

Mapping (Post)colonial Paris by Ear

1 The Voice of the (Post)colony: Radio, Hip Hop, and Soundscapes of the Street

"Va t'faire niquer, toi et tes livres." *Fuck you and your books!* This hostile apostrophe, hurled at legitimate culture with all the contempt of the *tutoiement*, is rapped by Booba on Lunatic's 2001 track "Hommes de l'ombres." Like much of Lunatic's output, it will likely be heard as imitating the codes of American gangsta rap with its tendency to celebrate money and violence. The track flaunts its flight from social criticism into reactive materialism and asserts its autonomy while confessing to the commercialism that grants it the imprimatur to speak as the recognized voice of sociopolitical resistance. In this single sonic fragment there are multiple voices and audiences, multiple modes of address interacting with one another. These overlapping, conflicting interpellations made *in* sound – but also made *of* sound as it is called upon to *speak for* something – make it complicated to assign a voice to the (post)colonial without profound ambivalence or contradiction.

Certainly a book of the kind addressed by Booba – especially one written by a white scholar and published by an esteemed university press in the Global North – cannot give voice to that condition, and nor should it aspire to. But it can reflect critically on the complex and entangled mechanisms by which some sounds come to be heard as the voice of the (post)colonial in the context of France, its overseas territories, and the complex relation to its expansionist histories. It goes without saying that there is no single sound that stands in for this voice, which is necessarily multiple and fragmented, and yet there are a number of sounds that vie for that position or that, in particular moments and places, are elevated into that position, contingently hegemonizing the crisscrossed weave of a polyvocal sonic field. It would be easy to reduce the sound of the banlieues to the sounds of violence, gray economies, barbarity, alienation, delinquency, or, conversely those of resistance, rage, jubilation, passion, irrationality - each an element of the banlieue's mediatized representation. They are all containers that restrict the dispersal and differentiation of sonic resonance in (post)colonial Paris.

The formulation in this section's title – the voice of the (post)colony – is therefore as fraught with unease as the prefix around which those parentheses hover, almost morphing into scare quotes. Both the voice and the "post" share a certain fragility and instability. The parentheses stubbornly refuse to evaporate because colonial forms of oppression and marginalization continue to persist today, these social relations turned inward and projected onto racialized populations within the Hexagon, in particular onto the Black and Arab children and

The track can be heard online: www.youtube.com/watch?v=k_GrIMRijHU.



2

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-009-05465-2 — Mapping (Post)colonial Paris by Ear Naomi Waltham-Smith Excerpt More Information

Music and the City

grandchildren of immigrants who live in the banlieues. This "post" is thus multidimensional and ambivalent, pointing to what comes after colonialism – simultaneously both as that which derives from it belatedly, and hence persists and remains of it, and as that which (largely in fantasy) supersedes, exceeds, and escapes that horizon. The German equivalent *nach*, which means both "after" and "according to," captures this double sense by which the (post) colonial is what follows from and in the wake of colonialism and from within that horizon envisions a future-to-come in which the chains of those lingering parentheses might at last be lifted. I take the "post" to articulate the multiple registers of vigilance that Christina Sharpe evokes with the phrase "in the wake": a vigil for the victims and losses of colonial violence, what comes to pass in the water behind the slave ship and continues to haunt the present, and the awakening to injustice and political consciousness.² In contrast with the foresight of vision, sound, insofar as it takes the form of wave and is propagated through resonant referral, is always somewhat behind itself - coming from all around including from behind, catching us by surprise and also marked by a belated syncopation (nachträglich).

In recent years France has witnessed an intensification of racialized marginalization, Islamophobia, and anti-immigrant sentiment in a droitification of political and media elites who have mainstreamed far-right views and persisted in denials of structural racism as an imported American concept irrelevant to French republican universalism. If, like anti-Blackness, colonialism is "interminable," there can be no straightforward mourning, memorialization, or veneer of repair for violence consigned to the past, for it is a death knell that continues to echo for Black and Arab men in the *cités*. Françoise Vergès writes with reference to the work of French-Algerian artist and founder of the decolonial art and social space La Colonie, Kader Attia, who grew up in the northeast Parisian département of Seine-Saint-Denis and whose hyphenated identity is erased by Eurocentric universalism: "For humiliation to be overcome, for wounds to heal, the injuries must first be shown and their histories listened to." Aurality nurtures an awakening to psychoanalyst Karima Lazali's "blank space" of colonial trauma,⁵ to the silenced tomb or crawlspace of the archive lyrically described in different ways by Harriet Jacobs, Saidiya Hartman, Katherine McKittrick, and Fred Moten.⁶

Resonating with the fugitivity of the Black radical tradition, to be "in the wake" of colonialism would therefore mean to be not only in the sights or

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment

² Sharpe, *In the Wake*. ³ Ibid., 19.

