

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87486-1 - Aristotle on Homonymy: Dialectic and Science

Julie K. Ward

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Aristotle on Homonymy: Dialectic and Science

In this book, Julie K. Ward examines Aristotle's thought regarding how language informs our views of what is real. First she places Aristotle's theory in its historical and philosophical contexts in relation to Plato and Speusippus. Ward then explores Aristotle's theory of language as it is employed in several works, including *Ethics*, *Topics*, *Physics*, and *Metaphysics*, so as to consider its relation to dialectical practice and scientific explanation as Aristotle conceived it.

Julie K. Ward is associate professor of philosophy at Loyola University, Chicago. The editor of *Feminism and Ancient Philosophy* and co-editor of *Philosophers on Race: Critical Essays*, she has also contributed to *Ancient Philosophy*, *Polis*, and *Hypatia*.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87486-1 - Aristotle on Homonymy: Dialectic and Science

Julie K. Ward

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87486-1 - Aristotle on Homonymy: Dialectic and Science

Julie K. Ward

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# Aristotle on Homonymy

*Dialectic and Science*

JULIE K. WARD

*Loyola University, Chicago*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87486-1 - Aristotle on Homonymy: Dialectic and Science

Julie K. Ward

Frontmatter

[More information](#)CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521874861](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521874861)

© Julie K. Ward 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library**Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Ward, Julie K.

Aristotle on homonymy : dialectic and science / Julie K. Ward.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and indexes.

ISBN 978-0-521-87486-1 (hardback)

1. Aristotle – Language. 2. Homonyms. I. Title.

B491.L3W37 2007

121'.68092-dc22 2006103393

ISBN 978-0-521-87486-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-12847-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	page vii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	ix
Introduction	1
1 The Theory of Homonymy in <i>Categories</i> 1 and Its Precursors	9
1.0 Overview	9
1.1 Homonymy in <i>Categories</i> 1	12
1.2 The Speusippean Account of Homonymy	18
1.3 The Platonic Antecedents of Aristotelian Homonymy	26
1.4 Platonic Eponymy and Participation	27
1.5 Platonic Participation, Eponymy, and Homonymy	31
1.6 Aristotle and Plato on Homonymy	36
1.7 Platonic Influence on Aristotelian Homonymy	40
2 Homonymy in the <i>Topics</i>	43
2.0 <i>The Aims of Dialectic</i>	43
2.1 <i>The Nature of Dialectic in Topics</i>	48
2.2 <i>Homonymy and Testing for Non-Synonymy</i>	56
2.3 <i>Homonymy and Argument in Topics Alpha 15</i>	64
2.4 <i>The Philosophical Uses of Homonymy in Topics</i>	70
2.5 <i>Conclusions</i>	75
3 Systematic Homonymy	77
3.0 <i>Overview of Core-Related Homonymy</i>	77
3.1 <i>Aristotle's Causal Account of Related Homonymy</i>	79
3.2 <i>The Causal Analyses of the Healthy and the Medical</i>	86
3.3 <i>Core-Dependent Homōnymia: The Healthy</i>	87
3.4 <i>Core-Dependent Homōnymia: The Medical</i>	91
3.5 <i>The Significance of Core-Dependent Homōnymia</i>	94
3.6 <i>The Results of Causal Analyses</i>	98

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87486-1 - Aristotle on Homonymy: Dialectic and Science

Julie K. Ward

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

## Contents

4	The Homonymy of <i>Being</i>	103
	4.0 Introduction	103
	4.1 The Homonymy of <i>Being</i> : Preliminary Problems	104
	4.2 The Categorical Argument for Homonymy of <i>Being</i>	111
	4.3 The Categorical Account: <i>Metaphysics Zeta 1 and Gamma 2</i>	112
	4.4 Assessing the Non-Univocity of <i>Being</i>	121
	4.5 The Causal Analysis of Core-Dependence	128
	4.6 The Significance of the Homonymy of <i>Being</i>	134
5	Physis, <i>Philia</i> , and Homonymy	137
	5.0 Introduction	137
	5.1 Physis in <i>Physis</i> and <i>Metaphysics</i>	138
	5.2 The Core-Dependence of Physis	143
	5.3 The Case of Physis: Priority in Logos and Causal Relation	144
	5.4 Conclusions about Physis	146
	5.5 <i>Philia</i> and Homonymy	149
	5.6 <i>Philia</i> and Core-Dependence in Eudemian Ethics <i>Eta 2</i>	151
	5.7 Priority in Logos: The Good	156
	5.8 <i>Philia</i> and Core-Dependence	160
6	Homonymy and Science	168
	6.0 Introduction: Demonstration and Science	168
	6.1 Homonymy and the Science of <i>Being qua Being</i>	171
	6.2 Homonymy: Definition and Scientific Inquiry	177
	6.3 Procedures of Framing Definitions: Posterior Analytics <i>Beta 13–14</i>	187
	6.4 Conclusion: The Results of Homonymy for Science	196
	<i>Afterword</i>	201
	<i>Bibliography</i>	207
	<i>Index of Passages</i>	215
	<i>General Index</i>	219

