

MAKING TREATIES WORK

There is an increasing focus on the need for national implementation of treaties. International law has traditionally left enforcement to the individual parties, but more and more treaties contain arrangements to induce States to comply with their commitments. This book examines three forms of such mechanisms: dispute settlement procedures in the form of international courts, non-compliance procedures of an administrative character, and enforcement of obligation by coercive means. Three fields are examined, namely, human rights, international environmental law, and arms control and disarmament. These areas are in the forefront of the development of current international law and deal with multilateral, rather than purely bilateral issues. The three sections of the book on human rights, international environmental law and arms control contain a general introduction and three or four case studies of the most relevant treaties in the field. The book finishes with three concluding articles.

GEIR ULFSTEIN is Professor of Law and Director of the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights, University of Oslo.

THILO MARAUHN is Professor of Public Law, International Law and European Law at the Justus-Liebig-Universität Gießen, and a Research Fellow at the University of Luzern.

ANDREAS ZIMMERMANN is Professor of Law and Director of the Walter-Schücking-Institute for International Law, University of Kiel.



MAKING TREATIES WORK

Human Rights, Environment and Arms Control

Edited by
GEIR ULFSTEIN

in collaboration with
THILO MARAUHN and
ANDREAS ZIMMERMANN





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521873178

© Cambridge University Press 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-87317-8 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

Preface	and acknowledgments	page xi
Notes o	xiii	
Table o	fcases	xvi
Table o	f treaties and other international instruments	xix
INTROD	UCTION	
Introd	uction	3
GEIR	ULFSTEIN, THILO MARAUHN AND	
ANDR	EAS ZIMMERMANN	
	The significance of treaties	3
	Compliance with treaty obligations	4
	General international law	5
	Treaty mechanisms	6
	Dispute settlement procedures	7
	Non-compliance procedures	9
	Enforcement	11
	The structure of the book	12
PART I	INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS	
1 Disput	e resolution, compliance control and	
enforce	ement in human rights law	15
ANDREAS ZIMMERMANN		
1.1	General questions and introduction	15
1.2	Dispute resolution	16
1.3	Compliance control	22
	Enforcement	38
1.5	Overall evaluation	47

v



vi CONTENTS

2 The Ir	ternational Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	48
MART	IN SCHEININ	
2.1	General issues	48
2.2	Dispute resolution	53
2.3	Compliance control	57
2.4	Enforcement	64
2.5	Overall evaluation	66
3 The E	uropean Convention on Human Rights	70
MARK	E. VILLIGER	
3.1	Introduction	70
3.2	The Court and its procedures	74
3.3	The Court's judgments	80
3.4	Overall evaluation	87
4 The E	uropean Convention on the Prevention of Torture	
compa	ared with the United Nations Convention Against	
Tortu	re and its Optional Protocol	91
RENA	TE KICKER	
4.1	General issues	91
4.2		101
4.3	Dispute resolution	103
4.4	Compliance control	104
4.5	Enforcement	107
4.6	Overall evaluation	109
PART II	INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW	
5 Dispu	te resolution, compliance control and	
enfor	ement in international environmental law	115
GEIR	ULFSTEIN	
5.1	Introduction	115
5.2	Dispute settlement procedures	118
5.3	Compliance control	124
5.4	Enforcement	128
5.5	Overall evaluation	131



		CONTENTS	vii
6	6 The Convention on International Trade in Endangered		
	Species	of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES)	134
	ROSAL	IND REEVE	
	6.1	Introduction	134
	6.2	Compliance control	136
	6.3	Enforcement	148
	6.4	Effectiveness of the compliance and	
		enforcement mechanisms	152
	6.5	Dispute resolution	157
	6.6	Lessons learned	158
7	The Co	nvention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution	161
	TUOMA	AS KUOKKANEN	
	7.1	General	161
	7.2	Dispute resolution	165
	7.3	Compliance control	166
	7.4	Enforcement	172
	7.5	Overall evaluation	173
		Annex: Structure and Functions of the	
		Implementation Committee and Procedures	
		for Review of Compliance	175
8	The Co	nvention on Access to Information, Public	
	Particip	oation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice	
	in Envi	ronmental Matters (Aarhus Convention)	179
	VEIT K	OESTER	
	8.1	Introduction	179
	8.2	Summary contents of the Aarhus Convention	
		and the nature of the Convention	182
	8.3	Dispute resolution	183
	8.4	Rules of the Convention and MoP decisions on	
		reporting and compliance control	189
	8.5	Bodies responsible for monitoring compliance	192
	8.6	Procedures of the Compliance Committee	197
	8.7	Determination of non-compliance and decision	
		on non-compliance response measures	203
	8.8 The relationship between settlement of disputes		
		and review of compliance	213



