to Do? 315
 - 20.3 Three Themes and Three Cases 318
 - 20.4 Final Objections
 - 20.5 So Then . . . 325

Bibliography 327 Index 338