

Sovereignty, the WTO and Changing Fundamentals of International Law

The last decade of the twentieth century and the first of the twenty-first century will certainly rank high as a challenging period for the generally accepted assumptions of international law. The forces of "globalization," accompanied by striking changes in government institutions, a remarkable increase in NGO activity and advocacy, an intense emphasis on market economic ideas and a backlash against them, have chipped away at the fragile theoretical foundations of the international legal system as it has been generally accepted for centuries. The objective of this book is to explore the relationship between general international law (and its sovereignty-based assumptions) with the legal "constitution," jurisprudence, and practice of the WTO as an empirical case study of international economic law, all in the context of these twenty-first-century developments.

JOHN H. JACKSON is University Professor of Law at the Georgetown University Law Center. He joined the Georgetown Faculty after a distinguished career as Hessel E. Yntema Professor of Law at the University of Michigan. He has advised the United States and other governments and international organizations on international trade law, and has published widely in the area. In June of 2003, Professor Jackson was awarded the honorary degree, "Doctor Iuris Honoris Causa" from Hamburg University Faculty of Law. Also in June 2003, he was appointed by WTO Director-General, Dr. Supachai Panitchpadki, to the WTO Consultative Board, composed of eight "eminent persons," and chaired by Peter Sutherland. The Board released a report entitled "The Future of WTO: Addressing Institutional Challenges in the New Millennium," in January 2005. He has published widely in the area of international trade law, including his book The Jurisprudence of GATT and the WTO: Insights on Treaty Law and Economic Relations (Cambridge University Press).



Recent books in the Hersch Lauterpacht Memorial Lecture series

JAN PAULSSON
Denial of Justice in International Law
0 521 85118 1

Francisco orrego vicuna International Dispute Settlement in an Evolving Global Society: Constitutionalization, Accessibility, Privatization 0.521.84239.5

MARTTI KOSKENNIEMI
The Gentle Civilizer of Nations:
The Rise and Fall of International Law 1870–1960
0 521 62311 1 hardback
0 521 54809 8 paperback

THOMAS M. FRANCK Recourse to Force: State Action against Threats and Armed Attacks 0.521.82013.8



Sovereignty, the WTO and Changing Fundamentals of International Law

JOHN H. JACKSON





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521748414

© John H. Jackson 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006 First paperback edition 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-86007-9 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-74841-4 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables and other factual information given in this work are correct at time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuacy of such inforantion thereafter.



To Joan, who deserves much for constant support and intellectual companionship.



Preface

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-86007-9 - Sovereignty, the WTO and Changing Fundamentals of International Law John H. Jackson Frontmatter More information

Contents

	Table of statutes and regulations Table of cases		xiv xx
	rt I	Challenges to fundamental assumptions of international law	
1	Intr	oduction: international law and international	
	eco	nomic law in the interdependent world of the	
	twe	nty-first century	3
	1.1	A time of challenge and changing assumptions	3
	1.2	Facts on the ground: the world situation landscape –	
		change, interdependence, globalization, adjustment	8
	1.3	Implications for international law and its role for	
		international relations: challenges to the fundamental	
		logic and axioms of international law (a brief overview	
		of things to come)	13
	1.4	Contours and road map – the structure of this book	15
2	The	real world impinges on international law:	
	exp	loring the challenges to the fundamental	
	ass	umptions of international law and institutions	18
	2.1	Introduction to exploring the challenges and their	
		impacts on international law	18
	2.2	Circumstances and conditions	20
	2.3	International law and its discontents	32
	2.4	International economic law	46

xi



2.5

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-86007-9 - Sovereignty, the WTO and Changing Fundamentals of International Law John H. Jackson Frontmatter More information

Contents

International institutional law

	2.6	Some conclusions: the international law system challenged	54		
3	Sovereignty-modern: a new approach to an outdated				
	con	cept	57		
	3.1	Sovereignty and the fundamental logic of international law	57		
	3.2	Traditional Westphalian sovereignty concepts: outmoded and discredited?	62		
	3.3	Potentially valid policy objectives of sovereignty concepts	70		
	3.4	Perceptions and reflections for Part I: changing fundamentals of international law	76		
Pa	rt II	The WTO			
4		WTO as international organization: institutional			
		lution, structure, and key problems	81		
	4.1	The WTO as international economic law and its			
		relationship to general international law	81		
	4.2	The policy objectives and preferences for a WTO	84		
	4.3	Historical background: from Bretton Woods to Cancún and Hong Kong	91		
	4.4	The World Trade Organization: structure of the treaty			
		and the institution	104		
	4.5	Institutional problems of the WTO	110		
	4.6 4.7	WTO Rules and members' domestic legal systems Scope of the subject matter agenda for the WTO:	122		
		the question of competence	128		
5	The	WTO dispute settlement system	134		
	5.1	The WTO dispute settlement system – unique, a great			
		achievement, controversial	134		
	5.2	The bottom-up trial and error history of the GATT			
		dispute settlement system and the Uruguay Round			
		makeover	137		
	5.3	The multiple policy goals of international dispute			
		settlement: dilemmas, balancing, and competing			
		principles	145		

viii

49



More information

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-86007-9 - Sovereignty, the WTO and Changing Fundamentals of International Law John H. Jackson Frontmatter

