

**UNITED STATES – DEFINITIVE SAFEGUARD  
 MEASURES ON IMPORTS OF CERTAIN  
 STEEL PRODUCTS**

**Final Reports of the Panel**

WT/DS248/R, WT/DS249/R,  
 WT/DS251/R, WT/DS252/R,  
 WT/DS253/R, WT/DS254/R,  
 WT/DS258/R, WT/DS259/R\*

*Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body  
 on 10 December 2003  
 as Modified by the Appellate Body Report*

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION .....	3301
A. Factual Background .....	3301
1. Initiation of Safeguards Investigation by the USITC .....	3301
2. USITC Injury Determination .....	3302
3. Remedy Recommendation by the USITC .....	3305
4. Request for Supplementary Information .....	3306
5. Trade Policy Staff Committee Actions .....	3307
6. Presidential Proclamation.....	3307
7. Country Exclusions .....	3309
8. Product Exclusions.....	3310
II. WTO PROCEDURAL ASPECTS.....	3311
A. Consultations under Article 12.3 of the Agreement on Safeguards.....	3311
B. Dispute Settlement Consultations .....	3312
C. Single Panel under Article 9.1 of the DSU .....	3312
III. CLAIMS MADE BY THE COMPLAINANTS .....	3318
A. European Communities.....	3318
B. Japan .....	3319
C. Korea.....	3320
D. China.....	3322
E. Switzerland .....	3323
F. Norway .....	3324
G. New Zealand .....	3325

\* WT/DS259/R and Corr.1.

---

 Report of the Panel
 

---

	Page
H. Brazil.....	3326
IV. CONCLUSIONS, RECOMMENDATIONS AND SUGGESTIONS REQUESTED BY THE COMPLAINANTS.....	3327
A. European Communities.....	3327
B. Japan.....	3329
C. Korea.....	3330
D. China.....	3331
E. Switzerland.....	3332
F. Norway.....	3333
G. New Zealand.....	3335
H. Brazil.....	3336
V. ORGANIZATIONAL MEETING – REQUEST FOR PRELIMINARY RULINGS.....	3337
VI. THE PANEL'S WORKING PROCEDURES.....	3339
VII. ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES.....	3342
A. Condition of the US Steel Industry.....	3342
1. The Complainants' Assessment of the US Domestic Steel Industry.....	3342
(a) Main Characteristics of the US Steel Industry ...	3342
(b) History of the US Steel Industry.....	3343
(c) Evolution of the US Steel Industry.....	3344
(d) Relative Competitiveness of Integrated Producers and Minimills.....	3347
(e) Impact of Competition Between Minimills and Integrated Producers.....	3350
(f) Conclusions.....	3353
2. The United States' Assessment of its Domestic Steel Industry.....	3353
B. Legal and Analytical Framework.....	3355
1. Standard of Interpretation.....	3355
2. Standard of Review.....	3360
3. Burden of Proof.....	3362
4. Methodologies.....	3364
5. Duty to Explain – Substantive Versus Procedural Obligations.....	3370
6. Judicial Economy.....	3378
C. Unforeseen Developments.....	3379
1. Introduction.....	3379
2. The Requirements of Article XIX:1(a) of GATT 1994 and Article 3.1 of the Agreement on Safeguards.....	3380

		US - Steel Safeguards
		Page
	(a)	Introduction..... 3380
	(b)	Legal Standard..... 3381
	(c)	What Amounts to "unforeseen developments"? ..... 3382
	(i)	The Russian and Asian Crises ..... 3382
	(ii)	The Strength of the US Economy and the Appreciation of the US dollar..... 3384
	(iii)	Macroeconomic Events ..... 3386
	(d)	"as a result of unforeseen developments" ..... 3387
	(i)	Logical Connection to Increased Imports and Conditions as to Cause or Threaten Serious Injury ..... 3387
	(ii)	Logical Connection to Concession ..... 3391
	(e)	The Timing of Unforeseen Developments ..... 3393
	(f)	Demonstration of "unforeseen developments" ... 3397
	(i)	Competent Authority's Report ..... 3397
	(ii)	The Need for a Reasoned and Adequate Explanation..... 3400
		Sufficiency and Representativeness of Data ..... 3400
		The USITC's Explanation..... 3404
	(iii)	Opportunity for Interested Parties to Present their Views to the USITC ..... 3409
	(iv)	The Timing of the Explanation of "unforeseen developments" ..... 3411
D.		"A Product" ..... 3412
	1.	Order of Identification of the Imported Product and the Domestic Industry ..... 3412
	2.	Defining/Identifying the "imported product" ..... 3415
	(a)	Specificity of the Imported Product..... 3415
	(b)	Purpose of Specific Identification of the Imported Products ..... 3420
	(c)	Grouping ..... 3421
	(d)	Parameters for Identifying the Imported Product ..... 3424
	(i)	Likeness..... 3424
	(ii)	Tariff Lines..... 3424
	(iii)	Consensus on Parameters?..... 3427
	3.	Methodology Used by the USITC in Determining the "imported product" ..... 3429
	(a)	Identification of the Imported Product ..... 3429

