

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page xvii</i>
<i>Table of cases</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>Table of statutes</i>	<i>xxxv</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xlvi</i>
<i>Note on the text</i>	<i>xlviii</i>
<i>Guide to student resources</i>	<i>xlix</i>
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 What is evidence?	2
1.2.1 Evidence law	3
1.2.2 Principles versus rules	4
1.3 Background to the Act	4
1.3.1 Structure of the Act	5
1.3.2 Practical effect of the Act	6
1.4 Preliminary concepts	7
1.4.1 Criminal versus civil proceedings	7
1.4.2 Order of court proceedings	8
1.4.3 Functions of judge and jury	8
1.4.4 Burden and standard of proof: sections 140–2	10
Burden of proof	10
Standard of proof	11
A Victorian variation	13
1.4.5 Judicial notice: sections 143–5	15
1.4.6 Formal admissions: section 184	16
1.4.7 Preliminary questions – the voir dire: section 189	17
1.4.8 Waiver: section 190	18
1.4.9 Judicial directions and leave: section 192	19
1.4.10 Advance rulings and findings: section 192A	20
1.4.11 Appeals	21
1.5 Types and forms of evidence	21
Key points	23

Key terms and definitions	23
Further reading	24
2 Adducing evidence	25
2.1 Introduction	26
2.2 Calling a witness	27
2.3 Presumption of competence and compellability: section 12	28
2.4 Competence: section 13	29
2.4.1 Children and witnesses who are cognitively impaired	31
2.4.2 Alternative arrangements for giving evidence	38
Adult complainants	39
Children and complainants who are cognitively impaired	39
2.5 Compellability	42
2.5.1 Defendant: section 17	43
2.5.2 Defendant's family: section 18	43
Exclusion of section 18	49
2.5.3 Silence at trial	49
Common law	49
The Act	54
Jury directions in Victoria	55
2.6 Oaths and affirmations: sections 21 and 23–4	57
2.7 Questioning of witnesses	59
2.7.1 Parties and the judge: sections 26–9	59
2.7.2 Counsel	60
2.8 Examination-in-chief	60
2.8.1 Prohibition of leading questions	61
2.8.2 Reviving memory: sections 32–5	62
In court	63
Police officers	65
Out of court	67
2.8.3 Unfavourable witnesses: section 38	68
2.9 Cross-examination	82
2.9.1 Improper or disallowable questions: section 41	82
Northern Territory and Victoria: improper questioning and vulnerable witnesses	82
2.9.2 Leading questions: section 42	89
2.9.3 The rule against prior consistent statements	90
2.9.4 Exceptions to the rule against prior consistent statements: section 108(3)	91
2.9.5 Prior inconsistent statements: sections 43–5	93
2.9.6 The rule in <i>Browne v Dunn</i>	94

	Rebuttal and reopening	97
	Civil cases	97
	Criminal cases	97
	Leave to recall witnesses: section 46	98
2.10	Re-examination: section 39	98
2.11	Proof of contents of documents: section 48	99
2.12	Other evidence	102
	2.12.1 Part 2.3 – other evidence	102
	Key points	103
	Key terms and definitions	105
	Further reading	105
	Practice problem	106
3	Relevance	108
3.1	Introduction	108
3.2	Different types of relevance	109
	3.2.1 Directly relevant evidence	109
	3.2.2 Indirectly relevant evidence	109
3.3	Defining relevance	119
	3.3.1 The common law	119
	Legal relevance	119
	3.3.2 The Act: sections 55–6	120
	Logical relevance	120
	3.3.3 Judicial discretions: sections 135–7	121
3.4	Provisional relevance: sections 57–8	131
	Key points	132
	Key terms and definitions	132
	Further reading	133
	Practice problems	133
4	Hearsay	135
4.1	Introduction	136
4.2	The common law	137
	4.2.1 Express and implied assertions	137
	4.2.2 Non-hearsay purpose at common law	139
4.3	The Act: section 59	141
	4.3.1 Representation	141
	4.3.2 Previous representation	142
	4.3.3 Asserted fact	143

4.3.4	Made by a person	143
4.3.5	Intended to assert	143
4.4	Hearsay purpose	146
4.4.1	Non-hearsay purpose: section 60	151
4.5	Exceptions to the hearsay rule	157
4.5.1	Competency: section 61	157
4.5.2	First-hand hearsay: section 62	158
4.5.3	Civil proceedings – maker of the statement is not available: section 63	160
4.5.4	Civil proceedings – maker of the statement is available: section 64	160
4.5.5	Criminal proceedings – maker of the statement is not available: section 65	161
	Made under a duty: section 65(2)(a)	162
	Made when or shortly after . . . unlikely that the representation is a fabrication: section 65(2)(b)	162
	Highly probable that the representation is reliable: section 65(2)(c)	164
	Against the interests of the person: section 65(2)(d)	168
	Previous representation adduced by a defendant: section 65(8)	175
	Evidence of a previous representation about a matter . . . adduced by a defendant: section 65(9)	178
4.5.6	Criminal proceedings – maker of the statement is available: section 66	179
4.6	Contemporaneous mental and physical states	189
4.6.1	The common law	189
	Statements of intention	190
	State of mind	190
	Emotional state of mind	191
	Knowledge	191
4.6.2	The Act: section 66A	192
4.7	Business records: section 69	192
4.7.1	Tags, labels and writing: section 70	199
4.7.2	Electronic communications: section 71	199
	Key points	200
	Key terms and definitions	201
	Further reading	202
	Practice problems	202
5	Opinion	204
5.1	Introduction	204

