The Classical and Christian Origins of American Politics

There has been a considerable amount of literature in the last 70 years claiming that the American founders were steeped in modern thought. This study runs counter to that tradition, arguing that the founders of America were deeply indebted to the classical Christian natural-law tradition for their fundamental theological, moral, and political outlook. Evidence for this thesis is found in case studies of such leading American founders as Thomas Jefferson and James Wilson, the pamphlet debates, the founders' invocation of providence during the revolution, and their understanding of popular sovereignty. The authors go on to reflect on how the founders' political thought contained within it the resources that undermined, in principle, the institution of slavery, and explores the relevance of the founders' political theology for contemporary politics. This timely, important book makes a significant contribution to the scholarly debate over whether the American founding is compatible with traditional Christianity.

Kody W. Cooper is UC Foundation Assistant Professor of Political Science and Public Service at the University of Tennessee, Chattanooga.

Justin Buckley Dyer is Professor of Government and Jack G. Taylor Regents Professor at the University of Texas at Austin.

The Classical and Christian Origins of American Politics

Political Theology, Natural Law, and the American Founding

KODY W. COOPER University of Tennessee at Chattanooga

JUSTIN BUCKLEY DYER *University of Texas at Austin*



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009098113 DOI: 10.1017/9781009106030

© Kody W. Cooper and Justin Buckley Dyer 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

18вn 978-1-009-09811-3 Hardback 18вn 978-1-009-10784-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

> For Cormac James, Belén Elizabeth, Perpetua Rose, Campion Thomas, Felicity Clare, Sebastian Sixtus, Zélie Grace, and Bosco Joseph Paul —KWC

For Lincoln Christine

—JBD

Contents

List	t of Figures	<i>page</i> ix
Acknowledgments		xi
I	Introduction: Classical and Christian Origins	I
2	God and Nature's Law in the Pamphlet Debates	29
3	Thomas Jefferson, Nature's God, and the Theological Foundations of Natural-Rights Republicanism	75
4	Reason, Revelation, and Revolution	99
5	Providence and Natural Law in the War for Independence	122
6	Reason, Will, and Popular Sovereignty	156
7	The Law of Nature in James Wilson's Lectures on Law	189
8	Conclusion: Classical Christian Natural Law and the American	
	Political Order	210
Index		239

vii

Figures

1.1 James Wilson's taxonomy of law7.1 Richard Hooker's taxonomy of law

page 8 199

Acknowledgments

As Benjamin Franklin observed in the 1737 edition of *Poor Richard's Almanack*, "there is no better relation than a prudent and faithful Friend." Our friendship stretches back to childhood and extends through our time together in graduate school at the University of Texas at Austin and now to this joint intellectual project we have labored over for the past several years. Each of us is blessed to have in the other such a prudent and faithful friend, and we are grateful for the time we have spent thinking, talking, debating, and writing together.

We are jointly appreciative for the sage advice and friendly criticism from J. Budziszewski, Jeffrey Tulis, Paul DeHart, Kevin Stuart, Matthew Wright, Nicholas Drummond, Allen Hertzke, and Glenn Moots. Three anonymous reviewers also provided helpful criticism and feedback on various parts of this project. On the publishing side, Robert Dreesen and the editorial team at Cambridge University Press have been a pleasure to work with.

Parts of this book grew out of material previously published in *Politics & Religion, American Political Thought, Duquesne Law Review*, and *Federalist Society Review*. We acknowledge permission to build on that material here. As a coauthored project, we have also amassed our own individual debts.

Kody thanks Shilo Brooks and everyone at the Benson Center for the Study of Western Civilization at the University of Colorado–Boulder for research support necessary to complete final revisions and edits, and he especially thanks the other 2021 Summer Fellows at the Benson Center: Jeremy Fortier, Christie Maloyed, Lisa Gilson, David and Allison Levy, Owen Anderson, Paul Ulrich, and Laura Jenkins for their helpful feedback on the project. He also extends a special thanks to Jedd and Cassie Martin for their warm Colorado hospitality and joyful embrace of the chaos that comes with hosting a family of nine for a month. This project would not have come to completion without you! Kody is grateful as well for the support from the University of Tennessee at

xi

xii

Acknowledgments

Chattanooga, including support from the Ruth S. Holmberg grant, the Summer Writing Stipend, and the warm advice and encouragement from colleagues at the Department of Political Science and Public Service. Finally, he is thankful for the unconditional love and unfailing support from his family.

During the final stages of this book's production, Justin returned from the University of Missouri to the University of Texas at Austin, where he had completed his PhD. He thanks his colleagues, new and old, for their support. Mizzou's Kinder Institute on Constitutional Democracy was a wonderful place to pursue answers to the questions raised in this book, and he remains ever grateful to Rich and Nancy Kinder for making that interdisciplinary and interideological project possible. Over the last several years, he has been invited to share parts of this research at the Natural Law Workshop at the UC Berkeley School of Law, at the Symposium on Truth and the Law at Duquesne University School of Law, and at various meetings and events organized by the James Wilson Institute. For the opportunity to do so, he thanks John Yoo, Steve Hayward, Janice Rogers Brown, Bruce Ledewitz, Heidi Li Feldman, Hadley Arkes, and Garrett Snedeker. For research assistance and help with graphic design and cover ideas, he thanks Bailey Martin and Allison Smythe, respectively. Finally, he is grateful for the steadfast love and encouragement of his wife, Kyle, and their children, Bennett, Pierce, and Lincoln.