

The Limits of Judicialization

Latin America was one of the earliest and most enthusiastic adopters of what has come to be known as the judicialization of politics – the use of law and legal institutions as tools of social contestation to curb the abuse of power in government, resolve policy disputes, and enforce and expand civil, political, and socioeconomic rights. Almost forty years into this experiment, *The Limits of Judicialization* brings together a cross-disciplinary group of scholars to assess the role that law and courts play in Latin American politics. Featuring studies of hot-button topics including abortion, state violence, judicial corruption, and corruption prosecutions, this volume argues that the institutional and cultural changes that empowered courts – the “judicialization superstructure” – often fall short of the promise of greater accountability and rights protection. Illustrative and expansive, this volume offers a truly interdisciplinary analysis of the limits of judicialized politics.

SANDRA BOTERO is Associate Professor at Universidad del Rosario in Bogota. She specializes in studying the relationship between the judiciary and democracy, as well as electoral behavior, with a regional focus on Latin America.

DANIEL BRINKS is Professor of Government and Law at the University of Texas, Austin. He is the author of multiple books, including *The DNA of Constitutional Justice in Latin America* (2018, with Abby Blass), which was awarded APSA’s C. Herman Pritchett Prize for Best Book on Law and Courts, and *Understanding Institutional Weakness: Power and Design in Latin American Institutions* (2020, with Steve Levitsky and Maria Victoria Murillo).

EZEQUIEL GONZALEZ-OCANTOS is Associate Professor of Political Science and Professorial Fellow of Nuffield College at the University of Oxford. He is the author of *Shifting Legal Visions: Judicial Change and Human Rights Trials in Latin America* (2016) and *The Politics of Transitional Justice in Latin America: Power Norms and Capacity Building* (2020).

The Limits of Judicialization

From Progress to Backlash in Latin America

Edited by

SANDRA BOTERO

Universidad del Rosario

DANIEL M. BRINKS

University of Texas at Austin

EZEQUIEL A. GONZALEZ-OCANTOS

University of Oxford



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-009-09834-2 — The Limits of Judicialization
 Edited by Sandra Botero , Daniel M. Brinks , Ezequiel A. Gonzalez-Ocantos
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
 It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
 education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009098342
 DOI: 10.1017/9781009098359

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Botero Cabrera, Sandra, editor. | Brinks, Daniel M., 1961– editor. | Gonzalez
 Ocantos, Ezequiel, 1984– editor.
 TITLE: The limits of judicialization : from progress to backlash in Latin America / edited by
 Sandra Botero, Universidad del Rosario; Daniel M. Brinks, University of Texas at Austin;
 Ezequiel A. Gonzalez-Ocantos, University of Oxford.
 DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press,
 2022. | “This book originated at a conference we organized in October 2019 at the
 Universidad del Rosario, Bogota, Colombia.”—ECIP Acknowledgements. | Includes
 bibliographical references and index.
 IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022008778 (print) | LCCN 2022008779 (ebook) |
 ISBN 9781009098342 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009096164 (paperback) |
 ISBN 9781009098359 (epub)
 SUBJECTS: LCSH: Political questions and judicial power—Latin America—Congresses.
 CLASSIFICATION: LCC KG608.A6 L56 2022 (print) | LCC KG608.A6 (ebook) |
 DDC 347.8/012—dc23/eng/20220429
 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022008778>
 LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022008779>

ISBN 978-1-009-09834-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy
 of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
 and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
 accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>List of Contributors</i>	xi
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
1 Working in New Political Spaces: The Checkered History of Latin American Judicialization <i>Sandra Botero, Daniel Brinks and Ezequiel Gonzalez-Ocantos</i>	I
2 Critical Disconnects: Progressive Jurisprudence and Tenacious Impunity in Mexico <i>Janice K. Gallagher and Jorge Contesse</i>	39
3 When Winning in the Courts Is Not Enough: Abortion and the Limits of Legal Mobilization without Grassroots Involvement in Peru <i>Camila Gianella</i>	66
4 Forms of Countermovement and Counter-Reform in Latin America: Judicial Backlash or Resources and Political and Legal Opportunities? <i>Alba Ruibal</i>	89
5 Backlash against State-Strengthening Reforms: The Rise and Fall of the CICIG in Guatemala <i>Rachel E. Bowen</i>	115
6 Backlash against Corporate Accountability for Grave Human Rights Violations in Colombia <i>Laura Bernal-Bermúdez</i>	139

