Voting for Autocracy

Most autocracies today hold elections. Yet the role of autocratic elections and the behavior of voters and parties in these regimes often appear puzzling. Through the use of simple formal theory, quantitative analysis, and historic narrative, this book develops a broadly comparative theory of the survival and demise of "electoral autocracies" and the strategies they use to resolve intraparty conflict, divide and deter elite opponents, and win political loyalty from the masses. The book illustrates the theory with an analysis of the Mexican Institutional Revolutionary Party (PRI), one of the most resilient autocratic regimes of the twentieth century. An autocratic regime hid behind the facade of elections that were held with clockwork precision. Although their outcome was totally predictable, elections were not hollow rituals. The PRI gave millions of ordinary citizens a vested interest in the survival of the autocratic regime. Voters could not simply "throw the rascals out" of office because their choices were constrained by a series of strategic dilemmas that compelled them to support the autocrats. The book also explores the factors that led to the demise of the PRI and what lead to the transformation of autocratic elections into democratic ones.

Beatriz Magaloni is an assistant professor of political science at Stanford University. She is also affiliated with the Center for Democracy, Development, and the Rule of Law and the Latin American Center. She received her M.A. and Ph.D. in political science from Duke University and a law degree from ITAM. Her dissertation won the Gabriel Almond Award for best dissertation in comparative politics granted by the American Political Science Association. Articles she has written have appeared in the *Journal of Theoretical Politics, Política y Gobierno*, and edited volumes.

Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics

General Editor Margaret Levi University of Washington, Seattle

Assistant General Editor Stephen Hanson University of Washington, Seattle

Associate Editors

Robert H. BatesHarvard UniversityPeter LangeDuke UniversityHelen MilnerColumbia UniversityFrances RosenbluthYale UniversitySusan StokesYale UniversitySidney TarrowCornell UniversityKathleen ThelenNorthwestern UniversityErik M. WibbelsUniversity of Washington, Seattle

Other Books in the Series

Lisa Baldez, Why Women Protest: Women's Movements in Chile Stefano Bartolini, The Political Mobilization of the European Left, 1860–1980: The Class Cleavage Mark Beissinger, Nationalist Mobilization and the Collapse of the Soviet State Nancy Bermeo, ed., Unemployment in the New Europe Carles Boix, Democracy and Redistribution Carles Boix, Political Parties, Growth, and Equality: Conservative and Social Democratic Economic Strategies in the World Economy Catherine Boone, Merchant Capital and the Roots of State Power in Senegal, 1930-1985 Catherine Boone, Political Topographies of the African State: Territorial Authority and Institutional Change Michael Bratton and Nicolas van de Walle, Democratic Experiments in Africa: Regime Transitions in Comparative Perspective Michael Bratton, Robert Mattes, and E. Gyimah-Boadi, Public Opinion, Democracy, and Market Reform in Africa

Continued on pages following the Index

For Alberto

Voting for Autocracy

HEGEMONIC PARTY SURVIVAL AND ITS DEMISE IN MEXICO

BEATRIZ MAGALONI

Stanford University



> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521862479

© Beatriz Magaloni 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Magaloni, Beatriz.
Voting for autocracy : hegemonic party survival and its demise in Mexico / Beatriz Magaloni.
p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in comparative politics)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN-13: 978-0-521-86247-9 (hardback)
1. Partido Revolucionario Institucional. 2. Democratization – Mexico.
3. Hegemony – Mexico. 4. Politics, Practical – Mexico. 5. Mexico – Politics and government – 20th century. I. Title. II. Series.
JL1298.R34M34 2006
324.272'083-dc22

ISBN-13 978-0-521-86247-9 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-86247-7 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

