

EXPLORATIONS IN ANCIENT AND MODERN PHILOSOPHY

M. F. Burnyeat (1939–2019) was a major figure in the study of ancient Greek philosophy during the last decades of the twentieth century and the first of this. After teaching positions in London and Cambridge, where he became Laurence Professor, in 1996 he took up a Senior Research Fellowship at All Souls College, Oxford, from which he retired in 2006. In 2012 he published two volumes collecting essays dating from before the move to Oxford. Two new posthumously published volumes bring together essays from his years at All Souls and his retirement. The main body of Volume 3 presents studies written for a wide readership, first on Plato's *Republic* and then on the reading and interpretation of Plato in subsequent periods, particularly in nineteenth-century Britain. The volume also includes hitherto unpublished lectures, 'The Archaeology of Feeling', on the ancient origins of some key modern philosophical and psychological concepts.

M. F. BURNYEAT was formerly Laurence Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Cambridge and a Senior Research Fellow at All Souls College, Oxford.

CAROL ATACK is a Fellow of Newnham College, Cambridge. She is the author of *The Discourse of Kingship in Classical Greece* (2020) and an associate editor of *Polis*. She previously worked with Myles Burnyeat in the preparation of *The Pseudo-Platonic Seventh Letter* (2015).

MALCOLM SCHOFIELD is Emeritus Professor of Ancient Philosophy at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of St John's College. He was co-editor with Myles Burnyeat and Jonathan Barnes of *Doubt and Dogmatism* (1980), the first volume of the published proceedings of a series of triennial conferences on Hellenistic philosophy that continues to the present. His most recent book is a survey of Cicero's political thought (2021).

DAVID SEDLEY is Laurence Professor of Ancient Philosophy Emeritus at the University of Cambridge and a Fellow of Christ's College. He was an editor of *Classical Quarterly* and *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy*. His books include (with A. A. Long) *The Hellenistic Philosophers* (1987) and *Creationism and Its Critics in Antiquity* (2007).

EXPLORATIONS IN ANCIENT AND MODERN PHILOSOPHY

VOLUME III

M. F. BURNYEAT

Prepared for publication by

CAROL ATACK

Newnham College, Cambridge

MALCOLM SCHOFIELD

University of Cambridge

DAVID SEDLEY

University of Cambridge



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-009-04866-8 — Explorations in Ancient and Modern Philosophy
Myles Burnyeat
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009048668

DOI: 10.1017/9781009047982

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2022

First paperback edition 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN – Set 978-1-009-04777-7 Hardback
ISBN – Volume I 978-0-521-75072-1 Hardback
ISBN – Volume II 978-0-521-75073-8 Hardback
ISBN – Volume III 978-1-316-51793-2 Hardback
ISBN – Volume IV 978-1-316-51794-9 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-009-04866-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	x
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xii
Introduction	I
PART I: THE REPUBLIC	3
1 Plato on why mathematics is good for the soul	5
2 Long walk to wisdom	73
3 The truth of tripartition	78
4 Plato and the dairy-maids: the distribution of happiness inside and outside the ideal city of the <i>Republic</i>	96
5 Justice writ large and small in <i>Republic</i> iv	119
6 Fathers and sons in Plato's <i>Republic</i> and <i>Philebus</i>	138
7 By the Dog	148
8 Culture and society in Plato's <i>Republic</i>	154
8a Lecture I. Couches, song, and civic tradition	154
8b Lecture II. Art and the menace of mimesis	183
8c Lecture III. Farewell to Homer and the honeyed muse	208

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
	PART II: THE PAST IN THE PRESENT	239
9	Plato	241
10	James Mill on Thomas Taylor's Plato: Introduction	264
11	What was 'the common arrangement'? An inquiry into John Stuart Mill's boyhood reading of Plato	272
12	The past in the present: Plato as educator of nineteenth-century Britain	306
	<i>Appendix: The Archaeology of Feeling</i>	329
I	Ancient freedoms	329
II	Anger and revenge	356
III	Happiness and tranquillity	377
IV	Other minds, other faces: philosophy and physiognomics in the ancient world	397
	<i>Bibliography</i>	418
	<i>Index locorum</i>	433

