Hobbes, Bramhall and the Politics of Liberty and Necessity

This is the first full account of one of the most famous quarrels of the seventeenth century, that between the philosopher Thomas Hobbes (1588–1679) and the Anglican archbishop of Armagh, John Bramhall (1594–1663). This analytical narrative interprets that quarrel within its own immediate and complicated historical circumstances, the Civil Wars (1638–1649) and Interregnum (1649–1660). The personal clash of Hobbes and Bramhall is connected to the broader conflict, disorder, violence, dislocation and exile that characterised those periods. This monograph offers not only the first comprehensive narrative of their hostilities over two decades, but also an illuminating analysis of aspects of their private and public quarrel that have been neglected in previous biographical, historical and philosophical accounts, with special attention devoted to their dispute over political and religious authority. This will be essential reading for scholars of early modern British history, religious history and the history of ideas.

NICHOLAS D. JACKSON was a University Fellow at the Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs, Syracuse University, from 1997 to 2005.

Cambridge Studies in Early Modern British History

Series editors

ANTHONY FLETCHER Emeritus Professor of English Social History, University of London

> JOHN GUY Fellow, Clare College, Cambridge

JOHN MORRILL Professor of British and Irish History, University of Cambridge, and Fellow, Selwyn College

This is a series of monographs and studies covering many aspects of the history of the British Isles between the late fifteenth century and the early eighteenth century. It includes the work of established scholars and pioneering work by a new generation of scholars. It includes both reviews and revisions of major topics and books which open up new historical terrain or which reveal startling new perspectives on familiar subjects. All the volumes set detailed research into our broader perspectives, and the books are intended for the use of students as well as of their teachers.

For a list of titles in the series, see end of book.

HOBBES, BRAMHALL AND THE POLITICS OF LIBERTY AND NECESSITY

A Quarrel of the Civil Wars and Interregnum

NICHOLAS D. JACKSON



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-87006-1 - Hobbes, Bramhall and the Politics Liberty and Necessity: A Quarrel of the Civil Wars and Interregnum Nicholas D. Jackson Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521870061

© Nicholas D. Jackson 2007

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2007

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-87006-1 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

It was . . . the seditious tenets of Mr Hobbes, and such like, which opened a large window to our troubles. . . . They are T. H. his own principles . . . which do serve to involve nations in civil wars.

John Bramhall, Archbishop of Armagh (1594–1663) (BW, IV, 219, 391)

He [Bramhall] further says that 'just laws are the ordinances of right reason'; which is an error that hath cost many thousands of men their lives.

Thomas Hobbes of Malmesbury (1588–1679) (EW, v, 176)

All books of controversies should be writ in Latin, that none but the learned may read them, and that there should be no disputations but in schools, lest it breed factions amongst the vulgar, for disputations and controversies are a kind of civil war, maintained by the pen, and often draw out the sword after.

William Cavendish, Duke of Newcastle (1592–1676) (*Life of Cavendish*, 125)

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments List of abbreviations		<i>page</i> ix xi
Note on dates and style		xvii
	Introduction	1
1	Bishop Bramhall, the 'Great Arminian', 'Irish Canterbury' and 'Most Unsound Man in Ireland', 1633–1641	21
2	Bishop Bramhall, the Earl of Newcastle, Thomas Hobbes and the First English Civil War	40
3	Hobbes's flight to France, <i>De Cive</i> and the beginning of the quarrel with Bramhall, summer 1645	68
4	An epistolary skirmish, 1645–1646: Bramhall's 'Discourse', Hobbes's 'Treatise' and Bramhall's 'Vindication'	100
5	Bramhall and the royalist schemes of 1646–1650	125
6	Hobbes and Leviathan among the exiles, 1646-1651	146
7	The public quarrel: Hobbes, Of Liberty and Necessity, 1654, Bramhall, Defence of True Liberty, 1655 and Hobbes, Questions concerning Liberty, Necessity and Chance, 1656	180
8	Castigations of Hobbes's Animadversions and The Catching of Leviathan, 1657–1658: Hobbes as Leviathan of Leviathans	220
9	The Restoration and death of Bramhall and Hobbes's last word, 1668	250
	Conclusion	276
Bibliography Index		305 323

