

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INTERNATIONAL
LAW REPORTS

VOLUME 134

Cambridge University Press
 978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134
 Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Volumes published under the title:

**ANNUAL DIGEST AND REPORTS
 OF PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW CASES**

- | | | |
|-------------------|---|---|
| Vol. 1 (1919-22) | } | Edited by Sir John Fischer Williams, K.C.,
and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D. |
| Vol. 2 (1923-24) | | |
| Vol. 3 (1925-26) | } | Edited by Arnold D. McNair, C.B.E., LL.D.,
and H. Lauterpacht, LL.D. |
| Vol. 4 (1927-28) | | |
| Vol. 5 (1929-30) | } | Edited by H. Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D., F.B.A. |
| Vol. 6 (1931-32) | | |
| Vol. 7 (1933-34) | | |
| Vol. 8 (1935-37) | | |
| Vol. 9 (1938-40) | | |
| Vol. 10 (1941-42) | | |
| Vol. 11 (1919-42) | | |
| Vol. 12 (1943-45) | | |
| Vol. 13 (1946) | | |
| Vol. 14 (1947) | | |
| Vol. 15 (1948) | | |
| Vol. 16 (1949) | | |

Volumes published under the title:

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

- | | | |
|---|---|---|
| Vol. 17 (1950) | } | Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
F.B.A. |
| Vol. 18 (1951) | | |
| Vol. 19 (1952) | | |
| Vol. 20 (1953) | | |
| Vol. 21 (1954) | } | Edited by Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, Q.C., LL.D.,
F.B.A., and E. Lauterpacht |
| Vol. 22 (1955) | | |
| Vol. 23 (1956) | | |
| Vol. 24 (1957) | } | Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C. |
| Vol. 25 (1958-I) | | |
| Vol. 26 (1958-II) | } | Edited by E. Lauterpacht, Q.C. |
| Vols. 27—68 and Consolidated Tables and Index to Vols. 1—35 and 36—45 | | |
| Vols. 69—134 and Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases
and Treaties to Vols. 1—80, Vols. 81—100
and Vols. 1—125 | } | Edited by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht, C.B.E., Q.C.,
and C. J. Greenwood, C.M.G., Q.C. |
| | | |

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134
Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

*Lauterpacht Centre for International Law
University of Cambridge*

INTERNATIONAL LAW REPORTS

VOLUME
134

Edited by

SIR ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE QC
*Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge
Bencher of Gray's Inn*

C. J. GREENWOOD, CMG QC
*Professor of International Law, London School of Economics and Political Science
Bencher of Middle Temple*

A. G. OPPENHEIMER
*Associate Editor: Civil Law Jurisdictions
Fellow of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge*

KAREN LEE
*Assistant Editor
Fellow of the Lauterpacht Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge
Fellow of Girton College, Cambridge*

GROTIUS PUBLICATIONS



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134
Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi
Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK
Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York
www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521879231

© Sir Elihu Lauterpacht 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-87923-1 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external
or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any
content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
PREFACE	vii
EDITORIAL NOTE	ix
TABLE OF CASES (alphabetical)	xiii
TABLE OF CASES (according to courts and countries)	xv
DIGEST (main headings)	xvii
DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 134	xix
TABLE OF TREATIES	xxix
REPORTS OF CASES	1
INDEX	767

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PREFACE

The present volume contains decisions from both international and national courts and tribunals on the death penalty, the nature and scope of provisional measures, and consular relations. The international decisions are from the International Court of Justice (*LaGrand* and *Avena*), the Grand Chamber of the European Court of Human Rights (*Mamatkulov*), the Inter-American Court of Human Rights (*Hilaire*) and the United Nations Human Rights Committee (*Kennedy*). The national decisions are from the courts of Barbados, Jamaica, Malawi, Singapore, Trinidad and Tobago and the United States of America.

Mr Joshua Brien, Legal Adviser at the Commonwealth Secretariat, wrote the summaries of the decisions from the International Court of Justice. Ms Karen Lee, Assistant Editor, prepared the summaries of the decisions from the European Court of Human Rights, Malawi (*Kafantayeni*) and Singapore (*Nguyen*), as well as seeing the volume through the press. Dr David Berry, Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Law, University of the West Indies, summarized the decision from the Caribbean Court of Justice (*Joseph and Boyce*) and Mr Oliver Jones, Faculty of Law, University of Hong Kong, the decision from the United States (*Sanchez-Llamas*). Professor Greenwood prepared the summaries of the decisions from the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, the United Nations Human Rights Committee and the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council in the cases from Barbados (*Boyce*), Jamaica (*Lewis*) and Trinidad and Tobago (*Matthew*). Ms Tara Grant prepared the Tables of Cases and Digest and provided general and secretarial assistance. Miss Maureen MacGlashan, CMG, compiled the Table of Treaties and Index. Mrs Alison Morley checked the copy and Mr Philip Riley read the proofs.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134
Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

viii

PREFACE

We are most grateful to all those who have contributed to the preparation of this volume. In addition, we would like to extend our thanks to our publishers, Cambridge University Press, and typesetters, Aptara, and their staff.

