

## THE CASE OF IRELAND

The late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries have long been seen as a foundational period for modern Irish political traditions such as nationalism, republicanism and unionism. *The Case of Ireland* offers a fresh account of Ireland's neglected role in European debates about commerce and empire in what was a global era of war and revolution. Drawing on a range of writings from merchants, agrarian improvers, philosophers, politicians and revolutionaries across Europe, this book shows how Ireland became a field of conflict and projection between rival visions of politics in commercial society, associated with the warring empires of Britain and France. It offers a new perspective on the crisis and transformation of the British Empire at the end of the eighteenth century, and restores Ireland to its rightful place at the centre of European intellectual history.

JAMES STAFFORD studied history at Oxford and Cambridge, completing his doctoral research in 2016. After postdoctoral work in Oxford and Bielefeld he is now Assistant Professor of History at Columbia University. He is a frequent commentator on contemporary British and European politics for a range of outlets, and was co-editor of *Renewal: A Journal of Social Democracy* from 2015–20.

## IDEAS IN CONTEXT

*Edited by* DAVID ARMITAGE, RICHARD BOURKE  
and JENNIFER PITTS

The books in this series will discuss the emergence of intellectual traditions and of related new disciplines. The procedures, aims and vocabularies that were generated will be set in the context of the alternatives available within the contemporary frameworks of ideas and institutions. Through detailed studies of the evolution of such traditions, and their modification by different audiences, it is hoped that a new picture will form of the development of ideas in their concrete contexts. By this means, artificial distinctions between the history of philosophy, of the various sciences, of society and politics, and of literature may be seen to dissolve.

A full list of titles in the series can be found at: [www.cambridge.org/IdeasContext](http://www.cambridge.org/IdeasContext)

# THE CASE OF IRELAND

*Commerce, Empire and the European Order, 1750–1848*

JAMES STAFFORD

*Columbia University*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
**UNIVERSITY PRESS**

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
 978-1-009-01374-1 — The Case of Ireland  
 James Stafford  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE  
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781009013741](http://www.cambridge.org/9781009013741)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009031905

© James Stafford 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2022  
 First paperback edition 2024

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data*

NAMES: Stafford, James, 1988- author.  
 TITLE: The case of Ireland : commerce, empire and the European order, 1750-1848 / James Stafford,  
 Columbia University, New York.  
 DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2022. |  
 SERIES: Ideas in context | Includes bibliographical references and index.  
 IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021044712 (print) | LCCN 2021044713 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316516126  
 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009013741 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009031905 (epub)  
 SUBJECTS: LCSH: Ireland—Commerce—History—18th century. | Ireland—Commerce—History—19th  
 century. | Ireland—Economic conditions—18th century. | Ireland—Economic conditions—19th cen-  
 tury. | Great Britain—Foreign relations—18th century. | Great Britain—Foreign relations—19th  
 century. | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / History & Theory  
 CLASSIFICATION: LCC HF3535 .s73 2022 (print) | LCC HF3535 (ebook) | DDC 382.09417/  
 09033—dcundefined  
 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021044712>  
 LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021044713>

ISBN 978-1-316-51612-6 Hardback  
 ISBN 978-1-009-01374-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

*For Clara*

## *Contents*

|  |                |
|--|----------------|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i>  | <i>page</i> ix |
| Introduction   | I              |
| An Age of Crisis   | 4              |
| The British Empire in Europe   | 8              |
| Conquest, Liberty and Aristocracy  | 11             |
| Visions of Commercial Society  | 14             |
| The Case of Ireland  | 17             |
| I The Enlightenment Critique of Empire in Ireland,                                   |                |
| c. 1750–1776   | 23             |
| Conquest and Colonisation, 1542–1692   | 25             |
| <i>The Case of Ireland</i> and the Woollen Controversy                               | 29             |
| The Declaratory Act (1720) and the Penal Laws (1695–1728)                            | 33             |
| ‘Improvement’ and the Catholic Question  | 35             |
| Montesquieu, Hume, Smith and Tucker on Ireland and<br>‘Jealousy of Trade’            | 43             |
| Smith, Young and the Political Economy of Anglo-Irish<br>Ascendancy                  | 49             |
| Regenerating Empire  | 56             |
| 2 Commerce without Empire? ‘Free Trade’ and ‘Legislative<br>Independence’, 1776–1787 | 59             |
| Molyneux’s <i>Case</i> and the ‘Friends of America’                                  | 62             |
| Commerce and the Balance of Power  | 67             |
| Free Ports and Protecting Duties   | 73             |
| From ‘Foederal Union’ to Commercial Propositions                                     | 78             |
| Sugar, Manufactures and the Revision of the Propositions                             | 84             |
| The Irish Debate on the Revised Propositions   | 90             |
| Josiah Tucker on Ireland and the Slave Trade   | 95             |
| A Revolution in Retrospect   | 97             |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| viii | <i>Contents</i>  |     |
| 3    | Property, Revolution and Peace, 1789–1803  | 100 |
|      | ‘A Rank among the Primary Nations of the Earth’  | 104 |
|      | War, Empire and Slavery  | 114 |
|      | Arthur O’Connor and the ‘Natural Progress of Opulence’                                       | 120 |
|      | Ireland and French Empire  | 129 |
|      | Rival Universalisms  | 137 |
| 4    | Enlightenment against Revolution: Commerce, Aristocracy<br>and the Case for Union, 1798–1801 | 139 |
|      | An Empire Divided  | 143 |
|      | Faction, Religion and Aristocracy  | 147 |
|      | Poverty and Disaffection   | 152 |
|      | John Foster and Thomas Brooke Clarke on Commerce and ‘Feudalism’                             | 156 |
|      | William Drennan and the Radical Critique of Union  | 162 |
|      | Friedrich Gentz on Union and the Balance of Power  | 165 |
|      | The ‘System of Burkism’?   | 171 |
| 5    | The Granary of Great Britain: War, Population<br>and Agriculture 1798–1815                   | 174 |
|      | Currency and Capital   | 177 |
|      | Grain and Emancipation   | 183 |
|      | Ireland and the Continental System   | 190 |
|      | Dependency and Empire  | 196 |
|      | Robert Malthus, Edward Wakefield and the Politics of the Potato                              | 200 |
|      | The Making of an Orthodoxy   | 207 |
| 6    | Democracy, Nationality and the Social Question,<br>1815–1848                                 | 210 |
|      | The British Economists and the ‘Cottage System’  | 213 |
|      | Property and the Social Question   | 220 |
|      | Gustave de Beaumont, Ireland and the Future of Democracy                                     | 228 |
|      | Young Ireland and the Political Economy of ‘Nationality’                                     | 238 |
|      | James Fintan Lalor and John Stuart Mill on Famine and Revolution                             | 244 |
|      | The Legacies of Revolution   | 250 |
|      | Conclusion: Ireland between Empires  | 253 |
|      | <i>Bibliography</i>  | 261 |
|      | <i>Index</i>   | 289 |

