

CHINA SINCE TIANANMEN

In a new edition of his path-breaking analysis of political and social change in China since the crackdown in Tiananmen Square in 1989, Joseph Fewsmith traces developments since 2001. These include the continuing reforms during the final years of Jiang Zemin's premiership and Hu Jintao's succession in 2002. Here the author also considers social trends and how Chinese citizens are starting to have a significant influence on government policies. As Fewsmith – a highly regarded political scientist and a seasoned China-watcher – observes, China is a very different place today than it was eighteen years ago. In the interim, it has emerged from isolation to become one of the most significant players on the world stage. This book – more than any other – explains the forces that have shaped China since Tiananmen.

JOSEPH FEWSMITH is Professor in the Departments of International Relations and Political Science at Boston University.



Cambridge Modern China Series

Edited by William Kirby, Harvard University

Other books in the series:

Christian Henriot and Wen-hsin Yeh, In the Shadow of the Rising Sun: Shanghai under Japanese Occuption

Andrew Scobell, China's Use of Military Force: Beyond the Great Wall and the Long March

Andrew H. Wedeman, From Mao to Market: Rent Seeking, Local Protectionism, and Marketization in China

Thomas P. Bernstein and Xiaobo Lu, *Taxation without Representation* in Contemporary Rural China

Linsun Cheng, Banking in Modern China: Entrepreneurs, Professional Managers, and the Development of Chinese Banks, 1897–1937

Bruce J. Dickson, Red Capitalists in China: The Chinese Communist Party, Private Entrepreneurs, and Political Change

Yasheng Huang, Selling China: Foreign Direct Investment During the Reform Era

Rachel Murphy, How Migrant Labor is Changing Rural China

Warren I. Cohen and Li Zhao, eds., Hong Kong under Chinese Rule: The Economic and Political Implications of Reversion

Tamara Jacka, Women's Work in Rural China: Change and Continuity in an Era of Reform

Shiping Zheng, Party vs. State in Post-1949 China: The Institutional Dilemma

Michael Dutton, ed., Streetlife China

Edward Steinfeld, Forging Reform in China: The Fate of State-Owned Industry

Wenfang Tang and William Parish, Chinese Urban Life under Reform: The Changing Social Contract

David Shambaugh, ed., The Modern Chinese State

Jing Huang, Factionalism in Chinese Communist Politics

Xin Zhang, Social Transformation in Modern China: The State and Local Elites in Henan, 1900–1937

Edmund S. K. Fung, In Search of Chinese Democracy: Civil Opposition in Nationalist China, 1929–1949

List of other books in the series continues after the index.



CHINA SINCE TIANANMEN

From Deng Xiaoping to Hu Jintao

JOSEPH FEWSMITH

Boston University





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

> > Cambridge University Press
> > The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521686051

© Joseph Fewsmith 2001, 2008

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001 Second edition 2008

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Fewsmith, Joseph, 1949– China since Tiananmen: from Deng Xiaoping to Hu Jintao / Joseph Fewsmith. p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1SBN 978-0-521-86693-4 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-68605-1 (pbk.)

1. China–Politics and government – 1976–2002. 2. Political leadership–China.

3. China–History–Tiananmen Square Incident, 1989. I. Title.

3. China–History–Tiananmen Square Incident, 1989. JQI510.F478 2008

951.05′9–dc22 2007053003

ISBN 978-0-521-86693-4 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-68605-1 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Stephanie and Andrew



Contents

Acknowledgments	page ix
Chronology	X
Schematic overview of the Chinese political spectrum	xvi
List of abbreviations and tables	xviii
Introduction]
PART I LINE STRUGGLE REVISITED: THE ATTACK ON DENG'S REFORM PROGRAM	
1. Tiananmen and the conservative critique of reform	21
2. Deng moves to revive reform	48
PART II REDEFINING REFORM: THE SEARCH FOR A NEW WAY	
3. The emergence of neoconservatism	83
4. The enlightenment tradition under challenge	113
5. The emergence of neostatism and popular nationalism	140
PART III ELITE POLITICS AND POPULAR NATIONALISM	
6. Jiang Zemin's rise to power	165
7. Elite politics in an era of globalization and nationalism	197



viii	Contents	
PART IV	A NEW ERA IN CHINESE POLITICS	
8. Hu Ji	intao takes over: a turn to the left?	231
Conclusio	on	272
Epilogue:	the Seventeenth Party Congress	278
Bibliograp	phy	285
Index		325