LAUTERPACHT CENTRE
FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW,
UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE

E. LAUTERPACHT

LAW DEPARTMENT,
LONDON SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS
AND POLITICAL SCIENCE

C. J. GREENWOOD

May 2008

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

EDITORIAL NOTE

The *International Law Reports* endeavour to provide within a single series of volumes comprehensive access in English to judicial materials bearing on public international law. On certain topics it is not always easy to draw a clear line between cases which are essentially ones of public international law interest and those which are primarily applications of special domestic rules. For example, in relation to extradition, the *Reports* will include cases which bear on the exception of “political offences” or the rule of double criminality, but will restrict the number of cases dealing with purely procedural aspects of extradition. Similarly, while the general rules relating to the admission and exclusion of aliens, especially of refugees, are of international legal interest, cases on the procedure of admission usually are not. In such borderline areas, and sometimes also where there is a series of domestic decisions all dealing with a single point in essentially the same manner, only one illustrative decision will be printed and references to the remainder will be given in an accompanying note.

DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

The *Reports* seek to include so far as possible the available decisions of every international tribunal, e.g. the International Court of Justice, or *ad hoc* arbitrations between States. There are, however, some jurisdictions to which full coverage cannot be given, either because of the large number of decisions (e.g. the Administrative Tribunal of the United Nations) or because not all the decisions bear on questions of public international law (e.g. the Court of Justice of the European Communities). In these instances, those decisions are selected which appear to have the greatest long-term value.

Human rights cases. The number of decisions on questions of international protection of human rights has increased considerably in recent years and it is now impossible for the *Reports* to cover them all. As far as decisions of international jurisdictions are concerned, the *Reports* will continue to publish decisions of the European Court of Human Rights and of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights, as well as “views” of the United Nations Committee on Human Rights. Decisions of national courts on the application of conventions on human rights will not be published unless they deal with a major point of substantive human rights law or a matter of wider interest to public international

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

lawyers such as the relationship of international law and national law, the extent of the right of derogation or the principles of the interpretation of treaties.

International arbitrations. The *Reports* of course include arbitral awards rendered in cases between States which involve an application of public international law. Beyond this, however, the selection of arbitral decisions is more open to debate. As these *Reports* are principally concerned with matters of public international law, they will not include purely private law commercial arbitrations even if they are international in the sense that they arise between parties of different nationality and even if one of them is a State. (For reports of a number of such awards, see *Yearbook Commercial Arbitration* (ed. Albert Jan Van den Berg, under the auspices of the International Council for Commercial Arbitration).) But where there is a sufficient point of contact with public international law then the relevant parts of the award will be reported. Examples of such points of contact are cases in which the character of a State as a party has some relevance (e.g. State immunity, stabilization clauses, *force majeure*) or where there is a choice of law problem involving discussion of international law or general principles of law as possible applicable laws. The same criteria will determine the selection of decisions of national courts regarding the enforcement of arbitral awards.

DECISIONS OF NATIONAL TRIBUNALS

A systematic effort is made to collect from all national jurisdictions those judicial decisions which have some bearing on international law.

EDITORIAL TREATMENT OF MATERIALS

The basic policy of the Editors is, so far as possible, to present the material in its original form. It is no part of the editorial function to impose on the decisions printed in these volumes a uniformity of approach or style which they do not possess. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of the summary and of the bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. This is followed by the full text of the original decision or of its translation. Normally, the only passages which will be omitted are those which contain either statements of fact having no bearing on the points of international law involved in the case or discussion of matters of domestic law unrelated to the points of international legal interest. The omission of material is usually indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets noting the passages which have been left out.

PRESENTATION OF MATERIALS

The material in the volume has been typeset for this volume. The source of all such material is indicated by the reference to the “Report” in square brackets at the end of the case. The language of the original decision is also mentioned there. The bold figures in square brackets in the body of the text in non-English cases indicate the pagination of the original report.

NOTES

Footnotes. Footnotes enclosed in square brackets are editorial insertions. All other footnotes are part of the original report.

Other notes. References to cases deemed not to be sufficiently substantial to warrant reporting will occasionally be found in editorial notes either at the end of a report of a case on a similar point or under an independent heading.