viii	CONTENTS	
8.9	Do the compliance and the dispute settlement	
	mechanisms constitute a self-contained regime?	214
8.10	Overall evaluation	215
9 The Co	nvention on Environmental Impact Assessment	
	nsboundary Context (Espoo Convention)	218
TIMO	KOIVUROVA	
9.1	Dispute resolution	220
9.2	Compliance control	226
9.3	Overall evaluation	235
PART III	INTERNATIONAL ARMS CONTROL	
_	e resolution, compliance control and	
enforce	ment of international arms control law	243
THILO	MARAUHN	
10.1	Introduction	243
10.2	Consolidation rather than crisis?	247
10.3	Negative and positive incentives to comply with	
	arms control agreements	250
10.4	Dispute settlement in arms control agreements	255
10.5	Compliance control in arms control agreements:	
	verification and inspections	257
10.6	Enforcement	266
10.7	Perspectives	271
	nvention on the Prohibition of the Development,	
	tion, Stockpiling and Use of Chemical Weapons and	
on their	r Destruction (Chemical Weapons Convention)	273
LISA T	ABASSI	
11.1		273
	Dispute resolution	274
	Compliance control	279
11.4	Enforcement	290
11.5	Overall evaluation	298
11.6	Conclusion	300



		CONTENTS	ix
12		aty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (NPT)	
		IAEA Safeguards Agreements	301
		ROCKWOOD	
	12.1	The IAEA's safeguards system	302
	12.2	The Treaty on the Non-Proliferation	
		of Nuclear Weapons	304
	12.3	Comprehensive NPT Safeguards Agreements	306
		Verification	308
		Dispute resolution	312
		Compliance	314
		Enforcement	319
	12.8	Overall evaluation	321
13	The Cor	nvention on the Prohibition of the Use, Stockpiling,	
	Produc	tion and Transfer of Anti-Personnel Mines and on their	
	Destruc	ction (Ottawa Convention)	324
	KATHLEEN LAWAND		
	13.1	Negotiating history of the Ottawa Convention	325
	13.2	Key obligations, achievements and challenges	327
	13.3	Compliance control, dispute resolution and enforcement	
		mechanisms managed by the States parties	329
	13.4	The involvement of non-State actors in	
		compliance control	341
	13.5	Conclusions: assessing the strengths and	
		weaknesses of the Ottawa Convention's	
		compliance control regime	343
GE	ENERAL	COMMENTS	
14	Disnute	resolution	351
	-	AS L. PAULUS	221
	14.1		351
		International human rights	356
		Environment	362
		Arms control	365
		Conclusion	368



X		CONTENTS	
15	Compli	ance control	373
	JUTTA	BRUNNÉE	
	15.1	Reporting	374
	15.2	Monitoring and assessment of compliance	376
	15.3	Compliance bodies	380
	15.4	Outcomes	388
	15.5	Conclusion	390
16	16 Enforcement		391
CHRISTIAN J. TAMS			
	16.1	Terminology and basic distinctions	319
	16.2	Enforcement in the different treaty systems	396
	16.3	The role of State responsibility	407
Inc	lex		411



PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book is the outcome of a joint research project undertaken by the editors. The underlying theme was to analyze how various regulatory regimes can facilitate the implementation of relevant treaty obligations undertaken by States parties. The editors had decided to invite specialists working in three fields of international law, namely, human rights, international environmental law and arms control, in order to provide analyses of arrangements for dispute settlement, compliance control and enforcement. These contributions were supplemented by introductions from the editors and concluding chapters by well-known academics.