⁴ Vergès, "Fire, Anger and Humiliation," 87 (emphasis mine). ⁵ Lazali, *Le trauma colonial*.

⁶ Jacobs, Incidents in the Life of a Slave Girl; Hartman, "Venus in Two Acts"; McKittrick, Demonic Grounds; Moten, Black and Blur. On the aurality of the crawlspace, see also Crawley, "Harriet Jacobs Gets a Hearing."



Mapping (Post)colonial Paris by Ear

crosshairs of an entrenched colonial imaginary but also in a "line of flight." For Sharpe it means both to inhabit and to rupture the colonial situation. Like a sound wave, the wake disturbs and sets ripples running across the surface. As such, the *banlieue*, fashioned as a mental – and often specifically a sonic – image by the circulation of mediatized stereotypes, is an echo of colonial violence but one that thereby retains the potential to rebound and ricochet otherwise, if belatedly. Listening is a practice of infinite repair tuning into the muted frequencies of colonial trauma – both militant and gentle. 8

The voice, too, sits athwart persistent domination and infinite liberation, betwixt subjection and empowerment, highlighting their irreducible entanglement and incessant negotiation. The voice may be an instrument of colonial power that commands, instructs, enjoins, dismisses, silences but it is also the support for an incipient power to speak up or speak back: the cry of despair, the shouted demand, the rallying summons. To have a voice is already to be at least partially liberated from domination or to have the power at least to renegotiate the striated field of audibility that decides whose voice is heard more or less loudly, with more or less distortion. Sound production and reproduction – from the radio to noisy protest in the streets – have to this day played an important role in these processes in the French context, working at times to "flip the script" of who is heard and who gets to speak for particular communities or interests. This Element, together with its digital archive of field recordings and photographs, aims to lend an ear to and sound with, resonate with, this sonic world, and as such to put itself in the wake of that tradition as a solidary reverberation. It aspires to a wakeful attunement, ears pricked with care-ful attention to the strains of coloniality's disturbances. To this end, the Element oscillates between accounts of Paris's (post)colonial sounds and sonic ecologies, analyses of their sociopolitical contexts, 10 and critical reflections on listening as a method forged in those settings, especially in tandem with practices of walking and mapping.

⁷ Sharpe, In the Wake, 18.

⁸ I refer to the gentleness described by philosopher and psychoanalyst Anne Dufourmantelle in Puissance de la douceur.

⁹ When I speak of care, I am thinking not only of Dufourmantelle but also of Vergès' decolonial analytic of care as reparation for what was laid to waste in racial and ecological devastation (*Un féminisme decolonial*) as well as the praxis, at the porous boundaries of theory and activism, of Madrid-based feminist collective Precarias a la Deriva ("A Very Careful Strike").

On the longer history of the racialized tumulte noir in the Parisian and wider Francophone context: Hill, Black Soundscapes, White Stages; Gillett, At Home in Our Sounds; Moore, Soundscapes of Liberation.



4

Music and the City

In "Hommes de l'ombre" Booba raps, "ne reçoit d'ordre / ni des keufs / ni des profs." Refusing to take orders from the cops or his teachers, the rapper decries the authoritarian potential of the sonic address. Frantz Fanon describes how the French broadcasting station Radio-Alger suffused the colony with nostalgic reverberations of the metropole to reassure the settler of his civilized status, functioning as a sonic tether or dam against the threat of "Arabization." 11 Fanon observes that while the radio was a fixture in most French households in Algeria, the colonized, of whatever class, had little interest in a mouthpiece of the occupier addressed to French ears - an indifference that Fanon argues cannot simply be ascribed to the standard sociological explanation of an untranslatable culture but must take account of the distinctive psychopolitical dynamics of colonial domination of which the radio is a technological extension. 12 Michael Allan finds in Fanon's essay "a remarkable phenomenology of perception" that blends textual reading and embodied sensory perception beyond hermeneutics. 13 Fanon's account moreover implies that the entire apparatus of listening, not only the device itself, is a colonial prosthesis that technologizes the colonized subject in an "anxiogenic" reaction formation, "the voice of the oppressor" "not received, deciphered, understood but rejected" as hostile, accusatory, and inquisitory and putting the listener on guard. 14 Such anxious listening has already dislocated the self-identical and self-possessed subject of phenomenology in a way that implicates the temporal disjointedness and belatedness of the (post)-colonial.

