

Cambridge University Press
0521859190 - The Rehnquist Legacy
Edited by Craig M. Bradley
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

THE REHNQUIST LEGACY

During the thirty-three years William Rehnquist has been on the Supreme Court, nineteen as Chief Justice, significant developments have defined the American legal landscape. This book is a legal biography of Chief Justice William Rehnquist of the United States Supreme Court and the legacy he created. It is an intensive examination of his thirty-three-year legacy as a Supreme Court Justice based on his Court opinions, primarily in the area of constitutional law. It is written by a group of legal scholars each of whom is a specialist in the area covered by his or her chapter. The focus of the book is on Rehnquist's own legacy, not necessarily that of the Court that he headed. Thus emphasis is placed not only on the goals that he achieved, but also on those that he failed to achieve.

Craig M. Bradley is the James Louis Calamaras Professor of Law at the Indiana University Law School in Bloomington, Indiana. Before entering teaching, Prof. Bradley served as an Assistant United States Attorney in Washington, D.C., as a law clerk to then-Justice William Rehnquist of the United States Supreme Court, and as Senior Trial Attorney in the Public Integrity Section of the U.S. Department of Justice. Since entering teaching Prof. Bradley has specialized in Criminal Procedure, Federal Criminal Law, and Comparative Criminal Procedure. His previous books include *The Failure of the Criminal Procedure Revolution* (U. of Pa. Press, 1993) and *Criminal Procedure: A Worldwide Study* (Carolina Academic Press, 1999). He has published over forty articles in such law journals as the *Harvard Law Review*, the *Supreme Court Review*, and many others. He also writes a bimonthly column on Supreme Court criminal procedure cases for *Trial* magazine, a publication of the American Association of Trial Lawyers. He is also the author of a forthcoming biographical essay on Chief Justice Rehnquist in Melvin I. Urofsky (ed.), *The Supreme Court Justices: A Biographical Dictionary* (CQ Press, 2d ed., 2006).

Cambridge University Press
0521859190 - The Rehnquist Legacy
Edited by Craig M. Bradley
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

THE REHNQUIST LEGACY

Edited by
Craig M. Bradley
Indiana University



Cambridge University Press
0521859190 - The Rehnquist Legacy
Edited by Craig M. Bradley
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521859196

© Cambridge University Press 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-85919-6 hardback
ISBN-10 0-521-85919-0 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-68366-1 paperback
ISBN-10 0-521-68366-1 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for
the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication
and does not guarantee that any content on such
Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
0521859190 - The Rehnquist Legacy
Edited by Craig M. Bradley
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

For Cindy, Derek, Kathleen, Snowy, and Wicca

CONTENTS

<i>List of Contributors</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Foreword: The Third Rehnquist Court</i> <i>Linda Greenhouse</i>	xiii
INTRODUCTION <i>Craig M. Bradley</i>	1
SECTION I. THE FIRST AMENDMENT	
1 THE <i>HUSTLER</i> : JUSTICE REHNQUIST AND “THE FREEDOM OF SPEECH, OR OF THE PRESS” <i>Geoffrey R. Stone</i>	11
2 LESS IS MORE: JUSTICE REHNQUIST, THE FREEDOM OF SPEECH, AND DEMOCRACY <i>Richard W. Garnett</i>	26
3 “I GIVE UP!” WILLIAM REHNQUIST AND COMMERCIAL SPEECH <i>Earl M. Maltz</i>	43
4 INDIRECT FUNDING AND THE ESTABLISHMENT CLAUSE: REHNQUIST’S TRIUMPHANT VISION OF NEUTRALITY AND PRIVATE CHOICE <i>Daniel O. Conkle</i>	54
SECTION II. CRIMINAL PROCEDURE	
5 THE FOURTH AMENDMENT: BE REASONABLE <i>Craig M. Bradley</i>	81
6 <i>DICKERSON v. UNITED STATES</i> : THE CASE THAT DISAPPOINTED <i>MIRANDA</i> ’S CRITICS – AND THEN ITS SUPPORTERS <i>Yale Kamisar</i>	106

