

## IRREGULAR MIGRANTS AND THE RIGHT TO HEALTH

In our globalised world, where inequality is deepening and migration movements are increasing, states continue to maintain strong regulatory control over immigration, health and social policies. Arguments based on state sovereignty can be employed to differentiate irregular migrants from other groups and reduce their right to physical and mental health to the provision of emergency medical care, even where resources are available. Drawing on the enabling and constraining factors of human rights law and public health, this book explores the scope and limits of the right to health of migrants in irregular situations, in international and European human rights law. Addressing these people's health solely with an exceptional medical paradigm is inconsistent with the special attention granted to people in vulnerable situations and non-discrimination in human rights, the emerging rights-based approach to disability, the social priorities of public health and the interdependence of human rights.

DR STEFANO ANGELERI is a Marie Skłodowska-Curie scholar at Queen's University Belfast and Universidad del Rosario Bogotá. Formerly he researched and lectured at the Irish Centre for Human Rights, NUI Galway where he also acted as Irish project manager for the FRANET project funded by the EU Agency for Fundamental Rights.

# Irregular Migrants and the Right to Health

**STEFANO ANGELERI**

Queen's University Belfast



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-009-05480-5 – Irregular Migrants and the Right to Health  
Stefano Angeleri  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781009054805](http://www.cambridge.org/9781009054805)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009051750

© Stefano Angeleri 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First paperback edition 2023

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-1-316-51191-6 Hardback  
ISBN 978-1-009-05480-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> xiii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
European	xv
European Court of Human Rights	xv
European Committee of Social Rights	xviii
International	xix
UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies	xix
Other International Cases	xx
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xxi
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
I.1 Preliminary Definitions: Irregular Migrants and the Right to Health	4
I.2 The Contours of This Human Rights Analysis: International Law and Public Health	7
I.3 The Plan of This Book	11
<b>1 Sovereignty and the Human Rights of Irregular Migrants</b>	<b>15</b>
1.1 Sovereignty and Human Rights Obligations	16
1.1.1 State Sovereignty in International Law	16
1.1.2 Human Rights Law	19
1.1.3 The Mutual Impact of Sovereignty and Human Rights	21
1.2 Migrants: Between Sovereignty and Human Rights	24
1.2.1 Migrants and Sovereignty	24
1.2.2 Migrant Rights or Human Rights?	27
1.2.2.1 International Law and the Standards of Civilisation	27
1.2.2.2 Human Rights for Migrants	29

1.3	Trends in the European and International Jurisprudence on the Human Rights of Migrants with Irregular or Precarious Status	34
1.3.1	Instances of Immigration Cases before the Strasbourg Court	34
1.3.1.1	The Prohibition of Refoulement and Collective Expulsions	36
1.3.1.2	The Right to Personal Liberty and to Fair and Decent Conditions of Detention and Living	40
1.3.1.3	The Protection of Family Life	42
1.3.2	A Glimpse at the UN Treaty Bodies' Jurisprudence Concerning Migrant Human Rights	45
1.3.2.1	Authoritative Interpretative Statements on the Rights of Migrants	45
1.3.2.2	Jurisprudential Trends from Treaty Bodies' Communication Procedures	47
1.3.3	The Different Approaches of European and International Case Law	51
1.4	Explicit Limitations on the Rights of Irregular Migrants in Human Rights Treaty Provisions	52
1.4.1	The Convention on Migrant Workers	52
1.4.2	The European Social Charter	53
1.5	Broadening Contextual Reflections on Migrant Rights	56
1.5.1	The Pro-migrant Approach of the Inter-American System of Human Rights	56
1.5.2	The Global Compact for Migration	57
1.6	Conclusions	59
2	<b>The Normative Contours of a Vulnerability- and Equity-Oriented Right to Health</b>	61
2.1	The Origins of Health as a Social Interest in the Last Two Centuries	62
2.2	Early Proclamations of the Right to Health, Sovereignty and the Universalisation of Social Rights as Human Rights	65
2.3	Philosophical Justifications for the Right to Health	70
2.4	The Right to the Highest Attainable Standard of Health in the Context of the ICESCR	75
2.4.1	A Textual Analysis of Article 12 ICESCR in the Light of Its <i>Travaux Préparatoires</i>	77