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

No reader of this book's footnotes will be able to overlook my debt to dozens of scholars. Here, however, I would like to specify those to whom my gratitude is especially great. For my understanding of Bramhall's career in Ireland in the 1630s I am much indebted to John McCafferty. He allowed me to read a draft of his article on Bramhall for the Oxford Dictionary of National Biography. Like so many others who have studied Hobbes in the last decade, my debt to Noel Malcolm is considerable. I thank Nicholas Tyacke, whose scholarship was enormously helpful in sketching the arminian-calvinist context of the Hobbes-Bramhall quarrel. Similarly, I would like to express gratitude to Lisa Sarasohn, whose work on Hobbes and Newcastle proved a good guide. All of the following scholars either answered queries, shared sources and unpublished writings, supplied images or offered advice and encouragement. Some of them did all of the above. They are: Marika Keblusek, Jack Cunningham, Thomas Pink, David Smith, Anthony Milton, Nicole Greenspan, David Sturdy, Nicholas Rogers and Jeffrey Collins. While I have disagreed with the latter in some points, his meticulous Hobbes scholarship has served as a model for my own. Early in this publishing venture, John Morrill's support and enthusiasm inspired diligent revision. I also thank the Press's anonymous reader who offered trenchant criticism and constructive suggestions for revision. At Cambridge I was fortunate to have been managed by a talented editor, Michael Watson. His nudging was always experienced as charm for the grace with which it was applied.

This book began as a dissertation. While it was still in that form it benefited from the reading of several historians at Syracuse University. For their perusal and criticism I thank Ralph Ketcham, Chris Kyle and Pamela Edwards. I am even more indebted to one of their fellow examiners, Gordon Schochet. His exceptional generosity began when he agreed to serve as a member of my dissertation committee. Not deserving that, I have been even more undeserving of all the subsequent attention he has paid to my work. My acquaintance with Dr Schochet has allowed me to understand how sincerely Hobbes must have thanked patrons like the Cavendishes. х

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-87006-1 - Hobbes, Bramhall and the Politics Liberty and Necessity: A Quarrel of the Civil Wars and Interregnum Nicholas D. Jackson Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgments

One of the more powerful incentives to publish a book is to obtain the opportunity to thank in public all those who have sustained the writer over many years of toil. I am heavily indebted to an advisor and mentor who has also proved a friend. I thank Joseph Levine not only for his critical tenacity while this was still being written as a dissertation (and before that, a seminar paper), but equally, more generally, for all the personal guidance and care I did not deserve as his graduate student. My gratitude to him is especially great for supporting me on all those occasions when even I would not support myself. My family, too, has supported me many times when I was thoroughly undeserving. I thank Brandon and Mary Jackson, whose hospitality and generosity at Little Spigot in West Witton allowed me to research Bramhall's career in Yorkshire. To another aunt, Gillian White, and her family in London, I am even more indebted. While my gratitude to her, Deborah, Jonathan, and Daniel is manifold, they shall be most amused for thanking them for pretending that I was not mad to be devoting most of my existence to resuscitating a dead man from Pontefract named John Bramhall. In the same way I must thank all my siblings (JJKLNSSMSBG) who have, for so long, suffered a scholar so gladly.

Lastly, and the opposite of leastly, I thank my parents. It would be no exaggeration to say that they have been this book's and this author's *sine qua non*. During its entire existence, first as a dissertation, then as a manuscript, finally as a typescript, this book has benefited from my father's historical acumen, critical scrutiny and editorial prowess. I wish many others knew what he knows: that such a description only scrapes the surface. Likewise, any description of the love and support my mother has provided would be absurdly insufficient. To state all the things for which I am indebted to my parents would be as difficult – and long – as was the writing of this book. Like all those who cannot find satisfactory words to express gratitude, I dedicate this book to them.