A gradual uptake of radios would follow as the political situation evolved with the first stirrings of Tunisian independence in 1951–2, the Casablanca Uprisings and subsequent popular unrest in Morocco, and the start of Algeria's own war of independence with the declaration of the Front de Libération Nationale (FLN) addressed to the Algerian people on November 1, 1954, during which period the appetite for news from democratic media sources steadily grew. But radio consumption rose dramatically, Fanon recounts, with the announcement in late 1956 of a "Voix de l'Algérie Libre" (Voice of Free Algeria) that would bring other voices besides that of the oppressor – the voices of anti-colonial resistance and the revolution – to all Algerians, radically reconfiguring the radio and the entire prosthestic structure of colonial listening.

What is most striking is that, in Fanon's account, the incipient liberation and decolonization of the radio voice entails that its authoritative status be dispersed through the invention of techniques of listening and re-sounding. Prior to the emergence of la Voix de l'Algérie Libre, the radio served to amplify the telephonic address of the omnipotent voice of God, of the university, of the *Führer* –

Fanon, "Ici la voix de l'Algérie," 307/71–72. 12 Arnall, Subterranean Fanon, 121–22.

¹³ Allan, "Old Media/New Futures": 188. ¹⁴ Fanon, "Ici la voix de l'Algérie," 323/89.



Mapping (Post)colonial Paris by Ear

in short, of the dominator – as European philosophers variously describe it. If for Sartre the radio listener is an inert object of the interpellating broadcast and for Adorno their autonomy is liquidated, for Jacques Derrida, reading Nietzsche, phonographic listening shares the university's goal of producing "docile and unquestioning functionaries" who, in "a ruse of the State," mistakenly believe themselves to enjoy total autonomy. ¹⁵ Derrida elaborates, referring to Nipper, the dog that became the iconic emblem of record label HMV (His Master's Voice).

The hypocritical hound whispers in your ear through his educational systems, which are actually acoustic or acroamatic devices. Your ears grow larger and you turn into long-eared asses when, instead of listening with small, finely tuned ears and obeying the best master and the best of leaders, you think you are free and autonomous with respect to the State. You open wide the portals [pavilions] of your ears to admit the State, not knowing that it has already come under the control of reactive and degenerate forces. Having become all ears for this phonograph dog, you transform yourself into a high-fidelity receiver. ¹⁶

Instead of this telephonic listening that tethers the listener via a leash or umbilical cord to the state and mandates a totalizing sameness, Derrida ponders a differentiation and prostheticization of listening that must come from the ear, or multiple ears, of the other.¹⁷ Extending this to sexual difference, Derrida also quips in passing that there is here "no woman or trace of woman" (*pas de femme*) aside from the maternal.¹⁸ The coupling of decoloniality and feminism inflects the modality of listening cultivated in this Element as *flânerie* undergoes deconstruction.

Something like this splintering or shattering of listening is already at work in Fanon's text. The French authorities swiftly began to jam the free voice, rendering it inaudible and forcing it constantly to jump frequencies, and the person in the room operating the radio, ear glued to the receiver, would be called upon to relay the voice as listeners struggled to tune into these fragmented, darting sounds. Decoding the crackle with accuracy was less important than the spontaneous, collaborative creation of narratives about the battles and combatants behind the static, which forged a collective consciousness attentive to difference, rather than the totalizing and essentializing unity of the colonial community. The effect was to produce a series of sonorous reticulations in which "every Algerian . . . wanted to become a reverberating element of the vast network of meanings born of the liberating combat." 19

Ian Baucom makes the bold argument that Fanon, besides writing about the radio, turns texts like *Peau noire, masques blanc* into radiophonic listening

¹⁹ Fanon, "Ici la voix de l'Algérie," 328/94.