<i>Contents</i>		vii
2.4.2	The Normative Content of the International Right to Health and the Correlative State Obligations	80
2.4.2.1	The Complex Scope of the Right to Health	81
2.4.2.2	The ‘Tripartite Typology’	82
2.4.2.3	The AAAQ-AP Framework	83
2.4.2.4	The Core Framework	85
2.4.2.5	International Meta-legal Health Standards: Primary Health Care and Universal Health Coverage	89
2.5	International Monitoring and Accountability for Protecting the Right to Health	94
2.5.1	State Reporting before the CESCR	95
2.5.2	The Justiciability of Socioeconomic Rights and the Optional Protocol to the ICESCR	99
2.5.3	A Sample of the Health-Related Views of the CEDAW Committee	102
2.5.4	The Contribution of the UN Charter-Based Mechanisms	104
2.5.5	Preliminary Conclusions	106
2.6	European Human Rights Law and the Right to Health	107
2.6.1	The Strasbourg Court’s Case Law: Health System Deficiencies and Regulatory Obligations	108
2.6.2	The ESC: European ‘Averages’ and Socioeconomic Protection	112
2.7	The Principle of Non-discrimination, Vulnerable Groups and the Right to Health	115
2.7.1	Equality, Non-discrimination and Marginalisation	115
2.7.2	What Is Vulnerability in Human Rights?	118
2.7.3	Non-discrimination and Vulnerability for the CESCR, the ECtHR and the ECSR	120
2.7.4	Non-discrimination and Health	123
2.8	Conclusions	125
<b>3</b>	<b>The Right to Health Care of Irregular Migrants: Between Primary Care and Emergency Treatment</b>	<b>128</b>
3.1	Irregular Migrants: Between Exclusionary Measures and Vulnerability	129
3.1.1	A Brief Recapitulation of the State Sovereignty Approach to Irregular Migration	129
3.1.2	Irregular Migrants and Their Vulnerability to Human Rights Abuse	131

3.2	European Human Rights Approaches to Health Care for Irregular Migrants	135
3.2.1	The ECtHR: Stretching a Constrained Material Competence	135
3.2.2	The ECSR: Between Interpretative Courage and Limitations of Mandate	139
3.3	International Human Rights Law and Levels of Health Care for Migrants with Irregular Status as Vulnerable People	140
3.3.1	The Human Rights Committee: Urgent Care and the Right to Life	141
3.3.2	The Committee on Economic Social and Cultural Rights: Irregular Migrants and the Typologies on Right to Health Obligations	143
3.3.3	Non-discrimination in the Enjoyment of the Right to Health as a Core Obligation of Immediate Nature	146
3.3.3.1	Emergency Treatment, Non-discrimination and Rights Limitations	146
3.3.3.2	Core Obligations, Non-discrimination and the Levels of Accessible Care	150
3.3.3.3	What Is ‘Essential’ Primary Health Care?	154
3.4	Levelling-up Developments	156
3.4.1	Vulnerable Migrants and Their Protection in Economic and Health Crises	157
3.4.1.1	The CESCR’s Approach vis-à-vis the Financial and Economic Crisis: Non-retrogression and Non-discrimination	158
3.4.1.2	The ECSR and Austerity in Europe	160
3.4.1.3	The COVID-19 Pandemic and Vulnerability-Targeted Measures	160
3.4.2	‘Firewalls’ to Guarantee the Effective Enjoyment of Health Services by Irregular Migrants	163
3.4.3	The Most Vulnerable Situations among Vulnerable Migrants	166
3.4.3.1	The Right to Health Care for All Migrant Children	167
3.4.3.2	Gender Equality and Sexual and Reproductive Health for Migrant Women and Girls	169
3.5	Conclusions	171