Thilo Marauhn and Geir Ulfstein applied for financing from the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (German Research Foundation) and the Norwegian Research Council, respectively, and the editors are grateful to both these institutions for the support they provided which made this endeavour a reality. Drafts of the respective reports were presented and discussed at a workshop held at the Walther-Schücking-Institute for International Law, University of Kiel, from 20 to 23 January 2005, which Andreas Zimmermann had undertaken to organize. Geir Ulfstein secured the contact with the authors and the publisher with a view to finalizing the book.

The editors would like to thank particularly all the contributors for their dedication, for allocating their precious time to this project, and for the open discussions during the workshop. We would like to give our special appreciation to Sarah Isabelle Reich, Justus Liebig University, Gießen, for her support in preparing the application to the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft, to the staff of the Walther-Schücking-Institute, in particular Carmen Thies, for having organized the workshop in such a professional manner, and, finally, the scientific assistants, Janne Kaasin, Karin Kaasen and Andreas M. Kravik, for their great efforts and skills in making the manuscript ready for publication.



xii

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Finally, thanks go to Cambridge University Press and its staff, first and foremost Finola O'Sullivan who ever since we first approached her has been an effective decision-maker.



NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

Jutta Brunnée is Professor of Law and Metcalf Chair in Environmental Law, University of Toronto.

Renate Kicker is Associate Professor at the Institute of International Law and International Relations, University of Graz, Austria; a Member of the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) since September 1997; and Director of the European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy (ETC).

Veit Koester was a civil servant with the Danish Ministry of Environment until 2002. He is External Professor at Roskilde University Centre, Denmark, and Visiting Professor at United Nations University's Institute of Advanced Studies, Yokohama, Japan and a guest lecturer at Copenhagen University, Faculty of Law. He is chairman of the Compliance Committee of the Aarhus Convention and chairman of the Compliance Committee of the Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety. He is a member of the Steering Committee for the IUCN (the World Conservation Union) Commission on Environmental Law and a member of the Conseil Europeen du Droit de l'Environnement (CEDE).

Timo Koivurova is Research Professor of Arctic Environment and Minority Law, and Director of the Northern Institute for Environmental and Minority Law (NIEM/Arctic Centre).

Tuomas Kuokkanen is Counsellor, Ministry of Environment of Finland; was a member of the Implementation Committee under the Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution from 1999 to 2005; and is a



xiv

NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

part-time Professor of International Environmental Law at the University of Joensuu.

Kathleen Lawand is Legal Adviser, Mines-Arms Unit, International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC).

Thilo Marauhn is Professor of Public Law, International Law and European Law at the Justus-Liebig-Universität Gießen, and Research Fellow at the University of Luzern.

Andreas Paulus is Lecturer, Institute for International Law, Ludwig-Maximilians-University München, Germany.

Rosalind Reeve is Associate Fellow of the Sustainable Development Programme, Chatham House, UK, and adviser to the David Shepherd Wildlife Foundation and the International Fund for Animal Welfare.

Laura Rockwood is Principal Legal Officer, Section Head for Non-Proliferation and Policy Making, Office of Legal Affairs, International Atomic Energy Agency.

Martin Scheinin is Professor of Constitutional and International Law and Director of the Institute for Human Rights at Åbo Akademi University, Turku, Finland. He was a member of the Human Rights Committee from 1997 to 2004.

Lisa Tabassi is Legal Officer, Technical Secretariat of the Organisation for the Prohibition of Chemical Weapons (OPCW).

Christian J. Tams is Lecturer, Walther-Schücking-Institute for International Law, University of Kiel, Germany.

Geir Ulfstein is Professor of Law and Director of the Norwegian Centre for Human Rights, University of Oslo. He is Deputy Director of the Board, Norwegian Branch of the International Law Association. He is also a member of the International Law Association's Committee on Human Rights Law and Practice, and a member of the IUCN (the World Conservation Union) Commission on Environmental Law.



NOTES ON THE CONTRIBUTORS

ΧV

Mark Villiger is a Judge of the European Court of Human Rights, and is Titularprofessor of International and European Law at the University of Zurich.

Andreas Zimmermann is Professor of Law and Director of the Walter-Schücking-Institute for International Law, University of Kiel. From 1999 to 2001 he was a member of the expert commission for the drafting of a Code of Offences Against International Law at the German Ministry of Justice. In 1997/8 he was a member of and legal adviser to the German delegation at the Preparatory Committee for, and at the United Nations Diplomatic Conference of Plenipotentiaries on, the Establishment of an International Criminal Court.



