

Contents

Acknowledgements	page xiii
Table of Cases	XV
European	XV
European Court of Human Rights	XV
European Committee of Social Rights	xviii
International	xix
UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies	xix
Other International Cases	XX
List of Abbreviations	xxi
Introduction	1
I.1 Preliminary Definitions: Irregular Migrants	
and the Right to Health	4
I.2 The Contours of This Human Rights Analysis:	
International Law and Public Health	7
I.3 The Plan of This Book	11
Sovereignty and the Human Rights of Irregular Migrants	15
1.1 Sovereignty and Human Rights Obligations	16
1.1.1 State Sovereignty in International Law	16
1.1.2 Human Rights Law	19
1.1.3 The Mutual Impact of Sovereignty and Human Righ	ts 21
1.2 Migrants: Between Sovereignty and Human Rights	24
1.2.1 Migrants and Sovereignty	24
1.2.2 Migrant Rights or Human Rights?	27
1.2.2.1 International Law and the Standards	
of Civilisation	27
1.2.2.2 Human Rights for Migrants	20



vi Contents

	on the Human Rights of Migrants with Irregular or	
	Precarious Status	34
	1.3.1 Instances of Immigration Cases before the	
	Strasbourg Court	34
	1.3.1.1 The Prohibition of Refoulement and	
	Collective Expulsions	36
	1.3.1.2 The Right to Personal Liberty and to Fair	
	and Decent Conditions of Detention	
	and Living	40
	1.3.1.3 The Protection of Family Life	42
	1.3.2 A Glimpse at the UN Treaty Bodies' Jurisprudence	
	Concerning Migrant Human Rights	45
	1.3.2.1 Authoritative Interpretative Statements	
	on the Rights of Migrants	45
	1.3.2.2 Jurisprudential Trends from Treaty Bodies'	17
	Communication Procedures	47
	1.3.3 The Different Approaches of European and	• •
	International Case Law	51
	1.4 Explicit Limitations on the Rights of Irregular Migrants	
	in Human Rights Treaty Provisions	52
	1.4.1 The Convention on Migrant Workers	52
	1.4.2 The European Social Charter	53
	1.5 Broadening Contextual Reflections on Migrant Rights	56
	1.5.1 The Pro-migrant Approach of the Inter-American	
	System of Human Rights	56
	1.5.2 The Global Compact for Migration	57
	1.6 Conclusions	59
		,
2	The Normative Contours of a Vulnerability- and	
	Equity-Oriented Right to Health	61
	2.1 The Origins of Health as a Social Interest in the Last	
	Two Centuries	62
	2.2 Early Proclamations of the Right to Health, Sovereignty	
	and the Universalisation of Social Rights as Human Rights	65
	2.3 Philosophical Justifications for the Right to Health	70
	2.4 The Right to the Highest Attainable Standard of Health	
	in the Context of the ICESCR	75
	2.4.1 A Textual Analysis of Article 12 ICESCR in the Light	
	of Its Travaux Préparatoires	77

