

ICSID Reports

Volume 12

The ICSID Reports provide the only comprehensive published collection of arbitral awards and decisions given under the auspices of the World Bank's International Centre for the Settlement of Investment Disputes or pursuant to other multilateral or bilateral investment treaties, including in particular the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) and the Energy Charter Treaty (ECT). These decisions, which are fully indexed, make an important contribution to the growing body of jurisprudence on international investment. The ICSID Reports are an invaluable tool for practitioners and scholars working in the field of international commercial arbitration or advising foreign investors. Volume 12 of the ICSID Reports includes the final award in Occidental v. Ecuador together with the English court decisions in that case on non-justiciability, the decision on jurisdiction in Impregilo v. Pakistan and the awards in EnCana v. Ecuador.



ICSID REPORTS

Volume

12



This volume may be cited as: 12 ICSID Reports



ICSID REPORTS

Reports of cases decided under the Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States, 1965 and related decisions on international protection of investments

Volume

12

EDITED

BY

JAMES CRAWFORD, SC, FBA, LLD (Cantab.)

Whewell Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge

AND

KAREN LEE, MA (Cantab.)

Fellow of the Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law, University of Cambridge Fellow of Girton College, Cambridge

CONSULTING EDITOR
Sir ELIHU LAUTERPACHT, CBE, QC

Honorary Professor of International Law, University of Cambridge Bencher of Gray's Inn

 $\label{eq:apublication} A \ \text{Publication of}$ the lauterpacht research centre for international law, university of cambridge

GROTIUS PUBLICATIONS





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521878043

© Cambridge University Press 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-87804-3 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

Introduction	Page ix
Editorial Note	xi
Acknowledgements	xiii
Table of Cases Reported in Volume 12	xiv
Table of Cases Reported in Volumes 1–12	xv
Digest of Cases Reported in Volume 12	xxvi
CASES	
MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7)	3
Award, 25 May 2004	6
Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467)	54
Final Award, 1 July 2004 Republic of Ecuador v. Occidental Exploration and Production Company England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division, 29 April 2005 England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division), 9 September 2005	59 101 104 129
Soufraki v. United Arab Emirates (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/7)	156
Award on Jurisdiction, 7 July 2004	158
Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8)	171
Decision on Jurisdiction, 3 August 2004	174
Empresas Lucchetti SA and Lucchetti Perú SA v. Republic of Peru (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/4)	218
Award on Jurisdiction, 7 February 2005	219



viii CONTENTS	
Impregilo SpA v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan (ICSID Case No. ARB/	03/3) 242
Decision on Jurisdiction, 22 April 2005	245
AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17)	308
Decision on Jurisdiction, 26 April 2005	312
Eureko BV v. Republic of Poland	331
Partial Award, 19 August 2005 Dissenting opinion, 19 August 2005	335 389
EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador	400
Interim Award on Request for Interim Measures of Protection, 31 January 2004 Partial Award on Jurisdiction, 27 February 2004 Award, 3 February 2006 Partial dissenting opinion, 30 December 2005	408 413 427 489
INDEX	
Index, Volume 12	511



INTRODUCTION

Arbitral tribunals and *ad hoc* committees set up under the Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States administered by the International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes (ICSID) have produced a large number of awards and decisions. In recent years, through the Additional Facility mechanism, their number has increased substantially, and their contribution both to the substance of international investment law and the procedure of international arbitration grows in importance. Chapter Eleven arbitration under NAFTA will increasingly contribute its share; so too do the increasing number of *ad hoc* arbitral decisions under bilateral and multilateral investment treaties, which are also included in this series. Many of these cases raise vital issues of investment protection and relate to fundamental questions of the relations between national and international law.

Article 48(5) of the ICSID Convention provides that the Centre shall not publish an award without the consent of the parties thereto. In the absence of an official series of reports of these texts, many have appeared unofficially, from time to time, in a variety of publications in different parts of the world. For those who wish to refer to these awards and decisions in a systematic manner, this diffusion has been a source of difficulty. There is considerable value in collecting and presenting this material in a single publication accompanied by summaries, tables of cases and with a detailed index. Some of the texts have previously been available only in French or Spanish.

James Crawford Karen Lee

Lauterpacht Research Centre for International Law University of Cambridge

August 2006



EDITORIAL NOTE

The ICSID Reports contain decisions rendered by arbitral tribunals and ad hoc committees set up within the framework of the Centre established pursuant to the ICSID Convention (including those rendered by ICSID tribunals established pursuant to bilateral investment treaties) and other decisions, whether judicial or arbitral, relating to such proceedings. These are accompanied by a full scholarly apparatus and index.

Volume 1 contains, in addition to the Basic Texts of the ICSID system, decisions in cases commenced during the period 1972 to 1981. Volume 2 contains material relating to proceedings commenced between 1981 and 1983, and Volume 3 contains the first three proceedings commenced in 1984. Volume 4 contains the texts of decisions and awards relating to ICSID cases commenced between 1984 and 1992. Volume 5 contains available texts of decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1992 and 2000, and Volume 6 contains those commenced between 1995 and 2001. Volume 7 contains decisions and awards for arbitration proceedings commenced between 1997 and 2002. Volume 8 contains decisions and awards for arbitration proceedings commenced between 1996 and 2002. Volume 9 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1990 and 2003. Volume 10 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 1998 and 2004. Volume 11 contains those for proceedings commenced between 2000 and 2002 and Volume 12 contains decisions and awards for proceedings commenced between 2001 and 2003. These cases are printed in chronological order according to the date of the main award or the date of the first reported stage of proceeding. All the proceedings relating to any given case are, so far as possible, assembled together in their own chronological order.

