

Reason's Grief An Essay on Tragedy and Value

In *Reason's Grief*, George Harris takes W. B. Yeats's comment that we begin to live only when we have conceived life as tragedy as a call for a tragic ethics, something the modern West has yet to produce. He argues that we must turn away from religious understandings of tragedy and the human condition and realize that our species will occupy a very brief period of history, at some point to disappear without a trace. We must accept an ethical perspective that avoids pernicious fantasies about ultimate redemption, one that sees tragic loss as a permanent and pervasive aspect of our daily lives yet finds a way to think, feel, and act with both passion and hope. *Reason's Grief* takes us back through the history of our thinking about value to find our way. The call is for nothing less than a paradigm shift for understanding both tragedy and ethics.

George W. Harris is Chancellor Professor of Philosophy at the College of William and Mary. He is the author of *Dignity and Vulnerability* and *Agent-Centered Morality*, and he has contributed to *The Journal of Philosophy, Nous, The Monist, American Philosophical Quarterly, Public Affairs Quarterly*, and other journals. He is a Distinguished Member of the National Society of Collegiate Scholars and a receipient of a fellowship from the National Endowment of the Humanities.



Reason's Grief

An Essay on Tragedy and Value

GEORGE W. HARRIS

College of William and Mary





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521863285

© George W. Harris 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Harris, George W.

Reason's grief: an essay on tragedy and value / George W. Harris.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0-521-86328-7 (hardback)

1. Tragic, The. 2. Values. 3. Ethics. I. Title.
BH301.T7H37 2006
128 – dc22 2005026789

ISBN-13 978-0-521-86328-5 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-86328-7 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To the memory of my parents, Mary O. and Theron J. Harris, and to Patty, Rachel, and Jenny



Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix
	An Aesthetic Prelude	1
1	The Problem of Tragedy	18
2	The Dubious Ubiquity of Practical Reason	42
3	Nihilism	63
4	Pessimism	86
5	Monism: An Epitaph	110
6	Moralism and the Inconstancy of Value	151
7	Moralism and the Impurity of Value	174
8	Best Life Pluralism and Reason's Regret	199
9	Tragic Pluralism and Reason's Grief	231
10	Postscript on the Future: The Idea of Progress and	262
	the Avoidance of Despair	202
Bibliography		289
Index		297



Acknowledgments

For constributions to Reason's Grief, I am grateful to many. Tony Cunningham, Paul Davies, Robert Fudge, Danny Statman, and anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press read different versions of the manuscript at different stages of its development, providing invaluable feedback. Others provided responses to parts of the manuscript from which I was able to clarify and sharpen my understanding. Discussion with Lanny Goldman on the topic of the incomparability of values was especially helpful in this regard. Laurence Thomas and Henry Richardson were helpful in gaining research support for the project, and Noah Lemos was helpful in recommending the manuscript to Cambridge. Feedback from audiences at the Royal Institute of Philosophy Conference on Emotions at the University of Manchester, England, in 2001; at the British Society for Ethical Theory meeting in Glasgow, Scotland, in 2001; at the Virtue Ethics: Old and New Conference at the University of Canterbury, Christchurch, New Zealand, in 2002; at the Perspectives on Evil and Human Wickedness Conference in Prague, Czech Republic, in 2003; and at the Beijing International Conference on Democracy in Beijing, China, in 2004 was exceedingly helpful. So too has been the response of my students in several seminars I have taught here at William and Mary over recent years. Research leave was made possible by a Faculty Research Assignment granted by the College of William and Mary for the 2000-01 academic year and by a National Endowment for the Humanities Fellowship for the year 2001-02. For this assistance, I am most grateful.



x

Cambridge University Press 0521863287 - Reason's Grief: An Essay on Tragedy and Value George W. Harris Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgments

For permission to include revised material from articles published in *American Philosophical Quarterly* and *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice*, I thank these journals. For bringing the manuscript to print at Cambridge University Press, I am indebted to three people: Beatrice Rehl, for her editorial guidance through the review process; Sarah McColl, for her management of the production process; and Russell Hahn, for his excellent copyediting. Of course, I am deeply indebted to many others whom I cannot acknowledge here. I hope that they will rest assured that their contributions are not less cherished for their anonymity. I cannot, however, leave implicit my undying gratitude to my wife, Patty, and my wonderful daughters, Rachel and Jenny, for the support and love they provide for an incurably pensive husband and father.