Acknowledgments

This book has its origins in an earlier attempt to come to grips with the political trends in China since the tragic crackdown on student demonstrations on June 4, 1989, an event usually referred to simply as "Tiananmen" after the central square in Beijing that had been the focus of student activities for the preceding six weeks (though most of the violence took place outside the square). Roderick MacFarquhar asked me to analyze events in the first three years since that time for a revised edition of his *The Politics of China*, which appeared in 1997. I thank him for his encouragement to write that chapter and for his later suggestion to expand that chapter into a book—though doing so took longer and involved more than I had anticipated at the time. His intellectual support and friendship have been critical to that enterprise.

A grant from the Smith Richardson Foundation and a sabbatical leave from Boston University in 1997–8 gave me time to pursue this research. Alas, it became apparent in that year that understanding politics in the years since Tiananmen required delving into the new intellectual moods that grew up in the 1990s and reflected a very different China from the one I had grown accustomed to in the 1980s – and that required additional time and effort. Fortunately, I knew or came to know many of the intellectuals whose works are discussed in the pages that follow. They have helped me understand not only the different ideas that gained currency but also why those ideas came into being and evolved as they have. I hope that I have repaid their time and guidance by conveying the trends of the 1990s accurately.

Since the first edition of this work was published in 2001, much has happened in China. Jiang Zemin has left office and been replaced by Hu Jintao, and the tenor of public discourse has changed significantly. It seemed time to incorporate these changes by updating this work. Accordingly, an eighth chapter has been added and the earlier chapters edited down so that, hopefully, the political history of China in the eighteen years since Tiananmen can be presented coherently. An epilogue has been added discussing



X

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-86693-4 - China since Tiananmen: From Deng Xiaoping to Hu Jintao Joseph Fewsmith Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgments

the Seventeenth Party Congress in October 2007. In updating this work I was helped by my stay at the Woodrow Wilson Center for International Scholars in the fall of 2005. I am very grateful to Robert Hathaway and the staff of the center for providing such a hospitable place to study and write.

In trying to understand post-Tiananmen China, I have often worked closely with Stanley Rosen, whose translations of debates in this period are cited frequently in the text. I thank him for his insights and support. I have also benefited from the friendship and support of my colleague Merle Goldman, who read the manuscript in draft form and whose comments have improved the final form. Similarly Cheng Li and Timothy Cheek read the manuscript and provided valuable comments, as did an anonymous reviewer. William C. Kirby supported the project and provided encouragement along the way.

As anyone who has worked on such a book knows, scholarship depends on those who collect, organize, and know the material they put on the shelves of libraries. I have been fortunate to work with the best. Nancy Hearst of the Fairbank Center at Harvard University has provided critical support, not only bibliographically but also by proofreading the final manuscript. James Cheng and his staff at the Harvard-Yenching Library at Harvard have been similarly helpful. Jean Hung and the staff at the Universities Service Center at the Chinese University of Hong Kong were of great assistance in locating much material used in this study, and Annie Chang at the Center for Chinese Studies Library at the University of California at Berkeley has also been of great help in finding material. I also appreciate the help that Jennifer Sova and Luke Wilcox provided in running down sources and checking footnotes.

Parts of this volume are adapted from articles previously published by the National Bureau of Asian Research, the Asia Society, and *Current History*. Permission to do so is gratefully acknowledged.

Mary Child, the editor for Asian Studies, Sociology, and History of Science at Cambridge University Press, provided invaluable guidance and support in the preparation of the first edition of this work, and Marigold Acland has similarly supported the preparation of the second edition.