Contents

	5.4	The current structure and operation of the WTO disput	
		settlement system	152
	5.5	A decade of WTO dispute settlement activity,	
		1995–2005	159
	5.6	Key jurisprudential questions I: the relation of WTO	100
		law to international law – sovereignty tensions	163
	5.7	Key jurisprudential questions II: structural doctrines	1.70
	5.0	channeling juridical techniques of decision	173
	5.8	Key jurisprudential questions III: treaty interpretation	182
	5.9	Key jurisprudential questions IV: dispute settlement	100
	5 10	reports and national law	192
	5.10	Key jurisprudential questions V: compliance and	105
	5 1 1	implementation	195
	5.11	Dispute settlement structural problems and proposed	100
	5 10	reforms	199
	5.12	Perspectives and conclusions for Part II: the lessons of the GATT/WTO system	204
		the GAT 17 W TO system	204
Pa	wt III	The search for solutions	
Ia		The scarch for solutions	
6	Poli	cy analytical approaches and thought	
		eriments	211
	6.1		
		Introduction to Part III and Chapter 6	211
	6.2	Introduction to Part III and Chapter 6 The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept	211 214
	6.2 6.3	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept	
		The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least)	214
	6.3	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional	214
	6.3	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about	214217
	6.3 6.4	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about market failure in the era of globalization	214217220
	6.36.46.5	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about market failure in the era of globalization Thinking constitutional The growing importance of juridical institutions	214217220222
	6.36.46.56.6	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about market failure in the era of globalization Thinking constitutional	214217220222
	6.36.46.56.6	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about market failure in the era of globalization Thinking constitutional The growing importance of juridical institutions Interface theory: managing globalization in a world of	214 217 220 222 227
7	6.3 6.4 6.5 6.6 6.7	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about market failure in the era of globalization Thinking constitutional The growing importance of juridical institutions Interface theory: managing globalization in a world of	214 217 220 222 227
7	6.3 6.4 6.5 6.6 6.7	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about market failure in the era of globalization Thinking constitutional The growing importance of juridical institutions Interface theory: managing globalization in a world of wide variation	214 217 220 222 227 230
7	6.3 6.4 6.5 6.6 6.7	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about market failure in the era of globalization Thinking constitutional The growing importance of juridical institutions Interface theory: managing globalization in a world of wide variation Strative applications	214 217 220 222 227 230
7	6.3 6.4 6.5 6.6 6.7	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about market failure in the era of globalization Thinking constitutional The growing importance of juridical institutions Interface theory: managing globalization in a world of wide variation strative applications Illustrative applications – grappling with detail and	214 217 220 222 227 230 234
7	6.3 6.4 6.5 6.6 6.7 Illus 7.1	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about market failure in the era of globalization Thinking constitutional The growing importance of juridical institutions Interface theory: managing globalization in a world of wide variation Strative applications Illustrative applications – grappling with detail and diversity	214 217 220 222 227 230 234
7	6.3 6.4 6.5 6.6 6.7 Illus 7.1	The sovereignty conundrum: slicing the concept Towards a policy analysis matrix: a three-dimensional puzzle (at least) Economics and markets: a thought experiment about market failure in the era of globalization Thinking constitutional The growing importance of juridical institutions Interface theory: managing globalization in a world of wide variation strative applications Illustrative applications – grappling with detail and diversity The WTO and its "constitution": institutional detail and	214 217 220 222 227 230 234 234



Contents

	7.4	Environmental policies	243
	7.5	Health, globalization, and international institutions	245
	7.6	Human rights and nation-state sovereignty	248
	7.7	Federalism examples: US and EU struggles with the	
		allocation of power	252
	7.8	The United Nations and the use of force:	
		constitutionalism evolving	256
8	Per	spectives and implications: some conclusions	258
		Appendix: Outline of the Uruguay Round treaty	
		establishing the World Trade Organization	269
No	Notes		271
Ind	lex		353



Preface

When I was invited in May 2001 to deliver the annual international law lecture series at the Cambridge University Lauterpacht Research Centre in November 2002, I was honored and also challenged to pursue further some thinking and writing about the interrelationship of international law and international economic law which I had already begun.

Little did I then realize, however, how complex and elaborate a preoccupation this task would be. At the time of the invitation, the events of September 11, 2001, had not yet occurred, and those events suddenly created an eruption of thinking and writing about general international law and its meaning for twenty-first-century international relations.

By the time I had prepared the lectures, it was apparent to me that there were added dimensions to the landscape which required exploration. The intellectual journey became longer, more perilous, and yet more interesting. The book is therefore substantially longer than the lectures, but still pursues the goal of being relatively compact.

Chapter 1 sets forth the overall logical structure of the book, and outlines the roadmap for the intellectual journey it represents, so that these need not be repeated here. However, a few general remarks may alert the reader to certain features of this book. For example, it is not designed to be a complete text on its subjects (international law and international economic law as represented by the World Trade Organization). This book only purports to provide an overall framework for thinking about those two subjects and how they interrelate, and an overview of their numerous conceptual problems and puzzles. In some sense this is two books pasted together, with bridges between them. It was not an easy project.

This book also is not designed to provide any "grand theory" of these subjects, but as stated several times in the text is about "queries rather



Preface

than theories." Its logic rests a great deal on empirical observation of one very complex, relatively new, and decidedly important international law institution, namely the World Trade Organization and particularly its dispute settlement system. The book's objective (hopefully at least partly realized) is to outline fundamental logical problems about existing international law concepts, and to use the WTO legal system as a source of empirically observed data to shed light on those logical problems of international law generally. The journey herein ends with Chapter 8, which reviews the way this is accomplished.