Illustrations

Figure 1.1 Construction of an icosahedron.	<i>page</i> 6
Figure 1.2	29
Figure 1.3	31
Figure 1.4	33
Figure 1.5 Motions of the Same and the Different.	53
Figure 1.6 Mars in Sagittarius, 3/86–11/86: loop dimensions 11° 47' × 1° 11'. Reproduced from Ido Yavetz, 'On the Homocentric Spheres of Eudoxus', <i>Archive for History of Exact Sciences</i> 52 (1998), 221–78.	55
Figure 8.1 Red-figure Attic kylix attributed to the Brygos Painter, <i>circa</i> 490–480 BC, showing a symposium scene. British Museum E68 = ARV ² 371.24. © The Trustees of the British Museum.	169
Figure 8.2 Red-figure Attic kylix attributed to Douris, <i>circa</i> 485–480 BC: symposium scene showing couches. British Museum E49 = ARV ² 432.52. © The Trustees of the British Museum.	190
Figure 8.3 Red-figure Attic kylix, dated 510–500 BC: a carpenter at work. British Museum E23 = ARV ² 179.1. © The Trustees of the British Museum.	219
Figure 9.1 Sample page from <i>Platonis omnia opera</i> (1556). Reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library.	242
Figure 9.2 Sample page from <i>Divini Platonis opera omnia quae extant</i> (1602). Reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library.	242

viii	<i>Illustrations</i>	
Figure 9.3	Sample page from <i>Platonis philosophi quae exstant Graece ad editionem H. Stephani accurate expressa, cum M. Ficini interpretatione</i> (1781–7). Reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library.	243
Figure 11.1	Page 489 from the 1556 Basel edition of the complete works of Plato, showing <i>Timaeus</i> 61b2–c5 with the heavy use of ligatures (FF.2.40). Reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library.	286
Figure 11.2	Page 1221 from the 1602 Frankfurt edition of the complete works of Plato, showing <i>Phaedrus</i> 245a5–b4 (L.9.7). Reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library.	289
Figure 11.3	Page 133 from Volume 4 of the Bipont multi-volume edition of the complete works of Plato, showing <i>Gorgias</i> 508d2–e2 (7700.c.413). Reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library.	297
Figure App. IV.1	Page 59 from Giambattista della Porta, <i>De humana physiognomonia</i> , 1586, showing human and animal tranquillity. Photo courtesy of Linda Hall Library.	407

Preface

Under the title *Explorations in Ancient and Modern Philosophy* (Cambridge University Press, 2012), Myles Burnyeat published two volumes of those of his collected papers that represented work dating from his periods teaching at University College London (1964–78) and the University of Cambridge (1978–96). He foresaw that a further collection might at some future date assemble publications and perhaps hitherto unpublished papers dating from his tenure of a Senior Research Fellowship at All Souls College, Oxford (1996–2006) and in subsequent retirement. Declining health did not allow him to implement that plan. Without any more specific guidance it was eventually left to his literary executors (Angela Hobbs, Malcolm Schofield, and David Sedley) to propose to Cambridge University Press two further volumes of his collected papers, representing the philosophical work of this later period. The principles governing their choices are sketched in the Introductions to each of the volumes.

It remains to tender warmest thanks to those individuals and bodies who have facilitated the appearance of Volumes III and IV of *Explorations*: first and foremost Margaret Bent, and for generous financial assistance All Souls College; Oliver Padel; George Boys-Stones, Victor Caston, and James Warren. Michael Sharp at Cambridge University Press has been strongly supportive throughout, and his colleagues Sarah Starkey and Katie Idle, and Lesley Hay and Franklin Mathews Jebaraj, have been unfailingly helpful in shepherding these volumes through the production process. The editorial work itself was undertaken by Carol Attack, Malcolm Schofield, and David Sedley.

CWA, MS, DNS

Acknowledgements

The following chapters in this book were previously published as follows:

- 1 'Plato on why mathematics is good for the soul': in Timothy Smiley, ed., *Mathematics and Necessity* (Proceedings of the British Academy 103) (Oxford, 2000), 1–81
- 2 'Long walk to wisdom', review of Andrea Nightingale, *Spectacles of Truth in Classical Greek Philosophy: Theoria in Its Cultural Context*: *Times Literary Supplement*, 24 February 2006, 9
- 3 'The truth of tripartition': *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* 106 (2005–6), 1–23
- 5 'Justice writ large and small in *Republic* iv': in Verity Harte and Melissa Lane, eds., *Politeia in Greek and Roman Philosophy* (Cambridge, 2013), 212–30
- 6 'Fathers and sons in Plato's *Republic* and *Philebus*': *Classical Quarterly* 54 (2004), 80–87
- 7 'By the Dog', review of Ruby Blondell, *The Play of Characters in Plato's Dialogues*: *London Review of Books*, 7 August 2003, 23–4
- 8 'Culture and society in Plato's *Republic*': *The Tanner Lectures on Human Values* 20 (1999), 215–324
- 9 'Plato': *Proceedings of the British Academy* 111 (2001), 1–22
- 10 'James Mill on Thomas Taylor's Plato: Introduction': *Apeiron* 34 (2001), 101–10
- 11 'What was "the common arrangement"? An inquiry into John Stuart Mill's boyhood reading of Plato': *Utilitas* 13 (2001), 1–32; *Philologus* 145 (2001), 158–86; *Apeiron* 34 (2001), 51–90
- 12 'The past in the present: Plato as educator of nineteenth-century Britain': in Amélie Oksenberg Rorty, ed., *Philosophers on Education: Historical Perspectives* (London–New York, 1998), 353–73