<b>4</b>	<b>The Determinants of the Health of Irregular Migrants: Between Interrelatedness and Power</b>	<b>173</b>
4.1	Conceptual Analysis of the Applicability of the Determinants of Health Approach for Irregular Migrants in Human Rights and Public Health	175
4.1.1	Enabling Arguments: (a) The Interdisciplinary Recognition of the Determinants of Health	175
4.1.2	Enabling Arguments: (b) Vulnerability and the Determinants of Health	178
4.1.3	Enabling Arguments: (c) Interrelated Rights and Intersectoral Measures	179
4.1.4	Conceptual Obstacles: (a) Immigration, Policy Models and Welfare Rights	180
4.1.5	Conceptual Obstacles: (b) The Effects of Power Constructs on the Rights of Irregular Migrants	184
4.1.6	Empowering Irregular Migrants with Indivisible Rights? From Theory to Human Rights Practice	187
4.2	European Human Rights Frameworks: From Constrained to Implicit Consideration of the Determinants of Health of Irregular Migrants	188
4.2.1	The Sovereignty-Constrained Case Law of the ECtHR	189
4.2.2	The Growing Jurisprudence of the ECSR	192
4.3	International Standards and UN Supervisory Bodies: Developing an Explicit Recognition of the Determinants of Health of Irregular Migrants as Human Rights	196
4.3.1	The Foundation of the Determinants of Health in Human Rights: The UDHR	196
4.3.2	Elaborating on UN Human Rights Treaties' Obligations	198
4.3.2.1	The Concluding Observations of the CESCR	198
4.3.2.2	The General Comments of the CESCR	201
4.3.2.3	Contributions of Other UN Treaty Bodies	204
4.3.2.4	The Special Procedures: An Endorsement for Healthy Living Environments as a Human Rights Issue	207
4.3.3	The Global Compact for Migration and the Determinants of Health	210
4.4	Conclusions	212



<b>5</b>	<b>Mental Health, Irregular Migration and Human Rights: Synergising Vulnerability- and Disability-Sensitive Approaches</b>	<b>215</b>
5.1	Approaching the Human Right to Mental Health in Theory and Practice	217
5.1.1	Definitional Challenges	217
5.1.2	Theoretical Grounding: The Concepts of Vulnerability and Disability as Tools of Substantive Equality	223
5.2	Mental Health and Human Rights Law	225
5.2.1	Mental Health Regulation on Human Rights	226
5.2.2	Human Rights Violations on Mental Health	227
5.2.3	Synergies between Public Health and Human Rights in Right to Mental Health	228
5.3	European Human Rights: Qualified Risks for Mental Health and Emergency Approaches	231
5.3.1	Deportation Measures and Mental Health	232
5.3.2	Immigration Detention and Psychological Suffering	238
5.3.3	Social Entitlements and Mental Health	241
5.4	International Human Rights Bodies: Emphasising Mental Health in Primary Care and Support Services	242
5.4.1	Mental Health Considerations in Human Rights Violations	242
5.4.2	Irregular Migrants' Right to Mental Health: Non-discrimination, Vulnerability and Disability Arguments	246
5.4.2.1	Mental Health in the PHC Model for Irregular Migrants	246
5.4.2.2	Age- and Gender-Related Considerations	251
5.4.2.3	The CRPD: A Transformative Tool for Combating Multiple Sources of Discrimination and Health-Related Rights Violations	254
5.5	Conclusions	259
	<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>263</b>
C.1	Main Findings: From Framework Limitations to Expansive Human Rights Standards	264
C.1.1	Chapter 1 – 'Sovereignty and the Human Rights of Irregular Migrants'	264
C.1.2	Chapter 2 – 'The Normative Contours of a Vulnerability- and Equity-Oriented Right to Health'	265

<i>Contents</i>		xi
C.1.3	Chapter 3 – ‘The Right to Health Care of Irregular Migrants: Between Primary Care and Emergency Treatment’	267
C.1.4	Chapter 4 – ‘The Determinants of the Health of Irregular Migrants: Between Interrelatedness and Power’	269
C.1.5	Chapter 5 – ‘Mental Health, Irregular Migration and Human Rights: Synergising Vulnerability- and Disability-Sensitive Approaches’	271
C.2	Taking a ‘Final’ Snapshot? Major Advances and Unaddressed Issues in Relation to Ensuring Comprehensive Protection of All Migrants’ Health Rights	272
	<i>Select Bibliography</i>	277
	<i>Index</i>	293

## Acknowledgements

This book could not have come to fruition without the support and contribution of several people I have met during the last six years. A very special thank you goes to my PhD supervisor, Dr Ciara Smyth, and my postdoc mentor, Professor Siobhán Mullally, who have encouragingly pushed me to improve my academic skills throughout these years. I am very grateful to current and past postgraduate students and staff at the Irish Centre for Human Rights and School of Law of National University of Ireland, Galway, and in particular to Professor Eilionóir Flynn, Dr Noemi Magugliani and Keelin Barry for their technical and professional advice. Special mentions of acknowledgement go to Dr Rebecca Downes for her tireless proofreading activities and to Professor Audrey Chapman for her insightful feedback as external examiner of the PhD dissertation on which this book is based.