I wish to express my gratitude to the Cambridge University Lauterpacht Research Centre for inviting me to deliver the annual series of international law lectures which occurred in November 2002. The delightful hospitality both physical and intellectual of the Lauterpacht center for those lectures, and of its founder Professor Sir Elihu Lauterpacht and its director Professor James R. Crawford, as well as some of their colleagues such as Professor Phillip Allott, provided an extraordinary and memorable launch for further struggles with the conceptual difficulties of the subject of general international law and its relationship with international economic law. Certainly the Center and its colleagues truly represent the best perspectives of its namesake, Judge Sir Hersch Lauterpacht, who has inspired so many thoughtful participants and observers of international relations and its relation to legal norms.

I am also grateful for the support of the Georgetown University Law Center, its Dean Judy Areen, dean during most of the efforts for this book, and the remarkable GULC library regarding its subject. In addition I wish to recognize the support of the University of Michigan School of Law (where I continue to hold the title of Emeritus Professor) for many decades of sustenance in the then novel and difficult task of exploring the minefields (and boiler room) of international economic law.

In addition I particularly want to recognize and appreciate the remarkable and diligent assistance of my principal editorial and administrative assistant, Joanna Sokolow. Her research ability and computer command, as well as her constantly pleasant demeanor and interaction with others including my students, are hard to replicate in any environment. I also express my appreciation and gratitude to several student research assistants, particularly Isabelle Van Damme and Helge Zeitler.

Likewise I am indebted intellectually to many colleagues and other professional friends and associates, long conversations with whom have helped shape my thinking. In particular, some of the editors of the Journal



Preface

of International Economic Law and the American Journal of International Law with which I am associated, have assisted my thinking.

Over many decades of activity, observation, and thinking concerning international law and economic law I have benefited enormously from many profound and interesting writings of authors of many viewpoints, as well as numerous intense discussions (over dinners or otherwise) with friends and colleagues too numerous to mention here. Likewise I am grateful to a number of students and their work and discussions with me. Many of these students have gone on to remarkable careers in subjects related to these discussions, and maintain close contact with me so as to continue the learning process on both sides.

Finally, but distinctly not least, I thank my wife Joan not only for the family support and sustenance, but for the intellectual companionship she has provided, often stimulating directions of my thinking.



Table of statutes and regulations

Act of 24 September 1789, ch. 20, 9(b), 1 Stat. 73, 77, 287n-24

Act to Extend the Authority of the President under section 350 of the 1930 US Tariff Act, as amended, and for other purposes, 5 July 1945, Pub. L. 79–130, 59 Stat. 410, 304n11, 305n18

Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS), WTO Charter Annex 1C, 105, 227, 247, 347n29

Agricultural Adjustment Act, 1951 Amendments to Section 22 (f) of, , 66 Stat. 75 (US), 317n11

Agriculture, Agreement on, WTO Charter Annex 1A, Article 13, 336n6 Alien Tort Claims Act (ATC Act), 28 U.S.C. 1350 (2000) (US), 41, 287n–24

Antidumping Act of 1916 (US), 179–180

Articles of Agreement of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD), Jul. 22, 1944, 60 Stat. 1440, 2. U.N.T.S. 134, amended Dec. 16, 1965, 16 U.S.T. 1942, 606 U.N.T.S. 294, 338n11

Articles of Agreement of the International Monetary Fund (IMF), Jul. 22, 1944, 60 Stat. 1301; 2 U.N.T.S. 39, 338n11

Bill of Rights passed by Congress September 25, 1789, ratified December 15, 1791 (US), 349n9

Bretton-Woods Agreements Act of 1945, 22 U.S.C.A. secs. 286–86gg, 274n9, 312n3

Central America-Dominican Republic-United States Free Trade Agreement (CAFTA) (Final Text) (May 28, 2004), 340n8

Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe, Final Act of, Helsinki, Aug. 1, 1975, 289n35

Constitution of the Netherlands, Article 94, 23

Cotonou Agreement, 2000 O.J. L317/3 (Dec. 15, 2000), 280n27, 298n28

DSU (Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes). See WTO Charter, Annex 2

xiv



Table of statutes and regulations

Europe, Treaty Establishing a Constitution for, 2004 O.J. (C 310), Rome, Oct. 29, 2004, 44, 292n8, 313n15, 337n3, 349n7, 350n6

European Convention on Human Rights (Convention for the Protection of Human

Rights and Fundamental Freedoms), Rome, Nov. 4, 1950, Council of Europe CETS No. 005, 226, 249, 348n3

European Economic Community, Treaty Establishing (Treaty of Rome) Mar. 25,

Financial Services Agreement (GATS Annex), 115

Framework Convention on Tobacco Control, WHO Doc.