Adorno, "On the Fetish-Character"; Sartre, Critique of Dialectical Reason, 270; Derrida, Otobiographies, 104/33.

¹⁶ Derrida, *Otobiographies*, 107/34–35. ¹⁷ Ibid., 107–9/35–36. ¹⁸ Ibid., 118/38.



6

Music and the City

devices. In his thinking "solidarity is antiphony, a technique of call and response, of listening and retransmitting." Gavin Arnall highlights how anticolonialism in Fanon's conception is not a reactive negation of domination that leaves its logic of assimilation intact but dismantles it through differentiation. Similarly, Baucom stresses the need to scatter those sounds that have gathered a community of listeners. Hearing Paul Gilroy's study of diasporic sound-system culture as a differential "rebroadcast" of Fanon, Baucom proposes that listening is what traverses the gaps in transmission – the crackling, frequency-hopping radio signal and, metonymically, the traumatic cadences and foreclosures of the archive. Listening thereby forges the kind of local and translocal solidarities across struggles explored in Section 7.

In the *quartiers populaires* of Paris and other French cities, where immigrants from the former colonies and their descendants struggle to resist the exclusionary totalization of republican universalism, one might expect the "battle of the airwaves" (guerre des ondes) of the Algerian Revolution to find its ongoing reverberation in diasporic radio. A station such as Radio Beur (later Beur FM) was the voice of "Les Marches des Beurs" in 1983, which marked the emergence of a beur movement in the 1980s and has since continued critically to articulate transcolonial solidarities between the banlieue and the broader geographical space of the Maghreb. However, the role of its most prominent genre, raï, has followed a more accommodating course of politicizing sound than la Voix de l'Algérie Libre. Since the 1930s raï had thematized the social concerns of Algeria's Indigenous peoples alongside more lightweight topics, but its political force came to be blunted largely on account of its social liberalism, which meant that it formed part of the youth culture that reacted against anti-colonial Arab nationalism and, in its pop variant, would rapidly be recruited into a progressive acoustic hybridity friendly to the sensibilities of the Global North. In promoting its cross-fertilization with other genres, including funk, hip hop, R&B, and jazz, and in its appeals to mainstream cosmopolitan audiences, Beur FM's programming negotiated (post)colonial identities within the metropole, cultivating a cultural *métissage* that drew on the diverse *fond sonore* of the *cités* to deconstruct straightforward oppositions between ethnic difference and republicanism,²² but increasingly this hybridity tended toward assimilating the former into the latter. As SOS-Racisme, an organization with close ties to the mainstream center-left Parti Socialiste but little popular support in the quartiers, began to sponsor multicultural concerts platforming rai in the 1980s, this cemented its more

²² This formulation, which belongs to French-Congolese rapper and spoken-word artist Abd Al Malik, is quoted in Silverstein, "A Transnational Generation," 295.



Mapping (Post)colonial Paris by Ear

integrationist status and Beur FM likewise became a paragon of assimilation, earning it a place among the beurgeoisie.²³

It is to another musical genre associated with the banlieue - one that has perhaps even become the soundtrack of the cités - that one must turn to find a more intense reconfiguration of Fanon's "sound-wave warfare," as the English translation has it: Francophone hip hop and perhaps especially in its transformations of rap battle codes.²⁴ The film *Banlieusards* (released to Anglophone audiences on Netflix in 2019 as Street Flow), written by the French rapper Kery James, who was born in Guadeloupe to Haitian parents, and codirected with Leïla Sy with a cameo as a boxing trainer from *La Haine* director Mathieu Kassovitz, would remain somewhat crude and naive in its depiction of life in the quartiers, its characters and narrative endorsing stereotypes of spaces of lawlessness, drugdealing, masculinist violence, social challenges, and racist policing, were it not for the film's ingenious conceit. Its ten-minute set piece, before a predictably tragically violent final act, cinematically translates the rap duel and specifically the address made to the state in James's 2012 track "Lettre à la République" into a formal debate in the Concours d'éloquence between studious Black banlieus ard Souleyman Traoré, who is determined to avoid his older brother's local-celebrity lifestyle of money, drugs, and crime and to keep their younger brother out of trouble, and Lisa Crèvecœur, his fellow law student and love-interest, who is white and from the affluent 5^{eme} arrondissement in central Paris. That this display of oratory is an elevation of a rap battle has escaped most film critics, as has its metareflection on James's attempts to claim his own place within the French linguistic tradition, for instance in the 2008 "Banlieusards" in which he raps, "Regarde moi, j'suis noir et fier de l'être / J'manie la langue de Molière, j'en maîtrise les lettres."25 Up for debate is the state's exclusive responsibility for the conditions in the banlieues. Lisa offers an ultimately paternalist sociological analysis of the causes of poverty and marginalization that leaves the banlieusards victims, dependent on the largesse of the state, and without agency – all, so he fires back, to absolve white guilt. In response, after calling him, in Malcolm X's term, a "house negro" to gasps from the floor, she recites a list of the Black and Arab men who have died at the hands of the police – Zyed and Bouna, Ali Ziri, Adama Traoré – and makes impassioned denunciations of the state's responsibility for racial violence and the oligarchization of democracy.