The awards and decisions in these *Reports* are reproduced, to the greatest extent possible, in the form in which they were handed down. Editorial intervention is limited to the introduction of a summary and of a bold-letter rubric at the head of each case. These are followed by the full text of the original decision, if available, or its translation. No attempt has been made to tamper with the texts by purporting to correct any errors or to clarify obscurities of expression.

Attempts have been made to obtain the full text of all awards and decisions. Where only excerpts are available these have been reproduced. Any omission of material is indicated either by a series of dots or by the insertion of a sentence in square brackets stating the nature of the passage which has been omitted. Should the full text of a previously excerpted or omitted decision or award subsequently become available it will be published in a later volume in the series.

Bold-letter headings preceding each case indicate the main points of law involved in the decision. These entries are also collected in a digest at the beginning of the volume.



xii

EDITORIAL NOTE

The source of the material in this volume is indicated at the end of each case. Where the material has been published in more than one language, one publication in each language is listed. The language of the original decision is also mentioned.

Various tables are printed at the beginning of each volume: an alphabetical table of cases reported in the volume, a consolidated alphabetical table of all the cases so far reported and a digest of the cases reported in the volume.

Earlier volumes contained a consolidated index. This has become impossible due to space considerations, and thus from Volume 11 the index is confined to the volume in question. The consolidated index for Volumes 1–10 is to be found at 10 *ICSID Reports* 453.



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The permissions granted for the publication of the following texts are gratefully acknowledged.

Summaries were written by Ms Tara Grant, Mr Jonathan Ketcheson, Ms Sarah M. Miller, Ms Kate Parlett, Ms Monique Sasson and Mr Tobias Schaffner. Ms Tara Grant also provided general and secretarial assistance.

The Index was prepared by Miss Maureen MacGlashan CMG and the Tables were prepared by the Editors.

Thanks are due to the Secretary-General and staff of ICSID for their assistance in many ways, including the provision of texts of decisions where this could be done consistent with ICSID rules. Responsibility for the summaries and other contents of this volume remains, however, solely with the Editors.



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUME 12

[ALPHABETICAL]

[//EFTIMODITO/MJ]	Page
AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17) Decision on Jurisdiction, 26 April 2005	308 312
Empresas Lucchetti SA and Lucchetti Perú SA v. Republic of Peru	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/03/4)	218
Award on Jurisdiction, 7 February 2005	219
EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador	400
Interim Award on Request for Interim Measures of Protection,	
31 January 2004	408
Partial Award on Jurisdiction, 27 February 2004	413
Award, 3 February 2006	427
Partial dissenting opinion, 30 December 2005	489
Eureko BV v. Republic of Poland	331
Partial Award, 19 August 2005	335
Dissenting opinion, 19 August 2005	389
Impregilo SpA v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/3) Decision on Jurisdiction, 22 April 2005	242 245
MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7)	3
Award, 25 May 2004	6
Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of	
Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467)	54
Final Award, 1 July 2004	59
Republic of Ecuador v. Occidental Exploration and	
Production Company	101
England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division, 29 April 2005	104
England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division), 9 September 2005	129
Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8)	171
Decision on Jurisdiction, 3 August 2004	174
Soufraki v. United Arab Emirates (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/7)	156
Award on Jurisdiction, 7 July 2004	158

xiv



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–12

[ALPHABETICAL]

[ALPHABETICAL]	
•	Vol., Page
ADF Group Inc. v. United States of America	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/1)	6, 449
Procedural Order No. 2 Concerning Place of Arbitration, 11 July 200	
Procedural Order No. 3 Concerning Production of Documents,	
4 October 2001	6, 461
Award, 9 January 2003	6, 470
Adriano Gardella SpA v. Government of Côte d'Ivoire	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/74/1)	1, 283
Award, 29 August 1977 (excerpts)	1, 287
AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17)	12, 308
Decision on Jurisdiction, 26 April 2005	12, 312
AGIP SpA v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo	
(ICSID Case No. ARB 77/1)	1, 306
Award, 30 November 1979	1, 309
,	,
AIG Capital Partners Inc. and CJSC Tema Real Estate Company v.	
Republic of Kazakhstan (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/6)	11, 3
Award, 7 October 2003	11,7
United Kingdom, High Court, Queen's Bench Division	
AIG Capital Partners Inc. and Another v. Republic of Kazakhstan,	
Application for Enforcement of Arbitral Award, 20 October 2005	11, 118
Amag Asia Cours Ban Amania an Danalanmant Ltd and BT Amag	
Amco Asia Corp., Pan American Development Ltd and PT Amco Indonesia v. Republic of Indonesia (ICSID Case No. ARB/81/1)	1, 376
Jurisdiction, 25 September 1983	
Provisional Measures, 9 December 1983	1, 389 1, 410
Award, 20 November 1984	1, 410
Annulment, 16 May 1986	1, 413 1, 509
Resubmitted Case: Jurisdiction, 10 May 1988	1, 543
Resubmitted Case: Award, 5 June 1990	1, 569
Resubmitted Case: Rectification, 17 October 1990	1, 638
Resubmitted Case: Rectification, 17 October 1990 Resubmitted Case: Annulment, 3 December 1992	9, 9
Annex, Interim Order No. I, Request for Stay of Enforcement of	2, 2
Award, 2 March 1991	9, 59
1 maio, 2 maion 1991	7,57



