

ICSID Reports

Volume 13

The *ICSID Reports* provide the only comprehensive published collection of arbitral awards and decisions given under the auspices of the World Bank's International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes or pursuant to other multilateral or bilateral investment treaties, including in particular the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and the Energy Charter Treaty (ECT). These decisions, which are fully indexed, make an important contribution to the growing body of jurisprudence on international investment. The *ICSID Reports* are an invaluable tool for practitioners and scholars working in the field of international commercial arbitration or advising foreign investors. Volume 13 of the *ICSID Reports* includes the awards and Svea Court of Appeal decisions in *Nagel* v. *Czech Republic* and *Petrobart Limited* v. *Kyrgyz Republic*, the NAFTA award in *GAMI Investments Inc.* v. *Mexico* and the decision on annulment in *MTD* v. *Chile*.



ICSID REPORTS

Volume

13



This volume may be cited as: 13 ICSID Reports



ICSID REPORTS

Reports of cases decided under the Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States, 1965 and related decisions on international protection of investments

Volume

13

EDITED

BY

JAMES CRAWFORD, SC, FBA, LLD (Cantab.)

Whewell Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge

AND

KAREN LEE, MA (Cantab.)

Fellow of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge Fellow of Girton College, Cambridge

CONSULTING EDITOR Sir ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE, QC

Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge Bencher of Gray's Inn

A PUBLICATION OF
THE LAUTERPACHT CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW,
UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

GROTIUS PUBLICATIONS





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521899871

© Cambridge University Press 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-89987-1

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

Introduction	Page ix
Editorial Note	
	xi
Acknowledgements	xiii
Table of Cases Reported in Volume 13	xiv
Table of Cases Reported in Volumes 1–13	xvi
Digest of Cases Reported in Volume 13	xxviii
CASES	
Link-Trading Joint Stock Company v. Department for Customs Control of the Republic of Moldova	3
Award on Jurisdiction, 16 February 2001	6
Final Award, 18 April 2002	14
Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and Telecommunications) (SCC Case No. 49/2002)	30
Final Award, 9 September 2003 Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 26 August 2005 Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and	33
Telecommunications)	96
IBM World Trade Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador	102
(ICSID Case No. ARB/02/10)	102
Decision on Jurisdiction and Competence, 22 December 2003	105
Dissenting opinion	118
Note on Settlement	120
Joy Mining Machinery Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/03/11)	121
Award on Jurisdiction, 6 August 2004	123
Note on Settlement	143

vii



viii Co	ONTENTS	
GAMI Investments Inc. v. Governmen	nt of the United Mexican States	144
Final Award, 15 November 2004		147
Československá Obchodní Banka AS (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/4)	v. Slovak Republic	178
Award, 29 December 2004		181
Plama Consortium Limited v. Republication (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/24)	lic of Bulgaria	268
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 Februa Order on Provisional Measures, 6	•	272 324
Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic	:	335
Award I, 13 February 2003 Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Co		337
Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Rep	oublic	369
Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic	(SCC Case No. 126/2003)	381
Award II, 29 March 2005 Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Co	ourt of Appeal, 19 January 2007	387
Kyrgyz Republic v. Petrobart Li	•	480
MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chil (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7)	e SA v. Republic of Chile	488
Decision on Respondent's Reques Execution, 1 June 2005		493
Decision on Annulment, 21 March	n 2007	500
INDEX		
Index, Volume 13		534



INTRODUCTION

Arbitral tribunals and *ad hoc* committees set up under the Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States administered by the International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID) have produced a large number of awards and decisions. In recent years, through the Additional Facility mechanism, their number has increased substantially, and their contribution both to the substance of international investment law and the procedure of international arbitration grows in importance. Chapter Eleven arbitration under NAFTA will increasingly contribute its share; so too do the increasing number of *ad hoc* arbitral decisions under bilateral and multilateral investment treaties, which are also included in this series. Many of these cases raise vital issues of investment protection and relate to fundamental questions of the relations between national and international law.

Article 48(5) of the ICSID Convention provides that the Centre shall not publish an award without the consent of the parties thereto. In the absence of an official series of reports of these texts, many have appeared unofficially, from time to time, in a variety of publications in different parts of the world. For those who wish to refer to these awards and decisions in a systematic manner, this diffusion has been a source of difficulty. There is considerable value in collecting and presenting this material in a single publication accompanied by summaries, tables of cases and with a detailed index. Some of the texts have previously been available only in French or Spanish.

James Crawford Karen Lee

Lauterpacht Centre for International Law University of Cambridge

February 2008



EDITORIAL NOTE

The ICSID Reports contain decisions rendered by arbitral tribunals and ad hoc committees set up within the framework of the Centre established pursuant to the ICSID Convention (including those rendered by ICSID tribunals established pursuant to bilateral investment treaties) and other decisions, whether judicial or arbitral, relating to such proceedings. These are accompanied by a full scholarly apparatus and index.