My wife Irene has been unfailing in her support. Our children, Stephanie and Andrew, have tolerated with uncommon grace my frequent trips to China and the time I have spent locked away in my study. Because of their patience, and just because they are such great kids, this book is dedicated to them.

© Cambridge University Press



Chronology

1989

June 4 Tiananmen crackdown

June 23–24 Fourth Plenary Session of the Thirteenth

Central Committee

November 6–9 Fifth Plenary Session of the Thirteenth

Central Committee

1990

January 10 Premier Li Peng announces the lifting of

martial law in Beijing

September Economic Work Conference

November Yearnings broadcast

December National Planning Conference

1991

March 22 First Huangfu Ping commentary

March NPC promotes Zhu Rongji to vice premier July I Jiang Zemin calls for opposing "peaceful

evolution"

August 19–21 Attempted coup d'état in Soviet Union

1992

Jaunary 18–February 21 Deng Xiaoping's "southern tour"

March 10–12 Politburo Meeting supports Deng Xiaoping September 28 Conservative theoretician Hu Qiaomu dies at

age 81

October 12–18 Fourteenth Party Congress

October 19 First Plenary Session of the Fourteenth

Central Committee

1993

March 5–7 Second Plenary Session of the Fifteenth

Central Committee

xi



xii Chronology

Summer Huntington's article, "Clash of Civilizations?"

published

August 3 Chinese ship, *Yin He*, stopped by US Navy September 23 2000 Olympics awarded to Sydney, Australia,

instead of Beijing

November Strategy and Management starts publication
November II–I4 Third Plenary Session of the Fourteenth

Central Committee

1994

March Looking at China through a Third Eye

published

September 25–28 Fourth Plenary Session of the Fourteenth

Central Committee

1995

April 10 Chen Yun, advocate of a planned economy,

dies at age 90

April 27 Chen Xitong removed as Beijing Party

secretary

September 25–28 Fifth Plenary Session of the Fourteenth

Central Committee

1996

March 8 China tests surface-to-surface missiles into sea

off the coast of Taiwan

May China Can Say No published

October Heart-to-Heart Talks with the General

Secretary published

October 7–10 Sixth Plenary Session of the Fourteenth

Central Committee

1997

February 2 Former Minister of Defense Qin Jiwei dies at

age 82

February 19 Deng Xiaoping dies at age 92

May 29 Jiang Zemin speaks at Central Party School

July 1 Hong Kong is returned to China

September 12–18 Fifteenth Party Congress convenes in Beijing September 19 First Plenary Session of the Fifteenth Central

Committee

October 28 Jiang Zemin arrives in Washington, D.C.



Chronology xiii

1998

February 25–26 Second Plenary Session of Fifteenth Central

Committee

March Crossed Swords published

March 5–19 NPC meeting announces major government

restructuring

May 4 Beijing University celebrates its 100th

anniversary

June 27 President Clinton arrives in Beijing
July 22 Jiang Zemin calls on Chinese military to

withdraw from business

September 14 Former president Yang Shangkun dies at

age 91

October 12–14 Third Plenary Session of the Fifteenth

Central Committee

December 21 Democratic activists Wang Youcai and Xu

Wenli sentenced to jail

1999

March 23 United States starts bombing Serbian forces

in Kosovo

April 6 Premier Zhu Rongji arrives in Washington to

discuss WTO

April 20 Task force established to investigate

corruption in Xiamen

April 25 Adherents of Falun Gong demonstrate

around Zhongnanhai

May 7 US bombs hit Chinese Embassy in Belgrade
July 9 Taiwan President Lee Teng-hui describes

relations with PRC as "special-state-to-state"