²³ Gross, McMurray, and Swedenburg, "Arab Noise and Ramadan Nights"; Echchaibi, "The Limits of French Universalism: Beur FM and Assimilation through Difference," in Voicing Diasporas,

 $^{^{24}\,}$ Fanon, "Ici la voix de l'Algérie," 320/85.

²⁵ On this song and its music video's bid for recognition, see Dotson-Renta, "On n'est pas condamné l'échec": 356-57.



8

Music and the City

Souleyman furiously rejects the disempowerment to which such victimization condemns him, preferring to be a "soldier." It is an unsubtle analysis, more interesting when heard as a reflexive critique of rap's role in reproducing all these objectifying clichés. Calling her out for presuming to speak for the banlieusards and allowing her own rage to upstage theirs, ²⁶ he delivers a devasting blow to hip hop and to every sonic construction of the banlieue, including those discussed in this Element and created through its research: "Je ne suis pas contenté de fantasmer la vie en banlieue et d'en déformer la réalité à travers objectif d'un appareil photo. La banlieue, je la connais" (I have never been content to fantasize about life in the suburbs, to deform the reality with the lens of a camera. The banlieue - I know it). This scene is helpful in pointing critically to how sonic production participates in constructing mythic images of la banlieue (in a reified singular), as dissected by Mame-Fatou Niang in the context of media discourses, cinema, and literature.²⁷ Whereas Niang aims to replace these images with the everyday normality of women's lives in the quartiers told from their standpoint, the research presented in this Element, including my own fieldwork in Paris, does not shy away from the extraordinary, the exceptional, the fabricated. It seeks to turn a critical ear (and lens) toward the process by which the (post)colonial city is represented sonically, how the racialized peripheries appear to the white core, especially when la banlieue comes to the center of Paris.

The Element aims expressly to thematize how the (post)colonial condition is rendered audible to – and is (mis)heard by – white civilizational-feminist ears and, working from this positionality and putting it into deconstruction, into the mode of a conditional, to begin to dismantle the schemas it traffics insofar as they marginalize, stigmatize, exoticize, fetishize, colonize. As I set out in Sections 2 and 5, this aural abolitionism entails finding new ways of moving through and mapping urban space that resist totalizing representations and at micro scales reconfigure the spatial dialectic of right and lawlessness into something more muscular, intimate, and carnal, with the intervening Sections 3 and 4 exploring the terrain in its borderings and mappings before turning in Sections 6 and 7 to counter-strategies for flipping their scripts through anti-fascist and decolonial-feminist praxis.²⁸ These modalities of moving

Myisha Cherry gives an instructive warning to allies on the potential misuses of their anger, however well intentioned, in "Rage Renegades: A Special Message to 'Allies," in *The Case for Rage*, 118–38.

²⁷ Niang, *Identités françaises*.

The idea, itself become an orthodoxy, that rap could be a "counterhegemonic" challenge to "dominant discourses," albeit entangled with contradictory processes of legitimation, was articulated by Tricia Rose in *Black Noise*, 102–3.



Mapping (Post)colonial Paris by Ear

through the city mobilize the prosthetic articulations of aurality to unsettle relations between core and periphery.