xvi TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–12

American Manufacturing and Trading Inc. v. Republic of Zaire (ICSID Case No. ARB/93/1)	5, 11
Award, 21 February 1997	5 , 14
Individual opinions, 21 February 1997	5, 37
Asian Agricultural Products Ltd [AAP] v. Democratic Socialist	
Republic of Sri Lanka (ICSID Case No. ARB/87/3)	4, 245
Award, 27 June 1990	4, 250
Dissenting opinion, 27 June 1990	4, 296
Atlantic Triton Company Limited v. People's Revolutionary	
Republic of Guinea (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/1)	3, 3
France, Cour d'appel, Rennes, 26 October 1984	3, 4
France, Cour de cassation, Rennes, 18 November 1986	3, 10
Award, 21 April 1986	3 , 13
Autoriate Commission of the Vernanda CA or Deliceming Demobile of	
Autopista Concesionada de Venezuela CA v. Bolivarian Republic of	(117
Venezuela (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/5)	6 , 417
Decision on Jurisdiction, 27 September 2001	6 , 419
Award, 23 September 2003	10, 309
Azinian, Davitian and Baca v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/97/2)	5, 269
Award, 1 November 1999	5, 272
Azurix Corp. v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/12)	10. 413
Azurix Corp. v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/12) Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003	10, 413 10, 416
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003	10, 413 10, 416
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's	10, 416
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2)	10, 416 1, 330
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980	1, 330 1, 335
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981	1, 330 1, 335 1, 368
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981	1, 330 1, 335
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981	1, 330 1, 335 1, 368
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987	1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987 Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings	1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369 1, 373
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987 Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings Ltd v. Federation of St Kitts and Nevis (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/2)	10, 416 1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369 1, 373
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987 Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings	1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369 1, 373
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987 Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings Ltd v. Federation of St Kitts and Nevis (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/2)	10, 416 1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369 1, 373
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987 Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings Ltd v. Federation of St Kitts and Nevis (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/2) Award, 13 January 1997	10, 416 1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369 1, 373
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987 Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings Ltd v. Federation of St Kitts and Nevis (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/2) Award, 13 January 1997 Casado and President Allende Foundation v. Republic of Chile	10, 416 1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369 1, 373 5, 106 5, 108
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987 Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings Ltd v. Federation of St Kitts and Nevis (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/2) Award, 13 January 1997 Casado and President Allende Foundation v. Republic of Chile (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/2) Decision on Provisional Measures, 25 September 2001	10, 416 1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369 1, 373 5, 106 5, 108
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987 Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings Ltd v. Federation of St Kitts and Nevis (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/2) Award, 13 January 1997 Casado and President Allende Foundation v. Republic of Chile (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/2) Decision on Provisional Measures, 25 September 2001 CDC Group Plc v. Republic of the Seychelles	10, 416 1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369 1, 373 5, 106 5, 108 6, 373 6, 375
Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 2003 Benvenuti and Bonfant srl v. Government of the People's Republic of the Congo (ICSID Case No. ARB/77/2) Award, 8 August 1980 France, Tribunal de grande instance, Paris, 13 January 1981 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 26 June 1981 France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 21 July 1987 Cable Television of Nevis Ltd and Cable Television of Nevis Holdings Ltd v. Federation of St Kitts and Nevis (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/2) Award, 13 January 1997 Casado and President Allende Foundation v. Republic of Chile (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/2) Decision on Provisional Measures, 25 September 2001	10, 416 1, 330 1, 335 1, 368 1, 369 1, 373 5, 106 5, 108



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–12	xvii
Decision on Continuation of Stay, 14 July 2004	11, 225
Decision on Application for Annulment, 29 June 2005	11, 237
Decision on Application for Annument, 25 June 2005	11, 237
Ceskoslovenska Obchodni Banka AS v. Slovak Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/4)	5, 330
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 24 May 1999	5 , 335
Decision on Further and Partial Objections to Jurisdiction,	,
1 December 2000	5, 358
Champion Trading Company, Ameritrade International Inc., J. T., J. B.	
and T. T. Wahba v. Arab Republic of Egypt	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/02/9)	10, 398
Decision on Jurisdiction, 21 October 2003	10, 400
CME Czech Republic BV (The Netherlands) v. Czech Republic	9, 113
Partial Award on the Merits, 13 September 2001	9, 121
Dissenting opinion	9, 243
Final Award on Damages, 14 March 2003	9, 264
Separate opinion	9,412
Judicial Review, Sweden, Svea Court of Appeal,	
15 May 2003	
Czech Republic v. CME Czech Republic BV	9, 439
CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Republic of Argentina	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8)	7, 492
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 17 July 2003	7, 494
Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija SA and Compagnie Générale des	
Eaux/Vivendi Universal v. Argentine Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/3)	5, 296
Award, 21 November 2000	5 , 299
Decision on the Challenge to the President of the Committee,	
3 October 2001	6, 330
Decision on Annulment, 3 July 2002	6, 340
Decision on Supplementation and Rectification of Annulment	
Decision, 28 May 2003	8, 489
Compañía del Desarrollo de Santa Elena SA v. Republic of Costa Rica	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/96/1)	5 , 153
Award, 17 February 2000	5, 157
Rectification of Award, 8 June 2000	5, 180
Empresas Lucchetti SA and Lucchetti Perú SA v. Republic of Peru	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/03/4)	12, 218
Award on Jurisdiction, 7 February 2005	12, 219