An endless thank you goes to my parents, Patrizia and Loris, and my broader family, who love me so much and have unconditionally supported my choices, even when they entailed living 2,000 km from home. Many thanks to my close friends in Galway, Milano, Cologne, Karlsruhe, Galicia, Lleida, Toronto, Dublin and Verona. I always feel at home with you around, and you have helped me to maintain good emotional health during all these years. Thanks also to my partner, Edgar. You have been so patient and loving during this book preparation, before and during pandemic times.

## Table of Cases

### EUROPEAN

#### *European Court of Human Rights*

<i>A.A. v Greece</i> App no 12186/08 (ECHR2010) .....	190
<i>A.S. v Switzerland</i> App no 39350/13 (ECHR 2015) .....	137
<i>Abdulaziz, Cabales and Balkandali v the United Kingdom</i> App nos 9214/81, 9474/81 (ECHR 1985) .....	26, 35, 43, 129
<i>Aden Amhed v Malta</i> App no 55352/12 (ECHR 2013) .....	109
<i>Aerts v Belgium</i> App no 25357/94 (ECHR 1998) .....	226
<i>Airey v Ireland</i> App no 6289/73 (ECHR 1979) .....	108, 135, 164, 189
<i>Alajos Kiss v Hungary</i> App no 38832/06 (ECHR 2010) .....	122
<i>Al-Nashif v Bulgaria</i> App no 50963/99 (ECHR 2002) .....	43
<i>Anakomba Yula v Belgium</i> App no 45413/07 (ECHR 2009) .....	184
<i>Asady and others v Slovakia</i> App no 24917/15 (ECHR 2020) .....	40
<i>Aswat v the United Kingdom</i> App no 17299/12 (ECHR 2013) .....	109, 234
<i>B. v the United Kingdom</i> App no 9840/82 (ECHR 1987) .....	42
<i>Bader and Kanbor v Sweden</i> App no 13284/04 (ECHR 2005) .....	37
<i>Bah v the United Kingdom</i> App no 56328/07 (ECHR 2011) .....	192
<i>Berrehab v the Netherlands</i> App no 10730/84 (ECHR 1988) .....	43
<i>Biao v Denmark</i> App no 38590/10 (ECHR 2014) .....	44
<i>Biao v Denmark</i> App no 38590/10 (ECHR 2016) .....	45
<i>Budina v Russia</i> App no 45603/05 (ECHR 2009) .....	189
<i>C.D. and Others v Greece</i> App nos 33441/10, 33468/10 and 33476/10 (ECHR2013) .....	189
<i>Calvelli and Ciglio v Italy</i> App no 32967/96 (ECHR 2002) .....	111
<i>Carson and Others v the United Kingdom</i> App no 42184/05 (ECHR 2010) .....	189
<i>Case ‘Relating to Certain Aspects of the Laws on the Use of Languages      in Education in Belgium’ v Belgium</i> App nos 1474/62, 1677/62, 1691/62, 1769/63, 1994/63, 2126/64 (ECHR 1968) .....	32