Acknowledgments	page ix
INTRODUCTION	1
1 EQUILIBRIUM PARTY HEGEMONY	44
2 STRUCTURAL DETERMINANTS OF MASS SUPPORT FOR THE PRI	82
3 BUDGET CYCLES UNDER PRI HEGEMONY	98
4 THE POLITICS OF VOTE BUYING	122
5 JUDGING ECONOMIC PERFORMANCE IN HARD TIMES	151
6 IDEOLOGICAL DIVISIONS IN THE OPPOSITION CAMP	175
7 HOW VOTERS CHOOSE AND MASS COORDINATION DILEMMAS	1 193
8 ELECTORAL FRAUD AND THE GAME OF ELECTORAL TRANSITIONS	227
9 CONCLUSION	257
References	273
Index	291

vii

Acknowledgments

This book is the result of almost ten years of research. It started as a dissertation in the Department of Political Science at Duke University. My gratitude goes first to Robert Bates, my mentor, dissertation advisor, and a key influence in my perspective on the politics of development. This book also owes a great deal to two of the leading experts on parties and elections, John Aldrich, who also served as my dissertation advisor, and Herbert Kitschelt, who has closely watched my research as it has evolved over the course of these years. Most of all, I am grateful to Alberto Diaz, my intellectual companion, my most devoted reader, and the coauthor of many papers upon which critical aspects of this book's theory are based. This book also owes a great deal to Federico Estévez. No one understands Mexican politics better than he does. Not only does he know all the "nuts and bolts" of the PRI regime, he is also driven, like me, by a strong passion for empirical research. Throughout my years both as director of the Political Science Program at ITAM and as a faculty member at Stanford, Federico has remained a great friend, critical reader of my work, and coauthor in many projects. Numerous insights in my book are owed to him

This book was written while Alberto and I ventured in search of two academic positions in a foreign country. Alberto was originally hired as an assistant professor at UCLA, and I was hired at Stanford. We decided from the outset that our first priority was to be together with our children. I am extremely grateful to the Political Science Department at UCLA for hiring me as a visiting professor during Alberto's first year as assistant professor. Dan Posner, Barbara Geddes, and John Zaller were an incredible support that year. Zaller also read all my work, and my theoretical perspective benefited immensely from his comments.

Acknowledgments

During my years at Stanford, I have had the privilege of working with a distinguished group of scholars. I have learned much from Barry Weingast, my coauthor on several projects about Mexico. In addition, David Laitin has been a decisive influence. Teaching our graduate seminar on comparative politics with him allowed me to place my work within the broader questions that so centrally motivate comparative politics and to understand more fully the comparative relevance of my research. David has also read many chapters of this book and has provided useful feedback. Furthermore, Isabela Mares has been a great friend and colleague. Isabela and I coordinated the comparative speaker series in 2004, and many of our discussions during these seminars or at dinners with the speakers were a tremendous source of inspiration for my work. I am also grateful to Steven Haber, who shares my interest in understanding the politics of autocratic regimes, and who has a keen understanding of Mexico. I thank the Social Science History Institute that Steve directs for critical financial support in helping to pay for research assistance. Jim Fearon has also read and commented on several aspects of my theory. I am grateful for his sharp criticisms that pushed me to refine my arguments, and also for his being a great neighbor. Lastly, Mike McFaul and Terry Karl have also read parts of my research and given me useful comments. Thanks to both!

My research on Mexico has benefited from a large network of friends and colleagues. Special thanks go to several colleagues at ITAM, where I spent several years while doing field research. Denisse Dresser, Federico Estévez, Eric Magar, Alejandro Moreno, Alejandro Poiré, Jeff Weldon, and Margarita Mendoza made those years incredibly fulfilling. I am also thankful to my good friend Jacqueline Martínez, who provided me with invaluable electoral information (now available at the website of CIDAC) and her keen insight in understanding local politics in Mexico. I want to also thank my ITAM students, who served as critical sounding boards for some of the perspectives presented in this book. Also, I am grateful to some of my political science colleagues at CIDE with whom I interacted at different academic events and who helped me to understand Mexican politics better. María Amparo Casar deserves special mention.

Robert Bates, Alberto Diaz, Guillermo Trejo, and two anonymous reviewers deserve special credit for reading the entire manuscript and making detailed comments on each of the chapters. Their input was critical in putting the final manuscript together. I also thank those who commented on articles or individual chapters that were presented at academic conferences. Parts of Chapters 2 and 8 were presented at the conference Advances