Volume 1 contains, in addition to the Basic Texts of the ICSID system, decisions in cases commenced during the period 1972 to 1981. Volume 2 contains material relating to proceedings commenced between 1981 and 1983, and Volume 3 contains the first three proceedings commenced in 1984. Volume 4 contains the texts of decisions and awards relating to ICSID cases commenced between 1984 and 1992. Volume 5 contains available texts of decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1992 and 2000, and Volume 6 contains those commenced between 1995 and 2001. Volume 7 contains decisions and awards for arbitration proceedings commenced between 1997 and 2002. Volume 8 contains decisions and awards for arbitration proceedings commenced between 1996 and 2002. Volume 9 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1990 and 2003. Volume 10 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1998 and 2004. Volume 11 contains those for proceedings commenced between 2000 and 2002. Volume 12 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 2001 and 2003 and Volume 13 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1997 and 2004. These cases are printed in chronological order according to the date of the main award or the date of the first reported stage of proceeding. All the proceedings relating to any given case are, so far as possible, assembled together in their own chronological order.

The awards and decisions in these *Reports* are reproduced, to the greatest extent possible, in the form in which they were handed down. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of a summary and of a bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. These are followed by the full text of the original decision, if available, or its translation. No attempt has been made to tamper with the texts by purporting to correct any errors or to clarify obscurities of expression.

Attempts have been made to obtain the full text of all awards and decisions. Where only excerpts are available these have been reproduced. Any omission of material is indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets stating the nature of the passage which has been omitted. Should the full text of a previously excerpted or omitted decision or award subsequently become available it will be published in a later volume in the series.

Bold-letter headings preceding each case indicate the main points of law involved in the decision. These entries are also collected in a digest at the beginning of the volume.



xii

EDITORIAL NOTE

The source of the material in this volume is indicated at the end of each case. Where the material has been published in more than one language, one publication in each language is listed. The language of the original decision is also mentioned.

Various tables are printed at the beginning of each volume: an alphabetical table of cases reported in the volume, a consolidated alphabetical table of all the cases so far reported and a digest of the cases reported in the volume.

Earlier volumes contained a consolidated index. This has become impossible due to space considerations, and thus from volume 11 the index is confined to the volume in question. The consolidated index for volumes 1–10 is to be found at 10 *ICSID Reports* 453.



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The permissions granted for the publication of the following texts are gratefully acknowledged. Particular thanks are due to the Arbitration Institute of the Stockholm Chamber of Commerce for its kind permission to publish the full Award and related court decision in *Nagel* v. *Czech Republic*.

In addition to those prepared by the Editors, summaries were written by Ms Ana Gerdau de Borja, Ms Razan Jafar, Mr Jonathan Ketcheson, Ms Kate Parlett and Ms Monique Sasson. Ms Tara Grant also provided general and secretarial assistance.

The Index was prepared by Miss Maureen MacGlashan CMG and the Tables were prepared by the Editors.

Thanks are due to the Secretary-General and staff of ICSID for their assistance in many ways, including the provision of texts of decisions where this could be done consistent with ICSID rules. Responsibility for the summaries and other contents of this volume remains, however, solely with the Editors.



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 13

[ALPHABETICAL]

[ALTHADETOAD]	Page
Československá Obchodní Banka AS v. Slovak Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/4)	178
Award, 29 December 2004	181
GAMI Investments Inc. v. Government of the United Mexican States	144
Final Award, 15 November 2004	147
IBM World Trade Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/02/10)	102
Decision on Jurisdiction and Competence, 22 December 2003	105
Dissenting opinion	118
Note on Settlement	120
Joy Mining Machinery Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/03/11)	121
Award on Jurisdiction, 6 August 2004	123
Note on Settlement	143
Link-Trading Joint Stock Company v. Department for Customs Control	
of the Republic of Moldova	3
Award on Jurisdiction, 16 February 2001	6
Final Award, 18 April 2002	14
MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7)	488
Decision on Respondent's Request for a Continued Stay of	
Execution, 1 June 2005	493
Decision on Annulment, 21 March 2007	500
Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and	
Telecommunications) (SCC Case No. 49/2002)	30
Final Award, 9 September 2003	33
Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 26 August 2005	
Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and	
Telecommunications)	96

xiv



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 13	XV
Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic	335
Award I, 13 February 2003	337
Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 13 April 2006	
Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic	369
Award II, 29 March 2005	381
Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 19 January 2007	
Kyrgyz Republic v. Petrobart Limited	480
Plama Consortium Limited v. Republic of Bulgaria	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/03/24)	268
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 February 2005	272
Order on Provisional Measures, 6 September 2005	324



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–13

[ALPHABETICAL]