<i>Centre of Legal Resources on behalf of Valentin Câmpeanu v Romania</i>	
App no 47848/08 (ECHR 2014) .....	110
<i>Chahal v United Kingdom</i> App no 22414/93 (ECHR 1996) .....	37
<i>Chapman v the United Kingdom</i> App no 27238/95 (ECHR 2001) .....	122
<i>Chowdury and Others v Greece</i> App no 21884/15 (ECHR 2017) .....	5, 191
<i>Cyprus v Turkey</i> App no 25781/94 (ECHR 2001) .....	110, 138
<i>D. v the United Kingdom</i> App no 30240/96 (ECHR1997) .....	36, 37, 136, 233
<i>D.H. and others v the Czech Republic</i> App no 57325/00 (ECHR 2007) .....	122
<i>Da Conceição Mateus and Santos Januário v Portugal</i>	
App nos 62235/12, 57725/12 (ECHR 2013, Decision) .....	136
<i>De Souza Ribeiro v France</i> , App no 22689/07 (GC ECHR 2012) <i>F.H. v Greece</i> App no 78456/11 (ECHR2014) .....	57
<i>Fadeyeva v Russia</i> App no 55723/00 (ECHR 2005) .....	109
<i>Gaygusuz v Austria</i> App no 17371/90 (ECHR1996) .....	31, 32, 183, 184
<i>Guerra and Others v Italy</i> App no 14967/89 (ECHR 1998) .....	109
<i>Hirsi Jamaa and Others v Italy</i> App no 27765/09 (ECHR 2012) .....	30, 37–9
<i>Hristozov et al. v Bulgaria</i> App nos 47039/11, 358/12 (ECHR 2012) .....	110, 136
<i>Hunde v The Netherlands</i> App no 17931/16 (ECHR 2016, Decision) .....	138, 190, 191
<i>J.R. and others v Greece</i> App no 22696/16 (ECHR 2018) .....	240
<i>Jalloh v Germany</i> App no 54810/00 (ECHR 2006) .....	109
<i>James et al. v the United Kingdom</i> App no 8793/79 (ECHR1986) .....	190
<i>Jeunesse v the Netherlands</i> App no 12738/10 (ECHR 2014) .....	44
<i>Johnston and Others v Ireland</i> App no 9697/82 (ECHR 1986) .....	42
<i>K.G. v Belgium</i> App no 52548/15 (ECHR 2018) .....	239
<i>K.H. and Others v Slovakia</i> App no 32881/04 (ECHR 2009) .....	109
<i>Kaak and others v Greece</i> App no 34215/16 (ECHR 2019) .....	240
<i>Kanagaratnam v Belgium</i> App no 15297/09 (ECHR 2011) .....	240
<i>Kawka v Poland</i> App no 25874/94 (ECHR 2001) .....	226
<i>Khan v France</i> App no 12267/16 (ECHR 2019) .....	42
<i>Khlaifia and Others v Italy</i> App no 16483/12 (ECHR 2015) and (ECHR 2016) .....	39–41, 132, 138, 191
<i>Kiyutin v Russia</i> App no 2700/10 (ECHR 2011) .....	109, 122–4
<i>Kudła v Poland</i> App no 30210/96 (ECHR 2000) .....	136, 239
<i>L.B. v Belgium</i> App no 22831/08 (ECHR 2012) .....	109
<i>L.L. v France</i> App no 7508/02 (ECHR 2006) .....	109
<i>Lopes de Sousa Fernandes v Portugal</i> App no 56080/13 (ECHR 2017) .....	110–11
<i>Lopez Ostra v Spain</i> App no 16798/90 (ECHR 1994) .....	109
<i>M.K. and Others v Poland</i> App nos 40503/17, 42902/17, 43643/17 (ECHR 2020) .....	40
<i>M.S.S. v Belgium and Greece</i> App no 30696/09 (ECHR 2011) .....	37, 38, 41, 109, 120–3, 138, 190
<i>Maaouia v France</i> App no 39652/98 (ECHR 2000) .....	31
<i>Marcks v Belgium</i> App no 6833/74 (ECHR 1979) .....	42

