

Cambridge University Press
0521854091 - The Logic of Violence in Civil War
Stathis N. Kalyvas
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

The Logic of Violence in Civil War

By analytically decoupling war and violence, this book explores the causes and dynamics of violence in civil war. Against prevailing views that such violence is either the product of impenetrable madness or a simple way to achieve strategic objectives, the book demonstrates that the logic of violence in civil war has much less to do with collective emotions, ideologies, cultures, or “greed and grievance” than currently believed. Stathis Kalyvas distinguishes between indiscriminate and selective violence and specifies a novel theory of selective violence: it is jointly produced by political actors seeking information and individual noncombatants trying to avoid the worst but also grabbing what opportunities their predicament affords them. Violence is not a simple reflection of the optimal strategy of its users; its profoundly interactive character defeats simple maximization logics while producing surprising outcomes, such as relative nonviolence in the “frontlines” of civil war. Civil war offers irresistible opportunities to those who are not naturally bloodthirsty and abhor direct involvement in violence. The manipulation of political organizations by local actors wishing to harm their rivals signals a process of privatization of political violence rather than the more commonly thought politicization of private life. Seen from this perspective, violence is a process taking place because of human aversion rather than a predisposition toward homicidal violence, which helps explain the paradox of the explosion of violence in social contexts characterized by high levels of interpersonal contact, exchange, and even trust. Hence, individual behavior in civil war should be interpreted less as an instance of social anomie and more as a perverse manifestation of abundant social capital. Finally, Kalyvas elucidates the oft-noted disjunction between action on the ground and discourse at the top by showing that local fragmentation and local cleavages are a central rather than peripheral aspect of civil wars.

Stathis N. Kalyvas is Arnold Wolfers Professor of Political Science at Yale, where he directs the Program on Order, Conflict, and Violence. He has previously taught at Chicago, NYU, and Ohio State and has been a visiting professor at the Juan March Institute and a Jean Monnet Fellow at the European University Institute. He is the author of *The Rise of Christian Democracy in Europe* (1996), which was awarded the J. David Greenstone Prize for the best book in politics and history. He has also received the Gregory Luebbert Award for the best article in comparative politics and has been a grant recipient of the Harry Frank Guggenheim Foundation and the United States Institute of Peace.

Cambridge University Press
 0521854091 - The Logic of Violence in Civil War
 Stathis N. Kalyvas
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics

General Editor

Margaret Levi *University of Washington, Seattle*

Assistant General Editor

Stephen Hanson *University of Washington, Seattle*

Associate Editors

Peter Lange *Duke University*

Helen Milner *Princeton University*

Frances Rosenbluth *Yale University*

Susan Stokes *Yale University*

Sidney Tarrow *Cornell University*

Kathleen Thelen *Northwestern University*

Erik Wibbels *University of Washington, Seattle*

Other Books in the Series

Lisa Baldez, *Why Women Protest: Women's Movements in Chile*

Stefano Bartolini, *The Political Mobilization of the European Left, 1860–1980:
 The Class Cleavage*

Mark Beissinger, *Nationalist Mobilization and the Collapse of the Soviet State*

Nancy Bermeo, ed., *Unemployment in the New Europe*

Carles Boix, *Democracy and Redistribution*

Carles Boix, *Political Parties, Growth, and Equality: Conservative and Social
 Democratic Economic Strategies in the World Economy*

Catherine Boone, *Merchant Capital and the Roots of State Power in Senegal,
 1930–1985*

Catherine Boone, *Political Topographies of the African State: Territorial Authority
 and Institutional Change*

Michael Bratton and Nicolas van de Walle, *Democratic Experiments in Africa:
 Regime Transitions in Comparative Perspective*

Michael Bratton, Robert Mattes, and E. Gyimah-Boadi, *Public Opinion,
 Democracy, and Market Reform in Africa*

Valerie Bunce, *Leaving Socialism and Leaving the State: The End of Yugoslavia,
 the Soviet Union, and Czechoslovakia*

Daniele Caramani, *The Nationalization of Politics: The Formation of National
 Electorates and Party Systems in Europe*

Continued after the Index

Cambridge University Press
0521854091 - The Logic of Violence in Civil War
Stathis N. Kalyvas
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Publication of this book has been aided by the generosity of the
Yale Center for International and Area Studies.