5.2	Defining opinion evidence	205
5.3	The opinion rule: section 76	207
5.4	Exception – dual relevance: section 77	209
5.5	Exception – lay opinions: section 78	210
5.6	Exception – expert opinions: section 79	215
	5.6.1 Basis rule	219
	5.6.2 Expert opinion basis and hearsay	223
	5.6.3 Procedural issues	224
5.7	Other admissible opinions	225
5.8	Scope of application – ultimate issue and common knowledge: section 80	226
	Key points	227
	Key terms and definitions	228
	Further reading	228
	Practice problems	229
6	Admissions	230
6.1	Introduction	231
6.2	What is an admission?	231
	6.2.1 Exception to the hearsay and opinion rules: section 81	232
	6.2.2 Personal knowledge: section 82	234
	6.2.3 No application against third parties without consent: section 83	235
6.3	Admissions and confessions made in police custody	235
	6.3.1 Electronic recording	235
	6.3.2 In the course of official questioning	243
6.4	Voluntariness and reliability of admissions	244
	6.4.1 The common law	244
	6.4.2 The Act	245
	Violent, oppressive, inhuman or degrading conduct: section 84	245
	Reliability of admissions: section 85	246
	‘Investigating official’ or an ‘act of another person’	253
	Circumstances in which the admission was made	253
	Exclusion of records of oral questioning: section 86	261
	Authority to make statements: section 87	262
	Proving admissions: section 88	265
6.5	Statements and conduct that amount to admissions	265
	6.5.1 Failure to call witnesses or produce evidence in civil proceedings	267

6.5.2	Pre-trial silence in criminal proceedings	267
	Pre-trial silence: section 89	267
	Consciousness of guilt	270
	Inculpatory and exculpatory statements of the accused	271
6.6	Discretions to exclude admissions	277
6.6.1	The unfairness discretion: section 90	278
6.6.2	The case of <i>Haddara</i>	292
	Key points	293
	Key terms and definitions	294
	Further reading	295
	Practice problems	295
7	Tendency and coincidence	297
7.1	Introduction	298
7.2	When the rules do not apply	299
7.2.1	Non-application: section 94	299
	Evidence of credibility of witness	300
	Bail or sentencing	300
	Fact in issue	300
7.2.2	Use of evidence for other purposes: section 95	301
7.2.3	Use of evidence to prove good character	302
7.3	Formal requirements: sections 97–100	302
7.3.1	Purpose	302
	Tendency and/or coincidence purpose	302
	Tendency reasoning in civil cases	304
	Tendency reasoning in criminal cases	305
	Coincidence reasoning in civil cases	306
	Coincidence reasoning in criminal cases	307
7.3.2	Notice	307
7.3.3	Significant probative value	310
	(A) How is 'significant probative value' assessed?	310
	(B) Should the court assume the truthfulness and reliability of the evidence?	311
	Applying tendency evidence	316
	Applying coincidence evidence	348
	Some basic differences between tendency and coincidence reasoning	350
7.4	Further restrictions in criminal cases: section 101	351
7.4.1	Probative value versus prejudicial effect	351
7.4.2	Collusion, concoction or contamination	363
7.4.3	Prejudicial effect	365

7.5	Competing with other inferences	367
7.6	Judicial directions	368
7.6.1	Jury directions in Victoria	369
	Key points	372
	Key terms and definitions	372
	Further reading	372
	Practice problem	373
8	Credibility	374
8.1	Introduction	374
8.2	The collateral nature of credibility evidence	375
8.3	What is credibility evidence?	377
8.3.1	Current definition: section 101A	377
8.3.2	Redefining credibility evidence under the Act	379
8.4	The credibility rule: section 102	384
8.5	Exceptions to the credibility rule	385
8.5.1	Evidence adduced in cross-examination: section 103	385
8.5.2	Evidence adduced in cross-examination of an accused: section 104	387
8.5.3	Evidence in rebuttal of denials: section 106	389
8.5.4	Evidence to re-establish credibility: section 108	393
8.6	Credibility of non-witnesses	396
8.6.1	Evidence about a person who has made a previous representation: section 108A	396
8.6.2	Previous representations of an accused: section 108B	398
8.6.3	Expert opinion on a witness's credibility: section 108C	400
	Key points	402
	Key terms and definitions	402
	Further reading	403
	Practice problems	403
9	Character	405
9.1	Introduction	405
9.2	The meaning of 'character'	406
9.3	Character evidence about the accused	407
9.3.1	Adducing evidence of good character: section 110	407
9.3.2	Character in general or in a particular respect?	409
9.3.3	Judicial directions and discretion	419
9.3.4	Evidence about character of co-accused: section 111	422