TABLE OF CASES

Permanent Court of International Justice

Mavrommatis Palestine Concessions Case (Greece v. United Kingdom), 1924 255, 352

International Court of Justice

Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (Bosnia and Herzegovina v. Yugoslavia), 1996 18

Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide (Croatia v. Yugoslavia), 2002 18

Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Rwanda), 2002 $\,$ 18

Avena and Other Mexican Nationals (Mexico v. United States), 2004 354, 357, 359 Barcelona Traction, Light and Power Company Ltd (Belgium v. Spain), 1970 39, 354, 364

Case Concerning Armed Activities on the Territory of the Congo (Democratic Republic of the Congo v. Uganda), 2005 43

Certain Property (Liechtenstein v. Germany), 2005 352, 353, 355

East Timor (Portugal v. Australia), 1995, 90 352, 354, 364

Fisheries Jurisdiction Case (Spain v. Canada) 1998 371

Gabcikovo-Nagymaros Dam case (Hungary v. Slovakia), 1997 119, 362, 363

LaGrand (Germany v. US), 2001 354, 357

Land and Maritime Boundary between Cameroon and Nigeria (Cameroon v. Nigeria), 1998 352

Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, Advisory Opinion, 2004 42, 54, 353, 354, 360

Legality of the Threat or Use of Nuclear Weapons, Advisory Opinion, 1996 54, 252, 355, 360, 363, 367, 368

Questions of Interpretation and Application of the 1971 Montreal Convention arising from the Aerial Incident at Lockerbie (Libya v. UK), 1998 352, 372

South West Africa Cases, 1962 255

Vienna Convention on Consular Relations (Paraguay v. US), 1998 371



TABLE OF CASES

xvii

Arbitration

Behring Sea Fur Seals Arbitration, Moore's *International Arbitration Awards* 755, 1898

Lake Lanoux case, 24 ILM 101, 1957 119

MOX Case: Dispute Concerning Access to Information under Article 9 of the Ospar Convention (Ireland v. United Kingdom), Permanent Court of Arbitration, 2003 120, 384

Southern Bluefin Tuna Arbitration, 39 ILM 1359, 2000 119

Trail Smelter (US v. Canada), 3 UNRIAA 1905 (1941); (1939) 33 AJIL 182 119, 362

WTO Dispute Settlement Body

- EC Asbestos: European Communities Measures Affecting Asbestos-Containing Products, 2001, WT/DS135/AB/R 361, 370
- EC Bananas: Report of the Appellate Body on the European Community Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas, 1997, WT/DS27/AB/R 354
- US Shrimps: United States Importation of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products, 1998, WT/DS58/AB/R 361
- US Steel: United States Imposition of Countervailing Duties on Certain Hot-Rolled Lead and Bismuth Carbon Steel Products Originating in the United Kingdom, 2000, WT/DS/138/AB/R 361