A/FCTC/INB2/2, 9 Jan. 2001, 246, 346n13

General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT)

1947, 105, 106

1957, 306n45

1994, 105, 128

Preamble, 84

Article I, 275n8

Article II, 96

Article III, 131, 142, 161, 178, 247, 275n8

Article III(2), 142-143, 186

Article III(4), 131, 186

Article XVI(1), 106

Article XX, 161, 165, 189-90

Article XX(g), 189

Article XXIII, 138–140, 152, 196–97

Article XXIV, 314n22

Article XXIV(12), 128

Article XXV, 107, 140

Article XXXIII, 298n27

Part I, 95

Part II, 95–96

Part III, 95

Protocol of Provisional Application (PPA), 82, 94-96

General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS). See WTO Charter Annex 1B,

Havana Charter for an International Trade Organization, Mar. 24, 1948, 84, 92–93, 129, 138, 314n1

Article 1, 85

Articles 92-97, 316n2

ICC Statute (Statute of the International Criminal Court), Article 98, 289n37

ICJ Statute. See Statute of the International Court of Justice

International Health Regulations (IHRs), 245, 246, 341n11, 346n6, 347n22

Luxembourg Accords, Jan. 29, 1966, 292n3

Mercosur Treaty Establishing a Common Market Between the Argentine Republic, the



Table of statutes and regulations

Federal Republic of Brazil, the Republic of Paraguay and the Republic of Uruguay, Mar. 26, 1991, 30 ILM 1041, 277n2, 280n26, 340–341n9

Mercosur Protocol of Brasilia for the Solution of Controversies, Decision 1/91, Art. 23 (Dec. 17, 1991) 36 ILM 691 (1997), 341n10

North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA), Dec. 17, 1992. Can.-Mex.-U.S., 32 ILM 289 & 605 (1993) (entered into force Jan. 1, 1994), 21, 126, 227, 340n7

North American Free Trade Agreement Act, P. L. No. 103-182, 102, 107 Stat. 2057, 2062 (1993), 19 U.S.C.A. sec. 3312 (a) (1), 279n20

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Declaration on International Investment and Multinational Enterprises & Principles of Corporate Governance, 289n35

Public Company Accounting Reform and Investor Protection Act of 2002, P. L. No. 107–204, 116 Stat. 745 (2002) (US), 278n11

Reciprocal Trade Agreements Act (1934/1945) (US), 92-94

Restatement (Third) of the Foreign Relations Law of the United States, Section 114 (1987), 280n24

Rome, Treaty of (Treaty Establishing the European Economic Community), Mar. 25, 1957, 306n45

Rules of Professional Responsibility for Attorneys (Sarbanes-Oxley Act), 15 U.S.C.S. 7201 (2003), 278n11

Safeguards, Agreement on, WTO Charter Annex 1A, Article 12(5), 333n15 Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures, Agreement on the Application of (SPS), WTO Charter Annex 1A, 161, 247, 347n26

Sarbanes-Oxley Act (Rules of Professional Responsibility for Attorneys), 15 U.S.C.S. 7201 (2003), 278n11

Statute of the International Court of Justice

Article 38(1), 35, 284n5

Article 38(1)(b), 39

Article 38(3), 285n12

Article 59, 175, 326n8

Statute of the International Criminal Court (ICC), Article 98, 289n37

Tariff Act (1930) (US), 92

Technical Barriers to Trade (TBT), Agreement on, WTO Charter Annex 1A, 247, 318n23, 347n27

Telecomms Agreement (GATS Annex), 115

Tobacco Control, Framework Convention on, WHO Doc. A/FCTC/INB2/2, Jan. 9, 2001, 246, 346n13

Trade Act of 1974 (US), Sections 301–310, 178–79, 313n4, 327n19, 327n21, 334n1

xvi



Table of statutes and regulations

Trade Act of 2002 (US), Title XXI, 307n57

Trade Policy Review Mechanism (TRPM), WTO Charter Annex 3, 105, 107

Trade Promotion Authority Act of 2002 (TPA Act) (US), 307n57

Treaty Establishing a Common Market Between the Argentine Republic, the Federal Republic of Brazil, the Republic of Paraguay and the Republic of Uruguay (Mercosur), Mar. 26, 1991, 30 ILM 1041, 277n2, 280n26, 340–41n9

Treaty Establishing a Constitution for Europe, 2004 O.J. (C 310), Rome, Oct. 29, 2004, 44, 292n8, 313n15, 337n3, 349n7, 350n6

Treaty Establishing the European Economic Community, Mar. 25, 1957 (Treaty of Rome), 306n45

Treaty of Westphalia (1648), 62-63

TRIPS (Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights), WTO Charter Annex 1C, 105, 227, 247, 347n29

TRPM (Trade Policy Review Mechanism), WTO Charter Annex 3, 105, 107 UN Charter, 223, 225

Article 2(4), 256

Article 17(2), 292n7

Article 51, 256

Article 94, 168

Chapter VII, 256

UNCLOS III (Third UN Conference on the Law of the Sea), Rule 37, UN Doc. A/Conf/62/30/Rev.1; 13 ILM 1205 (1974), 280n28

UNCTAD (UN Conference on Trade and Development), UN Doc. A/5479, 280n28

Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes (DSU). See WTO Charter, Annex 2

Understanding Regarding Notification, Consultation, Dispute Settlement and Surveillance, Nov. 28, 1979, GATT B.I.S.D. (26th Supp.) at 210 (1980), 140–141, 317n10, 318n17

UPU Congresses, Art. 19.1 of the Rules of Procedures of, 280n28 *Uruguay Round Agreements Act* (US)

P. L. No. 103-465, 102, 108 Stat. 4815, 19 U.S.C.A. sec. 3512(a)(1) (US), 279n20

section 102, Pub. L.No. 103-182, 102, 107 Stat. 2057, 289n40

US-Australia Free Trade Agreement (Final Text) (May 18, 2004), 340n8

US-Chile Free Trade Agreement (Final Text) (Jun. 6, 2003), entered into force Jan. 1, 2004, 340n8