,	lol., Page
ADF Group Inc. v. United States of America	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/1)	6 , 449
Procedural Order No. 2 Concerning Place of Arbitration, 11 July 200	6 , 453
Procedural Order No. 3 Concerning Production of Documents,	
4 October 2001	6 , 461
Award, 9 January 2003	6 , 470
Adriano Gardella SpA v. Government of Côte d'Ivoire	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/74/1)	1, 283
Award, 29 August 1977 (excerpts)	1 , 287
AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17)	12 , 308
Decision on Jurisdiction, 26 April 2005	12 , 312
AGIP SpA v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo	
(ICSID Case No. ARB 77/1)	1, 306
Award, 30 November 1979	1, 309
AIG Capital Partners Inc. and CJSC Tema Real Estate Company v.	
Republic of Kazakhstan (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/6)	11 , 3
Award, 7 October 2003	11, 7
United Kingdom, High Court, Queen's Bench Division,	,
AIG Capital Partners Inc. and Another v. Republic of Kazakhstan,	
Application for Enforcement of Arbitral Award, 20 October 2005	11 , 118
Amco Asia Corp., Pan American Development Ltd and PT Amco	
Indonesia v. Republic of Indonesia (ICSID Case No. ARB/81/1)	1 , 376
Jurisdiction, 25 September 1983	1, 389
Provisional Measures, 9 December 1983	1 , 410
Award, 20 November 1984	1 , 413
Annulment, 16 May 1986	1, 509
Resubmitted Case: Jurisdiction, 10 May 1988	1, 543
Resubmitted Case: Award, 5 June 1990	1, 569
Resubmitted Case: Rectification, 17 October 1990	1,638
Resubmitted Case: Annulment, 3 December 1992	9 , 9
Annex, Interim Order No. I, Request for Stay of Enforcement of	
Award, 2 March 1991	9 , 59



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–13	xvii
American Manufacturing and Trading Inc. v. Republic of Zaire (ICSID Case No. ARB/93/1) Award, 21 February 1997 Individual opinions, 21 February 1997	5, 11 5, 14 5, 37
Asian Agricultural Products Ltd [AAP] v. Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka (ICSID Case No. ARB/87/3) Award, 27 June 1990 Dissenting opinion, 27 June 1990	4 , 245 4 , 250 4 , 296
Atlantic Triton Company Limited v. People's Revolutionary Republic of Guinea (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/1) France, Cour d'appel, Rennes, 26 October 1984 France, Cour de cassation, Rennes, 18 November 1986 Award, 21 April 1986	3, 3 3, 4 3, 10 3, 13
Autopista Concesionada de Venezuela CA v. Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/5) Decision on Jurisdiction, 27 September 2001 Award, 23 September 2003	6 , 417 6 , 419 10 , 309
Azinian, Davitian and Baca v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/97/2) Award, 1 November 1999	5 , 269 5 , 272
Azurix Corp. v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/12) Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003	10 , 413 10 , 416
Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987	1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369 1, 373
Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings Ltd v. Federation of St Kitts and Nevis (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/2) Award, 13 January 1997	5 , 106 5 , 108
Casado and President Allende Foundation v. Republic of Chile (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/2) Decision on Provisional Measures, 25 September 2001	6 , 373 6 , 375



xviii TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–13

CDC Group Plc v. Republic of the Seychelles	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/02/14)	11 , 206
Award, 17 December 2003	11 , 211
Decision on Application for Annulment, 29 June 2005	11 , 237
Československá Obchodní Banka AS v. Slovak Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/4)	5 , 330
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 24 May 1999	5 , 335
Decision on Further and Partial Objections to	
Jurisdiction, 1 December 2000	5 , 358
Award, 29 December 2004	13 , 181
Champion Trading Company, Ameritrade International	
Inc., J.T., J.B. and T.T. Wahba v. Arab Republic of Egypt	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/02/9)	10 , 398
Decision on Jurisdiction, 21 October 2003	10 , 400
CME Czech Republic BV (The Netherlands) v. Czech Republic	9 , 113
Partial Award on the Merits, 13 September 2001	9 , 121
Dissenting opinion	9 , 243
Final Award on Damages, 14 March 2003	9 , 264
Separate opinion	9 , 412
Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 15 May 2003	
Czech Republic v. CME Czech Republic BV	9 , 439
CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8)	7 , 492
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 17 July 2003	7 , 494
Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija SA and Compagnie Générale	
des Eaux/Vivendi Universal v. Argentine Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/3)	5 , 296
Award, 21 November 2000	5 , 299
Decision on the Challenge to the President of the Committee,	
3 October 2001	6 , 330
Decision on Annulment, 3 July 2002	6 , 340
Decision on Supplementation and Rectification of Annulment	
Decision, 28 May 2003	8 , 489
Compañía del Desarrollo de Santa Elena SA v. Republic of Costa Rica	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/96/1)	5 , 153
Award, 17 February 2000	5 , 157
Rectification of Award, 8 June 2000	5 , 180