Report of the Panel

	Page
(b) Grouping .....	3429
4. Measure-Specific Argumentation .....	3433
(a) CCFRS .....	3433
(i) Grouping.....	3433
(ii) Market and Price for CCFRS.....	3435
(iii) Different Remedy on Slab .....	3437
(b) Tin Mill Products .....	3438
(c) FFTJ .....	3439
E. Definition of the Domestic Industry Producing Products that are Like or Directly Competitive with the Imported Product.....	3439
1. Introduction.....	3439
2. Defining/Identifying the "like product".....	3440
(a) Guidance in Prescribing a Definition .....	3440
(b) Relevance of Definition of Like Product under other WTO Agreements and Existing GATT/WTO Jurisprudence .....	3441
(i) Physical Properties, End-Uses, Consumer Perception and Tariff Classification .....	3444
(ii) Production Processes .....	3447
(iii) Competition.....	3455
(c) Relevance of Like Product Definitions Used in the Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duty Contexts.....	3458
3. Comparison of Imported Product and Domestic Like Product .....	3459
4. "Directly competitive" Products.....	3462
5. Identification of Domestic Producers.....	3463
6. Burden of Proof.....	3463
7. Measure-Specific Argumentation .....	3465
(a) CCFRS .....	3465
(i) General .....	3465
(ii) Like Product Criteria .....	3468
General .....	3468
Physical Properties .....	3471
End-Use .....	3474
Consumer Perception.....	3478
Tariff Classification .....	3479
Production Processes .....	3481
Marketing Channels.....	3486

		US - Steel Safeguards
		Page
	Competition.....	3486
(iii)	Relevance of Other Like Product Definitions in this Case.....	3487
(iv)	Like Product Definitions Used in the Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duty Contexts.....	3490
(v)	Relevance of Like Product Definitions in Previous Safeguards Investigations ....	3492
(vi)	Separate Remedy for Slab .....	3493
(b)	Tin Mill Products .....	3494
(i)	General .....	3494
(ii)	Like Product Criteria .....	3496
	Physical Properties .....	3496
	End-Use .....	3497
	Consumer Perception.....	3498
	Tariff Classification.....	3498
	Production Processes .....	3499
(iii)	Identification of Domestic Producers .....	3500
(c)	Welded Pipe .....	3503
(i)	General .....	3503
(ii)	Like Product Criteria .....	3505
	General .....	3505
	Physical Properties .....	3506
	End-Use .....	3508
	Consumer Perception.....	3510
	Tariff Classification.....	3510
	Production Processes .....	3513
	Marketing Channels.....	3515
	Other Factors .....	3516
(iii)	Definitions Proposed by the Complainants.....	3516
(iv)	Relevance of Like Product Definitions Used in the Anti Dumping and Countervailing Duty Contexts .....	3517
(d)	FFTJ .....	3518
F.	Increased Imports.....	3520
1.	Introduction.....	3520
2.	The Legal Standard .....	3521
(a)	Recent Increase .....	3521
(b)	Evaluation of Trends .....	3523
(c)	Rate and Amount of the Increase .....	3529

