

Cambridge University Press
978-1-009-06984-7 — Mortal and Divine in Early Greek Epistemology
Shaul Tor
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

MORTAL AND DIVINE IN EARLY GREEK EPISTEMOLOGY

This book demonstrates that we need not choose between seeing so-called Presocratic thinkers as rational philosophers or as religious sages. In particular, it rethinks fundamentally the emergence of systematic epistemology and reflection on speculative inquiry in Hesiod, Xenophanes and Parmenides. Shaul Tor argues that different forms of reasoning, and different models of divine disclosure, play equally integral, harmonious and mutually illuminating roles in early Greek epistemology. Throughout, the book relates these thinkers to their religious, literary and historical surroundings. It is thus also, and inseparably, a study of poetic inspiration, divination, mystery initiation, metempsychosis and other early Greek attitudes to the relations and interactions between mortal and divine. The engagements of early philosophers with such religious attitudes present us with complex combinations of criticisms and creative appropriations. Indeed, the early milestones of philosophical epistemology studied here themselves reflect an essentially theological enterprise and, as such, one aspect of Greek religion.

SHAUL TOR is Lecturer in Ancient Philosophy in the Departments of Classics and Philosophy, King's College London.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-009-06984-7 — Mortal and Divine in Early Greek Epistemology
Shaul Tor
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE CLASSICAL STUDIES

General Editors

R. G. OSBORNE, W. M. BEARD, G. BETEGH,
J. P. T. CLACKSON, R. L. HUNTER, M. J. MILLETT,
S. P. OAKLEY, T. J. G. WHITMARSH

Cambridge University Press
978-1-009-06984-7 — Mortal and Divine in Early Greek Epistemology
Shaul Tor
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

MORTAL AND DIVINE IN EARLY GREEK
EPISTEMOLOGY

A Study of Hesiod, Xenophanes and Parmenides

SHAUL TOR
King's College London



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-009-06984-7 — Mortal and Divine in Early Greek Epistemology
 Shaul Tor
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009069847

DOI: 10.1017/9781139235747

© Faculty of Classics, University of Cambridge 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

NAMES: Tor, Shaul, author.

TITLE: Mortal and divine in early Greek epistemology : a study of Hesiod, Xenophanes, and Parmenides / Shaul Tor, King's College London.

DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Series: Cambridge classical studies | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2017039153 | ISBN 9781107028166 (alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Pre-Socratic philosophers. | Knowledge, Theory of. | Hesiod. | Xenophanes, approximately 570 B.C.-approximately 478 B.C. | Parmenides.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC B200.K45 T67 2017 | DDC 182—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017039153>

ISBN 978-1-107-02816-6 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-06984-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-009-06984-7 — Mortal and Divine in Early Greek Epistemology
Shaul Tor
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

לאמי מורתי
To my mother and teacher

CONTENTS

<i>Preface and Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xii
Introduction	
1	1
1.1	10
1.2	19
1.3	36
1.4	48
1.5	52
2	61
2.1	65
2.2	72
2.3	90
2.4	95
3	104
3.1	108
3.2	116
3.3	128
3.4	133
3.5	144
Introduction to the Chapters on Parmenides	
4	155
4.1	163
4.2	169
4.3	183
4.4	196
4.5	215
	vii

Contents

5	How Could Parmenides Have Written <i>Alêtheia</i> ?	222
5.1	Recap and Introduction: Some Resolutions of the Paradoxical Implications of Parmenides' Theory of Human Cognition	222
5.2	Parmenides on the Soul: Hot Metempsychosis and the Physiology of Divinisation	227
5.3	The Proem in Its Time and Place	250
5.4	Conclusions: How Could Parmenides Have Written <i>Alêtheia</i> ?	277
5.5	The Ontological Question; Being, Intelligence and Intelligibility in <i>Alêtheia</i>	285
6	Retrospect and Prospect	309
6.1	Interrelations	309
6.2	The <i>daimôn</i> and Muse of Empedocles	318
6.3	Final Remarks: Reason and Revelation, Philosophy and Religion Again	339
	<i>Appendix</i>	347
	<i>Bibliography</i>	360
	<i>Index Locorum</i>	387
	<i>General Index</i>	399

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The roots of this book are in a Cambridge University doctoral thesis, and my first and foremost thanks go to my supervisors, Malcolm Schofield and Robert Wardy. They guided my efforts throughout that treacherous leg of my career with humbling wisdom and knowledge, devoted care, critical but always open-minded insight and unfailing encouragement and patience. In the years since, I was extraordinarily fortunate to receive the same kind and generous support also from David Sedley and Gábor Betegh, who went far beyond the call of duty for doctoral examiners and who likewise were always there to comment on drafts, give a word of advice or puzzle over some ancient texts. I am profoundly grateful to them all.