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–13	xix
Empresas Lucchetti SA and Lucchetti Perú SA v. Republic of Peru	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/03/4)	12 , 218
Award, 7 February 2005	12 , 210
11	,>
EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador	12 , 400
Interim Award on Request for Interim Measure of Protection,	
31 January 2004	12 , 408
Partial Award on Jurisdiction, 27 February 2004	12 , 413
Award, 3 February 2006	12 , 427
Partial dissenting opinion, 30 December 2005	12 , 489
Enron Corporation and Ponderosa Assets LP v. Argentine Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/01/3)	11 , 268
Decision on Jurisdiction, 14 January 2004	11 , 273
Decision on Jurisdiction (Ancillary Claim), 2 August 2004	11, 295
	,
Ethyl Corporation v. Government of Canada	7 , 3
Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 28 November 1997	7 , 5
Award on Jurisdiction, 24 June 1998	7 , 12
Funde DV v. Danublia of Doland	12 , 331
Eureko BV v. Republic of Poland Partial Award, 19 August 2005	12 , 331 12 , 335
Dissenting opinion, 19 August 2005	12 , 333 12 , 389
Disseiting opinion, 19 August 2003	12, 309
Fedax NV v. Republic of Venezuela (ICSID Case No. ARB/96/3)	5 , 183
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 11 July 1997	5 , 186
Award, 9 March 1998	5 , 200
Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1)	7 , 318
Interim Decision on Preliminary Jurisdictional Issues,	1,010
6 December 2000	7 , 327
Award, 16 December 2002	7 , 341
Dissenting opinion	7 , 407
Decision on the Correction and Interpretation of the Award,	
13 June 2003	7 , 418
Canada, United Mexican States v. Feldman Karpa	
Judicial Review, Ontario Superior Court of Justice,	
3 December 2003	8 , 500
Judicial Review, Ontario Court of Appeal, 11 January 2005	9 , 508
Fireman's Fund Insurance Company v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/02/01)	10 , 213
Decision on the Preliminary Question, 17 July 2003	10 , 214
, C , ,	, -



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1-13 $\mathbf{x}\mathbf{x}$ GAMI Investments Inc. v. Government of the United Mexican States **13**, 144 Final Award, 15 November 2004 **13**, 147 Generation Ukraine Inc. v. Ukraine (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/9) 10, 236 Award, 16 September 2003 **10**, 240 Genin and Others v. Republic of Estonia (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/2) **6**, 236 Award, 25 June 2001 **6**, 241 Decision on Claimants' Request for Supplementary Decisions and Rectification, 4 April 2002 **6.** 304 Goetz and Others v. Republic of Burundi (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/3) **6**. 3 Award, 10 February 1999 6, 5 Part 1. Decision on Liability, 2 September 1998 6, 5 Part 2. The Parties' Agreement, 23 December 1998 **6**, 46 Gruslin v. Malaysia (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/3) **5**, 483 Award, 27 November 2000 5, 484 IBM World Trade Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/10) **13**, 102 Decision on Jurisdiction and Competence, 22 December 2003 **13**, 105 Dissenting opinion **13**, 118 Note on Settlement **13**, 120 Impregilo SpA v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/3) **12**, 242 Decision on Jurisdiction, 22 April 2005 **12**, 245 Joy Mining Machinery Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/11) **13**, 121 Award on Jurisdiction, 6 August 2004 **13**, 123 Note on Settlement **13**, 143 Kaiser Bauxite Company v. Government of Jamaica (ICSID Case No. ARB/73/3) 1, 296 Jurisdiction and Competence, 6 July 1975 1, 298 Klöckner Industrie-Anlagen GmbH, Klöckner Belge SA and Klöckner Handelsmaatschappij BV v. Republic of Cameroon and Société Camerounaise des Engrais SA (ICSID Case No. ARB/81/2) **2**, 3 Award, 21 October 1983 (excerpts) 2.9 Dissenting opinion, 21 October 1983 (excerpts) 2,77

Annulment, 3 May 1985

2,95



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–13	xxi
LANCO International Inc. v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/6) Preliminary Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 1998	5 , 367 5 , 369
Lauder v. Czech Republic Final Award, 3 September 2001	9 , 62 9 , 66
Lemire v. Ukraine (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/1) Award embodying the Parties' Settlement Agreement,	6 , 59
18 September 2000	6 , 60
LG&E Energy Corporation and Others v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/1)	11, 411
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 30 April 2004	11, 414
Liberian Eastern Timber Corporation [LETCO] v. Government of the Republic of Liberia (ICSID Case No. ARB/83/2)	2 , 343
Award, 31 March 1986	2 , 346
Rectification, 10 June 1986	2 , 380
United States, District Court, Southern District of New York, 5 September 1986	2 , 383
United States, District Court, Southern District of New York, 12 December 1986	2 , 385
United States District Court, District of Columbia, 16 April 1987	2 , 390
Link-Trading Joint Stock Company v. Department for Customs Control	12.2
of the Republic of Moldova Award on Jurisdiction, 16 February 2001	13 , 3 13 , 6
Final Award, 18 April 2002	13 , 14
The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of	= 101
America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3) Decision on Objection to Competence and Jurisdiction,	7 , 421
9 January 2001	7 , 425
Award, 26 June 2003	7 , 442
Decision on Respondent's Request for a Supplementary Decision, 13 September 2004	10 , 444
United States District Court, District of Columbia,	10,
Loewen v. United States of America	
Judicial Review, 31 October 2005	10 , 448
Lucchetti (Empresas) SA and Lucchetti Perú SA v. Republic of Peru	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/03/4)	12 , 218
Award on Jurisdiction, 7 February 2005	12 , 219