ABBREVIATIONS

- Advice to Charles II = William Cavendish, Duke of Newcastle, Ideology and Politics on the Eve of Restoration: Newcastle's Advice to Charles II, ed. Thomas P. Slaughter (Philadelphia: American Philosophical Society, 1984).
- AH = John Vesey, 'Athanasius Hibernicus: or, The Life of the Most Reverend Father in God, John, Lord Archbishop of Armagh, Primate and Metropolitan of all Ireland' in Works of the Most Reverend Father in God, John Bramhall, D. D., late Lord Archbishop of Armagh, Primate and Metropolitan of all Ireland (Dublin, 1676), i-xliv.
- 'An Answer' = Hobbes, 'An Answer to Bishop Bramhall', *EW*, IV, 283–384.
- Answer to Milletière = Bramhall, An Answer to M. de la Milletière, his impertinent Dedication of his imaginary Triumph (entitled 'The Victory of Truth'), or his Epistle to the King of Great Britain King Charles II, BW, I, 7–81.
- *Anti-White* = Hobbes, *Thomas White's 'De Mundo' Examined*, trans. Harold Whitmore Jones (London: Bradford University Press, 1976).
- *Athenae Oxonienses* = Anthony Wood, *Athenae Oxonienses*, ed. Phillip Bliss (London, 1813–20; 4 vols.).
- Aubrey, Brief Lives = John Aubrey, Brief Lives, Chiefly of Contemporaries, Set Down by John Aubrey, Between the Years 1669 & 1696, ed. Andrew Clark (Oxford, 1898; 2 vols.).
- Baillie, *Letters and Journals* = Robert Baillie, *The Letters and Journals of Robert Baillie*, ed. David Laing (Edinburgh, 1841–2; 3 vols.).
- Behemoth = Hobbes, Behemoth, or the Long Parliament, ed. Ferdinand Toennies (1889); intro. Stephen Holmes (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1990).

xii

List of abbreviations

Bodl. = Bodleian Library, Oxford University.

BL = British Library, London.

- Brief View = Edward Hyde, Earl of Clarendon, A Brief View and Survey of the Dangerous and Pernicious Errors to Church and State, in Mr Hobbes's Book Entitled Leviathan (Oxford, 1676).
- BW = The Works of the Most Reverend Father in God, John Bramhall, ed.A. W. Haddan (Oxford: John Henry Parker, 1842–5; 5 vols.).
- Carte = A Collection of Original Letters and Papers, concerning the Affairs of England, from the Year 1641 to 1660, found among the Duke of Ormonde's Papers, ed. Thomas Carte (London: James Bettenham, 1739; 2 vols.).
- Castigations = Bramhall, Castigations of Mr Hobbes his Last Animadversions in the Case concerning Liberty and Universal Necessity; wherein all his exceptions about the controversy are fully satisfied, BW, IV, 197–506.
- *Catching* = Bramhall, *The Catching of Leviathan*, or the Great Whale, BW, IV, 507–97.
- CCSP = Calendar of the Clarendon State Papers preserved in the Bodleian Library, eds. O. Ogle, W. H. Bliss, W. D. Macray and F. J. Routledge (Oxford: Clarendon, 1869–1970; 5 vols.).
- CD = Constitutional Documents of the Puritan Revolution, ed. S. R. Gardiner (3rd edn, Oxford: Clarendon, 1906).
- CJ = Journals of the House of Commons.
- *CJI* = Journals of the House of Commons, Ireland.
- Clarendon, *History of Rebellion* = Edward Hyde, Earl of Clarendon, *The History of the Rebellion and Civil Wars in England*, ed. W. D. Macray (Oxford: Clarendon, 1888; 6 vols.).
- *Considerations* = Hobbes, *Considerations upon the Reputation, Loyalty, Manners, and Religion of Thomas Hobbes of Malmesbury, EW,* IV, 409–40.
- Corr. = The Correspondence of Thomas Hobbes, ed. Noel Malcolm (Oxford: Clarendon, 1994; 2 vols.).
- *CSP* = Calendar of State Papers.
- *CSPD* = Calendar of State Papers, Domestic.

List of abbreviations

xiii

CSPI = Calendar of State Papers, Ireland.

- DC = Hobbes, De Cive, On the Citizen, trans. Michael Silverthorne, ed. Richard Tuck (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998).
- Defence = Bramhall, A Defence of True Liberty from Antecedent and Extrinsecal Necessity, being an answer to a late book of Mr Thomas Hobbes of Malmesbury, entitled, A Treatise of Liberty of Liberty and Necessity, BW, IV, 3–196.
- Dialogue between a Philosopher and a Student = Hobbes, A Dialogue between a Philosopher and a Student, of the Common Laws of England, ed. Joseph Cropsey (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1971).
- 'Discourse' = Bramhall, 'A Treatise of Liberty and Necessity upon Occasion of Some Opinions of Thomas Hobbes about these', *BW*, IV, 3–196.
- *DNB* = *Dictionary of National Biography*, eds. Leslie Stephen and Sidney Lee (London, 1885–1900; 63 vols.).
- *Elements of Law* = Hobbes, *The Elements of Law, Natural and Politic/Human Nature and De Corpore Politico*, ed. J. C. A. Gaskin (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994).
- Evelyn, Diary and Correspondence = Diary and Correspondence of John Evelyn, F. R. S., to which is subjoined The Private Correspondence between King Charles I and Sir Edward Nicholas and between Sir Edward Hyde, afterwards Earl of Clarendon and Sir Richard Browne, ed. William Bray (London: George Bell & Sons, 1906; 4 vols.).
- *EW* = *The English Works of Thomas Hobbes of Malmesbury*, ed. William Molesworth (London: J. Bohn, 1839–45; 11 vols.).
- *Fair Warning* = Bramhall, *A Fair Warning to take heed of the Scottish Discipline, as being of all others most injurious to the Civil Magistrate, most oppressive to the Subject, most pernicious to both, BW, 111, 237–87.*