DIGEST OF CASES

With effect from Volume 75 the decisions contained in the *Reports* are no longer arranged according to the traditional classification scheme. Instead a Digest of Cases is published at the beginning of each volume. The main headings of the Digest are arranged alphabetically. Under each heading brief details are given of those cases reported in that volume which contain points covered by that heading. Each entry in the Digest gives the name of the case concerned and the page reference, the name of the tribunal which gave the decision and an indication of the main points raised in the case which relate to that particular heading of the Digest. Where a case raises points which concern several different areas of international law, entries relating to that case will appear under each of the relevant headings in the Digest. A list of the main headings used in the Digest is set out at p. xvii.

CONSOLIDATED INDEX AND TABLES

A Consolidated Index and a Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 1-80 were published in two volumes in 1990 and 1991. A further volume containing the Consolidated Index and Consolidated Tables of Cases and Treaties for volumes 81-100 was published in 1996. A Consolidated Index, a Consolidated Tables of Cases and a Consolidated Table of Treaties for volumes 1-125 were published in 2004. Consolidated Tables of Cases for volumes 126-30 were published in volume 130.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ALPHABETICAL

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word “note” in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

Attorney General and Others v. Joseph and Boyce 469	Kennedy v. Trinidad and Tobago (Communication No 845/1999) (Views under Article 5(4) of the Optional Protocol) 415, 428
Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States of America) (Provisional Measures) 95, 104	LaGrand Case (Germany v. United States of America) (Judgment) 1
Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States of America) (Judgment) 95, 120	Lewis v. Attorney General of Jamaica 615
Boyce and Another v. The Queen 439	Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey (Applications Nos 46827/99 and 46951/99) (Merits) 230
Boyce and Others v. Barbados 614 (note)	Matthew v. Trinidad and Tobago 687
Brown v. Attorney General of Jamaica 615	Nguyen Tuong Van v. Public Prosecutor 660
Bustillo v. Virginia 719	Sanchez-Llamas v. Oregon 719
Hilaire, Constantine and Benjamin and Others v. Trinidad and Tobago 293	Taylor and Another v. Attorney General of Jamaica 615
Kafantayeni and Others v. Attorney General of Malawi 649	
Kennedy v. Trinidad and Tobago (Communication No 845/1999) (Admissibility) 415, 418	

TABLE OF CASES REPORTED

ARRANGED ACCORDING TO COURTS
 AND TRIBUNALS (INTERNATIONAL CASES)
 AND COUNTRIES (MUNICIPAL CASES)

(Cases which are reported only in a note are distinguished from cases which are reported in full by the insertion of the word “note” in parentheses after the page number of the report.)

I. DECISIONS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNALS

<p><i>European Court of Human Rights</i></p> <p>2005 Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey (Applications Nos 46827/99 and 46951/99) (Merits) 230</p> <p><i>Inter-American Court of Human Rights</i></p> <p>2002 Hilaire, Constantine and Benjamin and Others v. Trinidad and Tobago 293</p> <p>2007 Case of Boyce and Others v. Barbados 614 (note)</p> <p><i>International Court of Justice</i></p> <p>2001 LaGrand Case (Germany v. United States of America) (Judgment) 1</p>	<p>2003 Case Concerning Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States of America) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures) 95, 104</p> <p>2004 Case Concerning Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States of America) (Judgment) 95, 120</p> <p><i>United Nations Human Rights Committee</i></p> <p>1999 Kennedy v. Trinidad and Tobago (Communication No 845/1999) (Decision on Admissibility) 415, 418</p> <p>2002 Kennedy v. Trinidad and Tobago (Communication No 845/1999) (Views under Article 5(4) of the Optional Protocol) 415, 428</p>
---	---

II. DECISIONS OF MUNICIPAL COURTS

<p><i>Barbados</i></p> <p>2004 Boyce and Another v. The Queen 439</p> <p>2006 Attorney General and Others v. Joseph and Boyce 469</p>	<p><i>Jamaica</i></p> <p>2000 Lewis v. Attorney General of Jamaica 615</p> <p><i>Malawi</i></p> <p>2007 Kafantayeni and Others v. Attorney General of Malawi 649</p>
---	--

<i>Singapore</i>	<i>United States of America</i>
2004 Nguyen Tuong Van v. Public Prosecutor 660	2006 Bustillo v. Virginia 719 Sanchez-Llamas v. Oregon 719
<i>Trinidad and Tobago</i>	
2004 Matthew v. Trinidad and Tobago 687	

DIGEST OF CASES

List of Main Headings

(Those headings for which there are entries in the present volume are printed in italics.
 For a guide to the Digest, see the Editorial Note at p. xi.)