This is not a text about hip hop or indeed about *music* specifically but about the wider category of sound. There is not space to do justice to the richness of the French scene in its musical or its sociopolitical complexity – a task that others have ably assumed.²⁹ Hip hop, rai, and other musical genres feature to the extent that they form a recognizable indexical component of the (post) colonial sonic environment in the city, much as African American hip hop has commodified racialized ghettoes in the United States. 30 The tension between the material conditions of hip hop's consumption and the social conditions it frequently thematizes and deplores as a performance of resistance is discussed in Section 6 in counterpoint with the circulation struggles of the gilets jaunes. Musical production is situated within a broader sonic ambience or atmosphere, mingling speech, live and recorded musics, noise pollution, everyday disturbances, and the sounds of protest, resistance, and flight – all forged in the crucible of ongoing colonialism. In Section 3 I analyze these atmospheres as "soundstates of emergency" to capture how the colonial state presupposes a savage exteriority – mere noise – that is yet to be civilized, universalized, and as such represents a category of rupture and disruption. In contrast to a fictionalized savagery, whether in its Macronist or Lepenist forms, I follow Louisa Yousfi in seeking out where sound expresses a vital and intimate barbarism that remains uncultured, untameable, irrecuperable beyond acculturation or integration. It is not in rap conscient, which continues to address itself to the state, but in the music of Booba or PNL that Yousfi finds a "oui et alors?" (and so what?) whose affirmation uproots Eurocentric logics of recognition and legibility, along with its literary and musical canons.31

The aim in submitting these sound ecologies to scholarly scrutiny is not to domesticate, civilize, or universalize them but to engage in a practice of *sounding with* the (post)colonial to make it resonate to the point where it shatters like a glass made to vibrate at its signature frequency. I proposed this notion of *shatter* in an earlier book while keeping its abolitionist impulse in reserve, but here this militant, even violent, species of resonance provides an analytic for making sense of sounds of/as counterviolence and of aurality's role in abolition democracy's dismantling of oppressive regimes and building of new institutions. Insofar as it arises immanently from being made to resonate with itself, *shatter* names less a frontal assault or radical elsewhere than an

³¹ Yousfi, Rester barbare.

²⁹ For example, Rollefson, *Flip the Script*; Durand (ed.), *Black, Blanc, Beur*; McCarren, *French Moves*.

For this analogy, see, for example, Horvath, "Postcolonial Noise," 291.



10

Music and the City

undoing under the pressure of vibrational intensity.³² The city of Paris becomes a site for such sonic work and for reassessing sound's imbrication in politics. Noisy protest is a privileged site for such investigation because it condenses the struggle over audibility in colonial forms of governmentality (though by no means the only site for this sound-wave battle). Big, angry manifs crisscross the city's geographical divides and are scenes in which the demands of social movements press on the limitations of those established representative organs of political voice, parties and elections. The accompanying archive of field recordings, presented at the limits of reading, is bookended by the presidential elections of 2017 and 2022 and by the outcry following the death of a young Black French-Malian man, Adama Traoré, at the hands of the police on his birthday on July 19, 2016, and the 30th birthday stolen from him, marked after six years of his sister Assa's indefatigable campaign against the intensified state and police violence over which Macron has since presided and which his second-round opponent threatened to unleash without restraint. The last word of the Element goes to the resonant solidarities that Le comité Adama is building for a future that would abolish those spectral hesitations around the (post)colonial. Every word is inscribed with the hope for vérité et justice for Adama and all those brutally silenced by colonial violence.

2 Walking the City: Aural Flânerie from Baudelaire to Trespass

Most of this Element was conceived and composed while walking, whether that be strolling through central London's parks and along its canals, snowshoeing up Alpine ascents in the Alto Adige, or marching in demonstrations along Parisian boulevards. Thinking, especially in its philosophical and contemplative varieties, has long held an affinity with walking: Frédéric Gros writes of the eighteenth-century French thinker of politics and music, for example:

Rousseau claimed to be incapable of thinking properly, of composing, creating or finding inspiration except when walking. The mere sight of a desk and chair was enough to make him feel sick and drain him of all courage. It was during long walks that the ideas would come, on the road that sentences would spring to his lips, as a light punctuation of the movement; it was paths that stimulated his imagination.³³

Like Nietzsche, another musical thinker, my philosophical instincts had been sufficiently well schooled in the European tradition so as continuously to feel the urge to break free of the shackles of my desk and laptop, to which I would

³² For Derrida's use of these aural metaphors to characterize what he calls "stricture," see *Negotiations*, 28–30.

³³ Gros, *Marcher*, 101/65.