## Acknowledgments

The present book had its origin in many puzzles I encountered about *pros hen* predication. The initial stimulus to pursue the subject area arose from an observation by Alan Code many years ago to the effect that Aristotle does not make precisely the same statements about *pros hen* and substance in *Metaphysics Zeta* as in *Gamma*. At the time, the full complexity of Aristotle's views on *pros hen* and systematic homonymy in general were unknown to me, and I began to investigate the topic. Some time later, while I was working on Aristotle's use of *pros hen*, Susan Levin suggested that we consider whether there were similarities between *pros hen* relatedness and Platonic eponymy. Although initially the differences between the two theories seemed considerable, eventually certain points of similarity became more evident to me. I would like to thank Susan for making the initial suggestion as well as for giving me an opportunity to share her thoughts and work on the related topic.

Some of my early research on *pros hen* was published in articles in 1995 and 1996, and I thank the editors of *Ancient Philosophy* and *Apeiron* for permission to use some of my work from these articles. Other related research, specifically about the systematic nature of Aristotle's concept of *physis*, was more recently published in *Polis* (2005), and I wish to thank the editor for permission to use part of this material as well.

An academic leave from Loyola University in 2001–2 enabled me to unify the early research I had done on *pros hen* with the more recent scholarly work on homonymy including Christopher Shields' 1999 book on the topic. Most recently, Loyola University granted me funding for graduate assistance in the final stages of manuscript preparation. I would like to thank some graduate students who assisted in readying the manuscript, specifically, Marjolein Oele, Jean Tan, and Kirk Shellko, as well as some past members of graduate seminars concerned with *pros hen*, especially Colin Anderson, Laura Hengehold, Ryan Madison, Marjolein Oele, and Steve Werlin. The manuscript

benefited from the critical comments provided by anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press and the steady guidance throughout by editor Beatrice Rehl.

Finally, I would like to express my appreciation to Ezio Vailati for his advice and Elizabeth Ward for her support; both, perhaps, have learned more about homonymy and synonymy than they cared to know.



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87486-1 - Aristotle on Homonymy: Dialectic and Science

Julie K. Ward

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## List of Abbreviations

## Works of Aristotle

<i>An. Po.</i>	<i>Posterior Analytics</i>
<i>An. Pr.</i>	<i>Prior Analytics</i>
<i>Cat.</i>	<i>Categories</i>
<i>DA</i>	<i>De Anima</i>
<i>De Int.</i>	<i>De Interpretatione</i>
<i>De Part. An.</i>	<i>Parts of Animals</i>
<i>EE</i>	<i>Eudemian Ethics</i>
<i>EN</i>	<i>Nicomachean Ethics</i>
<i>GA</i>	<i>Generation of Animals</i>
<i>Gen. Corr.</i>	<i>De Generatione et Corruptione</i>
<i>HA</i>	<i>History of Animals</i>
<i>Meta.</i>	<i>Metaphysics</i>
<i>Meteor.</i>	<i>Meteorologica</i>
<i>PA</i>	<i>Parts of Animals</i>
<i>Phys.</i>	<i>Physics</i>
<i>PN</i>	<i>Parva Naturalia</i>
<i>Poet.</i>	<i>Poetics</i>
<i>Rhet.</i>	<i>Rhetoric</i>
<i>Soph. El.</i>	<i>Sophistici Elenchi</i>
<i>Top.</i>	<i>Topics</i>

## Works of Plato

<i>Par.</i>	<i>Parmenides</i>
<i>Phd.</i>	<i>Phaedo</i>
<i>Rep.</i>	<i>Republic</i>
<i>Soph.</i>	<i>Sophist</i>
<i>Sym.</i>	<i>Symposium</i>
<i>Tim.</i>	<i>Timaeus</i>

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-87486-1 - Aristotle on Homonymy: Dialectic and Science

Julie K. Ward

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

## Abbreviations

## Works by Other Authors

<i>De Nom. An.</i>	Cajetan, <i>De Nomine Analogia</i>
<i>In Ar. Cat.</i>	Simplicius, Commentary on Aristotle, <i>Categories</i>
<i>In Aris. Meta.</i>	Alexander of Aphrodisias, Commentary on Aristotle, <i>Metaphysics</i>
<i>In Aris. Top.</i>	Alexander of Aphrodisias, Commentary on Aristotle, <i>Topics</i>
<i>Sum. Theol.</i>	Aquinas, <i>Summa Theologica</i>
<i>Sentent.</i>	Aquinas, <i>Sententiarum Libri Quattuor</i>
<i>S.T.</i>	Cajetan, Commentary on Aquinas, <i>Summa Theologica</i>