International Labour Organization Administrative Tribunal

 Judgment 2032 (2001)
 278

 Judgment 2232 (2003)
 279

 Judgment 2256 (2003)
 278

 Judgment 2327 (2004)
 279

 Judgment 2328 (2004)
 279

UN Human Rights CommitteeReports

A v. Australia, 1993 64

Apirana Mahuika et al. v. New Zealand, 1984 61

Bernard Ominayak, Chief of the Lubicon Lake Band v. Canada, 1984 49, 60, 61

Dante Piandiong et al. v. Philippines, 1999 63

A Publication and a Printing Company v. Trinidad and Tobago, 1989 60

European Commission on Human Rights

Austria v. Italy, 1961 18

Denmark, Norway, Sweden and the Netherlands v. Greece, 1968 22



xviii

TABLE OF CASES

European Court of Human Rights

Akkoc v. Turkey, 1993 Amuur v. France, 1996 104 Austria v. Italy, Application, 1960 Belilos v. Switzerland, 1988 80 Broniowski v. Poland, Application, 1996 83 Brumarescu v. Romania, Application, 1995 83 Corigliano v. Italy, 1982 81 Cyprus v. Turkey, 2001 22, 79 Denmark, Norway, Sweden and the Netherlands v. Greece, 1967 79 France, Norway, Denmark and Sweden v. Turkey, 1982 Gençel v. Turkey, Application, 1999 83 Ilascu v. Moldova and Russia, Application, 1999 82 Ireland v. United Kingdom, 1978 22, 79 Kalashnikov v. Russia, 2002 106 Le Compte, Van Leuven and de Meyere v. Belgium, 1982 82 Lorsé v. Netherlands, 2001 106 Mamatkulov v. Abdurasulovic v. Turkey, Applications, 1999 72 Moreira de Azevedo v. Portugal, 1991 81 Tyrer v. United Kingdom, 1978 88 Van der Ven v. Netherlands, 2003 106

Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Advisory Opinion, 1999 359 Barrios Altos Case, 2003 27

X etc. v. Netherlands, 1984 73

Netherlands

LJN: AU8685, Rechtbank 's-Gravenhage, 09/751003-04 298

United Kingdom Privy Council

Tangiora v. Wellington District Legal Services Committee (2000) 4 LRC 44 45



TABLE OF TREATIES AND OTHER INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

General Instruments

```
1945 UN Charter
  art. 2(3) 353
  art. 2(4) 267
  art. 33 7, 255, 353
  art. 39 269, 270, 304, 406
  art. 41 270
  art. 42 270
  art. 48 304
  art. 53 392
  art. 96 354
  Chapter VII 251, 266, 295-6, 297, 304
1945 ICJ Statute
  art. 36(1) 17
  art. 36(2) 17
  art. 63(2) 123
1963 Vienna Convention on Consular Relations, 596 UNTS 291 4, 371
  art. 36 357
1969 Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties, 1155 UNTS 331 46
  art. 3 207
  art. 28 76
  art. 31 44
  art. 31(3)(a) 233
  art. 60 5, 129, 212, 214, 393
  art. 60(1)(a)(i) 85
  art. 60(2)(c) 122, 269, 409
  art. 60(5) 212, 214
```

xix



```
XX
       TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS
1998 Statute of the International Criminal Court (Rome Statute), 2187 UNTS 3 298,
     358
  art. 12 359
  art. 13 359
2001 Articles on State Responsibility 5
  art. 33(2) 39
  art. 41 42
  art. 42 6, 42, 122, 409
  art. 42(11) 364
  art. 42(b)(ii) 409
  art. 48 6, 42, 409
  art. 48(1) 408
  art. 48(7) 364, 365, 409
  art. 49 6, 42, 43
  art. 54 6, 42, 43, 408
                         General regional instruments
1948 Charter of the Organization of American States, 119 UNTS 3
  art. 9 46
1948 Statute of the Council of Europe
  art. 3 23, 24, 85
  art. 4 23
  art. 7 31, 85
  art. 8 31, 46, 85, 109
  art. 23(a) 31
1972 European Convention on State Immunity, ETS No. 074A
  Additional Protocol 1972 89
     art. 1 89
     art. 2 89
     art. 4 89
2000 Constitutive Act of the African Union, OAU Doc. CAB/LEG/23.15
  art. 30 46
2000 Cotonou Agreement [2000] OJ L317/3 403
  art. 9 402
  art. 96(2) 402
```



TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS XXI

Human rights

```
1948 Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide, 78 UNTS 177 art. IX \, 17
```

1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, UN Doc. A/810 (1948) 71 15, 48, 88 art. 3 97

1950 European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, ETS No. 5 15, 70–90, 384

```
art. 3 77, 93, 105, 110, 396
art. 6(1) 83
art. 8 77
art. 10 77
```