Acknowledgements

xi

Note: To give help in following up references, the original pagination of the reprinted articles is indicated at the top of each page on the inner margin, and the original page divisions are marked in the course of the text by a pair of vertical lines, ||.

Abbreviations

ARV ²	J.D. Beazley, <i>Attic Red-figure Vase-painters</i> , 2nd edn, Oxford
DK	H. Diels and W. Kranz, <i>Die Fragmente der Vorsokratiker</i> , 10th edn, Berlin 1960–1
EAMP	M. F. Burnyeat, <i>Explorations in Ancient Philosophy</i> , Vols. 1–IV, Cambridge 2012–22
FGrH	F. Jacoby, <i>Die Fragmente der griechischen Historiker</i> , Berlin 1923–58
KRS	G. S. Kirk, J. E. Raven and M. Schofield, <i>The Presocratic Philosophers: A Critical History with a Selection of Texts</i> , 2nd edn, Cambridge 1983
LS	A. A. Long and D. N. Sedley, <i>The Hellenistic Philosophers</i> , 2 Vols., Cambridge 1987
LSJ	H. G. Liddell and R. Scott, <i>Greek–English Lexicon</i> , 9th edn rev. H. Stuart Jones, Oxford 1925–40
MCW	J. S. Mill, <i>Collected Works</i> , London and Toronto 1963–91
OED	<i>Oxford English Dictionary</i> , 2nd edn, Oxford 1989.
RE	A. Pauly, G. Wissowa and W. Kroll, <i>Real-Encyclopädie der classischen altertumswissenschaft</i> , 83 Vols., Stuttgart 1893–1980
SVF	<i>Stoicorum Veterum Fragmenta</i> , Leipzig 1903–24

Classical references are abbreviated according to *The Oxford Classical Dictionary* 4th edn, with the exception of the following:

M	Sextus Empiricus, <i>Against the Mathematicians</i>
---	---

Introduction

This volume collects those of Myles Burnyeat's philosophical publications from his Oxford period and in retirement that were devoted to two particular areas of his Plato scholarship. He had regularly lectured in his Cambridge days on the central books of Plato's *Republic*. But it was in these later years that he was able to articulate in extended published form his multi-faceted vision of the dialogue. One highly developed but hitherto unpublished paper ('Plato and the dairy-maids') appeared to require only one or two small finishing touches, and is also included. In addition, two short book reviews which address further important aspects of the *Republic's* philosophy or literary form are reproduced.

In a second part of the volume four closely connected papers are presented that deal wholly or in part with the study of Plato in Great Britain in mostly the earlier years of the nineteenth century. These reflect Burnyeat's admiration particularly of the contributions to Plato scholarship and interpretation made by the 'philosophical radicals' – and at the same time of their commitment to the educational ideals crystallised in the foundation of University College London, his own academic home for fourteen years. Chapters 9 and 12 in particular range more widely, and over other dimensions of Plato's philosophical impact through the centuries, or of what Burnyeat epitomised as 'the past in the present', a theme pursued also (with reference more to Hellenistic philosophy) in an Appendix to the volume.

The Appendix contains the texts of a lecture series addressed to a wider audience that Burnyeat gave in many universities from 1990 over the following two decades. They explore the roots in antiquity of some fundamental elements of the modern conception of the mind, although sometimes too the gulf between the past and the present. It appears that he would invariably deliver the lectures on the concept of freedom and on anger and revenge. By 2003 he was conceiving of a book project containing expanded versions, adding as a fourth chapter a similar version of a

lecture entitled ‘Other minds, other faces’. He had developed a fascination with physiognomy ancient and modern, and more generally with the physical expression of emotion. These explorations of ‘The Archaeology of Feeling’, as he called the series, provoked a great deal of still continuing interest, and are included – despite their author’s well-known aversion to the unauthorised publication or published discussion of his unpublished writings – in response to the warmth of that reception and as testimony to his ability to speak to the ‘common reader’ or listener.