xxii TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–13

Maffezini v. Kingdom of Spain (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/7) Decision on Request for Provisional Measures (Procedural	5 , 387
Order No. 2), 28 October 1999	5 , 393
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 25 January 2000	5 , 396
Award, 13 November 2000	5 , 419
Rectification of Award, 31 January 2001	5 , 440
Maritime International Nominees Establishment [MINE] v. Republic of	
Guinea (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/4)	4, 3
United States District Court, District of Columbia, 12 January 1981 United States Court of Appeals, District of Columbia,	4 , 4
12 November 1982	4 , 8
Belgium, Rechtbank van eerste aanleg, Antwerp, 27 September 1985	4 , 32
Switzerland, Tribunal fédéral, 4 December 1985	4 , 35
Switzerland, Tribunal de première instance, Geneva, 13 March 1986 Switzerland, Autorité de surveillance des offices de poursuite pour	4 , 41
dettes et de faillite, Geneva, 7 October 1986	4 , 45
Award, 6 January 1988	4 , 54
Annulment, 22 December 1989	4 , 79
Request for Annulment, Procedural Order No. 1, 17 May 1988 Application for Stay of Enforcement of Award, Interim Order	4 , 110
No. 1, 12 August 1988	4 , 111
Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/97/1)	5 , 209
Award, 30 August 2000	5 , 212
Canada, Supreme Court of British Columbia, <i>United Mexican</i> States v. Metalclad	
Judicial Review, 2 May 2001	5 , 236
Supplementary Reasons for Judgment, 31 October 2001	6 , 52
Methanex Corporation v. United States of America	7, 208
Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 31 December 2000	7 , 213
Decision on Petitions from Third Persons to Intervene as "Amici	5 224
Curiae", 15 January 2001	7 , 224
First Partial Award (Decision on Jurisdiction and Admissibility), 7 August 2002	7 , 239
Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic of	
Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6)	7 , 173
Award, 12 April 2002	7 , 178
Mihaly International Corporation v. Democratic Socialist Republic of	
Sri Lanka (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/2)	6 , 308
Award, 15 March 2002	6 , 310
Individual concurring opinion, 15 March 2002	6 , 323



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–13	xxiii
Mobil Oil Corporation, Mobil Petroleum Company Inc., Mobil Oil New Zealand v. Her Majesty the Queen in Right of New Zealand (ICSID Case No. ARB/87/2)	4 , 117
New Zealand, High Court, 1 July 1987	4 , 119
Findings on Liability, Interpretation and Allied Issues, 4 May 1989	4 , 140
Mondev International Ltd v. United States of America	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/2)	6 , 181
Miscellaneous Procedural Orders	6 , 186
Award, 11 October 2002	6 , 192
MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7)	12 , 3
Award, 25 May 2004	12 , 6
Decision on Respondent's Request for a Continued Stay of	, -
Execution, 1 June 2005	13 , 493
Decision on Annulment, 21 March 2007	13 , 500
Decision on Amanment, 21 March 2007	13, 300
Myers, S. D., Inc. v. Government of Canada	8 , 3
Procedural Orders Nos. 10 and 18	8 , 13, 15
First Partial Award on Liability, 13 November 2000	8 , 18
Separate opinion, 12 November 2000	8 , 66
Second Partial Award on Damages, 21 October 2002	8, 124
Final Award on Costs, 30 December 2002	8 , 172
Individual dissenting opinion, 30 December 2002	8 , 183
Judicial Review, Federal Court of Canada, 13 January 2004 Attorney-General of Canada v. S. D. Myers Inc.	8 , 194
Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and	
Telecommunications) (SCC Case No. 49/2002)	13 , 30
Final Award, 9 September 2003	13 , 33
Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 26 August 2005	
Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and	
Telecommunications)	13 , 96
Nykomb Synergetics Technology Holding AB v. Republic of Latvia	11 , 153
Award, 16 December 2003	11 , 158
Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of	
Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467)	12 , 54
Final Award, 1 July 2004	12 , 59
Republic of Ecuador v. Occidental Exploration and	
Production Company	12 , 101
England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division, 29 April 2005	12 , 104
England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division), 9 September 2005	12 , 129
	•



xxiv TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1-13 Olguín v. Republic of Paraguay (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/5) **6**, 154 Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 August 2000 **6**, 156 Award, 26 July 2001 **6**, 164 Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic **13**, 335 Award I, 13 February 2003 **13**, 337 Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 13 April 2006 Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic **13**, 369 Award II, 29 March 2005 **13**, 387 Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal, 19 January 2007 Kyrgyz Republic v. Petrobart Limited **13**, 480 Plama Consortium Limited v. Republic of Bulgaria (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/24) **13**, 268 Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 February 2005 **13**, 272 Order on Provisional Measures, 6 September 2005 **13**, 324 Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada **7**, 43 Ruling on Interim Measures, 7 January 2000 7,54 Award on Preliminary Motion to Dismiss the Claim, 26 January 2000 7,55 Award on the "Harmac Motion", 24 February 2000 7,64 Interim Award, 26 June 2000 7,69 Award on Canada's Motion regarding the "Super Fee", 7 August 2000 7,92 **7**, 99 Ruling on Claim of Crown Privilege, 6 September 2000 Award on the Merits of Phase 2, 10 April 2001 7, 102 Award on Damages, 31 May 2002 7, 148 Final Award on Costs, 26 November 2002 **7**, 170 PSEG Global Inc. and Others v. Republic of Turkey (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/5) **11,**431 Decision on Jurisdiction, 4 June 2004 11,434 S. D. Myers Inc. v. Government of Canada **8**. 3 Procedural Orders Nos. 10 and 18 **8**, 13, 15 First Partial Award on Liability, 13 November 2000 **8**, 18 Separate opinion, 12 November 2000 **8**, 66 Second Partial Award on Damages, 21 October 2002 8, 124 Final Award on Costs, 30 December 2002 8, 172 Individual dissenting opinion, 30 December 2002 **8**, 183 Judicial Review, Federal Court of Canada, 13 January 2004 8, 194 Attorney-General of Canada v. S. D. Myers Inc.