HJ = *Historical Journal*.

- HMC Cowper = Historical Manuscripts Commission Report (12), Appendix, Part II, on the Manuscripts of Earl Cowper, K. G., preserved at Melbourne Hall, Derbyshire, vol. II (London: Eyre and Spottiswoode, 1888).
- HMC Hastings, IV = Historical Manuscripts Commission Report (78) on the Manuscripts of the late Reginald Rawdon Hastings, Esq., of the

xiv

List of abbreviations

Manor House, Ashby de la Zouch, vol. IV, ed. Francis Bickley (London: HMSO, 1947).

- HMC Ormonde(a), I = Historical Manuscripts Commission Report (14), Appendix, Part VII: The Manuscripts of the Marquess of Ormonde, preserved at the Castle, Kilkenny, vol. I, ed. John T. Gilbert (London: Eyre and Spottiswoode, 1895).
- HMC Ormonde(b), I = Historical Manuscripts Commission Calendar of the Manuscripts of the Marquess of Ormonde, K. P., preserved at Kilkenny Castle, New Series, vol. I, ed. C. Litton Falkiner (London: Mackie and Co., 1902).
- HMC Pepys = Historical Manuscripts Commission Report (70) on the Pepys Manuscripts, preserved at Magdalene College, Cambridge, ed. E. K. Purnell (London: HMSO, 1911).
- HMC Portland, I = Historical Manuscripts Commission Report (13) on the Manuscripts of His Grace the Duke of Portland, preserved at Welbeck Abbey, vol. I, ed. F. H. Blackburne Daniell (London: Eyre and Spottiswoode, 1891).
- HMC Portland, II = Historical Manuscripts Commission Report (13) on the Manuscripts of His Grace the Duke of Portland, preserved at Welbeck Abbey, vol. II, ed. F. H. Blackburne Daniell (London: Eyre and Spottiswoode, 1893).
- HMC Portland, III = Historical Manuscripts Commission Report (13) on the Manuscripts of His Grace the Duke of Portland, preserved at Welbeck Abbey, vol. III, ed. Richard Ward (London: Eyre and Spottiswoode, 1894).
- *HPT* = *History of Political Thought*.
- *JBS* = *Journal* of British Studies.
- *Just Vindication* = Bramhall, *A Just Vindication of the Church of England from the Aspersion of Criminal Schism*, BW, 1, 83–279.
- *Lev.* = Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ed. Edwin Curley (Indianapolis: Hackett, 1994).
- Life of Cavendish = Margaret Cavendish, Duchess of Newcastle, *The Life* of William Cavendish, Duke of Newcastle, to which is added the True Relation of My Birth, Breeding and Life (London: A. Maxwell, 1667; ed. Charles H. Firth. 2nd rev. edn. London: Routledge and Sons; New York: E. P. Dutton, n.d.).

List of abbreviations

XV

LJI = Journals of the House of Lords, Ireland.