Air	<i>International Tribunals</i>
Aliens	Jurisdiction
Arbitration	Lakes and Landlocked Seas
Canals	<i>Nationality</i>
Claims	Recognition
Comity	<i>Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law</i>
Conciliation	Reprisals and Countermeasures
<i>Consular Relations</i>	Rivers
Damages	Sea
Diplomatic Relations	Sources of International Law
Economics, Trade and Finance	Space
Environment	State Immunity
Expropriation	State Responsibility
Extradition	State Succession
Governments	States
<i>Human Rights</i>	Territory
<i>International Court of Justice</i>	Terrorism
International Criminal Law	<i>Treaties</i>
International Organizations	War and Armed Conflict

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

DIGEST OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 134

Consular Relations

- | | <i>Page</i> |
|---|-------------|
| <p>Treaties — Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963 — Singapore not party to Convention — Prevailing norms of conduct between States — Whether requirement of consular access before statements recorded — Whether statements admissible — Whether breach of Article 36(1) — Singapore, Court of Appeal</p> <p style="padding-left: 2em;"><i>Nguyen Tuong Van v. Public Prosecutor</i></p> | 660 |
| <p>Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963, Article 36 — Requirement that consulate be informed of detention of one of its nationals — Whether conferring rights upon individuals — Consequences of non-compliance — Whether evidence obtained during detention not notified to consulate must be suppressed — Extent to which complaint of non-compliance may be excluded because not raised at earlier point in proceedings — Relationship between Articles 36(1) and (2) — Remedies for non-compliance — Optional Protocol — Extent of jurisdiction — International Court of Justice</p> <p style="padding-left: 2em;"><i>Case Concerning Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States of America) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures) (Judgment)</i></p> | 95 |
| <p>Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963, Article 36 — Requirement that consulate be informed of detention of one of its nationals — Whether conferring rights upon individuals — Consequences of non-compliance — Whether evidence obtained during detention not notified to consulate must be suppressed — Extent to which complaint of non-compliance may be excluded because not raised at earlier point in proceedings — Relationship between Articles 36(1) and (2) — Remedies for non-compliance — Optional Protocol — Extent of jurisdiction — International Court of Justice</p> <p style="padding-left: 2em;"><i>LaGrand Case (Germany v. United States of America) (Judgment)</i></p> | 1 |

Consular Relations (*cont.*)

Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963, Article 36 — Requirement that consulate be informed of detention of one of its nationals — Whether conferring rights upon individuals — Consequences of non-compliance — Whether evidence obtained during detention not notified to consulate must be suppressed — Extent to which complaint of non-compliance may be excluded because not raised at earlier point in proceedings — United States of America, Supreme Court

Sanchez-Llamas v. Oregon; Bustillo v. Virginia 719

Human Rights

Cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment — Prison conditions — Death row prisoners — Conditions of detention amounting to cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment — American Convention on Human Rights, 1969 — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Hilaire, Constantine and Benjamin and Others v. Trinidad and Tobago 293

Due process — Requirements of fair trial — Capital case — Requirement of legal assistance — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Hilaire, Constantine and Benjamin and Others v. Trinidad and Tobago 293

Due process — Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963, Article 36 — Requirement that State notify consulate of detention of foreign national — Whether conferring rights upon individual detainees — Non-compliance — Whether entitling individual to exclude evidence obtained during detention — United States of America, Supreme Court

Sanchez-Llamas v. Oregon; Bustillo v. Virginia 719

Inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment — Right to a fair trial — Right of access to justice — Relevant case law — Relevant international instruments — Death sentence mandatory for offence of murder in Malawi — Whether constitutional — Whether mandatory death penalty violating Sections 19, 42(2)(f) and 41(2) of Malawi Constitution — Whether Section 210 of

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

DIGEST OF CASES

xxi

Malawi Penal Code invalid pursuant to Section 5 of Malawi Constitution — Malawi, High Court

Kafantayeni and Others v. Attorney General of Malawi 649

Prohibition of torture — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 3 — Whether applicants facing real risk of treatment proscribed by Article 3 in Uzbekistan — Evidence — Assessment at date of extradition — Turkey failing to comply with interim measure indicated under Rule 39 — Court being prevented from assessing risk in appropriate manner — Whether Turkey violating Article 3 — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey (Applications Nos 46827/99 and 46951/99) (Merits) 230

Right of individual application — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 34 — Turkey failing to comply with measures indicated under Rule 39 of Rules of Court — Whether Turkey breaching its Article 34 undertaking not to hinder applicants in exercise of right of individual application — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey (Applications Nos 46827/99 and 46951/99) (Merits) 230