art. 11 77 art. 15 45 art. 19 74

art. 21 74 art. 22 74

art. 23 75 art. 24 37

art. 25 75 art. 26 76

art. 28 75, 76

art. 29 75

art. 30 72, 75

art. 33 79, 407 art. 34 76, 78, 79

art. 35 77

art. 35(2)(b) 17, 76

art. 35(3) 76, 77

art. 36(3) 87

art. 37(1)(a) 75

art. 38(1)(b) 78

art. 39 78

art. 40 78

art. 41 81, 82, 83

art. 45 78

art. 46 80

art. 46(1) 33, 71, 80

art. 46(2) 33, 71, 84, 85, 400

art. 46(3) 86



```
xxii
       TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS
  art. 46(4) 87
  art. 52 26
  art. 54 33
  art. 55 41
  art. 59(2) 74
  Protocol 1, art. 1 83
  Protocol 11 17, 70, 80
  Protocol 12 70-1
  Protocol 14 34, 72, 74, 76, 77, 80, 86–7
     art. 8(2) 34
1960 Unesco Convention Against Discrimination, 429 UNTS 93
  art. 17
1966 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD),
     660 UNTS 195
  art. 9 25
  art. 11 20
  Optional Protocol 68
1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 999 UNTS 171
     15, 48-69, 89, 375, 376, 377, 380, 381, 382, 384
  art. 1 48, 49
  art. 2 50, 65
  art. 2(3) 51
  art. 3 50
  art. 4 45
  art. 6 48, 49
  art. 7 49, 97, 396
  art. 8 49
  art. 9 49, 64
  art. 10 48-9
  art. 11 49
  art. 12
          49
  art. 13
          49
  art. 14
          49
  art. 15
          49
  art. 16
          49
  art. 17
          49
  art. 18
          49
  art. 19
          49
  art. 20
          49
```



TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS XXIII

```
art. 21 49
  art. 22
          48
  art. 23 49
  art. 24
          49
  art. 25 48
  art. 26 48
  art. 27 48, 50
  art. 28 19, 50, 52, 64, 126
  art. 29 126
  art. 30(4) 52
  art. 31 19
  art. 39(2) 53, 64
  art. 40 25, 50, 52, 53, 64, 65
  art. 40(1) 51, 57
  art. 40(2) 51, 57
  art. 40(4) 53
  art. 41 17, 20, 50, 51, 54, 55, 56, 407
  art. 41(1) 19, 20
  art. 42 50, 51, 54, 55, 56
  art. 42(6)(c) 52
  art. 44 18, 54
  Protocol 1 on Individual Complaints 49, 50, 52, 63-4, 68
     art. 4 19
     art. 4(2) 62
     art. 5(1) 56, 62
     art. 5(3) 62
     art. 5(4) 20, 52, 63
     art. 5(a) 199
1966 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), 993
     UNTS 3 15, 47, 48
  art. 16 25
1969 American Convention on Human Rights, 1144 UNTS 123 89
  art. 26 28
  art. 27 45
  arts. 34–40
              19
  art. 34 19
  art. 35 19
  art. 41(f) 36
  art. 42 28
  art. 43 28
```



```
xxiv
      TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS
  art. 45 17, 37
  art. 48 19
  art. 49 20
  art. 50 20, 36
  art. 51 20
  art. 52 19
  art. 62 17
  art. 63 20
1973 International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of
     Apartheid
  art. VI 25
1979 Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
     (CEDAW), 1249 UNTS 13 15, 357, 375, 377, 380, 382, 384, 387
  art. 18 25
  art. 29 357
  Optional Protocol 47, 68, 357
     art. 8 29
1979 Statute of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
  art. 20(b) 36
  art. 44(1) 36
1981 African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 1520 UNTS 217 89
  art. 30 19
  art. 31 19
  art. 45 17
  art. 47 19, 37
  art. 49 37
  art. 51(2) 19
  art. 52 20
  art. 53 20, 35
  art. 58 35
  Protocol
     art. 3 17
     art. 11 19
     art. 26(2) 19
     art. 27 20
     art. 29(2) 35
     art. 31 35
```



TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS XXV

```
1984 Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment
     or Punishment (UN CAT), 1465 UNTS 85 15, 384, 387, 396
  art. 1 97
  art. 3 100
  art. 17 19
  art. 19 25, 98
  art. 20 29, 99
  art. 21 20, 98
  art. 21(1)(a) 19
  art. 21(1)(h) 20
  art. 22 17, 98
  art. 22(4) 98
  art. 24 100
  art. 28 29
  Optional Protocol 2002 99, 110-11, 379
1987 European Convention for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or
     Degrading Treatment or Punishment (ECPT), ETS No. 126 27, 91-111, 374,
     379, 396
  Preamble 104-5
  Preamble 89
  art. 3 94, 101
  art. 8(5) 93, 107
  art. 9 105
  art. 10 93
  art. 10(2) 94, 107
  art. 11(2) 28, 94
  art. 14(3) 103
  Protocol 1 91
1987 European Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine, ETS No. 164
  art. 29 89
1989 Convention on the Rights of the Child, 577 UNTS 3 15
  art. 44 25
1990 United Nations Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant
     Workers and Members of their Families, 2220 UNTS 3
  art. 23 38
1992 European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, ETS No. 148
```

