

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-88777-9 - Comparative Perspectives on Revenue Law: Essays in Honour of John Tiley

Edited by John Avery Jones, Peter Harris and David Oliver

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

*Contributors and affiliations* page viii*Foreword by Dave Hartnett* x*Foreword by Hugh Ault* xvi

- 1 A comparison of statutory general anti-avoidance rules and judicial general anti-avoidance doctrines as a means of controlling tax avoidance: Which is better? (What would John Tiley think?)** 1
- BRIAN ARNOLD
- Introduction 1
- 1.1 Background – preliminary matters 2
- 1.2 Statutory general anti-avoidance rules 11
- 1.3 Judicial anti-avoidance doctrines 15
- 1.4 Assessment of judicial anti-avoidance doctrines and statutory GAARs 17
- 1.5 Similarity between the UK judicial anti-avoidance doctrines and the Canadian GAAR 20
- 2 The judicial approach to avoidance: some reflections on *BMBF* and *SPI*** 25
- MALCOLM GAMMIE
- Introduction 25
- 2.1 The *BMBF* decision 26
- 2.2 The *SPI* decision 33
- Conclusion 38
- 3 Comparing the application of judicial interpretative doctrines to revenue statutes on opposite sides of the pond** 40
- MARTIN McMAHON
- Introduction 40
- 3.1 Interpretative doctrines 42
- 3.2 Anti-abuse doctrines 55
- Conclusion 71

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-88777-9 - Comparative Perspectives on Revenue Law: Essays in Honour of John Tiley

Edited by John Avery Jones, Peter Harris and David Oliver

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

vi

COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES ON REVENUE LAW

<b>4 Abuse of rights and European tax law</b>	<b>75</b>
WOLFGANG SCHÖN	
Introduction	75
4.1 The two levels of legislation	76
4.2 Principles of 'abuse of rights' under EC law	79
4.3 Abuse of rights in the field of the fundamental freedoms	84
4.4 Abuse of rights in the field of tax directives	93
Conclusion	98
<b>5 The US legislative and regulatory approach to tax avoidance</b>	<b>99</b>
ERIK M. JENSEN	
Introduction	99
5.1 The tax shelter problem	100
5.2 Targeted legislation	105
5.3 Outcomes-oriented legislation	107
5.4 Codifying anti-avoidance doctrines	110
5.5 Anti-avoidance doctrines and administrative action	117
5.6 Disclosure	119
5.7 Improving advisors' behaviour	124
Conclusion: beyond the rules and a few final thoughts	129
<b>6 The law of taxation and unjust enrichment</b>	<b>132</b>
GRAHAM VIRGO	
Introduction	132
6.1 The relevance of the law of restitution	133
6.2 Restitutionary claims for the use of money	144
Conclusion	164
<b>7 The history of royalties in tax treaties 1921–61: Why?</b>	<b>166</b>
RICHARD VANN	
Introduction	166
7.1 Early League of Nations models and treaty practice	167
7.2 Mexico and London models and treaty practice	179
7.3 OEEC work and treaty practice	184
Conclusion	196
<b>8 Land taxation, economy and society in Britain and its colonies</b>	<b>197</b>
MARTIN DAUNTON	
Introduction	197
8.1 Nature of land taxation in Britain resting on the land tax	198
8.2 Nature of land taxation: the case of India	209

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-88777-9 - Comparative Perspectives on Revenue Law: Essays in Honour of John Tiley

Edited by John Avery Jones, Peter Harris and David Oliver

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

vii

8.3 Nature of land taxation: the case of New Zealand	212
Conclusion	218
<b>9 Meade and inheritance tax</b>	<b>219</b>
JOHN AVERY JONES	
Introduction	219
9.1 Summary of Meade's transfer tax proposals	221
9.2 Adopting LAWAT	225
9.3 Trusts	227
9.4 Combining the legacy and succession duty approach to trusts with Meade's LAWAT	229
<b>10 Taxation, human rights and the family</b>	<b>232</b>
PHILIP BAKER	
Introduction	232
10.1 The bases in the Convention for challenging tax rules based upon personal status	233
10.2 Discrimination on grounds of marital status	234
10.3 Discrimination on grounds of sex	236
10.4 The Widower's Bereavement Allowance cases	238
10.5 Discrimination on grounds of former marital status	240
10.6 Discrimination on grounds of existence of a family unit	242
Conclusion	243
<b>11 Family connections and the corporate entity: income splitting through the family company</b>	<b>244</b>
DAVID OLIVER AND PETER HARRIS	
Introduction	244
11.1 Relevance of the tax subject	245
11.2 Working for the family company	254
11.3 Distributions of the family company	263
11.4 Retained profits of the family company	268
11.5 Disposal of shares in the family company	277
Conclusion	283
<b>Epilogue: Establishing the foundations of tax law in UK universities</b>	<b>288</b>
JUDITH FREEDMAN	
References	296
Table of cases	309
Table of abbreviations	322
Index	323