

THE CONSTITUTION OF A FEDERAL COMMONWEALTH

By analysing original sources and evaluating conceptual frameworks, Nicholas Aroney discusses the idea proclaimed in the preamble to the Constitution that Australia is a federal commonwealth. Taking careful account of the influence which the American, Canadian and Swiss Constitutions had upon the framers of the Australian Constitution, the author shows how the framers wrestled with the problem of integrating federal ideas with inherited British traditions and their own experiences of parliamentary government. In so doing, the book explains how the Constitution came into being in the context of the groundswell of federal ideas then sweeping the English-speaking world.

In advancing an original argument about the relationship between the formation of the Constitution, the representative institutions, configurations of power and amending formulas contained therein, fresh light is shed on the terms and structure of the Constitution and a range of problems associated with its interpretation and practical operation are addressed.

NICHOLAS ARONEY is a Reader in Law at the T. C. Beirne School of Law, University of Queensland, a member of the Australian Association of Constitutional Law and a fellow of the Centre for Public, International and Comparative Law at the University of Queensland.



THE CONSTITUTION OF A FEDERAL COMMONWEALTH

THE MAKING AND MEANING OF THE AUSTRALIAN CONSTITUTION

NICHOLAS ARONEY





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521716895

© Nicholas Aroney 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Aroney, Nicholas.

The constitution of a federal commonwealth : the making and meaning of the Australian constitution / Nicholas Aroney.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-0-521-71689-5 (pbk.) – ISBN 978-0-521-88864-6 (hardback)

1. Federal government–Australia–History. 2. Constitutional history–Australia.

3. Australia–Politics and government. I. Title.

JQ4020.S8A7 2009

320.494'049-dc22 2008045144

ISBN 978-0-521-88864-6 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-71689-5 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



[A] Commonwealth of commonwealths, a Republic of republics, a State which, while one, is nevertheless composed of other States even more essential to its existence than it is to theirs.

James Bryce (1889)



CONTENTS

Preface page xi Table of statutes and executive instruments xiv Table of cases xviii	
Introduction: Australia as a federal commonwealth	1
7.1.11	

PART I Federalism 15

1 Conceptualising federalism 17
The conventional approach 17
Federal or national? 21
Compact or constitution? 24
Federation or confederation? 28
Avoiding sovereignty 32
Conclusion 37

2 Reframing the analysis 39

Integrative and disintegrative federalism 40
The formation of integrative federations 41
Representation and amendment in federal constitutions 46
Formation, representation and amendment 52
Formation, representation and configuration of power 61
Conclusion 62

PART II Federating Australia 65

3 Models and sources 67

James Madison 73

James Bryce 78

Edward Freeman 87

A. V. Dicey 92

John Burgess 96

vii



viii		CONTENTS
	4	Australian appropriations 101 Thomas Just 103 Andrew Inglis Clark 108 Richard Baker 111 Samuel Griffith 114 John Quick and Robert Garran 119 Charles Kingston 128 Isaac Isaacs and H. B. Higgins 130
	5	Constitutional foundations 134 The formative preconditions of Australian federation 135 The conference of 1890 149
	6	Formative institutions 158 The convention of 1891 158 The Commonwealth Bill of 1891 161 The parliaments and the peoples 164 The Enabling Acts 167 The convention of 1897–8 172 Ratification and enactment 176 Conclusion 180
		PART III Australian federation 185
	7	Principles of representation 187 Parkes's resolutions – consensus and division 191 The presuppositions of federalism – autonomy and equality 193 Responsible government and the powers of the Senate 200 Barton's resolutions – conceptions of democracy and federalism 206
	8	Representative institutions 215 The composition of the Senate 217 The composition of the House of Representatives 224 The relative powers of the two houses 237 Conclusion 244
	9	The states and the Commonwealth 247 Statements of fundamental principle 247 The continuing states 255
j	10	Configurations of power 272 Distributing competencies 272 Configurations of power 282



CONTENTS ix

11 Amendment procedures 299

Amendment by state conventions 301
Amendment by state referendums 308
Amendment by unanimous consent 323

