

SEEKING SUPREMACY

The emergence of the judiciary as an assertive and confrontational centre of power has been the most consequential new feature of Pakistan's political system. This book maps out the evolution of the relationship between the judiciary and military in Pakistan, explaining why Pakistan's high courts shifted from loyal deference to the military to open competition, and confrontation, with military and civilian institutions. Yasser Kureshi demonstrates that a shift in the audiences shaping judicial preferences explains the emergence of the judiciary as an assertive power centre. As the judiciary gradually embraced less deferential institutional preferences, a shift in judicial preferences took place and the judiciary sought to play a more expansive and authoritative political role. Using this audience-based approach, Kureshi roots the judiciary in its political, social and institutional context, and develops a generalizable framework that can explain variation and change in judicial-military relations around the world.

Yasser Kureshi is the John and Daria Barry Postdoctoral Fellow in constitutional theory and law at the University of Oxford. His research concerns the military and the judiciary and their impact on constitutional configurations and democratic outcomes in authoritarian and post-authoritarian states. His other research interests include democratic backsliding in South Asia, coup legitimization strategies, federalism and the making of legal cultures. His work has appeared in the *Journal of Comparative Politics*, the *Journal of Conflict Resolution* and *Democratization*.

CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Founded in 1997, Cambridge Studies in Law and Society is a hub for leading scholarship in socio-legal studies. Located at the intersection of law, the humanities, and the social sciences, it publishes empirically innovative and theoretically sophisticated work on law's manifestations in everyday life: from discourses to practices, and from institutions to cultures. The series editors have longstanding expertise in the interdisciplinary study of law, and welcome contributions that place legal phenomena in national, comparative, or international perspective. Series authors come from a range of disciplines, including anthropology, history, law, literature, political science, and sociology.

Series Editors

Mark Fathi Massoud, *University of California, Santa Cruz*

Jens Meierhenrich, *London School of Economics and Political Science*

Rachel E. Stern, *University of California, Berkeley*

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.

CAMBRIDGE
STUDIES IN
LAW AND SOCIETY

SEEKING SUPREMACY
The Pursuit of Judicial Power in Pakistan

Yasser Kureshi
University of Oxford





Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009016445

DOI: 10.1017/9781009025515

© Yasser Kureshi 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2022

First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Kureshi, Yasser, author.

Title: Seeking supremacy : the pursuit of judicial power in Pakistan / Yasser Kureshi, University of Oxford.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Series: Cambridge studies in law and society | Based on author's thesis (doctoral - Brandeis University, 2018) issued under title: Judging the generals : judicial-military interactions in authoritarian and post-authoritarian states. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021058038 (print) | LCCN 2021058039 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316516935 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009016445 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009025515 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Political questions and judicial power—Pakistan—History. | Judges—Political activity—Pakistan—History. | Civil-military relations—Pakistan—History.

Classification: LCC KPL3499 .K87 2022 (print) | LCC KPL3499 (ebook) | DDC 347.5491/014—dc23/eng/20220207

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021058038>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021058039>

ISBN 978-1-316-51693-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-009-01644-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Ami and Abou

CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures</i>	page viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	x
Introduction	1
1 The Judiciary, Rule of Law and the Military	18
2 The Loyal Court (1947–1977): The Entrenchment of a Judicial–Military Partnership	48
3 The Controlled Court (1977–1999, Part 1): A Judiciary in Transition	83
4 Between the Barracks and the Bar (1977–1999, Part 2): A Judiciary in Transition	111
5 The Confrontational Court (1999–2017): The Judiciary Challenges Military and Civilian Power	153
6 Epilogue: A Judiciary Fragmenting?	220
7 Conclusion and Comparative Perspectives	238
<i>Appendix: Structure of the Pakistani Judiciary</i>	265
<i>References</i>	267
<i>Index</i>	280

FIGURES

1.1 Judicial assertiveness against the military over time (1974–2013)	<i>page</i> 35
1.2 Judicial assertiveness against the military, by prerogative type (1974–2013)	36
1.3 Evolution of the Pakistani judiciary	46
4.1 Proportion of Supreme Court judges educated abroad (1956–2017)	121
4.2 Proportion of Supreme Court judges recruited from the bar of professional lawyers (1956–2017)	134
A.1 Structure of the Pakistani judiciary	266

TABLES

1.1 A typology of judicial relationships with the military	<i>page</i> 32
2.1 Summary of decisions in military prerogative cases (1973–1977)	77
3.1 Proportion of reported High Court/Supreme Court decisions favouring the military regime (1977–1981)	91
3.2 Proportion of reported High Court decisions challenging military regime by year (1978–1980)	91
3.3 Reported judgments pertaining to MLAs and military courts (1986–1988)	97
3.4 Reported judgments pertaining to the military’s economic prerogatives (1990–1999)	105
3.5 Supreme Court’s reported judgments pertaining to military prerogatives (1990–1999)	107
5.1 Comparison of reported judgments pertaining to the military’s economic prerogatives (1988–1999 and 2002–2005)	164
5.2 Comparison of reported judgments pertaining to military prerogatives (1989–1999 and 2009–2015)	181
7.1 Cross-national variation in judicial relationship with the military	242

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book and the professional and personal path leading to its completion began when I was a young Pakistani undergraduate student in the USA, watching from a distance, as a national movement demanding judicial independence and democracy unfolded. The unforgettable image of black-coated lawyers out in the streets, and judges being greeted with boisterous cheers and showered with flowers, inspired my long-term obsession with the complicated figure of the judge in Pakistan and beyond. Over a decade later, Pakistan's courts continue to elate and enrage, but never bore, and I am indebted to all those who enabled me to turn my youthful fascination into such a profound intellectual journey.