9.3.5	Leave to cross-examine about character of accused or co-accused: section 112	423
9.4	Character evidence about complainants and victims	428
	Key points	430
	Key terms and definitions	430
	Further reading	431
	Practice problems	431
10	Identification evidence	433
10.1	Introduction	433
10.2	Defining identification evidence	434
10.2.1	Types of identification evidence	435
	Visual identification and picture identification	435
	In-court identification	435
	Out-of-court identification	436
	Formal identification procedures	436
10.3	The common law and identification parades	437
10.4	Visual identification evidence: section 114	441
10.4.1	Exclusion	442
10.4.2	The 'reasonableness' condition	442
10.5	Picture identification evidence: section 115	445
10.5.1	Pictures of people in police custody	447
10.5.2	Exclusion	447
10.5.3	Warnings	448
	Unreliability	448
10.6	Special need for caution: section 116	448
10.6.1	Jury directions in Victoria	449
10.7	The displacement effect	451
10.7.1	The role of section 137	453
	Key points	456
	Key terms and definitions	456
	Further reading	456
	Practice problem	457
11	Privileges	458
11.1	Introduction	459
11.2	Client legal privilege	461
11.2.1	Definitions: section 117	462
	'Lawyer'	463

	'Client'	464
	'Employee or agent'	464
	Confidentiality	464
11.2.2	Dominant purpose test	465
11.2.3	Legal advice privilege: section 118	470
	'Communication' and 'document'	470
	Copy documents	472
11.2.4	Litigation privilege: sections 119–20	472
11.2.5	Invoking client legal privilege	473
11.2.6	General loss of privilege: section 121	474
11.2.7	Waiver: section 122	475
11.2.8	Other causes of loss of privilege: sections 123–6	479
11.3	Professional confidential privilege	480
	11.3.1 Medical communications	483
11.4	Sexual assault communications privilege	484
11.5	Journalist privilege	488
11.6	Religious confessions	489
11.7	Privilege against self-incrimination	491
	11.7.1 The common law	491
	11.7.2 The Act: sections 128–128A	492
	Objection	496
	Determination	497
	Certificate	497
	Preliminary procedures	497
11.8	Judicial reasons	498
11.9	Public interest immunity	498
	11.9.1 The common law	498
	Class claims and contents claims	499
	11.9.2 The Act: section 130	508
	11.9.3 Matters of state	509
	Security, defence or international relations of Australia	509
	Investigation and prosecution	510
	Proper functioning of government	510
	Interest in disclosure	510
	Factors to take into account	511
11.10	Settlement negotiations	511
	11.10.1 The common law	511
	11.10.2 The Act: section 131	517
11.11	Pre-trial, trial and non-judicial proceedings: section 131A	519
11.12	General procedural issues	521
	Key points	522

Key terms and definitions	522
Further reading	523
Practice problem	523
12 Discretionary and mandatory exclusions	525
12.1 Introduction	526
12.2 General discretion to exclude evidence: section 135	526
12.2.1 'Unfairly prejudicial'	528
12.2.2 'Misleading or confusing'	528
12.2.3 'Undue waste of time'	529
12.3 General discretion to limit the use of evidence: section 136	530
12.4 Mandatory exclusion of evidence in criminal proceedings: section 137	531
12.4.1 'Probative value'	532
12.4.2 'Unfair prejudice'	543
Procedural unfairness	548
12.5 Discretion to exclude improperly or illegally obtained evidence	548
12.5.1 The common law	548
12.5.2 The Act	556
Discretion to exclude improperly or illegally obtained evidence: section 138	556
'Improper' and 'impropriety'	557
Cautioning of persons: section 139	566
12.6 Corroboration	567
12.6.1 The common law	568
12.6.2 The Act: section 164	569
12.7 Unreliable evidence	569
12.7.1 Warning in relation to unreliable evidence: section 165	570
12.7.2 Warnings in relation to children's evidence: section 165A	571
12.7.3 Delay in prosecution: section 165B	572
Key points	575
Key terms and definitions	575
Further reading	576
Practice problem	576
13 Facilitation of proof and ancillary matters	577
13.1 Introduction	577
13.2 Facilitation of proof	577
13.2.1 The common law	578
13.2.2 General: sections 146–52	578

13.2.3	Matters of official record: sections 153–9	580
13.2.4	Post and communications: sections 160–3	581
13.3	Ancillary provisions	583
13.3.1	Requests: sections 166–9	583
13.3.2	Affidavits: sections 170–3	584
13.3.3	Foreign law: sections 174–6	584
13.3.4	Procedures for proving other matters: sections 177–81	586
13.4	Miscellaneous matters	587
	Key points	588
	Key terms and definitions	589
	Further reading	589
	Practice problem	589
14	Putting it all together: extended practice problems	590
	<i>Suggested answers to practice problems in Chapters 2–13</i>	595
	<i>Index</i>	609