## Table of Cases

xvii

<i>Maslov v Austria</i> App no 1638/03 (ECHR 2008) .....	44
<i>Mehmet Şentürk and Bekir Şentürk v Turkey</i> App no 13423/09 (ECHR 2013) .....	110, 136, 138
<i>Moustahi v France</i> App no 9347/14 (ECHR 2020) .....	240
<i>Mubilanzila Mayeka and Kaniki Mitunga v Belgium</i> App no 13178/03 (ECHR 2006) .....	42
<i>Muskhadzhiyeva and others v Belgium</i> App no 41442/07 (ECHR 2010) .....	240–1
<i>N. v the United Kingdom</i> App no 26565/05 (ECHR 2008) .....	36, 109, 136, 137
<i>Narjis v Italy</i> App no 57433/15 (ECHR 2019) .....	42
<i>Nasri v France</i> App no 19465/92 (ECHR 1995) .....	44
<i>Ndikumana v the Netherlands</i> App no 4714/06 (ECHR Decision 2014) .....	190
<i>N.D. and N.T. v Spain</i> App nos 8675/15 and 8697/15 (ECHR 2020) .....	39–40
<i>Nencheva and others v Bulgaria</i> App no 48609/06 (ECHR 2013) .....	110
<i>Novruc and others v Russia</i> App nos 31039/11, 48511/11, 76810/12, 14618/13 and 13817/14 (ECHR 2016) .....	124
<i>Othman (Abu Qatada) v the United Kingdom</i> App no 8139/09 (ECHR 2012) .....	39
<i>Oyal v Turkey</i> App no 4864/05 (ECHR 2010) .....	111
<i>Paposhvili v Belgium</i> App no 41738/10 (ECHR 2016) .....	36, 136, 137, 155, 234–6
<i>Ponomaryov and Others v Bulgaria</i> App no 5335/05 (ECHR 2011) .....	5, 184, 191, 270
<i>Rahimi v Greece</i> App no 8687/2008 (ECHR 2011) .....	41, 42, 120, 240
<i>Rodrigues da Silva and Hoogkamer v the Netherlands</i> App no 50435/99 (ECHR 2006) .....	43
<i>Romanov v Russia</i> App no 63993/00 (ECHR 2005) .....	227
<i>S.D. v Greece</i> App no 53541/07 (ECHR 2007) .....	41
<i>Saadi v the United Kingdom</i> App no 13229/03 (ECHR 2008) .....	35, 40, 41, 59, 239
<i>Savran v Denmark</i> App no 57467/15 (ECHR 2019) .....	137, 235
<i>Savran v Denmark</i> App no 57467/15 (ECHR 2021) .....	137, 232, 235–7, 271
<i>Soering v the United Kingdom</i> App no 14038/88 (ECHR 1989) .....	37
<i>Stanev v Bulgaria</i> App no 36760/06 (ECHR 2012) .....	226–7
<i>Stec and Others v the United Kingdom</i> App nos 65731/01 and 65900/01 (ECHR 2006) .....	109, 189
<i>Tarakhel v Switzerland</i> App no 29217/12 (ECHR 2014) .....	38, 235
<i>Thimothawes v Belgium</i> App no 39061/11 (ECHR 2017) .....	239
<i>Villnow v Belgium</i> App no 16938/05 (ECHR Decision 2008) .....	108
<i>W.D. v Belgium</i> App no 73548/13 (ECHR 2016) .....	109
<i>Winterwerp v the Netherlands</i> App no 6301/73 (ECHR 1979) .....	226
<i>X v Finland</i> App no 34806/04 (ECHR 2012) .....	227
<i>X, Y and Z</i> App no 21830/93 (ECHR 1997) .....	42
<i>Yildem et al. v Turkey</i> App no 72781/12 (ECHR 2018) .....	110

<i>Yordanova et al. v Bulgaria</i> App no 25446/06 (ECHR 2012) .....	122, 190
<i>Yoh-Ekale Mwanje v Belgium</i> App no 10486/10 (ECHR 2011) .....	137