Conclusion 332

PART IV Conclusions 335

12 A federal commonwealth 337

Federative logic 337

Interpretive implications 345

Final remarks 368

Select provisions 371

Commonwealth of Australia Constitution Act 1900 (UK) 371

Statute of Westminster 1931 (UK) 381

Australia Act 1986 (Cth) 384

Bibliography 389

Index 411



PREFACE

My present interest in the federal dimensions of the Australian constitutional system was triggered some years ago when writing on the subject of constitutional implications. At the time I was examining a line of cases in which the High Court of Australia had held that the Constitution contained an implied freedom of political communication. One of the arguments apparently accepted by the Court was that since the Constitution was founded upon the sovereignty of the Australian people, it accordingly made provision for a system of representative democracy and that various political freedoms, such as freedom of speech, were necessary in order to preserve the integrity of the system. My central criticism of this and similar lines of argument was that the more radical of these implications were not warranted because the multiple steps in the reasoning, while individually plausible, had the cumulative effect of producing an outcome far removed from the text and structure of the Constitution.¹

When considering these arguments, however, it was necessary for me to bear in mind another line of High Court decisions in which constitutional implications had been derived from the federal nature of the Constitution. In these cases it had been held that the Commonwealth Parliament could not enact legislation which would prevent the states from continuing to exist and function as autonomous, self-governing bodies politic. A question I had to face was whether these 'federal' implications – in contrast to the 'democratic' ones I had criticised – were warranted. Moreover, in other important cases decided by the High Court it had appeared that federal and democratic implications were in conflict and it seemed necessary for the Court to determine which would prevail.

Nicholas T. Aroney, Freedom of Speech in the Constitution (Sydney: Centre for Independent Studies, 1998).



XII PREFACE

Issues such as these forced me to ask to what extent and in what respects democratic and federal principles were embodied in the Constitution. What is more important, the federal or the democratic aspects of the Constitution, and how do these principles relate to one another? A survey of the Constitution's text suggests that while democratic provisions are very evident, federal principles permeate almost every section. Furthermore, the preamble to the Constitution states that the Commonwealth of Australia is a 'federal commonwealth'. What does this mean? What *kind* of union was envisaged, and why?² This book is the result of an extended inquiry into questions such as these.

Throughout this period I have benefited substantially from the encouragement and guidance of many colleagues who have read and commented upon the manuscript, including especially Greg Craven, Jeff Goldsworthy, Donald Kommers, Gabriel Moens, Suri Ratnapala and George Winterton.

The book includes a substantial study of American, Canadian and Swiss federalism, and I have been able to benefit from academic interaction with many scholars in these three countries through the support of the T. C. Beirne School of Law at the University of Queensland, together with a number of overseas research institutions. The Pew Charitable Trusts enabled me in 1998 to participate in a highly stimulating seminar on political theory led by Nicholas Wolterstorff at Calvin College, and I wish to extend my hearty thanks both to him and to the organisers and participants of the seminar. Special thanks in this respect are extended to Bill Brewbaker and Mark Hall for reading and commenting on draft chapters of this book. I am also very grateful to John Witte, Director of the Law and Religion Program at Emory University Law School, who in 1999 provided me with an office, enlightening discussion and the opportunity to present my research to a discerning audience. In particular, I must acknowledge my debts to Johan van der Vyver, Charles Reid and the late Harold Berman, whose encouragement and example will be long remembered. William Buss also at this time very kindly gave me the opportunity to present my research to faculty at the University of Iowa College of Law. Similar hospitality was shown to me by the late Daniel Elazar of the Centre for the Study of Federalism at Temple University. Professor Elazar's passing is a great loss; the 'covenantal' approach to federalism applied in this book owes much to

² Jed Martin, 'Explaining the Sentimental Utopia: Historians and the Centenary of Australian Federation' (2003) 18(1) Australian Studies 211, 219.



PREFACE XIII

him. In this connection I need also to thank Ellis Katz, Donald Lutz and Robert Williams for their comments, advice and encouragement.

In 2000, the United States Supreme Court Historical Society of Washington DC enabled me to present a paper on the colonial origins of US federalism to a seminar led by Jack Rakove, Akhil Amar and Maeva Marcus. My thanks are extended to them and to all the participants for stimulating discussions. Between 2001 and 2003, I again made a number of visits to Switzerland, Germany, the Netherlands and the United Kingdom, and was given very helpful guidance by numerous scholars, among whom I must mention Alexandre Fasel, Thomas Fleiner, Max Frenkel, Anton Greber, Walter Kälin, Wolf Linder, Daniel Thürer, Roland Vaubel, Stephen Weatherill, Dieter Wyduckel and the late Alis Koekkoek. Alis in particular organised for me to present my research at the Schoordijk Institute at Tilburg University; his kindness and integrity will long be remembered. Among Canadians, I also owe particular debts to Peter Hogg, Thomas Hueglin, Victor MacKinnon, Wes Pue and Barry Wright. Others I must mention who have commented on aspects of the argument include Ruben Alvarado, Bob Destro, Daniel Dreisbach, James Hutson, Gordon Hylton, Barry Shain, Ryan Streeter, Graham Walker, Peter Wallace and Todd Zywicki.