art. 17 24-5, 27



```
TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS
1995 Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, ETS No. 157
  art. 26 27
1996 European Social Charter (Revised), ETS No. 163 25
  art. 25 31
  art. 29 27
  Protocol on Collective Complaints 1995, ETS No. 34
     art. 1(b) 21
                          Environmental protection
1971 Convention on Wetlands of International Importance Especially as Waterfowl
     Habitat, Ramsar, 2 February 1971, 996 UNTS 243 158
1973 Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (CITES), 993 UNTS
     243 117, 134–60, 363, 374, 376, 378, 382, 383, 384, 385, 387, 389, 392, 398
  art. II 135
  art. III 135
  art. VIII 136
  art. VIII(1) 144
  art. VIII(6) 137
  art. VIII(7) 137, 145
  art. IX(1) 144
  art. XI 136
  art. XII 136, 138, 139-40
  art. XIII 136, 143
  art. XV 142
```

```
1974 Nordic Environment Protection, 13 ILM 352 (1974) art. 12 223, 236
```

- 1979 Convention on the Conservation of European Wildlife and Natural Habitats, ETS No. 104 195, 397
- 1979 ECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution (LRTAP), 18 ILM 1442 (1979) 117, 161–78, 186, 213, 374, 376, 378, 381, 383, 385, 388

art. XVI 142

art. XXIII 142 Appendix I 135

art. XVIII 119, 157, 158

Appendix II 135, 145, 149 Appendix III 135



TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS XXVII

```
art. 10(1) 162
  art. 13 119, 165, 235-6
  Annex V
     $6 127
  Protocol on Co-operation (EMEP) 1984 163
     art. 7 165
  Protocol on Sulphur 1985 163, 172
     art. 8 165
  Protocol on Nitrogen Oxide Emissions 1988 163, 166, 167, 169, 172
     art. 12 165
  Protocol on Volatile Organic Compounds 1991 163, 168, 169, 170, 172
     art. 3(3) 164
  Protocol on Sulphur 1994 125, 163, 168, 172
     art. 7 164
     art. 9 165
     art. 9(5) 165
  Protocol on Persistent Organic Pollutants 1998 163
     art. 11 164
     art. 12 165
  Protocol on Heavy Metals 1998 (Aarhus Protocol) 163
     art. 8 164
     art. 11 165
     art. 12 362
  Protocol to Abate Acidification etc. 1999 (Gothenburg Protocol) 163
     art. 9 164
     art. 11 119
     art. 11(5) 119, 165
1980 Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals (Bonn
     Convention), 19 ILM 15 (1980)
1985 Vienna Convention for the Protection of the Ozone Layer, 1513 UNTS 293 184,
     186, 235
  art. 11 364
1987 Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer, 26 ILM 1550
     (1987) 117-18, 184, 211, 213, 364, 383, 385
  art. 8 125
1989 Basel Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movement of
     Hazardous Wastes and their Disposal 1989, 28 ILM 657 (1989) 121, 159, 184,
     186, 213
```



XXVIII TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

```
1991 Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context
     (Espoo Convention), 90 ILM 802 (1991) 117, 186, 213, 218–39, 378, 384, 385,
     387
  art. 2 219
  art. 3 219
  art. 3(1) 223
  art. 3(7) 120, 199, 223
  art. 4 219
  art. 6 219
  art. 6(1) 222
  art. 7 219
  art. 11(2) 227
  art. 14(6) 230
  art. 14(7) 227
  art. 14bis 228
  art. 15 221, 362
  art. 15(2) 119, 222
  Annex IV 120
  Annex VII § 15 123
  Appendix I 223, 224
  Appendix IV 199, 223, 224
     § 1 225
     § 2 224
     § 3 224, 225, 226
     § 4 225
     § 6 224
     § 7 224
     § 9 225
     § 12 225
     § 13 225, 226
     § 14 225
  Appendix V 219
  Appendix VII 221, 222
  SEA Protocol. See 2003 Protocol (below)
1991 Convention on the Protection of the Alps, 31 ILM 767 (1992) 195, 202
```

```
1992 Convention for the Protection of the Marine Environment of the North-East
     Atlantic (OSPAR Convention)
  art. 9 120, 384
```

