

## Kripke's *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* at 40

Saul Kripke's *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* is one of the most celebrated and important books in philosophy of language and mind of the past forty years. It generated an avalanche of responses from the moment it was published and has revolutionized the way in which we think about meaning, intentionality, and the work of Ludwig Wittgenstein. It introduced a series of questions that had never been raised before concerning, most prominently, the normativity of meaning and the prospects for a reductionist account of meaning. This volume of new essays reassesses the continuing influence of Kripke's book and demonstrates that many of the issues first raised by Kripke, both exegetical and philosophical, remain as thought-provoking and as relevant as they were when he first introduced them.

Claudine Verheggen is Professor of Philosophy at York University, Toronto. She is the coauthor (with Robert Myers) of *Donald Davidson's Triangulation Argument: A Philosophical Inquiry* (2016) and the editor of *Wittgenstein and Davidson on Language, Thought, and Action* (Cambridge University Press, 2017).

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-09688-1 — Kripke's Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language at 40  
Edited by Claudine Verheggen  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*Cambridge Philosophical Anniversaries*

The volumes in this series reflect on classic philosophy books from the second half of the twentieth century, assessing their achievements, their influence on the field, and their lasting significance.

**Titles Published in This Series**

Kripke's *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* at 40  
Edited by Claudine Verheggen

Kuhn's *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* at 60  
Edited by K. Brad Wray

MacIntyre's *After Virtue* at 40  
Edited by Tom Angier

Rawls's *A Theory of Justice* at 50  
Edited by Paul Weithman

Cavell's *Must We Mean What We Say?* at 50  
Edited by Greg Chase, Juliet Floyd, and Sandra Laugier

This list can also be seen at [www.cambridge.org/cpa](http://www.cambridge.org/cpa)

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-09688-1 — Kripke's Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language at 40  
Edited by Claudine Verheggen  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# Kripke's *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* at 40

---

*Edited by*  
**Claudine Verheggen**  
*York University, Toronto*



Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-09688-1 — Kripke's Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language at 40  
Edited by Claudine Verheggen  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781009096881](http://www.cambridge.org/9781009096881)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009099103

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2024

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2024

First paperback edition 2025

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-1-009-09821-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-09688-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-009-09688-1 — Kripke's Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language at 40

Edited by Claudine Verheggen

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

---

In memory of Barry Stroud

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page ix</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>x</i>
Introduction CLAUDINE VERHEGGEN	1
1 Kripke's Wittgenstein's Skepticism about Rules and Meaning: In Defense of the Standard Interpretation ALEXANDER MILLER	14
2 Putting Wittgenstein Back into Kripkenstein: Meaning Skepticism and Knowing How to Go On HANNAH GINSBORG	35
3 Answering Kripke's Skeptic: Dispositions without 'Dispositionalism' HENRY JACKMAN	55
4 Wittgensteinean Notions of Uniformity and Kripkensteinean Skepticism JAMES R. SHAW	69
5 Wittgenstein's Naturalism and the Skeptical Paradox MARIE MCGINN	87
6 Kripke and Wittgenstein on Rules and Meaning GARY EBBS	107
7 Semantic Normativity, Properly So Called DANIEL WHITING	124
8 What Is the Skeptical Problem? Wittgenstein's Response to Kripke CLAUDINE VERHEGGEN	142
	vii

viii	Contents	
9	How Not to Brush Questions under the Rug OLIVIA SULTANESCU	163
10	Quadders and Zombies: A Kripkean Argument against Physicalism ANANDI HATTIANGADI	181
11	Communitarianism, Interpersonalism, and Individualism in Kripke's "Skeptical Solution" CHRISTOPHER CAMPBELL	201
12	"Considered in Isolation" ARIF AHMED	220
13	The Meaning of Meaning Ascriptions: Assertibility Conditions and Meaning Facts JOSÉ L. ZALABARDO	238
	<i>Bibliography</i>	259
	<i>Index</i>	274

## Contributors

---

- ARIF AHMED *University of Cambridge*  
CHRISTOPHER CAMPBELL *York University, Toronto*  
GARY EBBS *Indiana University Bloomington*  
HANNAH GINSBORG *University of California, Berkeley*  
ANANDI HATTIANGADI *Stockholm University*  
HENRY JACKMAN *York University, Toronto*  
MARIE MCGINN *University of York, York*  
ALEXANDER MILLER *University of Otago*  
JAMES R. SHAW *University of Pittsburgh*  
OLIVIA SULTANESCU *Concordia University*  
CLAUDINE VERHEGGEN *York University, Toronto*  
DANIEL WHITING *University of Southampton*  
JOSÉ L. ZALABARDO *University College London*



## Acknowledgments

---

I am very grateful to the authors for their contributions to this volume, all of which demonstrate that Kripke, in the spirit of Wittgenstein, continues to provoke new thought-provoking thoughts. I also want to thank the participants in a workshop on Kripke's *Wittgenstein on Rules and Private Language* at 40, which I organized at York University, Toronto, in June 2022, and the Department of Philosophy for sponsoring it. Preparation of the volume was made possible in part by a Research Leader Release from the Faculty of Liberal Arts and Professional Studies at York University and a Small Research Grant from York University. Thanks are also due to my editor, Hilary Gaskin, for first encouraging me to put together this volume for the Cambridge Philosophical Anniversaries series and for her support throughout the whole process. Finally, I am grateful to Nathan Malcomson, Robert Myers, and Olivia Sultanesco for their help with the preparation of the volume.

I dedicate this book to the memory of Barry Stroud, who taught me much about Wittgenstein and philosophy, and who, I think, even though (or perhaps because) he often disagreed with Kripke's interpretation of Wittgenstein, would have found this book congenial, as it fulfills Wittgenstein's (and, I think, Kripke's) goal not to spare people the trouble of thinking but to stimulate them to thoughts of their own. I am sorry that neither he nor Kripke lived to see it.