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–13	xxv
Salini Costruttori SpA and Italstrade SpA v. Kingdom of Morocco (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/4) Decision on Jurisdiction, 23 July 2001	6 , 398 6 , 400
Scimitar Exploration Limited v. Republic of Bangladesh and Bangladesh Oil, Gas and Mineral Corporation	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/92/2) Award, 5 April 1994	5 , 3 5 , 4
SGS Société Générale de Surveillance SA v. Islamic Republic of	Q 202
Pakistan (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/13) Pakistan, Supreme Court, Société Générale de Surveillance SA v.	8 , 383
Pakistan, through Secretary, Ministry of Finance	8 , 352
Order, 15 March 2002	8 , 354
Judgment, 3 July 2002	8 , 356
Procedural Order No. 2, 16 October 2002	8 , 388
Decision on Disqualification of Arbitrator, 19 December 2002	8 , 398
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 6 August 2003	8, 406
Note on Settlement	8, 451
SGS Société Générale de Surveillance SA v. Republic of the Philippines	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/02/6)	8, 515
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 29 January 2004	8 , 513
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 29 January 2004 Declaration, 29 January 2004	8 , 568
Decidiation, 29 January 2004	o , 300
Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8)	12 , 171
Decision on Jurisdiction, 3 August 2004	12 , 174
Doolston on various ton, 3 Tragast 200 T	12, 17 .
Société d'Exploitation des Mines d'Or de Sadiola SA [Semos] v.	
Republic of Mali (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/5)	10 , 114
Award, 25 February 2003	10 , 116
Société Ouest Africaine des Bétons Industriels [SOABI] v. State of	
Senegal (ICSID Case No. ARB/82/1)	2 , 164
Jurisdiction, 1 August 1984	2 , 175
Award, 25 February 1988	2 , 190
Dissenting opinion, 25 February 1988	2 , 277
Declaration of the President of the Tribunal, 25 February 1988	2 , 333
France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 5 December 1989	2 , 337
France, Cour de cassation, 11 June 1991	2 , 341
C f l' H', lA LE ' , (ICOD C N ADDIO)	10 156
Soufraki v. United Arab Emirates (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/7)	12 , 156
Award on Jurisdiction, 7 July 2004	12 , 158



xxvi TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–13

Southern Pacific Properties (Middle East) Limited [SPP(ME)] v. Arab	
Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/3)	3 , 45
ICC Award No. YD/AS No. 3493, 11 March 1983	3 , 49
France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 12 July 1984	3 , 79
Netherlands, District Court, Amsterdam, 12 July 1984	3 , 92
France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 6 January 1987	3 , 96
Jurisdiction (No. 1), 27 November 1985	3 , 101
Jurisdiction (No. 2), 14 April 1988	3 , 131
Dissenting opinion, 14 April 1988	3 , 163
Award, 20 May 1992	3 , 189
Dissenting opinion, 20 May 1992	3 , 249
Tanzania Electric Supply Company Limited v. Independent Power	
Tanzania Limited (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/8)	8 , 220
Award, 12 July 2001	8 , 226
Decision on Provisional Measures, 20 December 1999	8 , 239
Decision on Preliminary Issues, 22 May 2000	8 , 243
Decision on Tariff and Other Remaining Issues, 9 February 2001	8 , 272
Decision on All Further Remaining Issues, 24 May 2001	8 , 309
Stipulation regarding Future Disputes concerning the Construction	
Contingency Account	8 , 317
Stipulation and Agreement (and Annex)	8 , 318
Técnicas Medioambientales Tecmed SA v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB (AF)/00/2)	10 , 130
Award, 29 May 2003	10 , 134
Tokios Tokelés v. Ukraine (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/18)	11, 305
Procedural Order No. 1, Claimant's Request for Provisional	
Measures, 1 July 2003	11, 310
Decision on Jurisdiction, 29 April 2004	11, 313
Dissenting opinion	11, 341
Procedural Order No. 3, 18 January 2005	11, 352
Tradex Hellas SA v. Republic of Albania (ICSID Case No. ARB/94/2)	5 , 43
Decision on Jurisdiction, 24 December 1996	5 , 47
Award, 29 April 1999	5 , 70
United Parcel Service of America Inc. v. Government of Canada	7, 285
Award on Jurisdiction, 22 November 2002	7 , 288
Vacuum Salt Products Limited v. Government of Republic of Ghana	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/92/1)	4 , 320
Provisional Measures, 14 June 1992	4 , 323
Award, 16 February 1994	4 , 329