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
7	Courting Judicial Legitimacy: An Experimental Study of the Colombian Constitutional Court <i>Sofía Forero-Alba and Juan Carlos Rodríguez-Raga</i>	164
8	Family Ties and Nepotism in the Mexican Federal Judiciary <i>Julio Ríos-Figueroa</i>	195
9	Judicial Corruption: The Constitutional Court of Ecuador in Comparative Perspective <i>Santiago Basabe-Serrano</i>	217
10	Kickbacks, Crackdown, and Backlash: Legal Accountability in the Lava Jato Investigation <i>Luciano Da Ros and Matthew M. Taylor</i>	242
11	Turning Corruption Trials into Political Tools in the Name of Transparency: The Lava Jato Case <i>Mariana Mota Prado and Marta Rodríguez Machado</i>	266
12	Fighting Corruption, Dismantling Democracy: Antagonism, Communication, and the Political Use of Lava Jato in Brazil <i>João Guilherme Bastos dos Santos and Esther Solano Gallego</i>	289
13	Prosecutorial Agency, Backlash and Resistance in the Peruvian Chapter of Lava Jato <i>Viviana Baraybar and Ezequiel Gonzalez-Ocantos</i>	314
	<i>Index</i>	341

Figures

1.1	Average number of rights in Latin American constitutions since 1975	<i>page</i> 16
1.2	Regional average levels of <i>ex ante</i> autonomy, <i>ex post</i> autonomy and authority in Latin America	17
2.1	Median caseloads per state-based MP	53
2.2	Reported intentional homicides in Mexico (1997–2017)	54
7.1	Attitudes towards the Colombian Constitutional Court (2000–2020)	169
7.2	Support for abortion in Colombia (2012)	175
7.3	Marginal effect of specific support on diffuse support, by treatment	189
8.1	Judges and judicial officials with at least one relative per judicial circuit (2015–2016)	203
8.2	Endogamic and exchange relationship by judicial circuit	208
8.3	Supreme court decisions on administrative review	211

Tables

2.1	Disappearances/enforced disappearances (2006–2018)	<i>page</i> 54
2.2	Judicial and investigatory results for disappearances committed in Nuevo León (2009–2012)	61
3.1	KL and LC cases	69
4.1	A typology of abortion countermovements in Latin America	94
7.1	Treatments: types of arguments in the court’s decision	178
7.2	Items measuring loyalty to the court (diffuse support)	179
7.3	Sociodemographic information: descriptive statistics	180
7.4	Issue attitudes: descriptive statistics	181
7.5	Institutional attitudes: descriptive statistics	182
7.6	Pairwise comparisons of levels of agreement with the court’s decision	183
7.7	Pairwise comparisons of loyalty to the court	185
7.8	Loyalty to the court by immediate support for each treatment group	186
7.9	Multivariate model: loyalty to the court (diffuse support)	188
8.1	Judicial circuits and the likelihood of nepotism	209

Contributors

Viviana Baraybar, DPhil student, Department of Politics and International Relations, University of Oxford, UK

Santiago Basabe-Serrano, Professor, Department of Political Studies, FLACSO, Ecuador

João Guilherme Bastos dos Santos, Postdoctoral researcher, Brazilian National Institute of Science and Technology for Digital Democracy, Brazil

Laura Bernal-Bermúdez, Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, Pontificia Universidad Javeriana, Colombia

Sandra Botero, Associate Professor, Faculty of International, Political and Urban Studies, Universidad del Rosario, Colombia

Rachel E. Bowen, Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, Ohio State University, USA

Daniel Brinks, Professor of Government and Law, Department of Government, University of Texas at Austin, USA

Jorge Contesse, Associate Professor, Rutgers Law School, Rutgers University, USA

Luciano Da Ros, Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology and Political Science, Federal University of Santa Catarina, Brazil

Sofia Forero-Alba, Researcher, Center for the Study of Law, Justice and Society – Dejusticia, Colombia

Janice K. Gallagher, Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, Rutgers University Newark, USA

Camila Gianella, Assistant Professor, Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú, Peru and Researcher at the Chr. Michelsen Institute, Bergen, Norway

Ezequiel Gonzalez-Ocantos, Associate Professor, Department of Politics and International Relations and Professorial Fellow, Nuffield College, University of Oxford, UK

Mariana Mota Prado, Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, Canada

Julio Ríos-Figueroa, Professor, Department of Law, ITAM, Mexico

Marta Rodriguez de Assis Machado, Professor of Law, Getúlio Vargas Foundation School of Law, Brazil

Juan Carlos Rodriguez-Raga, Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, Universidad de los Andes, Colombia

Alba Ruibal, Full-Time Researcher, National Scientific and Technological Research Council, Argentina

Esther Solano Gallego, Assistant Professor, Federal University of São Paulo, Brazil

Matthew M. Taylor, Professor, School of International Service, American University, USA

Acknowledgments

This book originated at a conference we organized in October 2019 at the Universidad del Rosario, Bogota, Colombia. As editors, we would like to thank the university's Dirección de Investigación for generously funding the project, as well as the team at the Facultad de Estudios Internacionales, Políticos y Urbanos, for helping us with the organization. At Cambridge University Press, Sara Doskow and Rachel Blaifeder gave us excellent editorial guidance throughout, and Cameron Daddis, Dhivya Elavazhagan, Jadyne Fauconier-Herry, Joan Dale Lace and Joshua Penney helped us get the manuscript across the finish line. Vicky De Negri did a wonderful job with the index.