### European Committee of Social Rights

<i>CGIL v Italy</i> Com no 91/2013 (ECSR 2015) .....	114
<i>Conference of European Churches (CEC) v the Netherlands</i> Com no 30/2013 (ECSR decision on immediate measures 2013) .....	195
<i>Conference of European Churches (CEC) v the Netherlands</i> Com no 30/2013 (ECSR 2014) .....	55, 139, 194, 196, 241
<i>Defence for Children International (DCI) v Belgium</i> Com no 69/2011 (ECSR 2012) .....	55, 123, 139, 194, 195, 228, 241, 242
<i>Defence for Children International (DCI) v the Netherlands</i> Com no 47/2008 (ECSR 2009) .....	55, 139, 164, 193
<i>European Committee for Home-Based Priority Action for the Child and the Family (EUROCEF) v France</i> Com no 10114/2015 (ECSR 2018) .....	195, 272
<i>European Federation of National Organisations working with the Homeless (FEANTSA) v the Netherlands</i> Com no 86/2012 (ECSR decision on immediate measures 2013) .....	195
<i>European Federation of National Organisations working with the Homeless (FEANTSA) v the Netherlands</i> Com no 86/2012 (ECSR 2014) .....	55, 134, 139, 140, 194–6, 241
<i>European Roma and Travellers Forum (ERTF) v Czech Republic</i> Com no 104/2014 (ECSR 2016) .....	123–4
<i>European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC) v Bulgaria</i> Com no 46/2007 (ECSR 2008) .....	123
<i>Federation of Employed Pensioners of Greece (IKA-ETAM) v Greece</i> Com no 76/2012 (ECSR 2012) .....	123
<i>International Association Autism-Europe v France</i> Com no 13/2002 (ECSR 2003) .....	123
<i>International Commission of Jurists and European Council for Refugees and Exiles v Greece</i> , Com no 173/2018 (ECSR decision on admissibility and immediate measures 2019). .....	195
<i>International Federation of Human Rights League (FIDH) v France</i> Com no 14/2003 (ECSR 2004) .....	54, 112, 114, 139
<i>IPPF EN v Italy</i> Com no 87/2010 (ECSR 2013) .....	114
<i>Marangopoulos Foundation for Human Rights v Greece</i> Com no 30/2005 (ECSR 2006) .....	114, 115
<i>Médecins du Monde – International v France</i> Com no 67/2011 (ECSR 2012) .....	115
<i>Transgender Europe and ILGA Europe v Czech Republic</i> Com no 117/2014 (ECSR 2018) .....	113

## Table of Cases

xix

## INTERNATIONAL

## UN Human Rights Treaty Bodies

<i>A.H. v Denmark</i> Com no 2370/2014 (CCPR 2015) .....	241
<i>A.H.G. v Canada</i> Com no 2091/2011 (CCPR 2015) .....	243
<i>A.N. v Switzerland</i> Com no 742/2016 (CAT 2018) .....	48
<i>Alyne da Silva Pimentel Teixeira v Brazil</i> Com no 17/2008 (CEDAW 2011) .....	103
<i>Ben Djazia et al. v Spain</i> Com no 15/2015 (CESCR 2017) .....	101
<i>C. v Australia</i> Com no 900/1999 (CCPR 2002) .....	243
<i>Dorothy Kakem Titiahonjo v Cameroon</i> Com no 1186/2003 (CCPR 2007) .....	103
<i>E.A. v Sweden</i> Com no 690/2015 (CAT 2017) .....	52
<i>F.K.A.G. et al. v Australia</i> Com no 2049/2011 (CCPR 2013) .....	103, 245
<i>H.M. v Sweden</i> Com no 3/2011 (CRPD 2012) .....	103
<i>I.A.M. v Denmark</i> Com no 3/2016 (CRC 2018) .....	48
<i>I.D.G. v Spain</i> Com no 2/2014 (CESCR 2015) .....	101, 102
<i>Ibrahima Gueye et al. v France</i> Com no 196/1985 (CCPR 1989) .....	31
<i>J.B. v Switzerland</i> Com no 721/2015 (CAT 2017) .....	48, 244
<i>Jose Henry Monge Contreras v Canada</i> Com no 2613/2015 (CCPR 2017) .....	243
<i>Joyce Nawila Chiti v Zambia</i> Com no 1303/2004 (CCPR 2012) .....	103
<i>Kaba v Canada and Guinea</i> Com no 1465/2006 (CCPR 2010) .....	48
<i>L.C. v Peru</i> Com no 22/2009 (CEDAW 2011) .....	103, 228
<i>López Albán v Spain</i> Com no 37/2018 (CESCR 2019) .....	122
<i>M.A.M.A. et al. v Sweden</i> Com 391/2009 (CAT 2012) .....	48
<i>M.M.M. v Australia</i> Com no 2136/2012 (CCPR 2013) .....	103, 245
<i>M.P. v Denmark</i> Com no 2643/2015 (CCPR 2017) .....	52
<i>Madafferi v Australia</i> Com no 1011/2001 (CCPR 2004) .....	49, 245
<i>Mansour Leghaei et al. v Australia</i> Com no 1937/2010 (CCPR 2015) .....	48, 49
<i>McCallum v South Africa</i> Com no 1818/2008 (CCPR 2010) .....	102
<i>Miguel Ángel López Rodríguez v Spain</i> Com no 1/2013 (CESCR 2013) .....	101–2, 148
<i>O.A. v Denmark</i> Com no 2770/2016 (CCPR 2017) .....	48
<i>Osayi Omo-Amenaghawon v Denmark</i> Com no 2288/2013 (CCPR 2015) .....	243
<i>Rosario Gómez-Limón Pardo v Spain</i> Com No 52/2018 (CESCR 2020) .....	77
<i>Rouba Alhaj Ali v Morocco</i> Com no 682/2015 (CAT 2016) .....	48
<i>R.P.B. v The Philippines</i> Com no 34/2011 (CEDAW 2014) .....	228, 254
<i>S.F.M. v Spain</i> Com no 138/2018 (CEDAW 2020) .....	104
<i>S.G. and G.P. v Italy</i> Com no 22/2017 (CESCR 2019) .....	101–2
<i>Siobhán Whelan v Ireland</i> App no 2425/2014 (CCPR 2017) .....	228
<i>Stefan Lars Nystrom v Australia</i> Com no 1557/2007 (CCPR 2011) .....	49