xviii TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–12

EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador Interim Award on Request for Interim Measures of Protection,	12, 400
31 January 2004	12, 408
Partial Award on Jurisdiction, 27 February 2004	12, 413
Award, 3 February 2006	12, 427
Partial dissenting opinion, 30 December 2005	12, 489
1 man disserving opinion, to December 2000	12, .0>
Enron Corporation and Ponderosa Assets LP v. Argentine Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/01/3)	11, 268
Decision on Jurisdiction, 14 January 2004	11, 273
Decision on Jurisdiction (Ancillary Claim), 2 August 2004	11, 295
Ethyl Corporation v. Government of Canada	7, 3
Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 28 November 1997	7, 5
Award on Jurisdiction, 24 June 1998	7, 12
Tward on Junistiction, 24 June 1990	7, 12
Eureko BV v. Republic of Poland	12, 331
Partial Award, 19 August 2005	12, 335
Dissenting opinion, 19 August 2005	12, 389
Fedax NV v. Republic of Venezuela (ICSID Case No. ARB/96/3)	5, 183
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 11 July 1997	5, 186
Award, 9 March 1998	5, 200
Feldman v. United Mexican States (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/1)	7, 318
Interim Decision on Preliminary Jurisdictional Issues,	
6 December 2000	7, 327
Award, 16 December 2002	7, 341
Dissenting opinion	7, 407
Decision on the Correction and Interpretation of the Award,	
13 June 2003	7, 418
Canada, United Mexican States v. Feldman Karpa	
Judicial Review, Ontario Superior Court of Justice,	
3 December 2003	8, 500
Judicial Review, Ontario Court of Appeal, 11 January 2005	9,508
	,
Fireman's Fund Insurance Company v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/02/01)	10, 213
Decision on the Preliminary Question, 17 July 2003	10, 214
	10.225
Generation Ukraine Inc. v. Ukraine (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/9)	10, 236
Award, 16 September 2003	10, 240
Coming and Oak areas Boundille of Early (ACCID Com No. ARR/00/2)	(226
Genin and Others v. Republic of Estonia (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/2)	6 , 236
Award, 25 June 2001	6, 241



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–12	xix
Decision on Claimants' Request for Supplementary Decisions and Rectification, 4 April 2002	6, 304
Goetz and Others v. Republic of Burundi (ICSID Case No. ARB/95/3)	6, 3
Award, 10 February 1999	6, 5
Part 1. Decision on Liability, 2 September 1998	6, 5
Part 2. The Parties' Agreement, 23 December 1998	6, 46
Gruslin v. Malaysia (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/3)	5 , 483
Award, 27 November 2000	5, 484
Impregilo SpA v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/03/3)	12, 242
Decision on Jurisdiction, 22 April 2005	12, 245
Kaiser Bauxite Company v. Government of Jamaica	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/73/3)	1, 296
Jurisdiction and Competence, 6 July 1975	1, 298
Klöckner Industrie-Anlagen GmbH, Klöckner Belge SA and Klöckner	
Handelsmaatschappij BV v. Republic of Cameroon and Société	
Camerounaise des Engrais SA (ICSID Case No. ARB/81/2)	2, 3
Award, 21 October 1983 (excerpts)	2, 9
Dissenting opinion, 21 October 1983 (excerpts)	2, 77
Annulment, 3 May 1985	2, 95
LANCO International Inc. v. Argentine Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/6)	5, 367
Preliminary Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 December 1998	5 , 369
Lauder v. Czech Republic	9, 62
Final Award, 3 September 2001	9, 66
Lemire v. Ukraine (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/1)	6, 59
Award embodying the Parties' Settlement Agreement,	
18 September 2000	6, 60
LG&E Energy Corporation and Others v. Argentine Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/02/1)	11, 411
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 30 April 2004	11, 414
Liberian Eastern Timber Corporation [LETCO] v. Government of the	2 2 4 5
Republic of Liberia (ICSID Case No. ARB/83/2)	2 , 343
Award, 31 March 1986	2, 346
Rectification, 10 June 1986	2, 380