viii	Contents	
7	AGAINST THE TIDE: REHNQUIST'S EFFORTS TO CURTAIL EXPANSION OF THE RIGHT TO COUNSEL <i>James J. Tomkovicz</i>	129
8	NARROWING HABEAS CORPUS <i>Joseph L. Hoffmann</i>	156
SECTION III. THE STRUCTURE OF GOVERNMENT		
9	WILLIAM REHNQUIST'S FEDERALISM <i>Mark Tushnet</i>	187
10	FEDERALISM AND THE SPENDING POWER FROM <i>DOLE</i> TO <i>BIRMINGHAM BOARD OF EDUCATION</i> <i>Lynn A. Baker</i>	205
11	THE INDEPENDENT COUNSEL CASE: A TALE OF TWO CONSERVATIVES <i>Daniel A. Farber</i>	222
12	THE BATTLE OVER STATE IMMUNITY <i>William P. Marshall</i>	240
13	TRANSCENDING THE ROUTINE: METHODOLOGY AND CONSTITUTIONAL VALUES IN CHIEF JUSTICE REHNQUIST'S STATUTORY CASES <i>Philip P. Frickey</i>	266
14	REHNQUIST AND FEDERALISM: AN EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS <i>Ruth Colker and Kevin M. Scott</i>	279
SECTION IV. THE SCOPE OF FOURTEENTH AMENDMENT RIGHTS		
15	ABORTION: A MIXED AND UNSETTLED LEGACY <i>Dawn Johnsen</i>	301
16	SUBSTANTIVE DUE PROCESS, PUBLIC OPINION, AND THE "RIGHT" TO DIE <i>Neal Devins</i>	327
17	PRIVATIZING THE CONSTITUTION: STATE ACTION AND BEYOND <i>David J. Barron</i>	345
18	THE INTRACTABLE PROBLEM OF RACE <i>Earl M. Maltz</i>	369
	<i>Index</i>	383

CONTRIBUTORS

LYNN A. BAKER holds the Frederick M. Baron Chair in Law at the University of Texas School of Law in Austin, Texas. One of the United States' leading academic defenders of federalism and the rights of states, Baker has written extensively about the role of the spending power in federal–state relations. Among her most-cited works in this area are *Conditional Federal Spending after Lopez*, 95 COLUM. L. REV. 1911 (1995), and *Federalism and the Double Standard of Judicial Review*, 51 DUKE L.J. 75 (2001) (coauthored).

DAVID J. BARRON is Professor of Law at Harvard University. A former law clerk to Judge Stephen Reinhardt of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit and Justice John Paul Stevens, Professor Barron is a graduate of Harvard College and Harvard Law School. Prior to teaching, he served as an attorney-advisor for the Office of Legal Counsel of the U.S. Department of Justice from 1996 to 1999. His research focuses on issues in administrative law, constitutional law, and the scope of state and local governmental power. His recent publications include *Reclaiming Home Rule*, 116 HARV. L. REV. 2255 (2003) and *A Localist Critique of the New Federalism*, 51 DUKE L.J. 377 (2001). He is also the coauthor of a casebook, *LOCAL GOVERNMENT LAW* (3d ed. 2001) (with Gerald Frug and Richard Ford).

CRAIG M. BRADLEY is the James Louis Calamaras Professor of Law at Indiana University, Bloomington. He has previously served as an Assistant United States Attorney in Washington, D.C., as Senior Trial Attorney, Public Integrity Section, U.S. Department of Justice, and as a law clerk to then–Justice William Rehnquist. He is the author of *THE FAILURE OF THE CRIMINAL PROCEDURE REVOLUTION* (1993) and both editor and coauthor of *CRIMINAL PROCEDURE: A WORLDWIDE STUDY* (1999). He is also the author of a forthcoming biographical essay on Chief Justice Rehnquist in Melvin I. Urofsky (ed.), *THE SUPREME COURT JUSTICES: A BIOGRAPHICAL DICTIONARY* (2d ed. 2006).

RUTH COLKER is the Heck-Faust Memorial Chair in Constitutional Law at the Michael E. Moritz College of Law, The Ohio State University. She has published more than fifty law journal articles and is the author of numerous books, including *AMERICAN LAW IN THE AGE OF HYPERCAPITALISM* (1998) and *DISABILITY PENDULUM: THE FIRST DECADE OF THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT* (2005). She and Kevin M. Scott have compiled a database of all Rehnquist Court decisions.