<i>Tolipkhuzhaev v Uzbekistan</i> Com no 1280/2004 (CCPR 2009) .....	103
<i>Toussaint v Canada</i> Com no 2348/2014 (CCPR 2018) .....	49, 52, 141, 152–3, 207, 248, 268
<i>Trujillo Calero v Ecuador</i> Com no 10/2015 (CESCR 2018) .....	102
<i>Turdukan Zhumbaeva v Kyrgyzstan</i> Com no 1756/2008 (CCPR 2011) ....	102
<i>Warda v Denmark</i> Com no 2360/2014 (CCPR 2015) .....	48
<i>X. v Argentina</i> Com no 8/2012 (CRPD 2014) .....	103
<i>Y.A.A. and F.H.M. v Denmark</i> Com no 2681/2015 (CCPR 2017) .....	48

## Other International Cases

<i>Ahmadou Sadio Diallo (Republic of Guinea v Democratic Republic of the Congo)</i> , Preliminary Objections [2007] 599 .....	29
<i>Ahmadou Sadio Diallo (Republic of Guinea v Democratic Republic of the Congo)</i> , Merits [2010] ICJ Reports 639, (Judgment of 30 November 2010) .....	45, 94
<i>Barcelona Traction case (Belgium v. Spain)</i> [1970] ICJ .....	20, 28
Case C-562/13 <i>Centre public d'action sociale d'Ottignies-Louvain-la-Neuve v Moussa Abdida</i> [CJEU 2014] paras 62–64 .....	10
<i>Customs Régime between Germany and Austria</i> (Advisory Opinion) [1931] PCIJ Series A/B No 41 [Individual Opinion of M. Anzilotti] 57 .....	18
<i>Expelled Dominicans and Haitians v. Dominican Republic</i> , Judgment of 28 August 2014 (IACtHR) Series C No. 282 .....	57
<i>Island of Palmas Case (the Netherlands v USA)</i> (Merits) [1928] 2 UN Reports of International Arbitral Awards 829 .....	18–19
<i>Juridical Condition and Rights of the Undocumented Migrants</i> , Advisory Opinion OC-18, IACtHR Series A no 18 (17 September 2003) .....	56
<i>Pacheco Tineo Family v Bolivia</i> , Judgment of 25 November 2013 (IACtHR) Series C No. 272 .....	57
<i>Rights and Guarantees of Children in the Context of Migration and/or in Need of International Protection</i> , Advisory Opinion OC-21, IACtHR (19 August 2014) .....	57
<i>Vélez Loor v Panama</i> , Judgment of 23 November 2010 (IACtHR) Series C No. 218 .....	57

## Abbreviations

AAAQ	availability, accessibility, acceptability and good quality
CAT	Convention against Torture
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CERD	Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CESCR	Committee on Economic Social and Cultural Rights
COs	concluding observations
CRC	Convention of the Rights of the Child
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CSDH	Commission on the Social Determinants of Health
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECSR	European Committee of Social Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ESC	European Social Charter
HRC	Human Rights Council
HRCtee	Human Rights Committee
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights
ICMW	International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
PHC	primary health care
SDH	social determinants of health
UDH	underlying determinants of health

UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UHC	universal health coverage
UN	United Nations
UNCHR	UN Commission on Human Rights
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
WHA	World Health Assembly
WHO	World Health Organization