xx TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–12

United States District Court, Southern District of New York,	
5 September 1986	2, 383
United States District Court, Southern District of New York,	
12 December 1986	2, 385
United States District Court, District of Columbia, 16 April 1987	2, 390
The Loewen Group Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States of	
America (ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3)	7, 421
Decision on Objection to Competence and Jurisdiction, 9 January 2001	7,425
Award, 26 June 2003	7, 442
Decision on Respondent's Request for a Supplementary Decision, 13 September 2004	10, 444
United States District Court, District of Columbia, <i>Loewen</i> v. <i>United</i>	-0,
States of America	
Judicial Review, 31 October 2005	10, 448
,	,
Lucchetti (Empresas) SA and Lucchetti Perú SA v. Republic of Peru	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/03/4)	12, 218
Award on Jurisdiction, 7 February 2005	12, 219
Maffezini v. Kingdom of Spain (ICSID Case No. ARB/97/7)	5, 387
Decision on Request for Provisional Measures (Procedural Order	
No. 2), 28 October 1999	5, 393
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 25 January 2000	5, 396
Award, 13 November 2000	5, 419
Rectification of Award, 31 January 2001	5, 440
Maritime International Nominees Establishment [MINE] v. Republic of	
Guinea (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/4)	4, 3
United States District Court, District of Columbia, 12 January 1981 United States Court of Appeals, District of Columbia,	4, 4
12 November 1982	4, 8
Belgium, Rechtbank van eerste aanleg, Antwerp, 27 September 1985	4, 32
Switzerland, Tribunal fédéral, 4 December 1985	4, 35
Switzerland, Tribunal de première instance, Geneva, 13 March 1986 Switzerland, Autorité de surveillance des offices de poursuite pour	4, 41
dettes et de faillite, Geneva, 7 October 1986	4, 45
Award, 6 January 1988	4 , 54
Annulment, 22 December 1989	4, 79
Request for Annulment, Procedural Order No. 1, 17 May 1988 Application for Stay of Enforcement of Award, Interim Order	4, 110
No. 1, 12 August 1988	4, 111
Metalclad Corporation v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/97/1)	5, 209
Award. 30 August 2000	5. 212



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–12	xxi
Canada, Supreme Court of British Columbia, <i>United Mexican States</i> v. <i>Metalclad</i>	
Judicial Review, 2 May 2001	5 , 236
Supplementary Reasons for Judgment, 31 October 2001	6, 52
Methanex Corporation v. United States of America	7, 208
Decision on the Place of Arbitration, 31 December 2000 Decision on Petitions from Third Persons to Intervene as "Amici	7, 213
Curiae", 15 January 2001 First Partial Award (Decision on Jurisdiction and Admissibility),	7, 224
7 August 2002	7, 239
Middle East Cement Shipping and Handling Co. SA v. Arab Republic	
of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/99/6)	7, 173
Award, 12 April 2002	7, 178
Mihaly International Corporation v. Democratic Socialist Republic	
of Sri Lanka (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/2)	6, 308
Award, 15 March 2002	6, 310
Individual concurring opinion, 15 March 2002	6, 323
Mobil Oil Corporation, Mobil Petroleum Company Inc., Mobil Oil New Zealand v. Her Majesty the Queen in Right of New Zealand	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/87/2)	4, 117
New Zealand, High Court, 1 July 1987	4, 119
Findings on Liability, Interpretation and Allied Issues, 4 May 1989	4, 140
Mondev International Ltd v. United States of America	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/99/2)	6, 181
Miscellaneous Procedural Orders	6, 186
Award, 11 October 2002	6, 192
MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7)	12, 3
Award, 25 May 2004	12, 6
Myers, S. D., Inc. v. Government of Canada	8, 3
Procedural Orders Nos. 10 and 18	8, 13, 15
First Partial Award on Liability, 13 November 2000	8, 18
Separate opinion, 12 November 2000	8 , 66
Second Partial Award on Damages, 21 October 2002	8, 124
Final Award on Costs, 30 December 2002	8, 172
Individual dissenting opinion, 30 December 2002 Judicial Review, Federal Court of Canada, 13 January 2004	8, 183
Attorney-General of Canada v. S. D. Myers Inc.	8, 194



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1-12 xxii Nykomb Synergetics Technology Holding AB v. Republic of Latvia **11,** 153 Award, 16 December 2003 **11,** 158 Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467) **12,** 54 Final Award, 1 July 2004 **12,**59 Republic of Ecuador v. Occidental Exploration and Production Company **12,** 101 England, High Court, Queen's Bench Division, 29 April 2005 **12,** 104 England, Court of Appeal (Civil Division), 9 September 2005 **12,** 129 Olguín v. Republic of Paraguay (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/5) 6, 154 Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 August 2000 6, 156 Award, 26 July 2001 **6,** 164 Pope and Talbot Inc. v. Government of Canada **7,** 43 Ruling on Interim Measures, 7 January 2000 7,54 Award on Preliminary Motion to Dismiss the Claim, 26 January 2000 7,55 Award on the "Harmac Motion", 24 February 2000 **7,** 64 Interim Award, 26 June 2000 7,69 Award on Canada's Motion regarding the "Super Fee", 7 August 2000 7,92 **7,** 99 Ruling on Claim of Crown Privilege, 6 September 2000 Award on the Merits of Phase 2, 10 April 2001 7, 102 Award on Damages, 31 May 2002 **7,** 148 Final Award on Costs, 26 November 2002 **7,** 170 PSEG Global Inc. and Others v. Republic of Turkey (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/5) **11,**431 Decision on Jurisdiction, 4 June 2004 11,434 **8,** 3 S. D. Myers Inc. v. Government of Canada Procedural Orders Nos. 10 and 18 **8,** 13, 15 First Partial Award on Liability, 13 November 2000 **8,** 18 Separate opinion, 12 November 2000 **8,** 66 Second Partial Award on Damages, 21 October 2002 8, 124 Final Award on Costs, 30 December 2002 8, 172 Individual dissenting opinion, 30 December 2002 **8,** 183 Judicial Review, Federal Court of Canada, 13 January 2004 Attorney-General of Canada v. S. D. Myers Inc. **8,** 194 Salini Costruttori SpA and Italstrade SpA v. Kingdom of Morocco (ICSID Case No. ARB/00/4) **6,** 398 Decision on Jurisdiction, 23 July 2001 **6,** 400