I am especially grateful to Finola O'Sullivan at Cambridge University Press, who embraced the idea of this book with great enthusiasm, and to many members of the editorial staff for their attention to detail.

Particular thanks are also due to Colin Hughes and John Nethercote, both of whom read the entire typescript closely and provided me with pages of suggestions for improvement. To these and many others, I must express my gratitude. The book is much better than it would have been because of their helpful advice, although I am of course responsible for its remaining shortcomings.

Most importantly, however, I wish to thank my wife, Lisa, for her love, constancy and support. To her I owe more than I can say.

A note on terminology

The Commonwealth of Australia came into being when the six self-governing colonies of Australia were united into a federal commonwealth by force of the Commonwealth of Australia Constitution Act 1900 (UK). In this book, I use the term 'colony' to designate the six colonies prior to federation and use the term 'state' to designate them subsequent to federation.



TABLE OF STATUTES AND EXECUTIVE INSTRUMENTS

Representative and responsible government in the Australian colonies

New South Wales and the Australian colonies generally

The Transportation Act 1784 (UK) 24 Geo. III c. 56 135

New South Wales Act 1787 (UK) 27 Geo. III c. 2

Letters Patent, 2 April 1787 (First Charter of Justice for New South Wales)

Letters Patent, 4 February 1814 (Second Charter of Justice for New South Wales)

New South Wales Act 1823 (UK) 4 Geo. IV c. 96 136

Letters Patent, 13 October 1823 (Third Charter of Justice for New South Wales)

Australian Courts Act 1828 (UK) 9 Geo. IV c. 83 136

Australian Constitutions Act (No. 1) 1842 (UK) 5 & 6 Vic. c. 76 136, 137, 140

City of Sydney Incorporation Act 1842 (NSW) 137

Australian Constitutions Act (No. 2) 1850 (UK) 13 & 14 Vic. c. 59 67, 137, 138, 140, 145

New South Wales Constitution Statute 1855 (UK) 18 & 19 Vic. c. 54 137, 138

Constitution Act 1855 (NSW) 138

Municipalities Act 1858 (NSW) 137

Australian Colonies Act 1861 (UK) 24 & 25 Vic. c. 44

Australian Constitutions Act 1862 (UK) 25 & 26 Vic. c. 11

Colonial Laws Validity Act 1865 (UK) 28 & 29 Vic. c. 63 329, 334

Federal Council of Australasia Act 1885 (UK) 48 & 49 Vic. c. 60 28, 146-8

Constitution Act 1902 (NSW) 2 Edw. VII no. 32

Tasmania

Letters Patent, 18 August 1823 (First Charter of Justice for Tasmania) Order in Council, 14 June 1825 (Separation from New South Wales) Letters Patent, 4 March 1831 (Second Charter of Justice for Tasmania) Constitution Act 1856 (Tas.) 18 Vic. no. 17

xiv



TABLE OF STATUTES AND EXECUTIVE INSTRUMENTS XV

South Australia

South Australia Colonization Act 1834 (UK) 4 & 5 Will. IV c. 95 136 Letters Patent, 19 February 1836 (Establishing the Province of South Australia) South Australia Act 1842 (UK) 5 & 6 Vic. c. 61 136 South Australian Constitution Act 1855–6 (SA) 19 & 20 Vic. no. 2 138

Victoria

Victoria Electoral Act 1851 (NSW) 14 Vic. no. 47 137 Victorian Constitution Statute 1855 (UK) 18 & 19 Vic. c. 55 137, 138 Constitution Act 1975 (Vic.)