DANIEL O. CONKLE is the Robert H. McKinney Professor of Law at Indiana University, Bloomington, as well as an Adjunct Professor of Religious Studies and Nelson Poynter Scholar. He clerked for Judge Edward Allen Tamm of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the D.C. Circuit and practiced with the Cincinnati law firm of Taft, Stettinius & Hollister before joining the Indiana University faculty in 1983. Professor Conkle has published extensively on constitutional law and theory, religious liberty, and the role of religion in American law, politics, and public life. His recent publications include a 2003 book, *CONSTITUTIONAL LAW: THE RELIGION CLAUSES*.

NEAL DEVINS is Goodrich Professor of Law and Professor of Government at the College of William and Mary. His books include *THE DEMOCRATIC CONSTITUTION* (with Louis Fisher), *SHAPING CONSTITUTIONAL VALUES*, and *POLITICAL DYNAMICS OF CONSTITUTIONAL LAW* (with Fisher). He is also the series editor for *CONSTITUTIONAL CONFLICTS* and coeditor of the volume *FEDERAL ABORTION POLITICS* (with Wendy L. Watson).

DANIEL A. FARBER is the Sho Sato Professor of Law at the University of California at Berkeley. He was formerly the McKnight Presidential Professor of Public Law at the University of Minnesota, where he taught for twenty years. He is the coauthor of a leading casebook on constitutional law (with Phil Frickey and Bill Eskridge) and of a reader on modern constitutional theory (with John Garvey and Alex Aleinikoff). He has also authored or coauthored several other books on constitutional themes, such as *LINCOLN'S CONSTITUTION*, *THE FIRST AMENDMENT*, and *DESPERATELY SEEKING CERTAINTY: THE MISGUIDED QUEST FOR CONSTITUTIONAL FOUNDATIONS* (with Suzanna Sherry). He was a law clerk for Justice John Paul Stevens during the 1976 Term.

PHILIP P. FRICKEY, the Richard W. Jennings Professor of Law at the University of California at Berkeley (Boalt Hall), is a nationally recognized scholar in the fields of statutory interpretation, legislative process, federal Indian law, and constitutional law. Frickey is the coauthor of widely adopted casebooks on legislation and constitutional law, as well as books on legislation and statutory interpretation, and on law and public choice. He is also a publication editor of Hart & Sacks's *THE LEGAL PROCESS* (1994), and the author or coauthor of numerous journal articles, essays, and book reviews. He is a member of the editorial boards of *Issues in Legal Scholarship*, an electronic journal, and *Court Review*, the quarterly journal of the American Judges Association.

RICHARD W. GARNETT is a Lilly Endowment Associate Professor of Law at Notre Dame Law School, where he teaches and writes about criminal law, capital punishment, religious freedom, and the freedom of speech. Before coming to Notre Dame, he served as law clerk to Chief Justice Rehnquist during October Term 1996 and to then-Chief Judge Richard S. Arnold of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Eighth Circuit.

LINDA GREENHOUSE is the *New York Times's* longtime Supreme Court correspondent and winner of a 1998 Pulitzer Prize in Journalism (beat reporting) for her coverage of the Court. She has also received the Goldsmith Career Award for Excellence in Journalism from Harvard's Kennedy School of Government and the John Chancellor Award for Excellence in Journalism from the University of Pennsylvania's Annenberg School for Communication, both in 2004. Her most recent book is *BECOMING JUSTICE BLACKMUN* (2005).

Contributors

xi

JOSEPH L. HOFFMANN is the Harry Pratter Professor of Law at Indiana University, Bloomington. He has been teaching at Indiana since 1986, following one-year clerkships with the Honorable Phyllis A. Kravitch of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Eleventh Circuit and then–Associate Justice William H. Rehnquist. He is a nationally recognized expert on criminal procedure, habeas corpus, and the law of the death penalty. He is a coauthor of *COMPREHENSIVE CRIMINAL PROCEDURE* (2005), and recently served as cochair of the Massachusetts Governor’s Council on Capital Punishment.