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–12	xxiii
Scimitar Exploration Limited v. Republic of Bangladesh and Bangladesh Oil, Gas and Mineral Corporation (ICSID Case No. ARB/92/2)	5, 3
Award, 5 April 1994	5 , 4
SGS Société Générale de Surveillance SA v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/13)	8, 383
Pakistan, Supreme Court, Société Générale de Surveillance SA v. Pakistan, through Secretary, Ministry of Finance Order, 15 March 2002	8, 352 8, 354
Judgment, 3 July 2002	8, 354
Procedural Order No. 2, 16 October 2002	8, 388
Decision on Disqualification of Arbitrator, 19 December 2002	8 , 398
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 6 August 2003	8, 406
Note on Settlement	8, 451
SGS Société Générale de Surveillance SA v. Republic of the Philippines (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/6)	8, 515
Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 29 January 2004	8, 518
Declaration, 29 January 2004	8, 568
•	,
Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8)	12, 171
Decision on Jurisdiction, 3 August 2004	12, 174
Société d'Exploitation des Mines d'Or de Sadiola SA [Semos] v. Republic of Mali (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/5)	10, 114
Award, 25 February 2003	10, 114 10, 116
1111dd, 25 1 colddly 2005	10, 110
Société Ouest Africaine des Bétons Industriels [SOABI] v. State of	
Senegal (ICSID Case No. ARB/82/1)	2, 164
Jurisdiction, 1 August 1984	2, 175
Award, 25 February 1988	2, 190
Dissenting opinion, 25 February 1988	2, 277
Declaration of the President of the Tribunal, 25 February 1988 France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 5 December 1989	2, 333
France, Cour de cassation, 11 June 1991	2, 337 2, 341
Trance, cour de cassation, 11 June 1771	2, 311
Soufraki v. United Arab Emirates (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/7)	12, 156
Award on Jurisdiction, 7 July 2004	12, 158
Southern Pacific Properties (Middle East) Limited [SPP(ME)] v. Arab	
Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/84/3)	3, 45
ICC Award No. YD/AS No. 3493, 11 March 1983	3, 49
France, Cour d'appel, Paris, 12 July 1984	3, 79
Netherlands, District Court, Amsterdam, 12 July 1984	3, 92



xxiv TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–12

France, Cour de cassation, Paris, 6 January 1987	3, 96
Jurisdiction (No. 1), 27 November 1985	3, 101
Jurisdiction (No. 2), 14 April 1988	3, 131
Dissenting opinion, 14 April 1988	3, 163
Award, 20 May 1992	3, 189
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
Dissenting opinion, 20 May 1992	3, 249
Tanzania Electric Supply Company Limited v. Independent Power	
Tanzania Limited (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/8)	8, 220
Award, 12 July 2001	8, 226
Decision on Provisional Measures, 20 December 1999	8, 239
Decision on Preliminary Issues, 22 May 2000	8 , 243
Decision on Tariff and Other Remaining Issues, 9 February 2001	8, 272
Decision on All Further Remaining Issues, 24 May 2001	8, 309
Stipulation regarding Future Disputes concerning the Construction	
Contingency Account	8, 317
Stipulation and Agreement (and Annex)	8, 318
Técnicas Medioambientales Tecmed SA v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/2)	10, 130
Award, 29 May 2003	10, 134
Tokios Tokelés v. Ukraine (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/18)	11, 305
Procedural Order No. 1, Claimant's Request for Provisional	
Measures, 1 July 2003	11, 310
Decision on Jurisdiction, 29 April 2004	11, 313
Dissenting opinion	11, 341
Procedural Order No. 3, 18 January 2005	11, 352
•	,
Tradex Hellas SA v. Republic of Albania (ICSID Case No. ARB/94/2)	5, 43
Decision on Jurisdiction, 24 December 1996	5, 47
Award, 29 April 1999	5, 70
rinard, 25 ripin 1777	2, 70
United Parcel Service of America Inc. v. Government of Canada	7, 285
Award on Jurisdiction, 22 November 2002	7, 288
Award on Jurisdiction, 22 (November 2002)	7, 200
Vacuum Salt Products Limited v. Government of Republic of Ghana	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/92/1)	4, 320
Provisional Measures, 14 June 1992	4, 323
Award, 16 February 1994	4, 329
Award, 10 rebruary 1994	4, 329
"Vivendi"/Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija SA and Compagnie	
Générale des Eaux/Vivendi Universal v. Argentine Republic	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/97/3)	5, 296
Award, 21 November 2000	5, 299



