

Cambridge University Press

0521856795 - The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy

Lee Palmer Wandel

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Eucharist in the Reformation

The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy takes up the words, “this is my body,” “this do,” and “remembrance of me” that divided Western Christendom in the sixteenth century. It traces the different understandings of these simple words and the consequences of those divergent understandings in the delineation of the Lutheran, Reformed, and Catholic traditions: the different formulations of liturgy with their different conceptualizations of the cognitive and collective function of ritual; the different conceptualizations of the relationship between Christ and the living body of the faithful; the different articulations of the relationship between the world of matter and divinity; and the different epistemologies. It argues that the Incarnation is at the center of the story of the Reformation and suggests how divergent religious identities were formed.

Lee Palmer Wandel is Professor of History at the University of Wisconsin-Madison where she is also a Senior Fellow at the Institute for Research in the Humanities. She is the author of *Always Among Us: Images of the Poor in Zwingli's Zurich* (1990) and *Vocacious Idols and Violent Hands: Iconoclasm in Reformation Zurich, Strasbourg, and Basel* (1995) and editor of *Facing Death* (1996) and *History Has Many Voices* (2003). She has been a contributor to *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Reformation* and *The Cambridge History of Christianity*, as well as a number of journals and volumes of collected essays.

Cambridge University Press

0521856795 - The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy

Lee Palmer Wandel

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE EUCHARIST IN THE REFORMATION

Incarnation and Liturgy

LEE PALMER WANDEL

University of Wisconsin-Madison



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 0521856795 - The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy
 Lee Palmer Wandel
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521856799

© Lee Palmer Wandel 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Wandel, Lee Palmer.

The Eucharist in the Reformation : Incarnation and Liturgy / Lee Palmer Wandel.
 p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-521-85679-5 — ISBN 0-521-67312-7 (pbk.)

1. Lord's Supper — History of doctrines — 16th century. 2. Reformation. I. Title.
 BV825.3.W36 2006
 234'.163'09031 — dc22 2005010346

ISBN-13 978-0-521-85679-9 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-85679-5 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-67312-9 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-67312-7 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
Introduction	1
“ <i>This Is</i> ”	3
“ <i>My Body</i> ”	6
“ <i>This Do</i> ”	9
“ <i>In Remembrance of Me</i> ”	11
The Structure of the Book	11
1 The Eucharist to 1500	14
2 Augsburg	46
A Christian City	48
Preaching	55
Printing	67
The Eucharist in Augsburg	77
3 The Lutheran Eucharist	94
The Augsburg Confession	109
Catechizing the Eucharist	114
Legislating Liturgy	117
Nuremberg	121
Rothenburg ob der Tauber	133
4 The Reformed Eucharist	139
The Institutes of the Christian Religion	142
The Eucharist in Geneva	166
The Eucharist in Reformed Confessions	172
The French or Huguenot Church	176
The Scots Church	184
The Dutch Reformed Church(es)	192
The Heidelberg Catechism	204
5 The Catholic Eucharist	208
The Tridentine Missal	231

Cambridge University Press

0521856795 - The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy

Lee Palmer Wandel

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

Contents

The Mass in Rome	241
The Mass in the Andes	251
Conclusions	256
“This Is”	256
“My Body”	258
“This Do”	259
“In Remembrance of Me”	260
<i>Appendix 1</i>	263
I. <i>The Preparation</i>	263
II. <i>The Oblation</i>	263
III. <i>The Consecration</i>	263
IV. <i>The Communion</i>	263
V. <i>The Dismissal</i>	264
<i>Appendix 2</i>	265
<i>Bibliography</i>	271
<i>Index</i>	295