1.3 Trends in the European and International Jurisprudence



Contents	Vii
2.4.2 The Normative Content of the International Right	
to Health and the Correlative State Obligations	80
2.4.2.1 The Complex Scope of the Right to Health	81
2.4.2.2 The 'Tripartite Typology'	82
2.4.2.3 The AAAQ-AP Framework	83
2.4.2.4 The Core Framework	85
2.4.2.5 International Meta-legal Health Standards:	
Primary Health Care and Universal	
Health Coverage	89
2.5 International Monitoring and Accountability	
for Protecting the Right to Health	94
2.5.1 State Reporting before the CESCR	95
2.5.2 The Justiciability of Socioeconomic Rights	
and the Optional Protocol to the ICESCR	99
2.5.3 A Sample of the Health-Related Views of the	
CEDAW Committee	102
2.5.4 The Contribution of the UN Charter–	
Based Mechanisms	104
2.5.5 Preliminary Conclusions	106
2.6 European Human Rights Law and the Right to Health	107
2.6.1 The Strasbourg Court's Case Law: Health System	0
Deficiencies and Regulatory Obligations	108
2.6.2 The ESC: European 'Averages' and	
Socioeconomic Protection	112
2.7 The Principle of Non-discrimination, Vulnerable Groups	
and the Right to Health	115
2.7.1 Equality, Non-discrimination and Marginalisation	115
2.7.2 What Is Vulnerability in Human Rights?	118
2.7.3 Non-discrimination and Vulnerability for the CESCR, the ECtHR and the ECSR	
2.7.4 Non-discrimination and Health	120
2.7.4 Non-discrimination and Health 2.8 Conclusions	123
2.5 Conclusions	125
The Right to Health Care of Irregular Migrants: Between	
Primary Care and Emergency Treatment	128
3.1 Irregular Migrants: Between Exclusionary Measures	
and Vulnerability	129
3.1.1 A Brief Recapitulation of the State Sovereignty	,
Approach to Irregular Migration	129
3.1.2 Irregular Migrants and Their Vulnerability to Human	,
Rights Abuse	131

3



viii Contents

3.2	European Human Rights Approaches to Health Care for	
	Irregular Migrants	135
	3.2.1 The ECtHR: Stretching a Constrained	
	Material Competence	135
	3.2.2 The ECSR: Between Interpretative Courage	
	and Limitations of Mandate	139
3.3	International Human Rights Law and Levels of Health	
	Care for Migrants with Irregular Status as	
	Vulnerable People	140
	3.3.1 The Human Rights Committee: Urgent Care	
	and the Right to Life	141
	3.3.2 The Committee on Economic Social and Cultural	
	Rights: Irregular Migrants and the Typologies	
	on Right to Health Obligations	143
	3.3.3 Non-discrimination in the Enjoyment of the Right	
	to Health as a Core Obligation of Immediate Nature	146
	3.3.3.1 Emergency Treatment, Non-discrimination	
	and Rights Limitations	146
	3.3.3.2 Core Obligations, Non-discrimination	
	and the Levels of Accessible Care	150
	3.3.3.3 What Is 'Essential' Primary Health Care?	154
3.4	Levelling-up Developments	156
	3.4.1 Vulnerable Migrants and Their Protection	
	in Economic and Health Crises	157
	3.4.1.1 The CESCR's Approach vis-à-vis the Financial	
	and Economic Crisis: Non-retrogression	
	and Non-discrimination	158
	3.4.1.2 The ECSR and Austerity in Europe	160
	3.4.1.3 The COVID-19 Pandemic and Vulnerability-	
	Targeted Measures	160
	3.4.2 'Firewalls' to Guarantee the Effective Enjoyment	
	of Health Services by Irregular Migrants	163
	3.4.3 The Most Vulnerable Situations among	
	Vulnerable Migrants	166
	3.4.3.1 The Right to Health Care for All	
	Migrant Children	167
	3.4.3.2 Gender Equality and Sexual and Reproductive	
	Health for Migrant Women and Girls	169
3.5	Conclusions	171