Western Australia

Government in Western Australia Act 1829 (UK) 10 Geo. IV, c. 22 136 (Legislative Council Electoral) Ordinance 1870 (WA) 34 Vic. no. 13 Constitution Act 1889 (WA) 137, 138 Western Australian Constitution Act 1890 (UK) 53 & 54 Vic. c. 26 137, 138 Constitution Acts Amendment Act 1899 (WA) 63 Vic. no. 19

Queensland

Order in Council, 6 June 1859 (Separation from New South Wales) 138 Constitution Act 1867 (Qld) 31 Vic. no. 38 138

Federation enabling statutes

Australasian Federation Enabling Act 1895 (NSW) 168
Australasian Federation Enabling Act Amendment Act 1897 (NSW) 168
Australasian Federation Enabling Act 1899 (NSW)
Australasian Federation Enabling Act 1896 (Vic.) 168, 182
Australasian Federation Enabling Act 1899 (Vic.)
Australasian Federation Enabling Act (South Australia) 1895 (SA) 168
Commonwealth Bill Amendment Act 1899 (SA)
Australasian Federation Enabling Act (Tasmania) 1896 (Tas.)
Australasian Federation Enabling Act 1899 (Tas.) 178
Australasian Federation Enabling Bill (Queensland) 1897 (Qld) 170
Australasian Federation Enabling Act (Queensland) 1899 (Qld) 178
Australasian Federation Enabling Act 1896 (WA)
Australasian Federation Enabling Act 1900 (WA) 180



XVI TABLE OF STATUTES AND EXECUTIVE INSTRUMENTS

Other statutes

Australia Act 1986 (Cth) 41, 52, 60–1, 138, 345–6, 354 Australia Act 1986 (UK) 41, 52, 60–1, 138, 345–6, 354 Australia Act (Request and Consent) Act 1985 (Cth) Australia Acts (Request) Acts 1985 (NSW, Vic., Qld, SA, WA, Tas.) 14, 60, 351, 357

Constitutional Alteration (Preamble) Act 1999 (Cth) 354 Constitution Alteration (Referendums) Act 1977 (Cth) 355 Referendum (Machinery Provisions) Act 1984 (Cth) 320 Statute of Westminster 1931 (UK) 60, 138, 331–2, 351, 354 Statute of Westminster Adoption Act 1942 (Cth) 138

Foreign constitutions and statutes

United States of America

Fundamental Orders of Connecticut (1639) 39, 54, 83 Declaration of Independence (1776)

Articles of Confederation of the United States of America (1781) 25–6, 28, 48, 51

Constitution of the United States of America (1788) 21–8, 49–50, 51, 56–7, 61, 122, 217, 226, 249, 257–8

Constitution of the Confederate States of America (1861) 26

Canada

The Quebec Act 1774 (UK) 14 Geo. III c. 83 57, 59

The Constitutional Act 1791 (UK) 31 Geo. III c. 31 57

The Union Act 1840 (UK) 3 & 4 Vic. c. 35 29, 57

British North America Act 1867 (UK) 30 & 31 Vic. c. 3 29, 57-8, 72, 109

Rupert's Land Act 1868 (UK) 31-32 Vic. c. 105 58

Manitoba Act 1870 (Can.) 33 Vic. c. 3 58

Order in Council, 23 June 1870 (Rupert's Land and the North-Western Territory) 58

Order in Council, 16 May 1871 (British Columbia) 58

Order in Council, 26 June 1873 (Prince Edward Island) 58

Alberta Act 1905 (Can.) 4-5 Edward VII c. 3 58

Saskatchewan Act 1905 (Can.) 4-5 Edward VII c. 42 58

British North America Act 1915 (UK)

Constitution Act 1930 (UK) 20 & 21 Geo. V c. 26

Newfoundland Act 1949 (UK) 12 & 13 Geo. VI c. 22 58



TABLE OF STATUTES AND EXECUTIVE INSTRUMENTS XVII

The Canada Act 1982 (UK)
Constitution Act 1982 (Can.) 41, 49, 50, 52

Other countries

Constitution of Belgium (1994) 40, 46
Constitution of the German Empire (1871) 46, 51, 220, 255
German Basic Law (Constitution) (1949–98) 49
Constitution of Norway (1814) 228
Scotland Act 1998 (UK) 46
Constitution of Spain (1978–92) 40, 46
Federal Constitution of the Swiss Confederation (1848), (1874), (1999) 43, 45, 48, 49–50, 51, 61



TABLE OF CASES

Amalgamated Society of Engineers v. Adelaide Steamship Co. Ltd (1920) 28 CLR 129 132, 281, 364, 365, 366

Attorney-General (Cth); Ex rel McKinlay ν. Commonwealth (1975) 135 CLR 1 209, 358, 359

Attorney-General (Cth) v. Colonial Sugar Refining Company Ltd (1913) 17 CLR 644; [1914] AC 237 366