Cambridge University Press

0521856795 - The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy

Lee Palmer Wandel

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Illustrations*

1. Rogier van der Weyden, The Seven Sacraments: The Sacrament of the Eucharist. Location: Koninklijk Museum voor Schone Kunsten, Antwerp, Belgium. Photo credit: Scala/Art Resource, NY 24
2. Cruciform plan of Notre Dame (ca. 1163), after Nikolaus Pevsner, *An Outline of European Architecture* (London: Penguin Books, 1990), p. 102 30
3. Chalice of Gilles de Walcourt, and Paten from Wilton Abbey, Southern Tyrol, 1160–1170. Photo credit: Erich Lessing/Art Resource, NY 35
4. Augsburg, Sebastian Münster, *Cosmographiae universalis* (Basel: Heinrich Petri, 1559). Memorial Library, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wisconsin 50
5. Choir of St. Lorenz Church, Nuremberg. Photo credit: Kavaler/Art Resource, NY 128
6. Adam Kraft, Sacrament Shrine, St. Lorenz Church, Nuremberg. Photo credit: Erich Lessing/Art Resource, NY 131
7. Tilman Riemenschneider, The Altar of the Holy Blood, St. Jacob's Church, Rothenburg ob der Tauber. Photo credit: Erich Lessing/Art Resource, NY 135
8. "Temple de Lyon, Nommé Paradis" Geneva, CIG, coll. Bibliothèque publique et universitaire 182
9. Canon, *MISSALE ROMANUM* (Antwerp: Christopher Plantin, 1572). Stadt- und Staatsbibliothek Augsburg 238
10. Rome, Sebastian Münster, *Cosmographiae universalis* (Basel: Heinrich Petri, 1559). Memorial Library, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wisconsin 241
11. Etienne Dupérac, Sistine Chapel, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana 248
12. Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala, *Nueva Corónica y buen gobierno* [Travaux et memoires de l'Institut d'ethnologie, vol. 23] (Paris: Institut d'ethnologie, 1936). p. 625 253

Cambridge University Press
0521856795 - The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy
Lee Palmer Wandel
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

viii

Illustrations

PLATES

Color plates follow page 244

1. Michelangelo, The Last Judgment, Sistine Chapel, Vatican Palace, Vatican State. Photo Credit: Scala/Art Resource, NY
2. Leonardo da Vinci, The Last Supper, after restoration by Dottoressa Brambilla in 1997–2001. Santa Maria delle Grazie, Milan. Photo credit: Erich Lessing/Art Resource, NY

Cambridge University Press

0521856795 - The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy

Lee Palmer Wandel

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

This book began as a passing observation in the early 1990s that no one work treated the liturgies of the major traditions that were articulated in the sixteenth century. Over the years, I have come to understand why. I am all the more grateful, therefore, to all those who helped me along the way. Without these individuals and institutions, I could not have written it.

Foremost, I wish to thank those many collections upon which this book rests, and their staffs, who did so much to help me find materials: the libraries of the University of Wisconsin–Madison, Yale University, and the Institute for Advanced Study; the Stadtarchiv Augsburg, the Staats- und Stadtbibliothek Augsburg, the Universitätsbibliothek Augsburg, the Gemeente Archief Leiden, the Staatsbibliothek München, the Staatsarchiv and Landeskirchlichesarchiv Nürnberg, the Archivio Secreto Vaticano, the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticano, and the Herzog August Bibliothek Wolfenbüttel. I am particularly grateful to the staffs of the Manuscript Collection of the Stadtbibliothek Nürnberg and the Stadtarchiv Rothenburg ob der Tauber, who warmly welcomed a six-and-a-half-year-old, an extraordinary gift to his mother.

I am also grateful to those institutions that provided financial support: the Vilas Fellowship, the Graduate School at the University of Wisconsin, the National Endowment for the Humanities, all of which funded summer research trips; a Senior Faculty Fellowship at Yale, membership at the Institute for Advanced Study, a residential fellowship at the Institute for Research in the Humanities at the University of Wisconsin, and a John Simon Guggenheim Memorial Foundation Fellowship, all of which gave me time to read and write.

Friends and colleagues helped to orient me as I traversed different geographies of worship, fundamentally differently organized archives and libraries. Christine Kooi first introduced me to the Netherlands and Leiden, complexly understood, but also, pragmatically, the archives. Later conversations with Mia Mochizuki and Jeremy Bangs deepened my understanding of the material dimensions of Reformed worship, even as they showed me the material remains of that worship. Ray Mentzer was wonderfully generous in sharing his deep knowledge of Reformed churches in France, and, like so many others, I have had the pleasure of Robert Kingdon introducing me to Geneva. In Geneva, Irena Backus, Christian Grosse, and Tom Lambert shared their knowledge of the town, its history, its practice of

Cambridge University Press

0521856795 - The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy

Lee Palmer Wandel

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

Acknowledgements

worship. John Tedeschi and John Marino helped me to find my way in Rome.