- Marks of an Absurd Geometry = Hobbes, Marks of an Absurd Geometry, Rural Language, Scottish Church Politics, and Barbarisms of John Wallis, Professor of Geometry and Doctor of Divinity, EW, VII, 357–428.
- Nicholas Papers = The Nicholas Papers: Correspondence of Sir Edward Nicholas, Secretary of State, ed. G. F. Warner (Camden Society, 1886–1920; 4 vols.).
- NYCRO = North Yorkshire County Record Office (Northallerton).
- ODNB = Oxford Dictionary of National Biography, eds. H. C. G. Matthew and B. H. Harrison (Oxford and New York: Oxford University, 2004; 60 vols.).
- OL = Thomae Hobbes Malmesburiensis Opera Philosophica quae Latine *scripsit omnia*, ed. William Molesworth (London: J. Bohn, 1839–45; 5 vols.).
- OLN = Hobbes, Of Liberty and Necessity: A Treatise, Wherein All Controversy Concerning Predestination, Election, Free-Will, Grace, Merits, Reprobation, &c is fully decided and cleared; in answer to a treatise written by the Bishop of Londonderry, on the same subject, EW, IV, 229–78.
- Pell-Cavendish = John Pell (1611–1685) and His Correspondence with Sir Charles Cavendish: The Mental World of an Early Modern Mathematician, eds. Noel Malcolm and Jacqueline Stedall (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005).
- PRO = Public Record Office, London.

PRONI = Public Record Office of Northern Ireland.

- Questions = Hobbes, The Questions concerning Liberty, Necessity, and Chance Clearly Stated and Debated between Dr Bramhall, Bishop of Derry, and Thomas Hobbes of Malmesbury, EW, v.
- Rawdon Papers = The Rawdon Papers, consisting of Letters on Various Subjects, Literary, Political, and Ecclesiastical, to and from Dr John Bramhall, Primate of Ireland, including the Correspondence of Several Most Eminent Men During the Greater Part of the Seventeenth Century, ed. Edward Berwick (London and Dublin: John Nichols and Son and R. Milliken, 1819).

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-87006-1 - Hobbes, Bramhall and the Politics Liberty and Necessity: A Quarrel of
the Civil Wars and Interregnum
Nicholas D. Jackson
Frontmatter
More information

xvi

List of abbreviations

- Replication to the Bishop of Chalcedon = Bramhall, A Replication to the Bishop of Chalcedon's Survey of the Vindication of the Church of England from Criminous Schism, with an appendix in answer to the exceptions of S. W., BW, II, 1–335.
- Rushworth = John Rushworth, *Historical Collections* (London, 1659–1701; 7 vols.).
- *SC* = *The Stuart Constitution*, 2nd edn, J. P. Kenyon (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986).
- Schism Guarded = Bramhall, Schism Guarded and Beaten Back upon the Right Owners, BW, 11, 339–646.
- Serpent-Salve = Bramhall, The Serpent-Salve, or, A Remedy for the Biting of an Asp, BW, III, 291–496.
- Six Lessons = Hobbes, Six Lessons to the Professors of the Mathematics, One of Geometry, the Other of Astronomy, in the Chairs set up by the Noble and Learned Sir Henry Savile, in the University of Oxford, EW, VII, 181–356.
- Taylor, 'Funeral Sermon' = Jeremy Taylor, A Sermon preached in Christ's Church, Dublin, July 16, 1663; At the funeral of the Most Reverend Father in God, John Late Lord Archbishop of Armagh, and Primate of All Ireland, BW, I, xxxix–lxxvi.
- *Thurloe State Papers* = A *Collection of the State Papers of John Thurloe*, ed. T. Birch (London, 1742; 7 vols.).
- 'Treatise' = Hobbes, 'A Treatise of Liberty and Necessity', EW, IV, 239–78.
- 'Vindication' = Bramhall, 'A Vindication of True Liberty from Antecedent and Extrinsecal Necessity', *BW*, IV, 3–196.
- *Vindication of Episcopal Clergy* = Bramhall, *Vindication of Himself and the Episcopal Clergy from the Presbyterian Charge of Popery*, *BW*, III, 499–586.
- Wing = Short-Title Catalogue of Books Printed in England . . . 1641–1700, 2nd edn, ed. Donald Wing (New York, 1972–88).
- Works of Laud = William Laud, The Works of the Most Reverend Father in God, William Laud, eds. J. Bliss and W. Scott (Oxford: John Henry Parker, 1847–60; 7 vols.).

NOTE ON DATES AND STYLE

All dates are in Old Style (O.S., Julian), except that the year is taken to begin 1 January, rather than 25 March. However, in many cases I also give the date New Style (N.S., Gregorian), especially in the case of correspondence in which one or both writers were in Europe.

With rare (and obvious) exception, quotations of both seventeenth-century book-titles and texts have been silently modernised.

Derry refers either to the county or diocese of the anglican church in Ireland; Londonderry refers only to the town.