## *Acknowledgements*

This book is based on a doctoral thesis written at the University of Cambridge, supported by a Doctoral Award from the UK Arts and Humanities Research Council. I am additionally grateful to Emmanuel College, University of Cambridge; the Kurt Hahn Trust; and the Cambridge University History Faculty Doctoral Language Fund for their support, which allowed me to take language learning courses in Besançon and Munich. The British Association of Irish Studies, the History Faculty at the University of Cambridge, and Emmanuel College offered grants that enabled me to conduct archival research in Belfast and Dublin. I conducted additional research and revised the manuscript for publication as a postdoctoral fellow at the German Federal Research Council (DFG)–funded Research Training Group GRK 2225/1 ‘World Politics’, hosted at Bielefeld University.

I would like to extend my thanks to staff at the Cambridge University Library, the Marshall Economics Library, the British Library, the *Bayerische Staatsbibliothek*, the National Library of Ireland, the Royal Irish Academy, the Public Records Office of Northern Ireland and the Manuscripts Room at the National Library of Ireland for their assistance.

John Robertson first suggested the Free Trade crisis and Pitt’s Commercial Propositions to me as a possible subject for doctoral research. He has been a consistently inspiring and reassuring presence throughout the long years this book has taken to complete. Different aspects of the book have also benefitted from conversations over many years with István Hont (who supervised this research from 2011 until his death in 2013), Richard Bourke, Joanna Innes, Richard Whatmore, Ian McBride, Tom Pye, Lucian Robinson, Matthew Ward, Anna Plassart, Clara Maier, Peter Hession and Michael Sonenscher. I am also grateful to the two anonymous readers who produced reports on the manuscript for Cambridge University Press, and to Liz Friend-Smith and Melissa Ward for their patience and support throughout its production, editing and revision.



Different parts of this book have taken shape in one form or another over many years at seminars, conferences and job interviews all over Europe and the USA. I would like to thank Emily Jones, Natasha Wheatley, Nick Mulder, Niall O’Flaherty, Julia Nicholls, Emily Jones, Jon Parkin, David Leopold, Sam Zeitlin, Ben Jackson, Marc Mulholland, David Leopold, Hannah Dawson, Eugenio Biagini, Roy Foster, Wencke Meteling, Renaud Morieux, Susan Pedersen, Christopher Brown, Nicholas Dames, Stephanie McCurry, Niamh Gallagher, Colin Reid, Deborah Valenze, Peter Mandler, Maggie Scull, Naomi Lloyd-Jones, Waseem Yaqoob, Tobias Werron, Mathias Albert, Daniela Russ and Simon Hecke for their invitations, encouragement and insights, either during these occasions or in helping me to prepare for them.

I will always be grateful to Johanna, Gerd, David and Ella Stegmaier for giving me such a warm welcome in Munich while I was learning German and finding out about Friedrich Gentz. In Dublin, Adam Larragy and Cliodhna O’Connor were model hosts. Throughout the writing of this book and the thesis that preceded it I have richly profited, both personally and intellectually, from the friendship of Miles Mantle, Florence Sutcliffe-Braithwaite, Alice Blackhurst, Graham Riach, Emily Rees, Lewis Goodall, Hannah Malone, Elizabeth Gilbert, Portia Roelofs, Matthew Kennedy, George Robinson, Sam Sweeney and Paulina Gimpel.

My mother, Deborah Stafford, and sister, Rosie Stafford, always help me to keep things in perspective. This book would have been much harder to write in the absence of their generous understanding of the strange working patterns and long distances that are regrettably involved in a twenty-first-century academic career. My youngest sister, Lydia Stafford, is always in our thoughts; but this is not the place to mourn.

Lastly and most of all, I would like to thank Clara Maier, who was with me virtually every day as this book was researched and written, enlivening every moment, even the most difficult, with her love, spirit and joy. The birth of our daughter, Ada, has provided me with the best possible reason to finally complete this work.