Cambridge University Press
0521854091 - The Logic of Violence in Civil War
Stathis N. Kalyvas
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

The Logic of Violence in Civil War

STATHIS N. KALYVAS

Yale University



Cambridge University Press
0521854091 - The Logic of Violence in Civil War
Stathis N. Kalyvas
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA
www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521854092

© Stathis N. Kalyvas 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Kalyvas, Stathis N., 1964–
The logic of violence in civil war / Stathis N. Kalyvas.
p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in comparative politics)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0-521-85409-1 (hardback) – ISBN 0-521-67004-7 (pbk.)
1. Political violence. 2. Civil war. I. Title. II. Series.
JC328.6.K34 2006
303.6'4 – dc22 2005018158

ISBN-13 978-0-521-85409-2 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-85409-1 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-67004-3 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-67004-7 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
0521854091 - The Logic of Violence in Civil War
Stathis N. Kalyvas
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Τῆς Ἀγγλικῆς

Cambridge University Press
0521854091 - The Logic of Violence in Civil War
Stathis N. Kalyvas
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

We are so little accustomed to treat social phenomena scientifically that certain of the propositions contained in this book may well surprise the reader. However, if there is to be a social science, we shall expect it not merely to paraphrase the traditional prejudices of the common man but to give us a new and different view of them; for the aim of all sciences is to make discoveries, and every discovery more or less disturbs accepted ideas.

Emile Durkheim, *The Rules of Sociological Method*

No one engaged in thought about history and politics can remain unaware of the enormous role violence has always played in human affairs, and it is at first sight surprising that violence has been singled out so seldom for special consideration.

Hannah Arendt, *On Violence*

Le nouveau ne se produit jamais par simple interpolation de l'ancien.

Michel Houellebecq, *Les particules élémentaires*

Contents

<i>List of Tables and Figures</i>	<i>page</i> xii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
INTRODUCTION	1
I.1. Four Puzzles	1
I.2. Goals	5
I.3. Road Map	7
I.4. A Note on the History of the Project	14
1 CONCEPTS	16
1.1. Civil War	16
1.2. Violence	19
1.3. Scope Conditions	23
1.4. Conclusion	31
2 PATHOLOGIES	32
2.1. Madness and “Bloodless Convention”	32
2.2. Partisan Bias	35
2.3. Political Bias	38
2.4. Urban Bias	38
2.5. Selection Bias	48
2.6. Overaggregation Bias and Data Problems	48
2.7. Conclusion	51
3 BARBARISM	52
3.1. Barbarism and Civil War	52
3.2. Breakdown	55
3.3. Transgression	62

3.4.	Polarization	64
3.5.	The Technology of Warfare	66
3.6.	Assessment	70
3.7.	Conclusion	85
4	A THEORY OF IRREGULAR WAR I: COLLABORATION	87
4.1.	Sovereignty in Civil War	87
4.2.	The Identification Problem	89
4.3.	Support	91
4.4.	Forms of Collaboration and Defection	104
4.5.	The Institutional Setting of Collaboration	106
4.6.	Conclusion	110
5	A THEORY OF IRREGULAR WAR II: CONTROL	111
5.1.	The Allocation of Collaboration	111
5.2.	Survival	116
5.3.	How Control Shapes Collaboration	118
5.4.	Causal Paths from Control to Collaboration	124
5.5.	The Distribution of Control	132
5.6.	Constraints on Military Options	138
5.7.	Violence and Discrimination	141
5.8.	Conclusion	145
6	A LOGIC OF INDISCRIMINATE VIOLENCE	146
6.1.	The Incidence of Indiscriminate Violence	147
6.2.	Information and Indiscriminate Violence	148
6.3.	Deterrence and Indiscriminate Violence	149
6.4.	Counterproductive Effects of Indiscriminate Violence	151
6.5.	Why Does Indiscriminate Violence Occur?	160
6.6.	Accounting for the Puzzle	167
6.7.	Conclusion	171
7	A THEORY OF SELECTIVE VIOLENCE	173
7.1.	Information	174
7.2.	Denunciation	176
7.3.	Denunciation in Ethnic Civil Wars	181
7.4.	Is Selective Violence Possible?	183
7.5.	A Political Economy of Denunciation	192
7.6.	A Model of Selective Violence in Civil War	195
7.7.	Caveats	207
7.8.	Conclusion	208
8	EMPIRICS I: COMPARATIVE EVIDENCE	210
8.1.	Measuring Control	210
8.2.	How Control Shifts	213