To begin with, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to the various institutions that provided funding and support for the research and writing of this book. This book was born out of my dissertation, and the original research in Pakistan was made possible by funding and support from Brandeis University and the Andrew Mellon Foundation. I would not have been able to complete my fieldwork in Pakistan without the generous support provided by the law firm Fazle Ghani Advocates. The firm graciously provided me with a desk in their state-of-the-art law library in Karachi and allowed me to carry out my case law research. Through the lawyers there, I immersed myself in the raucous and exciting world of Pakistani litigation. I would also like to thank the Dawn Group of Newspapers for providing me with access to their archive of newspaper clippings that proved a treasure trove of useful information. As a postdoctoral scholar, I was also privileged to have access to the resources of the libraries of the University of Oxford, through Trinity College and the Oxford School of Global and Area Studies. Thanks to the funding from the John and Daria Barry Foundation and the support from Trinity College, I have been able to complete my follow-up research and writing of this book.

During my time at Brandeis, Eva Bellin and Jeffrey Lenowitz were wonderful advisers, and Eva's committed mentorship and cheery

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

optimism helped me see this project through. Outside Brandeis, Lisa Hilbink's intellectual imprint can be found across this project, and her advice, feedback and encouragement have all been indispensable in turning my dissertation into the book. My graduate school friends, Victoria McGroary, Matthew Isaacs, Kelly Stedem, Adam Smith and Paul Spalletta, were also an invaluable source of support. Finally, I have learned a lot from the lawyers, judges, journalists and activists I met in the field in Karachi, Lahore and Islamabad, who helped me understand the often bewildering culture and politics of Pakistan's bar and judiciary and went out of their way to help me gain access to interviewees through their networks. These include Salahuddin Ahmed, Raheel Kamran Sheikh, Hasnaat Malik, Munir Malik, Waqqas Mir, Faisal Siddiqi, Hasnain Chaudhry, Justice (ret'd) Jawwad Khawaja, Justice Mansoor Ali Shah, Abdullah Malik, Ali Almani, Saroop Ijaz, Summaiya Zaidi, Sara Malkani, Abdul Moiz Jaferii, Jeeva Haroon, Ahad Zuberi, Yousuf Nasim, Maryam Khan, Rana Asadullah, Qaiser Abbas, and Kamran Noorani.

At Cambridge University Press, Jens Meierhenrich was immensely encouraging, and Finola o' Sullivan, Marianne Nield, Chloe Quinn, Divya Arjunan and the rest of the editorial team have provided me with vital editorial support. Their guidance and the comments I received from four anonymous reviewers have also greatly improved the quality of the final product.

Finally, I am blessed to have a family that has nurtured both my interests and my ambitions and patiently supported me on the long and uncertain path of research and writing. I owe an enormous debt of gratitude to my parents. My father, Salman Kureshi, has been discussing and debating politics with me since I was a child, instilling in me, and encouraging, a passion for the study of politics. My mother, Ambreen Kureshi's endless energy and tireless efforts as a teacher and as a mother made the path I have taken possible, and have been a source of inspiration for me in my own academic career. My sister, Kiran Kureshi, is one of the warmest and most reassuring and resourceful people I have known, and her unflinching support has been invaluable.

I am especially indebted to my loving wife, Zoha Waseem. We met when we were both doing fieldwork for our dissertations, and now we are turning our dissertations into books together. Without her guiding me in my fieldwork, brainstorming ideas, providing feedback on drafts of chapters and reassuring me through this overwhelming process,

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would have never been able to see this project through, and I cannot wait to see her book in print as well.

I am fortunate to have so many other family members and friends who have been so generous to me over these past few years. In Lahore, Nadir Khan, Aisha Malik and Aizaz Khan welcomed me, opened their home to me and made my fieldwork in Lahore and Islamabad possible. Amar Khan supported me through my extended, and seemingly endless, education, and Waseem Ahmed and Talat Waseem facilitated several of my most fruitful interviews and provided care and support in Karachi and London. Other friends and relatives in Karachi, London and Boston, including Nadir Siddiqui, Zane deSouza, Huma Mehmood, Madeeha Channah, Anika Lakhani, Mehreen Mehmood, Maqbool Mehmood, Haniya Khan, Sadia Akram, Zamir Akram, Nadir Iqbal, Moeen Mehmood, Dania Khan, Faizan Diwan, Syed Ali Danial Jafri, Sana Khan and Zamir Khan, and many others, have all supported me along this journey.

The biggest challenge with such a project is completing it and seeing it leave your hands and go out into the world. I am thankful to all those who have helped this project progress to this point today, and I hope the book will do justice to all their generosity.