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–13	xxvii
"Vivendi"/Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija SA and Compagnie	
Générale des Eaux/Vivendi Universal v. Argentine Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/3)	5 , 296
Award, 21 November 2000	5 , 299
Decision on the Challenge to the President of the Committee,	ŕ
3 October 2001	6 , 330
Decision on Annulment, 3 July 2002	6 , 340
Decision on Supplementation and Rectification of Annulment	
Decision, 28 May 2003	8 , 489
Waste Management Inc. v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/2)	5 , 443
Award, 2 June 2000	5 , 445
Dissenting opinion, 2 June 2000	5 , 462
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/3)	6 , 538
Decision on Venue of the Arbitration, 26 September 2001	6 , 541
Decision on Preliminary Objection, 26 June 2002	6 , 549
Award, 30 April 2004	11, 361
Wena Hotels Ltd v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/4)	6 , 67
Decision on Jurisdiction, 29 June 1999	6 , 74
Award, 8 December 2000	6 , 89
Decision on Annulment, 5 February 2002	6 , 129
Yaung Chi Oo Trading Pte Ltd v. Government of the Union of Myanmar	
(ASEAN ID Case No. ARB/01/1)	8 , 452
Procedural Order No. 2, 27 February 2002	8 , 456
Award, 31 March 2003	8 , 463
Zhinvali Development Limited v. Republic of Georgia	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/00/1)	10 , 3
Award, 24 January 2003	10 , 6
Separate opinion, 14 January 2003	10 , 106



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 13

Annulment

Departure from fundamental rule of procedure – Failure to hear parties – ICSID Convention, Article 52(1)(d)

MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7), 488

Fair and equitable treatment – Manifest excess of powers – Whether Tribunal exceeded powers in assessment of fair and equitable treatment standard – Whether Tribunal decided *ex aequo et bono* – Whether reasons sufficient – Whether adequate explanation in reasons

MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7), 488

Stay of enforcement – Provisional stay – Application for continued stay – Whether Award enforceable with same effect as final judgment in domestic courts – ICSID Convention, Article 52(5) – Arbitration Rule 54(1)

MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7), 488

Applicable Law

1993 Consolidation Agreement between Czech and Slovak Republics – Law applicable to Consolidation Agreement – Consolidation Agreement containing legally binding obligations – Whether Consolidation Agreement governed by public international law – Whether Consolidation Agreement governed by Czech public law – Article 7(4) of Consolidation Agreement – Laws of Czech Republic – 1992 Bilateral Investment Treaty between Czech and Slovak Republics

Československá Obchodní Banka AS v. Slovak Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/4), 178

Arbitration

Application to annul Arbitral Award I – Whether Arbitral Award I to be altered wholly or in part – Whether arbitral tribunal deciding issue of jurisdiction correctly – Whether prerequisites for arbitration met – Whether Petrobart had made an investment within the meaning of Kyrgyz Foreign Investment Law

xxviii



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 13

xxix

("FIL") – Doctrine of assertion – Concept of investment in FIL – International law principles – *Res judicata* – Whether Swedish court to annul Arbitral Award I

Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic (Case No. T 3739-03), 335

Arbitration proceedings by Claimant against Slovak Republic for breach of obligations under 1993 Consolidation Agreement – Article 3 of Consolidation Agreement – Meaning and scope – Whether receivables properly assigned for purposes of Article 3 – "On-balance sheet" and "off-balance sheet" receivables – Claimant claiming damages

Československá Obchodní Banka AS v. Slovak Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/4), 178

Challenge to validity of arbitral award – Application by plaintiff to Swedish court to set aside arbitral award – Section 36 of Arbitration Act 1999 – Whether arbitral tribunal ruling on all issues submitted to it – Whether arbitral tribunal ruling on substance – Whether Section 36 of Arbitration Act 1999 applicable

Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and Telecommunications) (Case No. T 9059-03), 30

Challenge to validity of arbitral award – Whether valid arbitration agreement between parties – Section 34 of Swedish Arbitration Act – Whether sale and purchase agreement for condensed gas constituting investment under Energy Charter Treaty, 1994 – Whether administrative errors affecting outcome of case – Whether Swedish court to set aside Arbitral Award II

Kyrgyz Republic v. Petrobart Limited (Case No. T 5208-05), 480

Consent to UNCITRAL arbitration – Forum selection clause in contract between parties – Formal declaration by counsel of Respondent – Whether binding

Joy Mining Machinery Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/11), 121

Contract between UK company and Egyptian State enterprise – Dispute between parties – Claimant company requesting ICSID arbitration against Egypt – ICSID arbitration provisions in UK–Egypt Bilateral Investment Treaty – Essence of dispute – Whether Claimant's claim falling within BIT and ICSID Convention

Joy Mining Machinery Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/11), 121

Compensation

Whether Respondent liable to pay Claimant compensation – Whether Respondent in breach of Bilateral Investment Treaty – Damages – Whether Respondent



XXX

DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 13

liable for damages including loss of profits – Costs – Article 40 of UNCITRAL Rules

Link-Trading Joint Stock Company v. Department for Customs Control of the Republic of Moldova, 3