> The Determinants of the Health of Irregular Migrants: Between Interrelatedness and Power 173 4.1 Conceptual Analysis of the Applicability of the Determinants of Health Approach for Irregular Migrants in Human Rights and Public Health 175 4.1.1 Enabling Arguments: (a) The Interdisciplinary Recognition of the Determinants of Health 175 4.1.2 Enabling Arguments: (b) Vulnerability and the Determinants of Health 178 4.1.3 Enabling Arguments: (c) Interrelated Rights and Intersectoral Measures 179 4.1.4 Conceptual Obstacles: (a) Immigration, Policy Models and Welfare Rights 180 4.1.5 Conceptual Obstacles: (b) The Effects of Power Constructs on the Rights of Irregular Migrants 184 4.1.6 Empowering Irregular Migrants with Indivisible Rights? From Theory to Human Rights Practice 187 4.2 European Human Rights Frameworks: From Constrained to Implicit Consideration of the Determinants of Health of Irregular Migrants 188 4.2.1 The Sovereignty-Constrained Case Law of the ECtHR 189 4.2.2 The Growing Jurisprudence of the ECSR 192 4.3 International Standards and UN Supervisory Bodies: Developing an Explicit Recognition of the Determinants of Health of Irregular Migrants as Human Rights 196 4.3.1 The Foundation of the Determinants of Health in Human Rights: The UDHR 196 4.3.2 Elaborating on UN Human Rights Treaties' Obligations 198 4.3.2.1 The Concluding Observations of the CESCR 198

> > 4.3.2.2 The General Comments of the CESCR

4.3.2.3 Contributions of Other UN Treaty Bodies

4.3.2.4 The Special Procedures: An Endorsement

Rights Issue

Determinants of Health

4.3.3 The Global Compact for Migration and the

for Healthy Living Environments as a Human

Contents

4.4 Conclusions

201

204

207

210

212

ix



x Contents

5	Mental Health, Irregular Migration and Human Rights: Synergising Vulnerability- and Disability-Sensitive	
	Approaches	215
	5.1 Approaching the Human Right to Mental Health in Theory	215
	and Practice	217
	5.1.1 Definitional Challenges	217
	5.1.2 Theoretical Grounding: The Concepts of Vulnerability	21/
	and Disability as Tools of Substantive Equality	223
	5.2 Mental Health and Human Rights Law	225
	5.2.1 Mental Health Regulation on Human Rights	226
	5.2.2 Human Rights Violations on Mental Health	227
	5.2.3 Synergies between Public Health and Human	/
	Rights in Right to Mental Health	228
	5.3 European Human Rights: Qualified Risks for Mental	
	Health and Emergency Approaches	231
	5.3.1 Deportation Measures and Mental Health	232
	5.3.2 Immigration Detention and Psychological Suffering	238
	5.3.3 Social Entitlements and Mental Health	241
	5.4 International Human Rights Bodies: Emphasising Mental	
	Health in Primary Care and Support Services	242
	5.4.1 Mental Health Considerations in Human	'
	Rights Violations	242
	5.4.2 Irregular Migrants' Right to Mental Health: Non-	•
	discrimination, Vulnerability and	
	Disability Arguments	246
	5.4.2.1 Mental Health in the PHC Model for	•
	Irregular Migrants	246
	5.4.2.2 Age- and Gender-Related Considerations	251
	5.4.2.3 The CRPD: A Transformative Tool for	
	Combating Multiple Sources of Discrimination	
	and Health-Related Rights Violations	254
	5.5 Conclusions	259
Соп	elusion	263
001	C.1 Main Findings: From Framework Limitations to Expansive	
	Human Rights Standards	264
	C.1.1 Chapter 1 – 'Sovereignty and the Human Rights	-~4
	of Irregular Migrants'	264
	C.1.2 Chapter 2 – 'The Normative Contours	-~7
	of a Vulnerability- and Equity-Oriented Right	
	to Health'	265
		-)



Contents	xi
C.1.3 Chapter 3 – 'The Right to Health Care of Irregular Migrants: Between Primary Care and	
Emergency Treatment'	267
C.1.4 Chapter 4 – 'The Determinants of the Health of Irregular Migrants: Between Interrelatedness	
and Power'	269
C.1.5 Chapter 5 – 'Mental Health, Irregular Migration and Human Rights: Synergising Vulnerability- and	
Disability-Sensitive Approaches' C.2 Taking a 'Final' Snapshot? Major Advances and	271
Unaddressed Issues in Relation to Ensuring	
Comprehensive Protection of All Migrants'	
Health Rights	272
Select Bibliography	277
Index	293