DAWN JOHNSEN is Professor of Law at Indiana University, Bloomington. Prior to entering teaching she served as a law clerk to Judge Richard Cudahy of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Seventh Circuit, as Legal Director of the National Abortion Rights Action League (1988–93), and as Deputy and then Acting Assistant Attorney General for the Office of Legal Counsel at the U.S. Department of Justice (1993–98).

YALE KAMISAR is Professor of Law at the University of San Diego and Professor of Law Emeritus at the University of Michigan, where he taught during 1965–2004 and was Clarence Darrow Distinguished University Professor of Law. Since he first started to write on the subject in 1963, Kamisar has written fourteen law review articles on the law of confessions, seven of which were collected in *POLICE INTERROGATION AND CONFESSIONS: ESSAYS IN LAW AND POLICY* (1980). He is also coauthor of all eleven editions of *MODERN CRIMINAL PROCEDURE*, the most widely used casebook in its field, and all nine editions of *CONSTITUTIONAL LAW*.

EARL M. MALTZ is Distinguished Professor of Law at Rutgers University School of Law in Camden, New Jersey. He is the author of four books and many articles dealing with constitutional law and constitutional history, among them *THE CHIEF JUSTICESHIP OF WARREN BURGER* (2000). He is also the editor of the recently published *REHNQUIST JUSTICE: UNDERSTANDING THE COURT DYNAMIC* (2003).

WILLIAM P. MARSHALL is the Kenan Professor of Law the University of North Carolina in Chapel Hill. He served as Associate Counsel and Deputy Counsel to the President during the Clinton administration, where he worked primarily on issues of constitutional policy. He has written extensively on constitutional law issues and published articles in such leading journals as the *Virginia*, *Harvard*, *Chicago*, *Northwestern*, and *Illinois* law reviews.

KEVIN M. SCOTT is Assistant Professor, Political Science Department, Texas Tech University. He and Ruth Colker have compiled a database of all of the Supreme Court decisions decided by the Rehnquist Court, and have published a preliminary assessment of this data, entitled *Dissenting States?*, 88 VA. L. REV. 1301 (2002).

GEOFFREY R. STONE is the Harry Kalven, Jr., Distinguished Service Professor of Law at the University of Chicago. He served as a law clerk to Supreme Court Justice William Brennan. Stone has been a member of the faculty of the University of Chicago since 1973, and served as Dean of the Law School from 1987 to 1993 and as Provost of the University of Chicago from 1993 to 2001. Stone is the author or coauthor of many scholarly articles in the field of constitutional law and several books, including *THE FIRST AMENDMENT, CONSTITUTIONAL LAW, ETERNALLY VIGILANT: FREE SPEECH IN THE MODERN ERA*, and

Cambridge University Press
0521859190 - The Rehnquist Legacy
Edited by Craig M. Bradley
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

xii

Contributors

the award-winning *PERILOUS TIMES: FREE SPEECH IN WARTIME* (2004). He has served as an editor of the *Supreme Court Review* since 1991.

JAMES J. TOMKOVICZ is the Edward A. Howrey Professor of Law at the University of Iowa College of Law, where he has taught since 1982. He has also served as a visiting professor at the University of Michigan School of Law and the University of California, Los Angeles, School of Law. He is the author of *THE RIGHT TO THE ASSISTANCE OF COUNSEL: A REFERENCE GUIDE TO THE UNITED STATES CONSTITUTION* (2002) and the coauthor (with Professor Welsh White) of a casebook, *CRIMINAL PROCEDURE: CONSTITUTIONAL CONSTRAINTS UPON INVESTIGATION AND PROOF* (5th ed. 2004).

MARK TUSHNET is Carmack Waterhouse Professor of Constitutional Law at the Georgetown University Law Center. He served as a law clerk to Supreme Court Justice Thurgood Marshall. He is the coauthor of four casebooks, including the most widely used casebook on constitutional law. He has also written twelve books, including a two-volume work on the life of Justice Thurgood Marshall (1996–7) and *A COURT DIVIDED: THE REHNQUIST COURT AND THE FUTURE OF CONSTITUTIONAL LAW* (2005), and has edited four others. He was President of the Association of American Law Schools in 2003. In 2002 he was elected a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.