

WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

Dispute Settlement Reports

2003  
Volume II

Pages 487-961



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-85734-5 — Dispute Settlement Reports 2003 Volume 2: Pages 487-961

Edited by World Trade Organization

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521857345](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521857345)

© World Trade Organization 2003, 2005

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 987-0-521-85734-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## THE WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT REPORTS

The *Dispute Settlement Reports* of the World Trade Organization (the "WTO") include panel and Appellate Body reports, as well as arbitration awards, in disputes concerning the rights and obligations of WTO Members under the provisions of the *Marrakesh Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization*. The *Dispute Settlement Reports* are available in English, French and Spanish. Starting with 1999, the first volume of each year contains a cumulative index of published disputes.

*This volume may be cited as DSR 2003:II*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  | <i>Page</i> |
|--|-------------|
| <b>United States – Continued Dumping and Subsidy Offset<br/>Act of 2000 (WT/DS217, WT/DS234)</b> |             |
| Report of the Panel .....  | 489         |
| <b>Cumulative Index of Published Disputes .....</b>  | <b>953</b>  |

## UNITED STATES – CONTINUED DUMPING AND SUBSIDY OFFSET ACT OF 2000

### Report of the Panel

WT/DS217/R

WT/DS234/R

*Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body*

*on 27 January 2003*

*as Modified by the Appellate Body Report*

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  | Page |
|--|------|
| I. INTRODUCTION.....   | 493  |
| II. FACTUAL ASPECTS .....  | 495  |
| III. PARTIES' REQUESTS FOR FINDINGS AND<br>RECOMMENDATIONS ..... | 497  |
| A. Complaining Parties .....                                     | 497  |
| B. United States .....   | 498  |
| IV. ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES .....                               | 499  |
| A. First Written Submission of the Complaining Parties .....     | 499  |
| 1. Australia.....  | 499  |
| 2. Brazil .....  | 503  |
| 3. Canada .....  | 512  |
| 4. Chile and Japan.....  | 522  |
| 5. European Communities, India, Indonesia and<br>Thailand .....  | 532  |
| 6. Korea .....   | 543  |
| 7. Mexico .....  | 549  |
| B. First Written Submission of the United States .....           | 556  |
| C. First Oral Statements of the Complaining Parties .....        | 561  |
| 1. Australia.....  | 561  |
| 2. Brazil .....  | 566  |
| 3. Canada .....  | 572  |
| 4. Chile.....  | 577  |
| 5. European Communities.....                                     | 581  |
| 6. India .....   | 586  |
| 7. Indonesia.....  | 588  |

## Report of the Panel

|   | Page |
|---|------|
| 8. Japan .....  | 590  |
| 9. Korea .....  | 594  |
| 10. Mexico .....  | 597  |
| 11. Thailand .....  | 603  |
| D. First Oral Statement of the United States.....   | 605  |
| E. Answers of Complainants to Questions from the Panel .....  | 611  |
| 1. Australia.....   | 611  |
| 2. Brazil .....   | 617  |
| 3. Canada .....   | 626  |
| 4. Chile.....   | 635  |
| 5. European Communities, India, Indonesia, Thailand ..  | 643  |
| 6. Japan .....  | 654  |
| 7. Korea .....  | 665  |
| 8. Mexico .....   | 669  |
| F. Answers of the United States to Questions from the Panel,<br>Chile and the European Communities..... | 677  |
| 1. Answers of the United States to Questions from<br>the Panel.....                                     | 677  |
| 2. Answers of the United States to Questions from<br>Chile.....   | 681  |
| 3. Answers of the United States to Questions from<br>the European Communities.....                      | 682  |
| G. Second Written Submissions of the Complaining Parties.....   | 683  |
| 1. Australia.....   | 683  |
| 2. Brazil .....   | 692  |
| 3. Canada .....   | 699  |
| 4. Chile and Japan.....   | 710  |
| 5. European Communities, India, Indonesia and<br>Thailand .....   | 718  |
| 6. Korea .....  | 729  |
| 7. Mexico .....   | 735  |
| H. Second Written Submission of the United States.....  | 744  |
| I. Second Oral Statements of the Complaining Parties.....   | 754  |
| 1. Australia.....   | 754  |
| 2. Brazil .....   | 757  |
| 3. Canada .....   | 763  |
| 4. Chile.....   | 768  |