Right to fair trial — European Convention on Human Rights, 1950, Article 6(1) — Whether applying to extradition proceedings in Turkey — Whether violation of Article 6(1) concerning criminal proceedings in Uzbekistan — Whether risk of flagrant denial of justice — Evidence at time of extradition — Unavailability of additional information — Turkey failing to comply with indication — Whether Turkey violating Article 6(1) — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey (Applications Nos 46827/99 and 46951/99) (Merits) 230

Right to life — Capital punishment — Mandatory death penalty — Whether compatible with Article 6 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 1966 — Prerogative of mercy — Whether Covenant prescribing procedure to be followed — Due process — Delay — Ill-treatment following arrest — Conditions of detention — Legal aid — Whether required for constitutional challenge based on Covenant rights — Object and purpose of the Covenant and the Optional Protocol —

Human Rights (*cont.*)

- Reservations to the Optional Protocol — United Nations Human Rights Committee
Kennedy v. Trinidad and Tobago (*Communication No 845/1999*) (*Decision on Admissibility*) (*Views under Article 5(4) of the Optional Protocol*) 415
- Right to life — Capital punishment — Mandatory death penalty — Whether compatible with the Constitution of Barbados — Savings clause for existing laws — Effect of international treaties for the protection of human rights — Barbados, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council
Boyce and Another v. The Queen 439
- Right to life — Capital punishment — Mandatory death penalty — Whether compatible with the Constitution of Trinidad and Tobago — Savings clause for existing laws — Effect of international treaties for the protection of human rights — Trinidad and Tobago, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council
Matthew v. Trinidad and Tobago 687
- Right to life — Capital punishment — Recourse to international human rights body — Whether stay of execution required pending outcome of international proceedings — Whether petition for clemency should be stayed pending outcome of international proceedings — Due process — Barbados, Caribbean Court of Justice (Appellate Jurisdiction)
Attorney General and Others v. Joseph and Boyce 469
- Right to life — Capital punishment — Recourse to international human rights body — Whether stay of execution required pending outcome of international proceedings — Whether petition for clemency should be stayed pending outcome of international proceedings — Due process — Jamaica, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council
Lewis v. Attorney General of Jamaica 615
- Right to life — Capital punishment — Whether prohibited by American Convention on Human Rights, 1969 — Limitations — Procedure to be followed — Requirement to take account of

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

DIGEST OF CASES

xxiii

individual circumstances — Mandatory death penalty incompatible with the Convention — Access to court for challenges to death penalty — Due process — Right to apply for commutation of sentence — Procedure to be followed — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Hilaire, Constantine and Benjamin and Others v. Trinidad and Tobago

293

Right to life — Right to equal protection — Mandatory death penalty — Whether constitutional — Whether mandatory death penalty arbitrary — Whether depriving of life in accordance with the law — Whether customary international law rule prohibiting hanging as mode of execution — Whether domestic legislation inconsistent with Singapore Constitution — Whether mandatory death penalty violating Articles 9, 12 and 93 of Singapore Constitution — Singapore, Court of Appeal

Nguyen Tuong Van v. Public Prosecutor

660

International Court of Justice

Jurisdiction — Optional Protocol to the Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963 — Extent of jurisdiction conferred by Optional Protocol — Whether extending to claim for breach of provisional measures — Whether extending to claim based on customary law concept of diplomatic protection — Admissibility of claims — International Court of Justice

LaGrand Case (Germany v. United States of America) (Judgment)

1

Jurisdiction — Optional Protocol to the Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963 — Extent of jurisdiction conferred by Optional Protocol — Whether extending to claim for breach of provisional measures — Whether extending to claim based on customary law concept of diplomatic protection — Admissibility of claims — International Court of Justice

Case Concerning Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States of America) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures) (Judgment)

95

Provisional measures of protection — Statute of the International Court of Justice, Article 41 — Whether order indicating provisional measures legally binding — Differences between English

International Court of Justice (*cont.*)

and French texts of Article 41 — Object and purpose of the Statute and of Article 41 — Court ordering stay of execution — State carrying out execution — International Court of Justice

LaGrand Case (Germany v. United States of America) (Judgment) 1

Provisional measures of protection — Statute of the International Court of Justice, Article 41 — Criteria for the indication of provisional measures — International Court of Justice

Case Concerning Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States of America) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures) (Judgment) 95

International Tribunals

Interim measures — Scope — Whether binding — Convention system — General principles of international law — Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969 — Relevant international case law — European Court of Human Rights, Rule 39 of Rules of Court — European Court of Human Rights (Grand Chamber)

Mamatkulov and Askarov v. Turkey (Applications Nos 46827/99 and 46951/99) (Merits) 230

Provisional measures of protection — Court ordering stay of execution — Person concerned executed in defiance of provisional measures — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Hilaire, Constantine and Benjamin and Others v. Trinidad and Tobago 293