It will be impossible to detail my debt to all the others who have read or heard my work and to the many conversations from which it has benefited. I must mention George Boys-Stones, István Bodnár, Patricia Curd, Harvey Lederman, James Leshner, Geoffrey Lloyd, Catherine Rowett and James Warren, all of whom kindly read and helpfully commented on earlier drafts of different chapters. In particular, Robin Osborne, Hannah Willey and (again) Gábor Betegh read through the entire manuscript and made invaluable suggestions. None of these people should of course be held responsible for the results. In one form or another, I presented parts of the book at conferences and seminars in Cambridge, London, Glasgow, Durham, St Andrews, Budapest, Prague and Leiden. I owe much to comments from the audiences on those occasions. I am very grateful also to Michael Sharp from Cambridge University Press, for his seemingly inexhaustible reserves of patience and expert advice.

I could not ask for better or more thought-provoking teachers, colleagues and students than the ones I have had in Cambridge (as a student in St John's College and a Junior Research Fellow in

Preface and Acknowledgements

Jesus College) and London (as a lecturer in King's College London). Above all, the ancient philosophy seminars in both institutions – and the ancient philosophy communities in both cities more broadly – have provided a most stimulating and nourishing working environment, and one which I hold dear. I owe also a particular and longstanding debt of gratitude to David Butterfield for his ever generous help, advice and friendship, and for his inspiring example, throughout our years in Cambridge together.

The earliest (doctoral) phases of this study were funded by a St John's College Henry Arthur Thomas Scholarship, an Overseas Research Studentship and an Overseas Trust Bursary. Later stages of the project were made possible by Jesus College Cambridge and King's College London. A period of sabbatical leave granted by the latter was instrumental. I am grateful to those bodies for making my research possible.

I endeavoured to make this book as welcoming as possible to non-expert and Greek-less readers. This was easier to achieve fully in some sections than in others, where the argument is unavoidably more technical. Even in those places, though, I have tried to make the discussion as accessible as possible. I have restricted to the notes issues that some readers may legitimately wish to skip but others perhaps will not, and which would otherwise have disrupted the flow of the text. I have transliterated into English characters important individual Greek words or even brief phrases, when I felt that this might help the Greek-less reader to assess the argument or be interesting for them.

Translations from Greek and Latin sources are in general my own or modified, but I regularly consulted and made liberal use of existing translations. In particular, translations of Hesiod generally follow Most (2006), translations of Xenophanes follow Leshner (1992), translations of Parmenides follow Coxon (2009), Palmer (2009) and Graham (2010) and translations of Empedocles follow Inwood (2001). For these and other pre-Socratics, I also consulted and drew on the translations in KRS (1983) and Curd and McKirahan (2011).

An earlier and shorter version of Chapter 3 was previously published as Tor (2013a). The most central ideas in Chapters 4

Preface and Acknowledgements

and 5 were published in much abridged form in Tor (2015). Everything has been expanded, elaborated, rewritten and revised.

During the long process of writing this book, my family gave me the same unconditional and indispensable love and encouragement that they always have. My mother, Michal Arbell-Tor, has been, throughout those years and for as long as I can remember, an unfailingly interested, exercising and exciting person with whom to think and argue about the intellectual questions that preoccupied me. There is no question that it is because of her (and not just for the obvious reasons) that I have ended up doing what I do and in the way that I do it. Finally and most importantly, I thank again Hannah, this time not as the inimitable reader and interlocutor that she is, but as the wonderful partner that she is. Without her love and support I could not imagine this book or my life, nor would I care to.

ABBREVIATIONS

Further to the conventions and works listed below, I follow the abbreviations in the *Oxford Classical Dictionary* (4th edn).