TABLE OF CASES REPORTED IN VOLUMES 1–12	XXV
Decision on the Challenge to the President of the Committee,	
3 October 2001	6, 330
Decision on Annulment, 3 July 2002	6, 340
Decision on Supplementation and Rectification of Annulment	
Decision, 28 May 2003	8, 489
Waste Management Inc. v. United Mexican States	
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/2)	5, 443
Award, 2 June 2000	5, 445
Dissenting opinion, 2 June 2000	5, 462
(ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/3)	6, 538
Decision on Venue of the Arbitration, 26 September 2001	6, 541
Decision on Preliminary Objection, 26 June 2002	6, 549
Award, 30 April 2004	11, 362
Wena Hotels Ltd v. Arab Republic of Egypt (ICSID Case No. ARB/98/4)	6, 67
Decision on Jurisdiction, 29 June 1999	6, 74
Award, 8 December 2000	6, 89
Decision on Annulment, 5 February 2002	6, 129
Yaung Chi Oo Trading Pte Ltd v. Government of the Union of Myanmar	
(ASEAN ID Case No. ARB/01/1)	8, 452
Procedural Order No. 2, 27 February 2002	8, 456
Award, 31 March 2003	8, 463
Zhinvali Development Limited v. Republic of Georgia	
(ICSID Case No. ARB/00/1)	10, 3
Award, 24 January 2003	10, 6
Separate opinion 14 January 2003	10.106



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 12

Admissibility

Documentary evidence – Production of expert and witness reports to evidence status and ownership of investment – Probative value of submitted material – ICSID Arbitration Rule 34

AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17), 308

Arbitration

Application to set aside arbitral award – Excess of jurisdiction – Non-justiciability – Whether application to set aside arbitral award non-justiciable – Nature of BIT arbitration – Whether BIT conferring direct rights on investor – Agreement to arbitrate – Applicable law of agreement to arbitrate – Whether application concerned with transactions between States – Whether unincorporated BIT can be interpreted by English court – Where Arbitration Act giving right to make application – Application of principles in *Buttes Gas* and *International Tin Council* cases

Republic of Ecuador v. Occidental Exploration and Production Company, 101

ICSID Convention, Article 25 – Dispute arising "directly out of an investment" – Whether investment made directly or indirectly

Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8), 171

Jurisdiction of ICSID Tribunal – Application of most-favoured-nation ("MFN") clause in BIT – Whether MFN clause requiring Claimant to choose between one treaty and another

Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8), 171

Notification of dispute – Definition of dispute – Hypothetical dispute – Historical dispute – Time at which a dispute must exist

Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8), 171

Precedent – Absence of rule of precedent in general international law – Legal foundation of dispute – *Lex specialis* – Whether Tribunal should consider decisions and opinions of other arbitration tribunals

AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17), 308

xxvi



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 12

xxvii

Costs

Discretion to order costs – Order for costs in favour of unsuccessful claimant – Whether just and equitable

EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador, 400

Expropriation

Change in privatization strategy – Whether breach of obligation to treat fairly and equitably – Whether breach of obligation to provide full security and protection – Relevance of umbrella clause

Eureko BV v. Republic of Poland, 331

Indirect expropriation – Whether taxation law a taking of property – Whether taxation law "extraordinary, punitive in amount or arbitrary in its incidence"

EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador, 400

Right to VAT refund – Amendment of law to clarify that VAT refunds not payable – Whether refusal of refund the repudiation of a legal right – Relevance of right of domestic challenge to decisions of tax authorities

EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador, 400

Foreign Investment

Investment in land zoned as rural – Urban planning – Whether authorization to invest in specified land giving rise to legitimate expectation that change of use possible – Respective roles of foreign investment authority and planning authority

MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7), 3

Interpretation

Article 25(1) of ICSID Convention – Legal dispute arising directly from investment – Definition of legal dispute – Intrinsic definition and inherent logic – Whether dealing with legal issues that manifest evident disagreement – Whether claims substantial

AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17), 308

Article 25(1) of ICSID Convention – Legal dispute arising directly from investment – Interpretation of directness – Differing interpretation of "directness"



xxviii

DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 12

under NAFTA Chapter 11 and ICSID Convention – Directness under ICSID Convention concerning relationship of dispute to investment

AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17), 308

Article I(1)(b) of US-Argentina BIT – Meaning of "investor" – Whether AES Corporation proper claimant – Nationality of claimant company – Inapplicability of Article 42 of ICSID Convention to issue of nationality

AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17), 308

Jurisdiction

Admissibility – Expropriation – Whether claim to a VAT refund an investment – Whether deprivation of use or reasonably expected economic benefit of investment – Whether *prima facie* case of expropriation

Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467), 54

Arbitration – ICSID Convention, Article 26 – Dispute under a treaty – Dispute under a contract – Jurisdiction clause in contract – Exclusivity of remedies

Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8), 171

Consent to arbitration – Notice of arbitration – Whether consent in notice of arbitration sufficient – Waiver of claims in domestic courts – Whether waiver in notice of arbitration sufficient – Whether defect in waiver affecting jurisdiction

EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador, 400

Disputes – Jurisdiction over disputes arising after BIT's entry into force – Definition of "dispute" – Distinction between a single dispute and two separate disputes – Whether dispute concerning same subject matter – Whether *res judicata* status of court judgments put an end to the dispute

Empresas Lucchetti SA and Lucchetti Perú SA v. Republic of Peru (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/4), 218

Fork-in-the-road provision – Claim in domestic courts – Where cause of action in domestic court different from treaty claim – Whether dispute treaty-based

Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467), 54

Investment – Indirect investment – Investment held through third State subsidiary – Subsidiary sold while arbitration pending

EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador, 400



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 12

xxix

Jurisdiction ratione materiae – Contract claims – Absence of "umbrella clause" – Generic dispute settlement clause in BIT – Consent to arbitration not encompassing contract between autonomous corporate body and investor – Most-favoured-nation clause – No extension of consent

Impregilo SpA v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/3), 242

Jurisdiction ratione materiae – Treaty claims – Effect of contractual dispute resolution clauses – Treaty claims not excluded – Objective test for jurisdiction – Onus on Claimant to establish breach of BIT attributable to State – No jurisdiction over acts carried out by the State in its capacity as party to a contract – Decision on jurisdiction over acts carried out by the State in exercise of sovereign authority deferred to merits phase – ICSID Arbitration Rules, Rule 41(4)

Impregilo SpA v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/3), 242

Jurisdiction *ratione personae* – Standing on behalf of unincorporated joint venture – "Juridical person" for purpose of ICSID Convention, Article 25(2)(b) – Standing on behalf of other joint venture partners – Protected "investor" – Nationality – Other partners not nationals of other Contracting State to BIT – Two partners not nationals "of another Contracting State" for purpose of ICSID Convention, Article 25(1) – Standing of Claimant for its own share of loss

Impregilo SpA v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/3), 242

Jurisdiction *ratione temporis* – Absence of provision for retroactivity – Treaty dispute after entry into force of BIT – Applicable law – Law in force at time of performance of act allegedly in breach of BIT

Impregilo SpA v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan (ICSID Case No. ARB/03/3), 242

Taxation measures excluded from BIT protection – Whether indirect taxes excluded – Whether entitlement to VAT refund or credit a taxation measure

EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador, 400

Taxation measures generally excluded from BIT protection – Whether non-reimbursement of VAT matter of taxation – Whether exclusion only applying to matters of direct taxation – Whether participation contract an investment agreement – Where contract rights not directly invoked before Tribunal – Whether tax matter associated with an investment agreement excluded

Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467), 54



XXX DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 12

Whether breach of contract or breach of treaty – Whether conduct of State organ an act of State – Whether corporate rights an asset – Whether contractual rights to IPO an asset – Whether waiver of BIT claims – Whether breach of BIT by omission as well as by act – Relevance of umbrella clause

Eureko BV v. Republic of Poland, 331

Whether forum selection clauses precluding ICSID arbitration – Waiver – Diplomatic protection – Admissibility of "Calvo Clause" waiver in ICSID arbitration

AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17), 308

Whether prior exhaustion of local negotiations or remedies precondition for ICSID jurisdiction – Application of Article VII of BIT requiring initial negotiations – Prior exhaustion of local remedies under Article 26 of ICSID Convention only a condition for consent

AES Corporation v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17), 308

Municipal Law

Loss of nationality through operation of Italian domestic law – Applicable domestic laws for reacquisition of Italian nationality – Whether Claimant complying with applicable domestic laws – Interpretation of "residence" in applicable domestic laws – Whether Claimant maintaining actual habitual residence in accordance with applicable domestic laws – Whether Claimant satisfying burden of proof

Soufraki v. United Arab Emirates (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/7), 156

Nationality

Evidence – Whether Tribunal bound by rules of evidence in Italian civil procedure – Whether official documents of State authorities conclusive proof of nationality – ICSID Arbitration Rule 34(1) – Tribunal's competence to judge admissibility and probative value of evidence

Soufraki v. United Arab Emirates (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/7), 156

Individual investor – ICSID Convention, Article 25(1) and (2)(b) – Laws applicable to determining nationality – Provision for determining nationality under Bilateral Investment Treaty – Application of domestic laws of State whose



DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 12

xxxi

nationality investor claiming – Competence of Tribunal to apply domestic laws when deciding issues of jurisdiction

Soufraki v. United Arab Emirates (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/7), 156

Provisional Measures

Interim measures of protection – Apparent basis of jurisdiction – Irreparable damage – Freezing of accounts and attachment of sums – Whether interim measures urgent – Where State action open to challenge before domestic courts – Whether interim measures necessary

EnCana Corporation v. Republic of Ecuador, 400

Remedies

Compensation – Entitlement to compensation for claim not made on grounds of futility – Interest

Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467), 54

Treaties

Chile–Malaysia Bilateral Investment Treaty, 1992 – Fair and equitable treatment provision – Most-favoured-nation clause – Standard of fair and equitable treatment – Whether obligation to grant planning permission part of fair and equitable treatment – Whether obligation to observe contractual obligations part of fair and equitable treatment – Investment approved for a project against current government policy

MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile (ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7), 3

Ecuador–USA Bilateral Investment Treaty, 1993 – Fair and equitable treatment – Stability of legal and business framework – Where framework changed without clarity about its effect – Standard of stability and predictability under international law – Whether breach of full protection and security

Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467), 54

Ecuador-USA Bilateral Investment Treaty, 1993 - National treatment - VAT refunds for exporters - Whether comparison should be made between sectors



xxxii

DIGEST OF CASES IN VOLUME 12

of activity or exporters generally – Whether most-favoured-nation treatment obligations also breached

Occidental Exploration and Production Company v. Republic of Ecuador (LCIA Case No. UN 3467), 54

Interpretation – Principles of interpretation – Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1969, Article 31(1)

Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8), 171

Standing – Whether Claimant having standing – Indirect investment – Whether definition of investment excluding indirect investments

Siemens AG v. Argentine Republic (ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8), 171