<i>Contents</i>	xi
8.3. Full Control (Zones 1 and 5)	218
8.4. No Control (Zones 1 and 5)	222
8.5. Contestation (Zones 2, 3, and 4)	224
8.6. Conclusion	243
9 EMPIRICS II: MICROCOMPARATIVE EVIDENCE	246
9.1. Research Design	247
9.2. The Greek Civil War	248
9.3. The Argolid: Political, Social, and Economic Background	249
9.4. The Civil War in the Argolid	254
9.5. After the End of the Occupation	265
9.6. Violence: Descriptive Statistics	266
9.7. Control: Descriptive Statistics	275
9.8. Quantitative Evidence	278
9.9. Qualitative Evidence	290
9.10. Return to Manesi and Gerbesi	299
9.11. Mispredictions	302
9.12. A Replication: Almopia	310
9.13. Out-of-Sample Tests in Greece	314
9.14. Conclusion	328
10 INTIMACY	330
10.1. Intimate Violence	333
10.2. Why Denounce? A Sociology of Denunciation	336
10.3. The Range of Malicious Denunciation	343
10.4. The Dark Face of Social Capital: The Social Basis of Malicious Denunciation	351
10.5. Varying the Institutional Setting of Denunciation	358
10.6. Conclusion	362
11 CLEAVAGE AND AGENCY	364
11.1. Center and Periphery	365
11.2. <i>Kto kovo?</i> The Locus of Agency	376
11.3. Alliance	381
11.4. Conclusion	386
CONCLUSION	388
<i>Appendix A: Data Sources</i>	393
<i>Appendix B: Coding Protocols</i>	412
<i>Appendix C: Timeline of Conflicts</i>	423
<i>References</i>	427
<i>Index</i>	479

Tables and Figures

TABLES

1.1	A Typology of Mass Political Violence	<i>page</i> 29
4.1	Types of Defection	105
9.1	Villages: Descriptive Data	252
9.2	Basic Descriptive Statistics	267
9.3	Selective Violence	270
9.4	Indiscriminate Violence	270
9.5	Conflict Proneness and Civil War Violence	272
9.6	Mean Scores of Control	275
9.7	Transitions in Control	277
9.8	Frequency of Violence: Logistic Regressions	288
9.9	Intensity of Violence: OLS Regressions	289
9.10	A Typology of Greek Villages	316
9.11	Descriptive Statistics	316
A.1	Interviews	397
B.1	Villages Included in the Argolid Study	413
B.2	Ecological Clusters	414
B.3	Independent Variables	415
B.4	Villages Surveyed across Greece	416

FIGURES

6.1	Civilian Behavior as a Function of Indiscriminate Violence and Protection	167
7.1	Payoffs and Expected Cost of Collaboration with (or Defection to) Incumbents	198

<i>Tables and Figures</i>	xiii
7.2 Payoffs and Expected Cost of Collaboration with (or Defection to) Insurgents	199
7.3 Defection as a Function of Control	200
7.4 Individuals' Equilibrium Strategies	202
7.5 Denunciation Equilibria	203
7.6 Selective Violence and Control	204
7.7 Predicted Pattern of Selective Violence, Defection, and Denunciation	205
9.1 Greece and the Argolid	250
9.2 Villages Studied, Argos and Nafplía Counties, Argolid Prefecture	251
9.3 The Spatial Distribution of Selective Violence, September 1943–September 1944	268
9.4 The Spatial Distribution of Indiscriminate Violence, September 1943–September 1944	269
9.5 Selective Violence by Actor and Geographic Location	271
9.6 Selective Violence by Actor and Location	271
9.7 Temporal Variation of Violence by Actor and Type	274
9.8 Frequency and Intensity of Incumbent Indiscriminate Violence	275
9.9 Distribution of Control	276
9.10 Selective Violence by Zone of Control and Actor	279
9.11 Distribution of Selective Violence across Control Zones	279
9.12 Proportional Distribution of Selective Violence across Control Zones	280
9.13 Predicted versus Observed Violence	281
9.14 Predicted versus Observed Nonviolence	281
9.15 Violence and Control, September 1943–15 May 1944	282
9.16 Violence and Control, 15 May 1944–30 June 1944	283
9.17 Violence and Control, 1 July 1944–1 August 1944	284
9.18 Violence and Control, 1 August 1944–1 September 1944	285
9.19 Village Type and Altitude	317
A.1 Respondents from Thiriopetra, Almopia; Tseria, Messinia; and Prosimni, Argolid	396