relations

September 19–22 Fourth Plenary Session of Fifteenth Central

Committee

October 1 50th anniversary of the founding of the PRC

celebrated

November 15 United States and China reach agreement on

China's accession to WTO

2000

January 20 Wall Street Journal reports Lin Youfang, wife

of Politburo member Jia Qinglin, detained

for questioning



xiv	Chronology
February	Jiang Zemin raises "three represents" slogan
March 29	Enlightenment Daily carries letter implicitly criticizing Liu Junning
October 9–11	Fifth Plenary Session of Fifteenth Central Committee
2001	
April 1	Chinese F-8 fighter collides with American E-P3 surveillance plane off coast of Hainan
2002 October 22	Shanahai Darty Sagratary Huang Iv and
October 22	Shanghai Party Secretary Huang Ju and Beijing Party Secretary Jia Qinglin are transferred to the center
November 8–14	Sixteenth Party Congress convenes in Beijing
December 4	Hu Jintao, in his first public appearance as
2 eee	general secretary, speaks at celebration commemorating the 20th anniversity of the
	1982 constitution
December 5–6	Hu Jintao visits the revolutionary base of Xibaipo
	Thompo
2003	
2003 January 7–9	National meeting of propaganda heads
January 7–9	National meeting of propaganda heads Rural Work Conference
	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named
January 7–9 January 7–8 March 5–11	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier
January 7–9 January 7–8	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier Wen Jiabao presides over a State Council
January 7–9 January 7–8 March 5–11	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier Wen Jiabao presides over a State Council meeting that discusses the SARS issue Health Minister Zhang Wenkang and Beijing
January 7–9 January 7–8 March 5–11 April 2	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier Wen Jiabao presides over a State Council meeting that discusses the SARS issue Health Minister Zhang Wenkang and Beijing Mayor Meng Xuenong are dismissed from
January 7–9 January 7–8 March 5–11 April 2 April 20	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier Wen Jiabao presides over a State Council meeting that discusses the SARS issue Health Minister Zhang Wenkang and Beijing Mayor Meng Xuenong are dismissed from their posts
January 7–9 January 7–8 March 5–11 April 2	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier Wen Jiabao presides over a State Council meeting that discusses the SARS issue Health Minister Zhang Wenkang and Beijing Mayor Meng Xuenong are dismissed from their posts Hu Jintao calls to launch a "people's war"
January 7–9 January 7–8 March 5–11 April 2 April 20	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier Wen Jiabao presides over a State Council meeting that discusses the SARS issue Health Minister Zhang Wenkang and Beijing Mayor Meng Xuenong are dismissed from their posts
January 7–9 January 7–8 March 5–11 April 2 April 20	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier Wen Jiabao presides over a State Council meeting that discusses the SARS issue Health Minister Zhang Wenkang and Beijing Mayor Meng Xuenong are dismissed from their posts Hu Jintao calls to launch a "people's war" against SARS Third Plenary Session of the Sixteenth
January 7–9 January 7–8 March 5–11 April 2 April 20 May 1 October 11–14	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier Wen Jiabao presides over a State Council meeting that discusses the SARS issue Health Minister Zhang Wenkang and Beijing Mayor Meng Xuenong are dismissed from their posts Hu Jintao calls to launch a "people's war" against SARS Third Plenary Session of the Sixteenth
January 7–9 January 7–8 March 5–11 April 2 April 20 May 1 October 11–14	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier Wen Jiabao presides over a State Council meeting that discusses the SARS issue Health Minister Zhang Wenkang and Beijing Mayor Meng Xuenong are dismissed from their posts Hu Jintao calls to launch a "people's war" against SARS Third Plenary Session of the Sixteenth Central Committee An Investigation of China's Peasants by Chen
January 7–9 January 7–8 March 5–11 April 2 April 20 May 1 October 11–14 2004 March 2004	Rural Work Conference First Session of the Tenth National People's Congress Meeting. Wen Jiabao is named premier Wen Jiabao presides over a State Council meeting that discusses the SARS issue Health Minister Zhang Wenkang and Beijing Mayor Meng Xuenong are dismissed from their posts Hu Jintao calls to launch a "people's war" against SARS Third Plenary Session of the Sixteenth Central Committee An Investigation of China's Peasants by Chen Guidi and Chu Tao is banned



Chronology

XV

former Guangdong Party Secretary Ren

Zhongyi

September 8 Southern Personalities Weekly publishes list of

the 50 most influential Chinese public

intellectuals

September 13 Yitahutu chatroom is closed down
September 16–19 Fourth Plenary Session of the Sixteenth