Attorney-General (Cth) v. Schmidt (1961) 105 CLR 361 281, 365

Attorney-General (NSW) v. Brewery Employees Union of NSW (1908) 6 CLR 469 261

Attorney-General (Vic.); Ex rel Dale v. Commonwealth (1945) 71 CLR 237 276

Attorney-General (WA) v. Marquet (2003) 217 CLR 545 356

Austin ν . Commonwealth (2003) 215 CLR 185 366

Australian Boot Trade Employees Federation ν . Whybrow & Co. (1910) 10 CLR 266 284

Australian Capital Television Pty Ltd v. Commonwealth (1992) 177 CLR 106 13

Baxter v. Commissioners of Taxation (NSW) (1907) 4 CLR 1087 364

Bistricic v. Rokov (1976) 135 CLR 552 357

Bourke v. State Bank of NSW (1990) 170 CLR 276 281, 365

Chisholm v. Georgia 2 US (2 Dall.) 419 (1793) 24

Clyde Engineering Co. Ltd v. Cowburn (1926) 37 CLR 466 284, 291

Coe ν . Commonwealth (No. 1) (1978-9) 24 ALR 118 135

Coe v. Commonwealth (No. 2) (1993) 118 ALR 193 135

Cole v. Whitfield (1988) 165 CLR 360 368

Cooper v. Stuart (1889) 14 App. Cas. 286 135

D'Emden v. Pedder (1904) 1 CLR 91 132, 364

Ex parte McLean (1930) 43 CLR 472 284

Federated Amalgamated Government Railway and Tramway Service Association v. NSW Railway Traffic Employees Association (1906) 4 CLR 488 364

Federated Municipal and Shire Council Employees' Union of Australia ν.

Melbourne Corporation (1919) 26 CLR 508 83

Hannah v. Dalgarno (1903) 1 CLR 1 292

xviii



TABLE OF CASES

xix

Hodge v. The Queen (1883) 9 AC 117 72

Kable v. Director of Public Prosecutions (NSW) (1996) 189 CLR 51 2

Kruger v. Commonwealth (1997) 189 CLR 1 14

Mabo v. Queensland (No. 2) (1992) 175 CLR 1 135

Marbury v. Madison 5 US (1 Cranch.) 137 (1803) 72

McCulloch v. Maryland 17 US (4 Wheat.) 316 (1819) 26, 72

McGinty v. Western Australia (1996) 186 CLR 140 13-14, 232, 350-1, 358, 359

Melbourne Corporation v. Commonwealth (1947) 74 CLR 31 366

Nationwide News Pty Ltd v. Wills (1992) 177 CLR 1 13

New South Wales v. Commonwealth (1976) 135 CLR 337 357

New South Wales v. Commonwealth (2006) 229 CLR 1 366

Northern Suburbs General Cemetery Reserve Trust v. Commonwealth (1993) 176 CLR 555 238

Polyukhovich v. Commonwealth (1991) 172 CLR 501 355

R v. Kidman (1915) 20 CLR 425 134

R v. Kirby; Ex parte Boilermakers' Society of Australia (1956) 94 CLR 254 2, 292

R v. Licensing Court of Brisbane; Ex parte Daniell (1920) 28 CLR 23 284

R v. Phillips (1970) 125 CLR 93 290

Reference re Amendment of the Constitution of Canada (Nos. 1, 2 and 3) [1981] 1 SCR 753 58

Reference re Secession of Quebec [1998] 2 SCR 217 58

Sue v. Hill (1999) 199 CLR 462 60

Tasmania v. Commonwealth (1904) 1 CLR 329 368

Theophanous v. Herald & Weekly Times Ltd (1994) 182 CLR 104 181

Toy v. Musgrove (1888) 14 VLR 349 138

Victoria v. Commonwealth (1975) 134 CLR 81 361

Victoria v. Commonwealth and Hayden (1975) 134 CLR 338 276

Victorian Stevedoring & General Contracting Co. Pty Ltd v. Dignan (1931) 46 CLR 73 2

Walker v. New South Wales (1994) 182 CLR 45 135

Wesberry v. Sanders 376 US 1 (1963) 232, 234

Western Australia v. Commonwealth (1995) 183 CLR 373 136

Western Australia v. Wilsmore [1981] WAR 179 357

W. H. Blakeley Co. v. Commonwealth (1953) 87 CLR 501 281, 365

Wik Peoples v. Queensland (1996) 187 CLR 1 135