Acknowledgments

This book is the outcome of an unexpected disruption. In 1997 the United States Information Agency told me that I had to spend two years in Greece because of a visa regulation. At the time I was teaching at NYU and did not welcome this prospect. Yet my forced stay in Greece led to exploratory fieldwork that eventually impelled me to shift altogether my research agenda toward the study of civil war and violence. I am indebted to Roger Petersen for discussing with me this fascinating topic just before my departure for Greece and to Adam Przeworski for supporting with enthusiasm what seemed at the time like a highly improbable research venture.

Once in Greece, I relied on a network of friends for my first contacts. Yannis Apostolopoulos, Dimitra Hadjiangelaki, Kostas Heliotis, and Vangelis Kombotis proved immensely helpful. Tasoula Vervenioti was instrumental in convincing me that interviews were both possible and valuable – against the opposite advice I had received from several professional historians in Greece. My friend Nikos Argyropoulos was helpful and supportive, as always. George Mavrogordatos wisely mixed encouragement and criticism. I cannot thank Marina Tsouloucha enough; she, over many years, helped me mine the riches of the Historical Archive of the Argolid. I also thank H. F. Meyer and G. Th. Mavrogordatos for sharing some of the archival material they collected, and the Near East Foundation for retrieving and making available to me the *Village Social Organization in Greece* study.

More people than I can possibly list here listened to my arguments in formal or informal settings, invited me to seminars and workshops where I presented my research, read my work, and offered comments. I want to single out just a few: Lars-Erik Cederman, Kanchan Chandra, Jim Fearon, Manolis Galenianos, Diego Gambetta, Michael Hechter, Macartan Humphreys, Matt Kocher, David Laitin, Nikos Marantzidis, Nikolay Marinov, John Roemer, Nicholas Sambanis, Ignacio Sanchez Cuenca, Jonah Schulhofer-Wohl, Steven Shewfelt, Jim Vreeland, and Elisabeth Wood. Ana M. Arjona was particularly helpful during the final stretch, as were Sandy Henderson and Abbey Steele, who helped edit the manuscript.

Four anonymous reviewers provided valuable feedback. Margaret Levi supported this project from its early stages, as did Lew Bateman. I thank them all.

I started this project at NYU, began writing while at the University of Chicago, and completed the book at Yale. All three institutions provided an excellent intellectual and professional environment. The European University Institute and the Juan March Institute hosted me at crucial times, allowing me to make significant headway; for this, I am very grateful to Daniel Verdier and José Maria Maravall. The H. F. Guggenheim Foundation funded my research in northern Greece, part of which is included here. Thanks to Chrysostomos Mantzavinos and Christoph Engel, I was able to prepare the manuscript for publication in the wonderful environment of the Max Planck Institute for Research in Collective Goods in Bonn. I am very grateful to Ian Shapiro and the Yale Center for International and Area Studies for their support in publishing this book.

I was fortunate to include parts of this book in graduate seminars I taught at Chicago, Juan March, and Yale. My students took my work apart ruthlessly, sending me back repeatedly to fix the problems they identified; this bespeaks the quality of their feedback and their contribution to the final project.

For superb research assistance, I would like to thank Ioannis Evrigenis, Ioanna Karariga, Panayota Koliatsi, Harris Mylonas, Nassos Roussias, Sebastian Saiegh, Andromachi Tsomaka, and Jieun Yoo. Steve Citron-Pousty designed the maps. I acknowledge the permission to use the material in Chapters 6 and 11, whose earlier versions appeared as “The Paradox of Terrorism in Civil War,” *Journal of Ethics* 8:1 (2004): 97–138, and “The Ontology of ‘Political Violence’: Action and Identity in Civil Wars,” *Perspectives on Politics* 1:3 (2003): 475–94.