Central Committee

September 19 Jiang Zemin retires from the Central Military

Commission

September 22 Strategy and Management is closed down
November II Propaganda Department issues Document

Number 29

November 23 Wang Guangze, a journalist at the 21st

Century Business Herald, is fired

December 14 Small- and medium-sized SOEs must clarify

who is funding a buyout and who will

manage the business before any MBO can be

approved

2005

March 17 Jiao Guobiao is dismissed from Peking

University

April 14 Management buyouts of large state-owned

enterprises are banned

July 10 Xinhua News Agency issues draft Property

Law

August 12 Peking University law professor Gong

Xiantian posts letter on Internet attacking the

draft property rights law

2006

March 5–14 Fourth Session of the Tenth National People's

Congress meeting discusses Eleventh

Five-Year Program

August 10 Selected Works of Jiang Zemin are published
September 24 Party Secretary of Shanghai Chen Liangyu is

removed from office for his involvement in a

security fund scandal

October 8–11 Sixth Plenary Session of the Sixteenth Central

Committee



xvi Chronology

December Sociologist Lu Jianhua is secretly sentenced to

twenty years for leaking state secrets

2007

March 5–16 Amended property rights law passed at Fifth

Session of the Tenth National People's

Congress meeting

October 15–20 Seventeenth Party Congress convened

in Beijing



Schematic overview of the Chinese political spectrum

Schematic overview of Chinese political spectrum

STATE				
	The Left	Political Center	Right	
The Old Left Deng Liqun Yu Quanyu Leftist Journals Contemporary Trends Quest for Truth Mainstream	Li Peng Ding Guan'gen Tang Wensheng Wang Renzhi	Jiang Zemin Zeng Qinghong Wang Huning SOCIETY	Zhu Rongji Wang Daohan Liu Ji	Liberals Wan Li Li Shenzhi Shen Jiru Ling Zhijun Ma Licheng
	The New Left			Liberals
New Nationalists China Can Say No Wang Xiaodong Yang Ping Fang Ning	Post-Modernists Wang Hui Cui Zhiyuan Gan Yang Zhang Kuan	Neostatists Hu Angang Wang Shaoguang		Liu Junning Qin Hui Xu Youyu Zhu Xueqin Lei Yi

Note: This schematic is arranged horizontally from the center outward, showing those who are far to the left and right of the political center (the Old Left and Liberals respectively) as well as those with left and right tendencies within the political center. Vertically, those farther from the top exercise less political influence. Thus, the Old Left and Liberals influence the political center but are not as powerful, similarly, intellectuals such as Li Shenzhi are not in the same category as former Vice-Premier Wan Li. Other intellectuals, whether New Left or Liberal, are even more distant from the political center and are depicted as societal actors.



Abbreviations and tables

ABBREVIATIONS

ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
CAC	Central Advisory Commission

CAS Chinese Academy of Sciences
CASS Chinese Academy of Social Sciences

CCP Chinese Communist Party

CDIC Central Discipline Inspection Commission

CMC Central Military Commission

CPSU Communist Party of the Soviet Union

CYL Communist Youth League

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

IMF International Monetary Fund MOFCOM Ministry of Commerce

MOFTEC Ministry of Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation

NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organization

NPC National People's Congress
NMD National Missile Defense
PBSC Politburo Standing Committee
PRC People's Republic of China

SETC State Economic and Trade Commission

SEZ Special Economic Zone
SOE State-Owned Enterprise
SPC State Planning Commission
TVE Township and Village Enterprise

TMD Theater Missile Defense

USTR United States Trade Representative

WTO World Trade Organization

xviii



List of abbreviations and tables	xix
TABLES	
1 Leadership of the Chinese Communist Party	page 73
2 Leadership of the Chinese Communist Party following	the
15th Party Congress	202
3 Leadership of the Chinese Communist Party following	the
16th Party Congress	241
4 Frequency of formulations	253
5 Politburo membership before and after the	
17th Party Congress	280
6 The Secretariat	2.81