---

 Report of the Panel
 

---

	Page
(d) "Sharp" and "significant" Increase .....	3529
3. Requirement of Reasoned and Adequate Explanation ...	3534
4. Case-Specific Arguments .....	3534
(a) Consideration of 2001 Data .....	3534
(i) Full-Year 2001 Data .....	3534
(ii) Interim 2001 Data .....	3535
(b) Period of Investigation .....	3538
(c) Method of Analysis of Increased Imports .....	3539
(i) Quantitative Analysis Required? .....	3539
(ii) End-Point Analysis .....	3540
(d) Consideration of Decline in Imports .....	3541
(e) Aggregation of Products .....	3541
5. Measure-Specific Argumentation .....	3541
(a) CCFRS .....	3541
(i) Aggregation .....	3542
(ii) "Increased imports" within the Meaning of the Agreement on Safeguards? .....	3544
(iii) The USITC's Method of Analysis .....	3545
Trends .....	3545
End-Point Analysis .....	3547
(iv) Consideration of 2001 Data .....	3548
(v) Consideration of Decline in Imports .....	3548
(b) Tin Mill Products .....	3549
(i) "Increased imports" within the Meaning of the Agreement on Safeguards? .....	3549
(ii) The USITC's Method of Analysis .....	3551
(iii) Requirement of Reasoned and Adequate Explanation .....	3551
(iv) Relevance of the Like Product Definition .....	3553
(c) Hot-Rolled Bar .....	3553
(i) "Increased imports" within the Meaning of the Agreement on Safeguards? .....	3553
(ii) Consideration of 2001 Data .....	3554
(iii) The USITC's Method of Analysis .....	3555
(d) Cold-Finished Bar .....	3555
(i) "Increased imports" within the Meaning of the Agreement on Safeguards? .....	3555

		US - Steel Safeguards
		Page
	(ii) Requirement of Reasoned and Adequate Explanation .....	3556
(e)	Rebar .....	3556
	(i) "Increased imports" within the Meaning of the Agreement on Safeguards? .....	3556
	(ii) The USITC's Method of Analysis .....	3557
(f)	Welded Pipe .....	3558
	(i) "Increased imports" within the Meaning of the Agreement on Safeguards? .....	3558
	(ii) The USITC's Method of Analysis .....	3559
(g)	FFTJ .....	3560
(h)	Stainless Steel Bar .....	3560
(i)	Stainless Steel Wire .....	3561
	(i) "Increased imports" within the Meaning of the Agreement on Safeguards? .....	3561
	(ii) The USITC's Method of Analysis and the Requirement of a Reasoned and Adequate Explanation .....	3562
(j)	Stainless Steel Rod .....	3562
G.	Serious Injury or Threat of Serious Injury .....	3564
1.	Competent Authorities' Obligations under the Agreement on Safeguards in Making Injury Determinations .....	3564
2.	"Significant overall impairment" .....	3565
	(a) CCFRS .....	3565
	(b) Rebar .....	3571
	(c) Welded pipe .....	3572
3.	Obligation to Evaluate all Relevant Factors .....	3573
4.	Obligation to Provide Reasoned and Adequate Explanations .....	3576
	(a) Alternative Explanations of Data .....	3577
	(i) CCFRS .....	3577
	(ii) Hot-Rolled Bar .....	3580
	(iii) Cold-Finished Bar .....	3585
	(iv) Rebar .....	3587
	(v) Welded Pipe .....	3588
	(vi) Stainless Steel Wire .....	3593
	(vii) Other Products .....	3597
	(b) Representativeness of Data .....	3598

