ON PHILOSOPHY IN AMERICAN LAW

In recent years, there has been tremendous growth of interest in the connections between law and philosophy, but the diversity of approaches that claim to be working at the intersection of these disciplines might suggest that this area of inquiry is so fractured as to be incoherent. This volume gathers leading scholars to provide focused and straightforward articulations of the role that philosophy might play at this juncture of the history of American legal thought.

The volume marks the seventy-fifth anniversary of Karl Llewellyn’s essay “On Philosophy in American Law” in which he rehearsed the broad development of American jurisprudence, diagnosed its contemporary failings, and then charted a productive path opened by the variegated scholarship that claimed to initiate a realistic approach to law and legal theory. The essays are written in the spirit of Llewellyn’s article: they are succinct and direct arguments about the potential for bringing law and philosophy together.

Francis J. Mootz III is the author of Rhetorical Knowledge in Legal Practice and Critical Legal Theory (2006) and Law, Rhetoric and Hermeneutics (to be published in 2010). He is editor of Gadamer and Law (2007) and Nietzsche and Law (2008, with Peter Goodrich). He is also the author of a law casebook, Commercial Transactions: Sales, Leases, and Computer Information (2nd ed., 2008, with David Frisch and Peter Alces). He has published numerous articles in a variety of journals, including law reviews and peer-reviewed journals. Professor Mootz is a regular presenter at academic symposia focusing on issues of legal theory. He is a member of the editorial advisory board of the interdisciplinary journals Law, Culture and the Humanities, and International Journal for the Semiotics of Law and is a member of the Organizing Committee of the Association for the Study of Law, Culture and the Humanities. He is an active member of the Association of American Law Schools, the North American Society for Philosophical Hermeneutics, the Law and Society Association, the Society for Ricoeur Studies, and the Rhetoric Society of America.

He currently is the William S. Boyd Professor of Law at the University of Nevada, Las Vegas. Prior to accepting this appointment, he was the Samuel Weiss Distinguished Faculty Scholar and Professor of Law at the Dickinson School of Law of the Pennsylvania State University.
On Philosophy in American Law

Edited by

Francis J. Mootz III
William S. Boyd School of Law
University of Nevada, Las Vegas
Contents

Introduction
Francis J. Mootz III

PART I. KARL LLEWELLYN AND THE COURSE OF PHILOSOPHY IN AMERICAN LAW

1 On Philosophy in American Law (1934) K. N. Llewellyn
3

2 Law in Life, Life in Law: Llewellyn’s Legal Realism Revisited
Jan M. Broekman
11

3 On Realism’s Own “Hangover” of Natural Law Philosophy: Llewellyn Avec Dooyeweerd
David S. Caudill
19

4 On the Instrumental View of Law in American Legal Culture
Brian Z. Tamanaha
27

5 When Things Went Terribly, Terribly Wrong
Steven L. Winter
35

6 The Mechanics of Perfection: Philosophy, Theology, and the Foundations of American Law
Larry Catá Backer
44

PART II. PHILOSOPHICAL PERSPECTIVES ON LAW

7 Toward Normative Jurisprudence
Robin West
55

8 Critical Legal Theory Today
Jack M. Balkin
64

9 Reviving the Subject of Law
Penelope Pether
73
Contents

10 Law and Creativity 81
George H. Taylor

11 The Stories of American Law 88
Robert L. Hayman Jr. and Nancy Levit

PART III. AREAS OF PHILOSOPHY AND THEIR RELATIONSHIP TO LAW

Brian H. Bix

13 Political Philosophy and Prosecutorial Power 106
Austin Sarat and Connor Clarke

14 On (Moral) Philosophy and American Legal Scholarship 114
Matthew D. Adler

15 The Aretaic Turn in American Philosophy of Law 122
Lawrence B. Solum

16 On Continental Philosophy in American Jurisprudence 130
Adam Thurschwell

17 Psychoanalysis as the Jurisprudence of Freedom 139
Jeanne L. Schroeder and David Gray Carlson

PART IV. PHILOSOPHICAL EXAMINATIONS OF LEGAL ISSUES

18 Law as Premise 151
Frank I. Michelman

19 Doing Justice to Justice: Paul Ricoeur 159
David H. Fisher

20 Love Is All You Need: Freedom of Thought versus Freedom of Action 167
Eugene Garver

21 Legal Philosophy over the Next Century (While We Wait for the Personal Rocket Transportation We Were Promised) 176
R. George Wright

22 Atmospherics: Abortion Law and Philosophy 184
Anita L. Allen

PART V. LAW, RHETORIC, AND PRACTICE THEORY

23. Foundationalism and Ground Truth in American Legal Philosophy: Classical Rhetoric, Realism, and Pragmatism 195
Eileen A. Scallen

24 The Irrelevance of Contemporary Academic Philosophy for Law: Recovering the Rhetorical Tradition 205
Francis J. Mootz III
Contents

25  Dicta
    Peter Goodrich 215

26  Recent and Future Concepts of Law: From Conceptual Analysis to a Practice Theory of Law
    Dennis Patterson 223

27  The Tasks of a Philosophy of Law
    Robert P. Burns 232

PART VI. QUESTIONING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PHILOSOPHY AND AMERICAN LAW

28  Law and Philosophy at Odds
    Larry Alexander and Emily Sherwin 241

29  Jurisprudence: Beyond Extinction?
    Steven D. Smith 249

30  Law and Philosophy in the Hyperreal
    Pierre Schlag 257

31  Philosophy? In American Law?
    Philippe Nonet 265

PART VII. COMMENTARIES

32  Optimism and Pessimism in American Legal Philosophy
    Carlos A. Ball 273

33  This Jurisprudential Moment
    Marianne Constable 279

34  Fresh Looks, Philosophy-in-Action, and American Law
    Michael Sullivan 285

Contributors and Selected Bibliography 295

Name Index 305