

THE VAT IN DEVELOPING AND TRANSITIONAL COUNTRIES

Value-added tax (VAT) now dominates tax systems around the world. But should every country have a VAT? Is the current VAT always as good as it could be in economic, equity, and administrative terms? In developing and transitional countries the answers to such questions are critical to stability, growth, and development. VAT is a critical fiscal tool in most countries. But VAT can sometimes be better designed and almost always better administered. The key questions that must be answered in designing and implementing VAT are essentially the same in all countries. But different tax designs may best suit different countries facing different circumstances. This book reviews experiences with VATs around the world and assesses how the choice of particular design features may affect outcomes in particular contexts.

Richard M. Bird is Professor Emeritus, Department of Economics, and Adjunct Professor and Co-Director of the International Tax Program at the Joseph L. Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada and currently holds appointments as a Fellow at the C. D. Howe Institute and Distinguished Visiting Professor at the Andrew Young School of Public Policy, Georgia State University. He has served in the Fiscal Affairs Department of the International Monetary Fund; been a visiting professor in the United States, the Netherlands, Australia, and elsewhere; and been a frequent consultant to the World Bank and other national and international organizations, working in more than 50 countries around the world. He has written and edited dozens of books and hundreds of articles, especially on public finance in developing countries. He was awarded the Daniel M. Holland Medal of the National Tax Association in 2006 for outstanding contributions to the study and practice of public finance.

Pierre-Pascal Gendron is Professor of Economics, The Business School, Humber College Institute of Technology & Advanced Learning, Toronto, and Research Associate, International Tax Program, Joseph L. Rotman School of Management, University of Toronto. He has served in the federal government of Canada; been a consultant in progressive positions with tax practices of professional services firms in Canada and the Netherlands; and served as consultant on fiscal matters for international, governmental, and nongovernmental organizations. He has written extensively on public economics, especially in the area of taxation. He regularly speaks on the subject at conferences and seminars.



The VAT in Developing and Transitional Countries

RICHARD M. BIRD

University of Toronto

PIERRE-PASCAL GENDRON

Humber College Institute of Technology & Advanced Learning, Toronto





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521877657

© Richard M. Bird and Pierre-Pascal Gendron 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Bird, Richard Miller, 1938-

The VAT in developing and transitional countries / Richard M. Bird, Pierre-Pascal Gendron.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-87765-7 (hardback)

HJ5715.D44B57 2007

336.2′714091724 – dc22 2006101757

ISBN 978-0-521-87765-7 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

| List | ist of Tables | |
|------------------|--------------------------------|-----|
| Pre | face | ix |
| 1 | Why This Book? | 1 |
| 2 | The Rise of VAT | 10 |
| 3 | Is VAT Always the Answer? | 28 |
| 4 | Trade and Revenue | 48 |
| 5 | Equity and the Informal Sector | 70 |
| 6 | What Should Be Taxed? | 81 |
| 7 | Key Issues in VAT Design | 108 |
| 8 | New Issues in VAT Design | 138 |
| 9 | Administering VAT | 161 |
| 10 | Dealing with Difficulties | 176 |
| 11 | The Political Economy of VAT | 193 |
| 12 | Where Do We Go from Here? | 213 |
| Anı | nex | 223 |
| Annex References | | 233 |
| Ind | lex | 259 |

v



Tables

| 2.1 | VAT in the 'Old' Member States of the European Union | page 12 |
|-----|--|---------|
| 2.2 | Deviations between Standard and Weighted Average VAT Rates | |
| | in the European Union | 13 |
| 2.3 | The Spread of VAT | 17 |
| 2.4 | Tax Structure by Region, 1975–2002 | 18 |
| 4.1 | Ukraine's VAT Is in Trouble: Its Decline as a Revenue Source | 58 |
| 4.2 | VAT Revenue Performance in the Western Hemisphere | 63 |
| 4.3 | VAT Efficiency at Standard and Weighted Average Rates | 64 |
| 4.4 | Jamaica: Productivity and Efficiency of the GCT, 1991–2004 | 65 |
| 5.1 | The Distributive Effects of VAT | 73 |
| 6.1 | Canada: GST/HST and QST Refunds in Respect of Tax | |
| | on Real Estate | 85 |
| 6.2 | Rebate Rates under the Canadian GST/HST and Québec QST | 90 |
| 6.3 | Input VAT Compensation for Public-Sector Services in Europe | 92 |
| 6.4 | Requirements for Equality of Treatment under Full Taxation | 94 |
| 7.1 | VAT Thresholds: Selected Countries | 117 |
| 7.2 | Jamaica: Thresholds Required to Maintain 1991 Level | 119 |
| 7.3 | Jamaica: Revenue Losses from Alternative Thresholds | 119 |
| 7.4 | Examples of VAT Exemptions in Selected Countries | 122 |
| 7.5 | Jamaica: Zero-Rating, 2004 | 134 |
| 8.1 | Sales Taxes in Federal Countries | 148 |
| 8.2 | Sales Taxes in Canada, 2006 | 151 |
| 8.3 | Features of Alternative 'Federal' VAT Models | 153 |

vii



| viii | Tables | |
|------|--|-----|
| 8.4 | Comparison of Some Federal Sales Tax Regimes | 158 |
| 9.1 | Jamaica: Markups Reported on GCT Returns, 2002 | 171 |
| 12.1 | Good and Bad Prospects for VAT Success: A Subjective Appraisal | 218 |
| A.1 | VAT – When, Where, and at What Rates | 223 |
| A.2 | VAT – Some Indicators | 228 |



Preface

The value-added tax (VAT) has been around for more than 50 years. A large literature dealing with various aspects of this most important fiscal innovation of the last half-century exists. One aim of this book is to review this literature and suggest some avenues for further research that should prove rewarding and yet more questions that need further examination. A more important aim is to review the extensive practical experience with VAT around the world in recent decades and suggest some ways to improve its design and implementation in developing and transitional countries.

A first version of some of this material was prepared for a project on Fiscal Reform in Support of Trade Liberalization supported by USAID. We are grateful for numerous comments received from participants in several workshops held at USAID and the World Bank during the course of this project. In addition, we are grateful to the many colleagues in governments around the world and in the International Monetary Fund, the World Bank, and the Inter-American Development Bank who have, over the years, contributed so much to our knowledge of VAT both in theory and especially in practice. Duanjie Chen, Sijbren Cnossen, Glenn Jenkins, Michael Keen, David Sewell, Carlos Silvani, Emil Sunley, and several anonymous reviewers were also most helpful in providing comments and materials that have helped us in writing this book. We are especially grateful for a very close reading of an earlier draft by Michael Keen that has, we hope, saved us from some pitfalls as well as for the helpful editorial efforts of Scott Parris, Janis Bolster, and Susan Thornton. Most of all, we are grateful for the forbearance and patience of our families in putting up with us, not just during the writing of this book but in general.