US-Singapore Free Trade Agreement (Final Text) (May 6, 2003), entered into force Jan. 1, 2004, 340n8

xvii



Table of statutes and regulations

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT), 4, 14, 45, 52, 161, 170, 176, 183, 187, 193, 194, 196, 212, 225, 268, 289n34, 328n3 Article 2.1(a), 288n32 Article 31(1), 291n14, 292n5 Article 31(3), 323n12 Article 31(3)(b), 331n3 Articles 31 and 32, 158, 166–67, 184 Westphalia, Treaty of (1648), 62–63 World Health Organization (WHO) Constitution, 246 Preamble, 345–346n1, 346n7 Article 19, 346n12 Article 22, 346n15 Article 75, 347n21 WTO Charter (Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization), 104–106, 269-70, 306n36 Annex 1A, Multilateral Agreements on Trade in Goods Agreement on Agriculture, Article 13, 336n6 Agreement on Implementation of Article VI, 324n17, 324n20 Agreement on Safeguards, Article 12(5), 333n15 Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade (TBT), 247, 318n23, 347n27 Agreement on the Application of Sanitary and Phytosanitary Measures (SPS), 161, 247, 347n26 GATT 1994, 105, 128 (See also General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade) Annex 1B, General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS), 105, 162–163, 242, 315n11 Annex on Financial Services & Annex on Negotiations on Basic Telecommunications, 115 Article VI(4), 133 Annex 1C, Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS), 105, 227, 247, 347n29 Annex 2, Understanding on Rules and Procedures Governing the Settlement of Disputes (DSU), 105, 113, 144–145, 152, 158–59 Article 1, 145, 319n4 Article 3, 146, 147 Article 3(2), 148, 183, 191, 332n7 Article 3(3), 147–48 Article 3(8), 318n24, 332n11 Article 5, 319n2

xviii

Article 12, 320n14

Article 11, 154, 180, 327n25



Table of statutes and regulations

Article 12(2), 183 Article 13, 155, 181 Article 15, 320n14 Article 16, 320n14, 320n15 Article 17(6), 170, 180, 181, 324n18, 324n19, 325n23, 325n25, 327n26, 328n29 Article 17(6)(i), 328n30 Article 17(6)(ii), 170–71 Article 19(1), 332n10 Article 19(2), 332n7 Article 21(1), 324n16 Article 21(6), 324n16 Article 22, 332n12 Article 22(1), 324n14 Article 22(2), 324n15 Article 22(4), 327n23 Article 22(6), 327n23, 332n13 Article 23, 319n4 Article 23(2), 124 Article 25, 319n3 Proposed Text by Mexico, WTO Doc. Amendments to, TN/DS/W/40, Jan. 27, 2003, 332n14 Appendix 3, 320n14 Rules of Conduct, WTO Doc. WT/DSB/RC/1, Dec.11, 1996, 319n5 Annex 3, Trade Policy Review Mechanism (TRPM), 105, 107 Annex 4, Plurilateral Agreements, 106, 115 Preamble, 84–86 Article IX, 108, 159, 310n6, 310n7 Article IX(2), 343n1 Article IX(8), 310n9 Article X, 343n2 Article XI, 308n8, 309n6 Article XII, 308n8 Article XIII, 109, 308n8 Article XVI, 91 Article XVI(1), 176 Article XVI(3), 332n5 Article XVI(4), 124 Wye River Memorandum, Oct. 23, 1998, 1sr.-PLO, 37 ILM 1251 (1998), 298n26

xix



Table of cases

Alvarez-Machain case

SOSA v. Alvarez-Machain, No 03-339 and 03-485, June 29, 2004, 124 S.Ct. 2739, 279n23, 287n23

United States v. Alvarez-Machain, 504 U.S. 655 (1992), 40-41, 287n22

Arrest Warrant of 11 April 2000 (Dem. Rep. Congo v. Belg.), 41 ILM 536 (2002) (International Court of Justice), 294n3

Asbestos case

EC-Measures Affecting the Prohibition of Asbestos and Asbestos Products, WTO Doc. WT/DS135/AB/R, adopted Mar. 12, 2001, 186, 247, 320n17, 330n9, 331n2

EC-Measures Affecting Asbestos and Asbestos-Containing Products, WTO Doc. WT/DS135/AB/R, adopted Apr. 5, 2001, 327n27

Australia – Measures affecting Importation of Salmon, WTO Doc. WT/DS18/AB/R, adopted Nov. 6, 1998, 347n28

Australian Subsidy on Ammonium Sulphate, Apr. 3, 1950, GATT B.I.S.D. (Vol. II) at 188 (1952), 317n6, 317n7

Banco Nacional de Cuba v. Sabbatino, 376 U.S. 398, 84 S.Ct. 923, 11 L.Ed.2d 804 (1964), 40, 287n21

Beef Hormones case

EC – Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones), WTO Docs. WT/DS26 & 48/AB/R, adopted Jan. 16, 1998, 328n31, 328n33

EC – Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones), WTO Docs. WT/DS26 & 48/AB/R, adopted Feb. 13, 1998, 154, 155, 161, 171, 182, 247, 319n7, 322n12, 325n26, 325n27, 329n4, 347n28

US – Continued Suspension of Obligations in the EC – Hormones Dispute (WT/DS320) and Canada – Continued Suspension of Obligations in the EC