United Nations Human Rights Committee — Jurisdiction — Reservation to State's accession to the Optional Protocol — Whether limiting jurisdiction of the Tribunal — Whether reservation compatible with object and purpose of the Optional Protocol — Severability of reservation — United Nations Human Rights Committee

Kennedy v. Trinidad and Tobago (Communication No 845/1999) (Decision on Admissibility) (Views under Article 5(4) of the Optional Protocol) 415

Nationality

Proof of nationality — Dual nationality — Nationality of claims — International Court of Justice

Case Concerning Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States of America) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures) (Judgment) 95

Relationship of International Law and Municipal Law

Customary international law — Prohibition against cruel and inhuman treatment or punishment — Whether specific customary international law prohibition against hanging as mode of execution — State practice — Whether sufficient evidence for customary international law prohibition against death penalty generally — Whether customary international law rule or domestic statute prevailing in event of inconsistency — Whether Singapore Constitution importing customary international law into Singapore — Treaties and customary international law — Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 1963 — Whether stating principles of customary international law — Singapore, Court of Appeal

Nguyen Tuong Van v. Public Prosecutor 660

Decisions of international courts and tribunals — Effect in municipal law — Effect of decisions of International Court of Justice — Whether binding or merely persuasive — Municipal remedies for international violations — Where relevant instrument does not stipulate specific international remedy — Where also refers back to municipal law — Scope of discretion for municipal courts — Considerations for federal states — United States of America, Supreme Court

Sanchez-Llamas v. Oregon; Bustillo v. Virginia 719

Treaties — American Convention on Human Rights, 1969 — Requirement that State ensure municipal law effectively guarantees Convention rights — Existence of law which contravenes such rights a breach of the Convention — Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Hilaire, Constantine and Benjamin and Others v. Trinidad and Tobago 293

Relationship of International Law (*cont.*)

- Treaties — Effect in municipal law — Human rights treaties not incorporated into municipal law — Relevance as aid to interpretation — Barbados, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council
Boyce and Another v. The Queen 439
- Treaties — Effect in municipal law — Human rights treaties not incorporated into municipal law — Relevance as aid to interpretation — Trinidad and Tobago, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council
Matthew v. Trinidad and Tobago 687
- Treaties — Unincorporated treaties — American Convention on Human Rights, 1969 — Effect in municipal law — Right of access to international tribunals — Legitimate expectation — International human rights petitions — Prerogative of mercy — Capital punishment — Barbados, Caribbean Court of Justice (Appellate Jurisdiction)
Attorney General and Others v. Joseph and Boyce 469
- Treaties — Unincorporated treaties — American Convention on Human Rights, 1969 — Effect in municipal law — Right of access to international tribunals — Legitimate expectation — International human rights petitions — Prerogative of mercy — Capital punishment — Jamaica, Judicial Committee of the Privy Council
Lewis v. Attorney General of Jamaica 615

Treaties

- Interpretation — Principles of interpretation — Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969, Articles 31-3 — International Court of Justice
Case Concerning Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States of America) (Request for the Indication of Provisional Measures) (Judgment) 95
- Interpretation — Treaty authentic in more than one language — Differences between authentic texts — Means of resolution —

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

DIGEST OF CASES

xxvii

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969, Articles 31-3 —
International Court of Justice

LaGrand Case (Germany v. United States of America)
(Judgment)

1

Interpretation and application — Whether conferring rights upon
individuals — Interpretation of treaty by International Court of
Justice — Weight to be given to this interpretation by national
court — United States of America, Supreme Court

Sanchez-Llamas v. Oregon; Bustillo v. Virginia

719

Reservations — Permissibility — Vienna Convention on the Law
of Treaties, 1969, Article 19 — Reservation to the Optional Pro-
tocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights,
1966 — Object and purpose of the Optional Protocol — Whether
reservation compatible with object and purpose — Effect of imper-
missible reservation — Whether severable — United Nations
Human Rights Committee

Kennedy v. Trinidad and Tobago (Communication No 845/1999)
(Decision on Admissibility) (Views under Article 5(4) of the
Optional Protocol)

415

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TABLE OF TREATIES

This table contains a list, in chronological order according to the date of signature, of the treaties referred to in the decisions printed in the present volume. It has not been possible to draw a helpful distinction between treaties judicially considered and treaties which are merely cited.

In the case of bilateral treaties, the names of the parties are given in alphabetical order. Multilateral treaties are referred to by the name by which they are believed commonly to be known. References to the texts of treaties have been supplied, including wherever possible at least one reference to a text in the English language. The full titles of the abbreviated references will be found in the list of Abbreviations and Sources printed in the volume containing the Consolidated Table of Treaties to Volumes 1-125.