Acknowledgments

and Setbacks in the Third Wave of Democratization in Latin America. I am grateful to Frances Hagopian, Scott Mainwaring, and Guillermo O'Donnell for their feedback. Several of the ideas that drive my voting model and Chapter 4 were presented at the conference Citizen-Politician Linkages in Democratic Politics, which took place at Duke University. I am particularly thankful to Herbert Kitschelt, Kanchan Chandra, and Luis Medina. Similar ideas were presented at a conference on vote buying that Alberto Diaz and I organized, Clientelism in Latin America: Theoretical and Comparative Perspectives, and at the conference Frontiers in Latin American Political Economy, both of these at Stanford. I thank Barbara Geddes, Miriam Golden, John Londregan, Jim Robinson, Susan Stokes, Aaron Tornel, and Leonard Wantchekon for their keen insights. I also presented several articles at annual meetings of the American Political Science Association. Particular thanks go to Gary Cox and Olga Shvetsova, who commented on aspects of my work that deal with voter coordination, and to William Keech, who commented on my work on electoral cycles.

I also want to thank the scholars and friends who have participated in various conferences on Mexican voting behavior. Some of these scholars have contributed to the survey data that is employed in several chapters of this book. Jorge Domínguez deserves special mention as a source of intellectual inspiration, and as one of the most critical readers of my work over the course of these years. I also thank the group of scholars involved in the Mexico 2000 Panel Study, particularly Chappell Lawson, for making the group possible, and also Kathleen Bruhn, Miguel Basañez, Roderic Camp, Wayne Cornelius, Joseph Klesner, James McCann, Alejandro Moreno, Pablo Parás, and Alejandro Poiré. I thank Alejandro Moreno, who has helped me to refine my understanding of Mexican voters, and Alejandro Poiré, who is my coauthor on several papers on voting behavior. My gratitude goes to Rafael Giménez, who allowed me to design a survey questionnaire used to test aspects of my theory about the divisiveness of the opposition and who made available the 1997 survey employed in Chapter 7. I thank Alonso Lujambio, Juan Molinar, and Jeffrey and Carolina Weldon, who gave me access to the Council Hall of the Federal Electoral Institute on the night of the 2000 presidential elections, when the PRI finally lost and yielded power peacefully.

I am also grateful to the superb research assistance of Vidal Romero, whose help was critical in writing Chapter 5. He has also assisted me in numerous other projects, and together with Tania has provided incredible friendship. I thank Arianna Sánchez, one of my most driven students from

Acknowledgments

ITAM (now a law student at Stanford), Sandra Pineda, and Marcela Gómez for helping me put together the dataset in Chapter 4 that allowed me to empirically assess key aspects of my theory of vote buying. My gratitude also goes to Alex Kuo, Jeffrey Lee, and especially to Matt Carnes for their laborious help in editing this book. I am grateful as well to Margaret Levy for her invaluable support and for including this book in the Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics series. Thanks also to Susan Stokes for her incisive comments and for patiently guiding this book through production. Lew Bateman was also a source of advice and encouragement throughout the process.

Finally, I want to thank my family and close friends. My sisters, Diana, Ana, and Claudia, are my best friends. Simply knowing that they are there together with their daughters provides an immense sense of security and a sense of home. My mother, the strongest person I know, is a central pillar of our family. Her support and love have been decicive in making these years more enjoyable. My father has transmitted to me since early childhood a passion for understanding and also a strong commitment to try my best always. This commitment has brought me far. My Aunt Kiki pushed me to leave Mexico and to seize the opportunities that an academic career in the United States could offer. My cousins, Kristof and Andras, and my brotherin-law, Michael, are also always close to my heart. My three children, Emilia, Nicolas, and now baby Mateo, are the joy of my life. They have taught me about devotion and unconditional love. I also want to thank Reme, Virginia, and Estela, who have provided love and support to our children and have allowed me to keep them close to me while I work at home (although, I must say, always with numerous distractions). However, as a friend once told me, "The whole point of being at home is being available." I also want to thank Lizy, Hernán, Jaana, Andres, Norma, Elvira, Francisco, Pilar, Tony, Mijal, Clara, Samuel, Vera, Alia, Cristian, Belen, Carmelita, Arianna, the Armitanos, Magdalena, and all the Leaping Lizards; the children and parents of Ohlone's room seven; and the loving Bing Nursery School community for being like a family to us and our children while in the United States.

This book is dedicated to my soul mate and partner, Alberto, who is the most loving and generous person I know. Without him, I probably would not have ventured in pursuit of an academic career in the United States. Juggling motherhood, my new status of immigrant, and a professional life would simply not have been possible without his constant support and optimism.