Table of cases

- Hormones Dispute (WT/DS321), WTO Docs. WT/DS320/8 & 321/8, of Aug. 2, 2005, 319–320n11
- Biret International SA v. Council, Case C-93/02 P, 2003, ECR I-10497, 314n18
- Bush v. Gore, 531 U.S. 98 (2000), 253, 350n1
- Byrd Amendment case (US Continued Dumping and Subsidy Offset Act of 2000), WTO Docs. WT/ DS217 & 234/AB/R, adopted Jan. 16, 2003, 180, 323n9, 327n24
- Canada Import, Distribution, and Sale of Alcoholic Drinks by Canadian Provincial Marketing Agencies, GATT B.I.S.D. 37(1989), Mar. 22, 1988, and GATT B.I.S.D. 27 (1993), Feb. 18, 1992, 314n21
- Canada Measures Affecting the Export of Certain Aircraft, WTO Doc. WT/DS70/AB/R, adopted Aug. 20, 1999, 292n10
- Certain Expenses of the United Nations (Art. 17, para. 2 of the Charter), Advisory Opinion of 20 July 1962 (International Court of Justice), 292n7
- Charming Betsy case (Murray v. The Schooner Charming Betsy), 6 U.S. (2 Cranch) 64, 2 L.Ed. 208 (1804), 124–25, 193, 279n24, 287n20, 313n5, 331n4
- Chevron U.S.A. Inc. v. Natural Resources Defense Council, Inc. et. al., 467 U.S. 837 (1984), 325n22
- Citrus case (EEC Tariff Treatment of Citrus Products from Certain Mediterranean Countries), L/5776, 317n14
- Commission v. Germany, Case 61/94, 1996 E.C.R. I-3989 (European Court of Justice), 290n40
- Continental Shelf case (Tunisia/Libya), 1982 ICJ Rep. 18 (International Court of Justice), 291n15
- Corus Staal BV v. Dept. of Commerce, Fed. Cir. No. 04–1107, Jan. 21, 2005, 395 F.3d 1343, 331n8
- Cotton case (US Subsidies on Upland Cotton), WTO Docs. WT/DS267/AB/R & WT/DS267/R, both adopted Mar. 21, 2005, 283n52, 283n53, 308n57, 322n20, 336n6, 341n15, 341n16, 342n18
- Dem. Rep. Congo v. Belg. (Arrest Warrant of 11 April 2000), 41 ILM 536 (2002) (International Court of Justice), 294n3
- EC Export Subsidies on Sugar (Sugar case), WTO Docs. WT/DS265/R, WT/DS266/R, WT/DS283/R, panel Reports on complaints by Australia, Brazil, and Thailand, adopted May 19, 2005, 283n52, 308n57, 322n21, 341n16, 342n18
- EC Imposition of Anti-Dumping Duties on Imports of Cotton Yarn from Brazil,



Table of cases

- WTO Doc. ADP/137, adopted by the ADP Committee, Oct. 30, 1995, 323n1
- EC Measures Affecting the Approval and Marketing of Biotech Products (GMO case), WTO Docs. WT/DS291/27, WT/DS292/21, & WT/DS293/21 (ongoing case), 319n9, 328n32
- EC Measures Affecting Asbestos and Asbestos-Containing Products (Asbestos case), WTO Doc. WT/DS135/AB/R, adopted Apr. 5, 2001, 327n27
- EC Measures Affecting the Prohibition of Asbestos and Asbestos Products (Asbestos case), WTO Doc. WT/DS135/AB/R, adopted Mar. 12, 2001, 186, 247, 320n17, 330n9, 331n2
- EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones) (Beef Hormones case), WTO Docs. WT/DS26 & 48/AB/R
 - adopted Jan. 16, 1998, 328n31, 328n33
 - adopted Feb. 13, 1998, 154, 155, 161, 171, 182, 247, 319n7, 322n12, 325n26, 325n27, 329n4, 347n28
- EEC Payments and Subsidies Paid to Processors and Producers of Oilseeds and Related Animal Feed Proteins, Jan. 25, 1990, GATT B.I.S.D. (37th Supp.) at 37 (1990), 318n22
- EEC Tariff Treatment of Citrus Products from Certain Mediterranean Countries (Citrus case), L/5776, 317n14
- Ethiopia v. South Africa/Liberia, 1966 ICJ Rep. 6 (International Court of Justice), 292n7
- Filartiga v. Pena-Irala, 630 F.2d. 876 (2d Circ. 1980), 287n20
- France v. Turkey (S.S. Lotus case), 1927 PCIJ (Ser. A) No. 10, 52, 262, 285n8, 292n9
- French Assistance to Exports of Wheat and Wheat Flour, Nov. 21, 1958, GATT B.I.S.D. (7th Supp.) at 46 (1959), 318n16
- FSC case (US Tax Treatment for "Foreign Sales Corporations")
 - Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by the EC, WTO Doc. WT/DS108/AB/RW, adopted Jan. 29, 2002, 321n22
 - WTO Docs. WT/DS108/R & WT/DS108/AB/R, adopted Mar. 20, 2000, 321n22, 342n21
 - Recourse to Arbitration by the United States under Article 22.6 of the DSU and Article 4.11 of the SCM Agreement, WTO Doc. WT/DS108/ARB, circulated Aug. 30, 2002, 321n22
- Fuji Film case (Japan Measures Affecting Consumer Photographic Film and Paper), WTO Doc. WT/DS44/R, adopted Apr. 22, 1998 (not appealed), 181, 327n28
- German Duty on Sardines case (Oct. 31, 1952), GATT B.I.S.D. (1st Supp.) at 53 (1953), 317n7