A number of friends and colleagues read or heard parts of the book. For invitations to present and discuss my work, I am grateful to Northwestern University; the Institute for Advanced Study; the National Humanities Center; the Centre for History and Economics of King's College, Cambridge; King's College, Cambridge and Queen Mary College, the University of London; Emory University; the Université Montpellier; the Landesgeschichtliches Colloquium der Universität Augsburg; the Colloquium Augustana; the Sonderforschungsbereich 496: Symbolische Kommunikation und gesellschaftliche Wertssysteme von Mittelalter bis zur Französischen Revolution of the Universität Münster; the Historisches Seminar, Freie Universität Berlin; and Johns Hopkins University. Alison Frank, Rolf Kiessling, Robert Kingdon, Christine Kooi, Walter Melion, Hans Christoph Rublack, Brett Sheehan, Karl Shoemaker, David Steinmetz, and Anke Sczesny all read parts of the manuscript, helping me to achieve greater clarity of thinking and, I hope, accuracy of writing. The readers for Cambridge University Press and my editor, Frank Smith, especially, helped to make this book better.

While the notes will give some indication of the specific expertise of others I have drawn upon, let me here acknowledge scholars whose thinking informs my own, whose work has helped me to sharpen, make more articulate and more circumspect the methods and conceptualizations of this book. Irena Backus, Ron Delph, Anthony Grafton, Lawrence Manley, Heiko Oberman, Claude Rawson, David Steinmetz, and Charles Trinkaus have taught me much about how to read texts. Thomas Brady, Peter Blickle, James Scott, and David Underdown have shaped my understanding of human agency and of human communities as discursive and dialogic. Caroline Walker Bynum, Ed Muir, Peter Hawkins, and Virginia Reinburg have helped me to think more complexly about liturgy, Caroline and Peter, in particular, about the interplay of Incarnation and liturgy. Conversations with Miri Rubin, predominantly in a series of glorious gatherings in Cambridge, and with those she brought together, led me to greater circumspection about how we speak about the praxis of faith. During my year in Princeton, Sabine McCormack shared her insights into Andean Christianity and asked hard questions of my thinking on the Eucharist.

The community of scholars in Augsburg, led by Rolf Kiessling, has offered me an intellectual home, where insights, perceptions, ideas are explored collectively, benefiting materially from the aggregate of the scholarship the members bring to the conversation. Anke Sczesny and Sabine Ullmann in particular have given generously of their time and their understanding of various communities in early modern Augsburg.

The deeper themes of this book were worked out in conversations, over dinners and on walks, with beloved friends, whose shared fascination

Cambridge University Press

0521856795 - The Eucharist in the Reformation: Incarnation and Liturgy

Lee Palmer Wandel

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgements*

xi

inspired my own: over two decades, with Hans-Christoph and Lizzie Rublack, the dynamism, the essential discursiveness, and the pluralism of the Reformation; over even longer, with Walter Melion, the implications of Incarnation, conceptions of the body, images, and the material dimensions of worship; with Rolf and Christa Kiessling, the relationship between words and meaning, and, in those marvel-filled excursions, “religion” in its material and regional complexity; most recently, with Bob and Karen Sack, cognition, matter, physics, and dimension.

This book was written in the shadow of the loss of three people whose fierce commitment to human dignity and difference inspired and inspires the approach I take. John Boswell and Robert Scribner both challenged fundamentally the ways in which history accords some human beings normative or definitive place, others marginal. My mother first taught me the absolute respect for other voices, the listening, that is the point of departure for this book; the older I get the better I understand her essentially pluralist vision of the world. I am sorry I did not finish it in time for them to tell me if I have succeeded in honoring that commitment, for them to see what I have learned from them.

Shadows and light. Absence and presence. Matt was that six-and-a-half-year-old a decade ago; he has grown up with this book. In the midst of overwhelming losses, I have learned from him that wicked wit and a sly irreverence are genetic, that laughter does not die, and that grace can be found in the most unexpected of times. I have struggled to find words that name what Thomas Max Safley has given. In the end, I turn to Sonnet 116, which has proven resistant to conventionalizing and signals something of his presence throughout these pages. This book is for them.