art. 32(1) 120



TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS XXIX

1992 Convention on Biological Diversity, 31 ILM 818 (1992) 118, 186, 220 art. 27 235

1992 Convention on the Protection and Use of Transboundary Watercourses and International Lakes

Protocol on Water and Health 1999 216, 239

art. 20 236

1992 Helsinki Convention on the Transboundary Effects of Industrial Accidents, 31 ILM 1330 (1992)

art. 4(2) 237

art. 21 236

art. 22 236

Annex II 237

1992 Rio Declaration

art. 7 115

art. 10 217

1992 United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, 1771 UNTS 107

129, 184, 377-8, 389

art. 14 235, 362

1997 Convention on the Law of Non-Navigational Uses of International Watercourses,

Doc. A/5/869

art. 33 237

1997 Kyoto Protocol to the United Nations Convention on Climate Change, 37 ILM 22

(1998) 118, 184, 186, 210, 376, 383, 389

art. 7 378

art. 17 212, 399

art. 18 130, 191

1998 Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters (Aarhus Convention), 2161

UNTS 447 117, 179-217, 362, 383, 387

Preamble 182, 188, 189

art. 1 182

art. 2 182

art. 3 182

art. 3(9) 182, 215

art. 4 182, 183, 215



```
XXX TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS
```

```
art. 5 182
art. 6 182, 183, 195
art. 6(11) 181
art. 6bis 181
art. 7 182
art. 8 182
art. 9 182
art. 9(1) 183
art. 10 182
art. 10(1) 192
art. 10(2) 181, 189, 192
art. 10(2)(d) 194
art. 10(3) 210
art. 10(5) 363
art. 11 212
art. 12 182, 192
art. 15 125, 181, 191, 194, 207, 216
art. 16 184, 213, 236
art. 16(1) 212
art. 16(2) 119, 186
Annex 1 182
Annex 1bis 181
Annex 2 184, 185
   § 1 186
   § 15 186
PRTR Protocol 2003 181, 186
   art. 22 191
```

1998 Rotterdam Convention on the Prior Informed Consent Procedure in Certain Hazardous Chemicals and Pesticides in International Trade, 38 ILM 1 (1999) 159, 184

2000 Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety to the Convention on Biological Diversity, 1760 UNTS 79 159, 186, 199, 203, 213 art. 34 191

2001 Stockholm Convention on Persistent Organic Pollutants, 40 ILM 532 (2001) 159, 184 art. 17 191

2003 Protocol on Civil Liability and Compensation for Damage Caused by the Transboundary Effects of Industrial Accidents on Transboundary Waters art. 26 236



TABLE OF TREATIES AND INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS XXXI

2003 Protocol on Strategic Environmental Assessment to the Convention on
Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context, Doc.
ECE/MP.EIA/2003/2 218, 220
art. 5 219, 220
art. 6 220
art. 7 220
art. 8 220
art. 8 220
art. 9 220
art. 10 219, 220, 223
art. 11 220
art. 14 235

Arms control

1925 Protocol for the Prohibition of the Use of Asphyxiating, Poisonous or Other Cases, and of Bacteriological Methods of Warfare, 94 LNTS (1929) No. 2138 273, 298

```
1956 IAEA Statute, 276 UNTS 3 (No. 3988) 301

art. III(A)(5) 302

art. III(B)(4) 302, 318, 320

art. XII 405, 406

art. XII(A) 303

art. XII(C) 303, 315, 317, 318, 403
```

1963 Treaty Banning Nuclear Weapon Tests in the Atmosphere, in Outer Space and Under Water (Limited Test Ban Treaty), 480 UNTS 43 4 art. IV 268

art. 1V 208

art. VII(5) 260

art. 20 221

1967 Tlatelolco Treaty for the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons in Latin America, 634 UNTS 326

art. 7 260 art. 14 260 art. 15 260 art. 25 256 art. 31(1) 268 Protocol II art. 1 253

art. 3 253