xxii



Table of cases

- GMO case (EC Measures Affecting the Approval and Marketing of Biotech Products), WTO Docs. WT/DS291/27, WT/DS292/21, & WT/DS293/21 (ongoing case), 319n9, 328n32
- Hermès v. FHT, Case C-53/96, 1998 E.C.R. I-3603 (European Court of Justice), 290n40
- Interfood v. Hauptzollamt Hamburg, Case 92/71, 1972 E.C.R. 231 (European Court of Justice), 289–90n40
- Japan Measures Affecting Consumer Photographic Film and Paper (Fuji Film case), WTO Doc. WT/DS44/R, adopted Apr. 22, 1998 (not appealed), 181, 327n28
- Japan Taxes on Alcoholic Beverages, WTO Doc. WT/DS8, 10 & 11/AB/R, adopted Nov. 1, 1996, 161, 166–168, 176, 186, 187, 320n16, 322n10, 323n5, 323n11, 327n11, 329n7, 331n5
- Korea Measures Affecting Government Procurement, WTO Doc. WT/DS163/R, adopted Jun. 19, 2000, 291n16
- Legal Consequences for States of the Continuing Presence of South Africa in Namibia (South West Africa) notwithstanding Security Council Resolution 276 (1970), Advisory Opinion 1971 ICJ Rep. 16 (International Court of Justice), 291–92n1
- Léon Van Parys NV v. Belgisch Interventie-en Restitutiebureau (BIRB), Case C-377/02, Mar. 1, 2005 (not yet published), 314n18
- Lotus case (France v. Turkey), 1927 PCIJ (Ser. A) No. 10, 52, 262, 285n8, 292n9
- Malaysia Prohibition of Imports of Polyethylene and Polypropylene, WTO Doc. WT/DS1, requested Jan. 10, 1995, 323n3
- Marbury v. Madison, 5 U.S. 137 (1803), 198, 317n6, 349n11
- McCulloch v. Maryland, 4 Wheat. 316 (1819), 292n6
- Murray v. The Schooner Charming Betsy, 6 U.S. (2 Cranch) 64, 2 L.Ed. 208 (1804), 124–125, 193, 279n24, 287n20, 313n5, 331n4
- Netherlands Measures of Suspension of Obligations to the United States, Nov. 8, 1952, GATT B.I.S.D. (1st Supp.) at 32 (1953), 317n11, 332n9
- Nicaragua Case, 1986 ICJ Rep. 3 (International Court of Justice), 291n15
- Oil Fee or Superfund case (US Taxes on Petroleum and Certain Imported Substances), GATT B.I.S.D. (34th Supp.), at 136 (1988), 142, 143, 178, 317n13, 327n16
- The Paguete Habana, 175 U.S. 677 (1900), 287n20
- Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pa. v. Casey, 505 U.S. 833 (1992), 174, 326n4
- Roe v. Wade, 410 U.S. 113 (1973), 174, 326n5

xxiii



Table of cases

- SA CNL-SUCAL NV v. HAG GF AG, Case C-10/89, 1990 E.C.R., I-3711 (European Court of Justice), 326n6
- Shrimp-Turtle case (US Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products, WTO Doc. WT/DS58/AB/R, adopted Nov. 6, 1998), 150, 161, 177, 187–191, 276n2, 278n14, 294n5, 322n14, 327n14, 330n13, 330n17, 331n19, 331n21
- SOSA v. Alvarez-Machain, No 03-339 and 03-485, June 29, 2004, 124 S.Ct. 2739, 279n23, 287n23
- South West Africa (Ethiopia v. South Africa/Liberia), 1966 ICJ Rep. 6 (International Court of Justice), 292n7
- South West Africa (Legal Consequences for States of the Continuing Presence of South Africa in Namibia notwithstanding Security Council Resolution 276 (1970)), Advisory Opinion 1971 ICJ Rep. 16 (International Court of Justice), 291–92n1
- Spain Measures Concerning Domestic Sale of Soybean Oil, June 17, 1981, L/5142, 318n16
- S.S. Lotus Case (France v. Turkey), 1927 PCIJ (Ser. A) No. 10, 52, 262, 285n8, 292n9
- Steel Safeguards case (US Definitive Safeguard Measures on Imports of Certain Steel Products), WTO Docs. WT/DS248, 249, 251–254, 258, & 259/R, adopted Nov. 10, 2003, 176, 198, 327n12, 341n15
- Sugar case (EC Export Subsidies on Sugar), WTO Docs. WT/DS265/R, WT/DS266/R, WT/DS283/R, panel Reports on complaints by Australia, Brazil, and Thailand, adopted May 19, 2005, 283n52, 308n57, 322n21, 341n16, 342n18
- Superfund or Oil Fee case (US Taxes on Petroleum and Certain Imported Substances), GATT B.I.S.D. (34th Supp.), at 136 (1988), 142, 143, 178, 317n13, 327n16
- Timken Company v. United States, Jan. 16, 2004, 354 F.3d 1334, 331n8 Tuna-Dolphin cases
 - US Prohibition of Imports of Tuna and Tuna Products from Canada, GATT Docs. L/5198 29S/91, adopted Feb. 22, 1982, 190, 331n22
 - US Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (Tuna I), GATT Docs. DS21/R 39S/155, adopted Sept. 3, 1991, 190, 278n14, 331n22
 - *US Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (Tuna II)*, GATT Doc. DS29/R, adopted Jun. 16, 1994, 27n14, 190, 323n1, 331n22
- Tunesia/Libya Continental Shelf Case, 1982 ICJ Rep. 18 (International Court of Justice), 291n15
- United States Anti-Dumping Act of 1916, WTO Docs. WT/DS136/AB/R & WT/DS162/AB/R, adopted Sept. 26, 2000, 325n25