1945

- June 26 Charter of the United Nations (9 Hudson 327; UKTS 67 (1946), Cmd 7015; 145 BFSP 805; USTS 993; 1 Peaslee 1288; 59 Stat 1031; 1 UNTS 16; 39 AJIL (1945) Supp. 190; JOF 13 January 1946; 3 Bevens 1153; Blackstone's *International Law Documents*, 8th edn 9 (amended version))
- Chapter XIV
 - Art. 92 40
 - Art. 94(1) 36-7, 44
 - Art. 94(2) 44
 - Chapter XVI
 - Art. 111 40
- June 26 Statute of the International Court of Justice (9 Hudson 510; UKTS 67 (1946), Cmd 7015; USTS 993; 145 BFSP 832; 1 Peaslee 1322; 3 Bevens 1179; 1945 CanTS 7; 39 AJIL (1945) Supp. 215n; JOF 13 January 1946; 59 Stat 1031)
- Chapter II
 - Art. 36(1) 9
 - Art. 36(2) 67, 82, 104
 - Art. 38 25
 - Art. 38(1) 82
 - Art. 38(1)(c) 164-5
 - Chapter III
 - Art. 40(1) 82
 - Art. 40(2) 9, 108, 120
 - Art. 40(3) 108-9
 - Art. 41 9, 24-5, 54, 75-8, 81, 84-94, 106-13, 114-18, 120, 246-7, 268-9, 286-7

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxx

TABLE OF TREATIES

Art. 41(1)	37-47
Art. 59	41
Art. 63(1)	9, 121

1950

Nov. 4	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (213 UNTS 221; UKTS 71 (1953), Cmd 8969; 156 BFSP 915; ETS 5; 45 AJIL (1951) Supp. 24; 1 Peaslee 354; 2 Vert A 20; 1 HRR 65; JOF 4 May 1974; 1 EYB 316; 1974 RTAF 28)	
	Art. 3	709-10

1963

Apr. 24	Vienna Convention on Consular Relations (596 UNTS 261; UKTS 14 (1973), Cmnd 5219; 21 UST 77; 3 IndJIL 221; 57 AJIL (1963) 993; TIAS 6820; 1963 UNJYB 109; JOF 18 April 1971; 1971 RTAF 34; 40 Vert A 542)	
	Art. 1	151
	Art. 5	105-6, 113, 123
	Art. 5(a)	58
	Art. 5(e)	58
	Art. 35	748
	Art. 36	218-29, 722-66
	Art. 36 (chapeau)	58
	Art. 36(1)	19-22, 33-6, 53, 74-5, 81-2, 141-61, 176, 180, 666-70
	Art. 36(1)(a)	20, 21-2, 29-31, 59, 126, 130, 155-8
	Art. 36(1)(b)	20-2, 28-36, 49-52, 54-62, 73-4, 83-4, 104-6, 110-18, 123-31, 134-76, 180-99, 202-8, 668-9, 722-3, 748, 751-2
	Art. 36(1)(c)	21-2, 29-30, 73-4, 126, 130, 215-18
	Art. 36(2)	34-6, 47-8, 51, 53-4, 61-2, 73-4, 79-81, 127, 152, 158-61, 170-1, 176, 210-15, 670, 723, 729, 735, 744, 752-3, 757-61
	Art. 41(1)	748
	Art. 43(1)	749
Apr. 24	Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, Optional Protocol Concerning the Compulsory Settlement of Disputes (596 UNTS 487; 14 UKTS (1973), Cmnd 5219; 21 UST 325; TIAS 6820; 40 Vert A 544)	
	Art. I	9, 19-20, 23-4, 63-7, 71-3, 82-4, 104, 113, 118-20, 131-7, 202

1966

Dec. 16	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (999 UNTS 171; UKTS 6 (1977), Cmnd 6702; JOF 30 June 1981;	
---------	---	--

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TABLE OF TREATIES

xxxi

50 Vert A 683; 6 ILM 368 (1967); 1966 UNJYB 178; 1966 YBHR 442; 30 ZaöRV 365; Brownlie, *Basic Documents in International Affairs*, 3rd edn 270; Blackstone's *International Law Documents*, 8th edn 108)

Art. 2	436-7, 710
Art. 2(3)	433, 436
Art. 2(3)(a)	436
Art. 4	444-5
Art. 6	430, 619, 710-11
Art. 6(1)	434, 436, 437, 444
Art. 6(2)	431, 432, 437-8
Art. 6(4)	431-2, 434
Art. 7	430-1, 432-3, 434, 435-6, 710-11
Art. 9(2)	429, 619
Art. 9(3)	429-30, 436, 618, 619
Art. 10(1)	432-3, 435-6, 618, 619
Art. 14(1)	430-1, 433, 434, 436
Art. 14(3)(c)	430, 436, 619
Art. 14(3)(d)	436
Art. 14(5)	430, 436, 657
Art. 26	425