Costs

Arbitral tribunal's decision on costs – Application by plaintiff to Swedish court to vary decision on costs – Czech Republic's litigation costs – Whether plaintiff liable

Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and Telecommunications) (Case No. T 9059-03), 30

Expenses – Arbitration costs – Where Respondent raised unsuccessful objections – Whether Claimant responsible for costs attributable to unsuccessful objections

Nagel v. Czech Republic (Ministry of Transportation and Telecommunications) (SCC Case No. 49/2002), 30

Litigation costs – Whether requested amount reasonable – Interest

Kyrgyz Republic v. Petrobart Limited (Case No. T 5208-05), 480

Petrobart's claim for alteration of distribution of costs in arbitral proceedings – Dismissal of claim – Costs in the Court of Appeal

Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic (Case No. T 3739-03), 335

Damages

Slovak Republic's alleged breach of its obligation to cover losses pursuant to Article 3 of Consolidation Agreement – Coverage losses – *Locus standi* – Calculation of damages – Principal amount of loan – Interest – Capitalization – Lost profit – Costs

Československá Obchodní Banka AS v. Slovak Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/4), 178

Expropriation

Article 1110 NAFTA – *De facto* expropriation – Indirect expropriation – Taking – Value of the investment – Value of available domestic remedies – Whether Claimant's investment expropriated contrary to Article 1110 NAFTA

GAMI Investments Inc. v. Government of the United Mexican States, 144



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 13

xxxi

Customs and tax regime stability – Whether change in customs and tax regime tantamount to expropriation – United States of America–Moldova Bilateral Investment Protection Treaty, 1993

Link-Trading Joint Stock Company v. Department for Customs Control of the Republic of Moldova, 3

De facto expropriation – Measures not directed at transfer of value of investment

Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic (SCC Case No. 126/2003) (Award II), 335

Fair and Equitable Treatment

Article 1105 NAFTA – Whether Mexico violating minimum standard of treatment – Effect of Mexico's maladministration of sugar programme – Whether outright and unjustified repudiation of regulations – Mexico's failure to implement key parts of sugar programme – Attribution – Causation – Whether Mexico violating Article 1105 NAFTA

GAMI Investments Inc. v. Government of the United Mexican States, 144

Transfer of assets of State organ to detriment of investor – Government intervention in enforcement proceedings to stay execution – Whether fair and equitable treatment – Whether violation of obligation to provide effective enforcement of rights

Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic (SCC Case No. 126/2003) (Award II), 335

Foreign Investment

Definition – Whether bank guarantees an investment under BIT – Whether Claimant's activities amounting to an investment under ICSID Convention – ICSID Convention, Article 25

Joy Mining Machinery Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/11), 121

Definition of investment – Energy Charter Treaty, 1994, Article 1(5) and (6) – Whether condensed gas agreement constituting an investment under the ECT

Kyrgyz Republic v. Petrobart Limited (Case No. T 5208-05), 480

Jurisdiction

Bulgaria-Cyprus Bilateral Investment Treaty, 1987 - Consent to arbitration - Most-favoured-nation provision - Interpretation - Scope - Reading of MFN



xxxii

DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 13

provision with other BITs to which Bulgaria Contracting Party – Whether providing Respondent's consent to ICSID arbitration – Whether entitling Claimant to rely on dispute settlement provisions in these other BITs

Plama Consortium Limited v. Republic of Bulgaria (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/24), 268

Competence of Tribunal to rule on its own jurisdiction – Prior decision of Kyrgyz courts on issue of jurisdiction – Swedish Arbitration Act, Section 2 – UNCITRAL Rules, Article 21

Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic (Award I), 335

Consent to arbitrate – Entering into a BIT by State as consent to arbitrate – No need for additional consent by State – ICSID Convention, Article 36(2)

IBM World Trade Corporation v. *Republic of Ecuador* (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/10), 102

Consent to arbitrate – Exhaustion of local administrative and judicial remedies – Interpretation of terms of the BIT – BIT, Article VI – ICSID Convention, Article 26

IBM World Trade Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/10), 102

Domestic proceedings dealing with domestic law claim – Whether principles of *res judicata* or collateral estoppel applicable to related but distinct treaty claim

Petrobart Limited v. Kyrgyz Republic (SCC Case No. 126/2003) (Award II), 335

Energy Charter Treaty, 1994, Article 26 – ICSID Convention, Article 25 – Whether ICSID Tribunal having jurisdiction to decide on merits of Claimant's claims for alleged breaches of Part III of Energy Charter Treaty – Consent to arbitration – Relevance of Article 17(1) of Energy Charter Treaty – Burden of proof – Whether allegation of treaty violation sufficient to establish jurisdiction – Whether jurisdictional requirements of Articles 1 and 26 of Energy Charter Treaty satisfied

Plama Consortium Limited v. Republic of Bulgaria (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/24), 268

Exclusive jurisdiction clause under investment contract – Interpretation of terms of BIT – Fork-in-the-road provision – BIT as the fundamental basis of the claim – Domestic courts retaining jurisdiction over investment-unrelated matters

IBM World Trade Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/10), 102