xxiv



Table of cases

- United States v. Alvarez-Machain, 504 U.S. 655 (1992), 40–41, 287n22 United States v. Palestine Liberation Organization, 695 F.Supp. 1456 (S.D.N.Y. 1988), 313n6
- Uruguayan Recourse to Article XXIII, Nov. 16, 1962, GATT B.I.S.D. (11th Supp.) at 95 (1963), 318n15
- US Anti-Dumping Act of 1916, WTO Docs. WT/DS136/R & WT/DS136/AB/R, adopted Sept. 26, 2000, 327n22
- US Continued Dumping and Subsidy Offset Act of 2000 (Byrd Amendment case), WTO Docs. WT/ DS217 & 234/AB/R, adopted Jan. 16, 2003, 180, 323n9, 327n24
- US Continued Suspension of Obligations in the EC Hormones Dispute (WT/DS320) and Canada Continued Suspension of Obligations in the EC Hormones Dispute (WT/DS321) (Beef Hormones case), WTO Docs. WT/DS320/8 & 321/8, of Aug. 2, 2005, 319-320n11
- US Countervailing Measures Concerning Certain Products from the European Communities, WTO Doc. WT/DS212/AB/R, adopted Jan. 8, 2003, 315n10
- US Definitive Safeguard Measures on Imports of Certain Steel Products (Steel Safeguards case), WTO Docs. WT/DS248, 249, 251–254, 258, & 259/R, adopted Nov. 10, 2003, 176, 198, 327n12, 341n15
- US Import Prohibition of Certain Shrimp and Shrimp Products (Shrimp-Turtle case), WTO Doc. WT/DS58/AB/R, adopted Nov. 6, 1998, 150, 161, 177, 187–91, 276n2, 278n14, 294n5, 322n14, 327n14, 330n13, 330n17, 331n19, 331n21
- US Imposition of Countervailing Duties on Certain Hot-Rolled Lead and Bismuth Carbon Steel Products Originating in France, Germany and the United Kingdom WTO Doc. SCM/185, Nov. 15, 1994 (not adopted), 323n1 WTO Doc. WT/DS138/AB/R, adopted Jun. 7, 2000, 325n21
- US Measures Affecting Alcoholic and Malt Beverages, GATT B.I.S.D. 39 (1992) 206, 314n21
- US Measures Affecting the Cross-Border Supply of Gambling and Betting Services, WTO Doc. WT/DS285/R, adopted Apr. 20, 2005 (subject to appellate changes), 322n18, 322n19
- US Measures Affecting Imports of Woven Wool Shirts and Blouses from India, WTO Doc. WT/DS33/R, adopted 23 May 1997, 325n26
- US Prohibition of Imports of Tuna and Tuna Products from Canada, GATT Docs. L/5198 29S/91, adopted Feb. 22, 1982, 190, 331n22
- US Restrictions on Imports of Cotton and Man-Made Fibre Underwear WTO Doc. WT/DS24/AB/R, adopted Feb. 25, 1997, 308n57, 319n3, 341n16

XXV



Table of cases

- WTO Doc. WT/DS24/R, adopted Feb. 25, 1998, 325n26
- US Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (Tuna I), GATT Docs. DS21/R 39S/155, adopted Sept. 3, 1991, 190, 278n14, 331n22
- US Restrictions on Imports of Tuna (Tuna II), GATT Doc. DS29/R, adopted Jun. 16, 1994, 27n14, 190, 323n1
- US Sections 301–310 of the Trade Act of 1974, WTO Doc. WT/DS152/R, adopted Jan. 27, 2000 (not appealed), 313n4, 327n19, 327n21, 334n1
- US Standards for Reformulated and Conventional Gasoline
 - WTO Doc. WT/DS2/AB/R, adopted Jan. 29, 1996, 161, 165–166, 177, 278n14, 320n18
 - WTO Doc. WT/DS2/AB/R, adopted Apr. 26, 1996, 322n9
 - WTO Doc. WT/DS2/AB/R, adopted May 20, 1996, 323n2
 - WTO Doc. WT/DS4/AB/R, adopted May 20, 1996, 161, 165–166, 177, 278n14, 320n18
- US Subsidies on Upland Cotton (Cotton case) , WTO Docs. WT/DS267/AB/R & WT/DS267/R, both adopted Mar. 21, 2005, 283n52, 283n53, 308n57, 322n20, 336n6, 341n15, 341n16, 342n18
- US Sunset Reviews of Anti-Dumping Measures on Oil Country Tubular Goods from Argentina, WTO Doc. WT/DS268/AB/R, adopted Dec. 17, 2004, 327n15
- US Tax Treatment for "Foreign Sales Corporations" (FSC case)
 - Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by the EC, WTO Doc. WT/DS108/AB/RW, adopted Jan. 29, 2002, 321n22
 - WTO Docs. WT/DS108/R & WT/DS108/AB/R, adopted Mar. 20, 2000, 321n22, 342n21
 - Recourse to Arbitration by the United States under Article 22.6 of the DSU and Article 4.11 of the SCM Agreement, WTO Doc. WT/DS108/ARB, circulated Aug. 30, 2002, 321n22
- US Taxes on Petroleum and Certain Imported Substances (Oil Fee or Superfund case), GATT B.I.S.D. (34th Supp.), at 136 (1988), 142, 143, 178, 317n13, 327n16