Kripke’s Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language at 40

Saul Kripke’s *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* is one of the most celebrated and important books in philosophy of language and mind of the past forty years. It generated an avalanche of responses from the moment it was published and has revolutionized the way in which we think about meaning, intentionality, and the work of Ludwig Wittgenstein. It introduced a series of questions that had never been raised before concerning, most prominently, the normativity of meaning and the prospects for a reductionist account of meaning. This volume of new essays reassesses the continuing influence of Kripke’s book and demonstrates that many of the issues first raised by Kripke, both exegetical and philosophical, remain as thought-provoking and as relevant as they were when he first introduced them.

Claudine Verheggen is Professor of Philosophy at York University, Toronto. She is the coauthor (with Robert Myers) of *Donald Davidson’s Triangulation Argument: A Philosophical Inquiry* (2016) and the editor of *Wittgenstein and Davidson on Language, Thought, and Action* (Cambridge University Press, 2017).
Cambridge Philosophical Anniversaries

The volumes in this series reflect on classic philosophy books from the second half of the twentieth century, assessing their achievements, their influence on the field, and their lasting significance.

Titles Published in This Series

Kripke’s *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* at 40
Edited by Claudine Verheggen

Kuhn’s *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* at 60
Edited by K. Brad Wray

MacIntyre’s *After Virtue* at 40
Edited by Tom Angier

Rawls’s *A Theory of Justice* at 50
Edited by Paul Weithman

Cavell’s *Must We Mean What We Say?* at 50
Edited by Greg Chase, Juliet Floyd, and Sandra Laugier

This list can also be seen at www.cambridge.org/cpa
Kripke’s *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* at 40

*Edited by*

Claudine Verheggen

*York University, Toronto*
In memory of Barry Stroud
Contents

List of Contributors  ix
Acknowledgments  x

Introduction  1
CLAUDINE VERHEGGEN

1 Kripke’s Wittgenstein’s Skepticism about Rules and Meaning: In Defense of the Standard Interpretation  14
ALEXANDER MILLER

2 Putting Wittgenstein Back into Kripkenstein: Meaning Skepticism and Knowing How to Go On  35
HANNAH GINSBORG

3 Answering Kripke’s Skeptic: Dispositions without ‘Dispositionalism’  55
HENRY JACKMAN

4 Wittgensteinean Notions of Uniformity and Kripkensteinean Skepticism  69
JAMES R. SHAW

5 Wittgenstein’s Naturalism and the Skeptical Paradox  87
MARIE MCGINN

6 Kripke and Wittgenstein on Rules and Meaning  107
GARY EBBS

7 Semantic Normativity, Properly So Called  124
DANIEL WHITTING

8 What Is the Skeptical Problem? Wittgenstein’s Response to Kripke  142
CLAUDINE VERHEGGEN
Contents

9 How Not to Brush Questions under the Rug 163
   OLIVIA SULTANESCU

10 Quadders and Zombies: A Kripkean Argument
   against Physicalism 181
   ANANDI HATTIANGADI

11 Communitarianism, Interpersonalism, and Individualism
   in Kripke’s “Skeptical Solution” 201
   CHRISTOPHER CAMPBELL

12 “Considered in Isolation” 220
   ARIF AHMED

13 The Meaning of Meaning Ascriptions: Assertibility
   Conditions and Meaning Facts 238
   JOSÉ L. ZALABARDO

Bibliography 259
Index 274
Contributors

ARIF AHMED University of Cambridge
CHRISTOPHER CAMPBELL York University, Toronto
GARY EBBS Indiana University Bloomington
HANNAH GINSBORG University of California, Berkeley
ANANDI HATTIANGADI Stockholm University
HENRY JACKMAN York University, Toronto
MARIE MCGINN University of York, York
ALEXANDER MILLER University of Otago
JAMES R. SHAW University of Pittsburgh
OLIVIA SULTANESCU Concordia University
CLAUDINE VERHEGGEN York University, Toronto
DANIEL WHITING University of Southampton
JOSÉ L. ZALABARDO University College London
I am very grateful to the authors for their contributions to this volume, all of which demonstrate that Kripke, in the spirit of Wittgenstein, continues to provoke new thought-provoking thoughts. I also want to thank the participants in a workshop on Kripke’s *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* at 40, which I organized at York University, Toronto, in June 2022, and the Department of Philosophy for sponsoring it. Preparation of the volume was made possible in part by a Research Leader Release from the Faculty of Liberal Arts and Professional Studies at York University and a Small Research Grant from York University. Thanks are also due to my editor, Hilary Gaskin, for first encouraging me to put together this volume for the Cambridge Philosophical Anniversaries series and for her support throughout the whole process. Finally, I am grateful to Nathan Malcomson, Robert Myers, and Olivia Sultanescu for their help with the preparation of the volume.

I dedicate this book to the memory of Barry Stroud, who taught me much about Wittgenstein and philosophy, and who, I think, even though (or perhaps because) he often disagreed with Kripke’s interpretation of Wittgenstein, would have found this book congenial, as it fulfills Wittgenstein’s (and, I think, Kripke’s) goal not to spare people the trouble of thinking but to stimulate them to thoughts of their own. I am sorry that neither he nor Kripke lived to see it.