- | | |
|-----------|---|
| Alexander | Alexander, P. J. (1967) <i>The Oracle of Baalbek: the Tiburtine Sibyl in Greek Dress</i> . Washington, DC. |
| Beckby | Beckby, H. (1957–1958) <i>Anthologia Graeca</i> , 2nd edn, 4 vols. Munich. |
| Bernabé | Bernabé, A. (2004–2007) <i>Poetae Epici Graeci: Testimonia et Fragmenta. Pars II. Orphicorum et Orphicis Similium Testimonia et Fragmenta</i> . Munich. |
| Campbell | Campbell, D. A. (1982) <i>Greek Lyric I: Sappho and Alcaeus</i> . Cambridge, MA. |
| Chilton | Chilton, C. W. (1967) <i>Diogenis Oenoandensis Fragmenta</i> . Leipzig. |
| DG | Diels, H. (1879) <i>Doxographi Graeci</i> . Berlin. |
| Drachmann | Drachmann, A. B. (1903–1927) <i>Scholia Vetera in Pindari Carmina</i> , 3 vols. Leipzig. |
| Dübner | Dübner, F. (1969) <i>Scholia Graeca in Aristophanem</i> . Hildesheim. |
| Düring | Düring, I. (1961) <i>Aristotle's Protrepticus</i> . Stockholm. |
| Gaisford | Gaisford, T. (1962) <i>Etymologicum Magnum</i> . Amsterdam. |
| GJ | Graf, F. and Johnston, S. I. (2013) <i>Ritual Texts for the Afterlife: Orpheus and the Bacchic Gold Tablets</i> , 2nd edn, London. |
| Gregorio | Di Gregorio, L. (1975) <i>Scholia Vetera in Hesiodi Theogoniam</i> . Milan. |
| Hilgard | Hilgard, A. (1965) <i>Grammatici Graeci</i> , vol. IV.1–2. Hildesheim. |

List of Abbreviations

Irigoin	Irigoin, J. (1993) <i>Bacchylide. Dithyrambes, Épinicies, Fragments</i> . Paris.
Isnardi Parente	Isnardi Parente, M. (1982) <i>Senocrate – Ermodoro: frammenti</i> . Napoli.
Kindstrand	Kindstrand, J. F. (1990) [<i>Plutarchi</i>] <i>De Homero</i> . Leipzig.
Latte	Latte, K. (1953) <i>Hesychii Alexandrini Lexicon</i> , vol. I. Copenhagen.
Lentz	Lentz, A. (1965) <i>Grammatici Graeci</i> , vol. III. 1–2. Hildesheim.
M	Maehler, H. (2001) <i>Pindari Carmina cum Fragmentis. Pars II. Fragmenta</i> . Leipzig.
Müller	Müller, K. (1965) <i>Geographi Graeci Minores</i> , vol. II. Hildesheim.
Papageorgius	Papageorgius, P. N. (1888) <i>Scholia in Sophoclis Tragoedias Vetera</i> . Leipzig.
Parke	Parke, H. W. (1967) <i>The Oracles of Zeus: Dodona, Olympia, Ammon</i> . Oxford.
Pertusi	Pertusi, A. (1955) <i>Scholia Vetera in Hesiodi Opera et Dies</i> . Milan.
Pfeiffer	Pfeiffer, R. (1949) <i>Callimachus</i> , vol. I. Oxford.
PW	Parke, H. W. and Wormell, D. E. W. (1956) <i>The Delphic Oracle</i> , vol. II: <i>The Oracular Responses</i> . Oxford.
Rabe	Rabe, H. (1906) <i>Scholia in Lucianum</i> . Leipzig.
Rose	Rose, V. (1967) <i>Aristotelis Qui Ferebantur Librorum Fragmenta</i> . Stuttgart.
Sandbach	Sandbach, F. H. (1967) <i>Plutarchi Moralia</i> , vol. VII. Leipzig.
Scheer	Scheer, E. (1958) <i>Lycophronis Alexandra</i> , vol. II. Berlin.
Smith	Smith, M. F. (1993) <i>Diogenes of Oenoanda: the Epicurean Inscription</i> . Naples.
Usener	Usener, H. (1963) <i>Epicurea</i> . Rome.
Wendel	Wendel, K. (1974) <i>Scholia in Apollonium Rhodium Vetera</i> . Berlin.