Report of the Panel

	Page
	(i) Production Destined for Internal Consumption ..... 3598
	(ii) Confidential Information ..... 3608
	(iii) Recent Data ..... 3617
	(iv) Analysis of Trends..... 3617
	(c) Aggregation of Data ..... 3617
	(i) CCFRS ..... 3617
	(ii) Tin Mill Products..... 3618
	(d) Decision-Making Processes in the Context of the USITC's Injury Determinations ..... 3619
H.	Causation ..... 3620
	1. Definition and Establishment of "causal link" ..... 3620
	2. Correlation ..... 3621
	(a) CCFRS ..... 3629
	(i) Coincidence in Time..... 3629
	(ii) Relevance of Volume and Price Effects of Imports ..... 3637
	(iii) Increased Imports and Industry's Performance..... 3648
	(iv) Relevance of Like Product Analysis for CCFRS ..... 3651
	(b) Tin Mill Products ..... 3652
	(i) Coincidence in Time..... 3652
	(ii) Relevance of Prices of Imports and Domestic Products..... 3654
	(c) Hot-Rolled Bar ..... 3655
	(d) Cold-Finished Bar ..... 3657
	(e) Rebar ..... 3659
	(f) FFTJ ..... 3661
	(g) Stainless Steel Bar ..... 3662
	(h) Stainless Steel Wire..... 3664
	(i) Stainless Steel Rod ..... 3666
	3. Non-Attribution..... 3668
	(a) Definition and Scope ..... 3668
	(i) The Obligation to "separate" and "distinguish" ..... 3669
	(ii) Identification of the Nature and Extent of Injurious Factors..... 3669
	(iii) Contribution..... 3671
	(iv) Quantification..... 3673



	Page
(v) Consistency of the Causation Test Applied by the USITC with WTO Jurisprudence.....	3685
(vi) Treatment of Imports from Free-Trade Areas.....	3701
(vii) Duty to Provide a Reasoned and Adequate Explanation in the Context of the Causation Analysis.....	3707
(b) Measure-Specific Argumentation.....	3708
(i) CCFRS .....	3708
Factors Considered by the USITC .....	3708
Economic Analyses Submitted to the USITC .....	3745
Failure to Provide a Reasoned and Adequate Explanation .....	3748
Relevance of Like Product Analysis for CCFRS.....	3750
(ii) Tin Mill Products.....	3752
Decision-Making .....	3752
Factors Considered by the USITC .....	3754
Factors not Considered by the USITC....	3759
Relevance of "like product" Analysis .....	3761
Failure to Provide Reasoned and Adequate Explanation .....	3762
(iii) Hot-Rolled Bar .....	3764
Factors Considered by the USITC .....	3764
Factors not Considered by the USITC....	3769
Failure to Provide a Reasoned and Adequate Explanation .....	3769
(iv) Cold-Finished Bar .....	3770
Factors Considered by the USITC .....	3770
Factors not Considered by the USITC...	3772
(v) Rebar .....	3775
Factors Considered by the USITC .....	3775
Factors not Considered by the USITC....	3777
Failure to Provide Reasoned and Adequate Explanation .....	3780
(vi) Welded Pipe .....	3780
Factors Considered by the USITC .....	3780
Factors not Considered by the USITC....	3787
Relevance of Like Product Analysis for Welded Pipe.....	3788

Report of the Panel

	Page
	Failure to Provide a Reasoned and Adequate Explanation ..... 3789
(vii)	FFTJ ..... 3790
	Factors Considered by the USITC ..... 3790
	Factors not Considered by the USITC .... 3791
	Failure to Provide Reasoned and Adequate Explanation ..... 3792
(viii)	Stainless Steel Bar ..... 3794
	Factors Considered by the USITC ..... 3794
	Failure to Provide Reasoned and Adequate Explanation ..... 3803
(ix)	Stainless Steel Wire ..... 3803
	Decision-Making ..... 3803
	Factors Considered by the USITC ..... 3804
	Failure to Provide Reasoned and Adequate Explanation ..... 3808
(x)	Stainless Steel Rod ..... 3809
	Factors Considered by the USITC ..... 3809
	Failure to Provide Reasoned and Adequate Explanation ..... 3812
4.	Effect of Violations of Other Provisions of the Agreement on Safeguards ..... 3813
I.	Article 5 ..... 3814
1.	Requirements of Article 5.1 ..... 3814
(a)	General ..... 3814
(b)	Extent and Level of the Safeguard Measures ..... 3816
(i)	"... to the extent necessary ..." ..... 3816
(ii)	"... to prevent serious injury attributed to 'increased imports' " ..... 3818
(c)	"Facilitate adjustment" ..... 3822
(d)	Time Reference Point for Analysis ..... 3837
(e)	Justification of the Measure ..... 3839
(i)	Timing of Justification ..... 3839
(ii)	Presidential Measure Differs from Measure Recommended by the Competent Authority ..... 3845
(iii)	Relationship with the Non Attribution Requirement and Determinations under Article 4.2(b) ..... 3851
(f)	Quantification ..... 3854