I acquired many friends among the people I interviewed, but I am particularly indebted to the Kalymniou, Skinochoritis, and Yannakou families for their warm hospitality and friendship. At the same time, I owe many thanks to all the people who opened their doors to me in Greece. Many were initially distrustful, but they grew friendly as the conversation went on; they spoke with passion, emotion, and great intelligence about their lives, their beliefs, their suffering, their hopes. This was a life-changing experience for me. This book does very little justice to their remarkably rich and cogent recollections. I am already at work on another book that will be based directly on their stories, as well as the stories that I recovered from the archives.

I would not have been able to carry out this research without the emotional and material support of my parents, Nikos and Margarita Kalyvas, to whom I am, once more, deeply grateful. The book is dedicated to Angeliki Louvi, who was there throughout the entire project, from conception to end. I need not say more, for she already knows.

Abbreviations

AMFOGE	Allied Mission for Observing the Greek Elections
ARVN	Army of the Republic of Vietnam
ASKI, KKE	Archive of Contemporary Social History, Archive of the Communist Party of Greece
AUC	United Self-Defense Forces of Colombia
BLO	British Liaison Officer
DAN	Municipal Archives of Nafplio
DIS/AEA	Directorate of Army History, Archive of National Resistance
DSE	Democratic Army of Greece
EAM	National Liberation Front
EDES	National Democratic Greek League
EES	Greek National Army
EGP	Guerrilla Army of the Poor
EKKA	National and Social Liberation
ELAS	National Popular Liberation Army
ELF	Ethnolinguistic Fractionalization Index
ELN	National Liberation Army
ERP	Revolutionary Army of the People
ETA	Basque Fatherland and Liberty
FARC	Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia
FECCAS	Christian Federation of Salvadoran Peasants
FLN	Front of National Liberation
FMLN	Farabundo Martí National Liberation Front
FRELIMO	Liberation Front of Mozambique
FRETILIN	Revolutionary Front of Independent East Timor
GIA	Armed Islamic Group
GVN	Government of the Republic of Vietnam

HAA/DAN	Historical Archive of the Argolid, Municipal Archives of Nafplion
HAA/EDD	Historical Archive of the Argolid, Special Court of Collaborators
HES	Hamlet Evaluation System
INLA	Irish National Liberation Army
IRA	Irish Republican Army
JVP	People's Liberation Front
KKE	Communist Party of Greece
KLA	Kosovo Liberation Army
KMT	Kuomintang
LTTE	Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam
MI ₅	British domestic intelligence service
MPAJA	Malayan People's Anti-Japanese Army
MPLA	Popular Movement for the Liberation of Angola
MRLA	Malay Races Liberation Army
MTLD	Movement for the Triumph of Democratic Freedoms
NDF	National Democratic Front
NEF	Near East Foundation
NGOs	nongovernmental organizations
NKVD	People's Commissariat for Internal Affairs
NPA	New People's Army
NPFL	National Patriotic Front of Liberia
OPLA	Organization for the Protection of People's Fighters
ORDEN	Nationalist Democratic Organization
PASOK	Panhellenic Socialist Movement
PEEA	Political Committee of National Liberation
PF	Popular Forces
PKK	Kurdistan Workers' Party
PPF	Popular Party of France
PRI	Institutional Revolutionary Party
PRO, FO	Public Records Office, Foreign Office Records
PRO, HS	Public Records Office, Special Operations Executive Records
RENAMO	Mozambican National Resistance
RUF	Revolutionary United Front
SB	Security Battalion
SWAPO	South West Africa People's Organization
UNITA	National Union for the Total Independence of Angola
UVF	Ulster Volunteer Force
VC	Vietcong
VCI	Vietcong Infrastructure
ZSt.	Zentrale Stelle der Landesjustizverwaltungen

Cambridge University Press
0521854091 - The Logic of Violence in Civil War
Stathis N. Kalyvas
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

The Logic of Violence in Civil War