|   | Page |
|---|------|
| 5. European Communities.....  | 772  |
| 6. India.....   | 777  |
| 7. Indonesia.....   | 779  |
| 8. Japan.....   | 780  |
| 9. Korea.....   | 784  |
| 10. Mexico.....   | 790  |
| 11. Thailand.....   | 795  |
| J. Second Oral Statement of the United States.....  | 796  |
| K. Complaining Parties' Answers to Questions from the Panel<br>after the Second Meeting.....  | 801  |
| 1. Australia.....   | 801  |
| 2. Brazil.....  | 804  |
| 3. Canada.....  | 808  |
| 4. Chile.....   | 817  |
| 5. European Communities, India, Indonesia and<br>Thailand.....  | 821  |
| 6. Japan.....   | 829  |
| 7. Korea.....   | 835  |
| 8. Mexico.....  | 839  |
| L. United States' Answers to Questions from the Panel after<br>the Second Meeting.....  | 846  |
| V. ARGUMENTS OF THE THIRD PARTIES.....  | 852  |
| VI. INTERIM REVIEW.....   | 852  |
| A. United States.....   | 852  |
| B. Mexico.....  | 854  |
| C. Canada.....  | 854  |
| D. Australia.....   | 855  |
| E. Japan.....   | 855  |
| F. European Communities.....  | 855  |
| G. Korea.....   | 856  |
| VII. FINDINGS.....  | 856  |
| A. Procedural Issues.....   | 856  |
| 1. Submission of New Evidence.....  | 856  |
| 2. Issuance of Separate Reports.....  | 858  |
| B. Ad Article 18.1 and SCM Article 32.1, and Paragraphs 2<br>and 3 of GATT Article VI – Specific Action Against<br>Dumping/Subsidy..... | 859  |

Report of the Panel

|  | Page |
|--|------|
| 1. Introduction.....   | 859  |
| 2. The Standard for Determining whether or not a Measure Constitutes a "specific action against dumping" .....   | 861  |
| 3. Does the CDSOA Act Specifically in Response to Dumping, in the Sense that CDSOA Payments may be Made Only in Situations Presenting the Constituent Elements of Dumping? ..... | 863  |
| 4. Is the CDSOA a Specific Action Against Dumping? .....   | 865  |
| 5. Is the CDSOA Permitted by Footnotes 24 and 56 of the AD and SCM Agreements Respectively?.....   | 876  |
| 6. Conclusion .....  | 877  |
| C. Ad Article 5.4/SCM Article 11.4 - Standing .....  | 878  |
| 1. Arguments of the Parties.....   | 878  |
| 2. Evaluation by the Panel .....   | 880  |
| 3. Conclusion .....  | 882  |
| D. Ad Article 8.3/SCM Article 18.3 - Undertakings.....   | 882  |
| 1. Arguments of the Parties.....   | 882  |
| 2. Evaluation by the Panel .....   | 884  |
| E. Developing Country Issue – Ad Article 15 .....  | 887  |
| 1. Arguments of the Parties.....   | 887  |
| 2. Evaluation by the Panel .....   | 887  |
| F. AD Article 18.4/SCM Article 32.5 & WTO Article XVI:4 - Necessary Steps to Ensure Conformity.....  | 888  |
| 1. Arguments of the Parties.....   | 888  |
| 2. Evaluation by the Panel .....   | 888  |
| G. Adverse Effects - SCM Article 5 .....   | 889  |
| 1. Arguments of the Parties.....   | 889  |
| 2. Evaluation by the Panel .....   | 893  |
| H. SCM Articles 4.10 and 7.9 .....   | 903  |
| 1. Arguments of the Parties.....   | 903  |
| 2. Evaluation by the Panel .....   | 903  |
| I. GATT Article X:3(a).....  | 904  |
| 1. Arguments of the Parties.....   | 904  |
| 2. Evaluation by the Panel .....   | 905  |
| 3. Conclusion .....  | 906  |
| VIII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION .....   | 907  |