Dec. 16	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Optional Protocol (First) (999 UNTS 302; UKTS 6 (1977), Cmnd 6702; 6 ILM 383 (1967); 1966 UNJYB 193; 1966 YBHR 450; 8 Jo. ICJ 78; 30 ZaöRV 394; Brownlie, <i>Basic Documents in International Affairs</i> , 3rd edn 292; Blackstone's <i>International Law Documents</i> , 8th edn 120)	418-28, 710-11
	Preamble	419
	Art. 1	419
	Art. 2	419
	Art. 4(2)	423
	Art. 5(2)(b)	429
	Art. 5(4)	436
	Art. 12(2)	436-7

1969

May 23	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (1155 UNTS 331; UKTS 58 (1980), Cmnd 7964; 1969 UNJYB 140; 63 AJIL (1969) 875; 8 ILM 679 (1969); 9 IndJIL 288; 29 ZaöRV 711; Blackstone's <i>International Law Documents</i> , 8th edn 128)	
	Preamble	397-8
	Art. 19(c)	422-3, 424-7
	Art. 26	397-8
	Art. 31	151, 244, 287
	Art. 31(1)	270

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87923-1 - International Law Reports, Volume 134

Edited by Elihu Lauterpacht and C. J. Greenwood

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxxii

TABLE OF TREATIES

	Art. 31(3)(b)	289
	Art. 31(3)(c)	267, 291
	Art. 32	151, 287
	Art. 33(4)	40-1
Nov. 22	American Convention on Human Rights (1144 UNTS 123; PAULTS 36; 9 ILM 673 (1970); 65 AJIL (1971) 679; Blackstone's <i>International Law Documents</i> , 8th edn 146)	
	Art. 1	493
	Art. 1(1)	304-6, 341-9, 354-5, 356, 359-60, 364-5, 367-8, 376-8
	Art. 2	305, 347-52, 354, 356, 359, 377, 400, 413-14, 493, 711
	Art. 4	378, 492, 711
	Art. 4(1)	304-5, 341-9, 366, 368-70, 381-96, 399, 400-4, 409-10, 614 n., 711-12
	Art. 4(2)	341-9, 366, 399, 400-9, 492-3, 614 n.
	Art. 4(3)	492-3
	Art. 4(6)	305, 364-70, 378, 410-11, 493, 551-7, 562
	Art. 5(1)	304-6, 341-2, 360-4, 366, 368-70, 377-8, 411-13, 614 n.
	Art. 5(2)	304-6, 341-2, 360-4, 366, 368-70, 377-8, 411-13, 614 n.
	Art. 5(4)	306, 361
	Art. 5(6)	306, 361
	Art. 7(5)	305, 349-60, 377
	Art. 8(1)	304-6, 342, 349-60, 367-8, 377
	Art. 8(2)(c)	306, 355
	Art. 8(2)(d)	353, 355
	Art. 8(2)(e)	353, 355
	Art. 25	305, 306, 352-3, 356-60, 377
	Art. 44	493, 551-7, 562, 594-609
	Art. 46	493
	Art. 51	311-12
	Art. 62(1)	309-10
	Art. 62(3)	310
	Art. 63(1)	370-6, 378-80
	Art. 63(2)	248-9, 290
	Art. 68	493
	Art. 78	308
	Art. 78(2)	310
1984		
Dec. 10	UN Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment (New York)	

TABLE OF TREATIES

xxxiii

Convention) (UKTS 107 (1991), Cm 1775; 1465 UNTS 85; 23 ILM 1027 (1984); 24 ILM 535 (1985); 6 EHRR 259; Blackstone's *International Law Documents*, 8th edn 309) 245-6

1998

Nov. 1

European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1950) as amended by Protocol 11, effective as of 1 November 1998 (ETS 5; Blackstone's *International Law Documents*, 8th edn 46)

Art. 1	558-9
Art. 2	253-4, 259, 274
Art. 3	235, 256-9, 273, 276, 277-81
Art. 6	235, 276, 281-3
Art. 6(1)	259-61, 274
Art. 13	271
Art. 26(d)	287, 291
Art. 27(2)	235
Art. 27(3)	235
Art. 34	233 n. 11, 235, 261-72, 274, 275-6, 283-92
Art. 36(2)	235
Art. 41	272-3
Art. 43	235
Art. 45(2)	274