VALUE ADDED TAX

This book integrates legal, economic, and administrative materials about value added tax. Its principal purpose is to provide comprehensive teaching tools – laws, cases, analytical exercises, and questions drawn from the experience of countries and organizations around the world. It also serves as a resource for tax practitioners and government officials that must grapple with issues under their VAT or their prospective VAT. The comparative presentation of this volume offers an analysis of policy issues relating to tax structure and tax base as well as insights into how cases arising out of VAT disputes have been resolved. In the new edition, the authors have expanded the coverage to include new VAT-related developments in Europe, Asia, Africa, and Australia. A new chapter on financial services has been added as well as an analysis of significant new cases.

Alan Schenk teaches VAT at Wayne State University and has taught VAT at other universities such as Harvard University, the University of Michigan, and the University of San Diego. For the past eight years, Professor Schenk has served as Technical Advisor for the International Monetary Fund, drafting and reviewing legislative proposals for sales and value added tax for several countries in Africa and for emerging economies of Eastern Europe. He is the author of four books and has published many articles on VAT including several involving the taxation of financial services.

Oliver Oldman is Learned Hand Professor of Law, Emeritus, at the Harvard Law School. For twenty-five years until July 1989, he was the Director of the School’s International Tax Program. He has been a member of the Law School Faculty since 1955 when he began directing the Tax Program’s training activities and was appointed Professor of Law in 1961. He began teaching about value added taxes in his Comparative Tax Policy course in the 1960s and offered his first separate course on the value added tax in 1979. He has taught the course continuously at Harvard Law School since then. Professor Schenk has been a frequent guest lecturer.
Value Added Tax
A COMPARATIVE APPROACH

Alan Schenk
Wayne State University

Oliver Oldman
Harvard Law School
To
Jared, Ethan, Daniel, Jordan & Rae
AS

Sumi & Robyn
OO
Contents

List of Tables, Figures, and Charts   page  xxiii
List of Cases                      xxv
Preface to the Revised Edition     xxxiii

1 SURVEY OF TAXES ON CONSUMPTION AND INCOME, AND INTRODUCTION TO VALUE ADDED TAX  1
   I. Introduction                  1
   II. Development of Taxes on Consumption – A Brief Review of History  2
   III. Direct and Indirect Taxes on an Income or Consumption Base  5
      A. Direct and Indirect Taxes  5
      B. Income and Consumption Base for Tax  8
   IV. Tax Structures in Developed and Developing Economies  13
   V. Broadening the Base of a Tax System  16
   VI. The Value Added Tax  16
   VII. The Proliferation of VATs  17
   VIII. Glossary of VAT Terms  19
   IX. Outline of Issues Pertaining to Consumption Taxes  23
   X. Discussion Questions  24

APPENDIX A: DEVELOPMENT TAXATION  25
   I. Introduction  25
   II. The Reform of Indirect Taxation  27
Contents

III. Taxing Imports 27

IV. Taxing Exports 28

2 Forms of Consumption-Based Taxes and Altering the Tax Base 30

I. Forms of Consumption-Based Taxes 30
A. Introduction 30
B. Consumption-Based Direct Tax on Individuals 30
C. Single and Multistage Sales Taxes 33

II. Overview of the Value Added Tax 33
A. In General 33
B. Jurisdictional Reach of the Tax 35
C. Inclusion of VAT in Tax Base 35
D. Inclusion of Capital Goods in Tax Base 36

III. Methods of Calculating VAT Liability 38
A. Credit-Invoice VAT 38
B. Credit-Subtraction VAT That Does Not Rely on VAT Invoices 41
C. Sales-Subtraction VAT 42
D. Addition-Method VAT 43

IV. Methods of Altering the Tax Base 46
A. Entity Exemptions 48
B. Zero Rating 50
C. Transaction Exemption 52
D. Alteration of Base by Granting or Denying Credits 54
E. Multiple Rates 54

V. Discussion Questions 55

3 Varieties of VAT in Use 58

I. Introduction 58

II. European Union: A Mature VAT Resistant to Change 59
A. VAT in the European Community 59
B. European Court of Justice 63
C. Application of the EU Sixth VAT Directive 64
1. History and proposal for recodification 64
2. When is a tax on consumption not a turnover tax or VAT in violation of the sixth directive? 64
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Contents</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Japanese Consumption Tax</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Credit-subtraction VAT without invoices</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Movement toward invoice-method VAT</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. New Zealand Goods and Services Tax</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Broad Tax Base</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Taxation of Government Services</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Taxation of Casualty and Other Nonlife Insurance</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Global Reach of the New Zealand GST</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. African Experience Expanding Base to Tax Financial Services</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Commonlaw and Civil Law Approaches</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Registration, Taxpayer, and Taxable Business Activity</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Registration</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. In General</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Mandatory Registration</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. General rules</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Promoters of public entertainment</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Registration regardless of turnover</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Registration Threshold and the Small Business Exemption</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. In general</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. What is the business?</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Splitting a business and the related person rules</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Severing value from the business</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Voluntary Registration</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Cancellation of Registration</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Transition to Registration and Cancellation of Registration</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G. Registration of Branches and Group of Companies</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H. Electronic Commerce</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Telecommunication Services</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Person Liable for Tax</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. General Principles</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Person Treated as Seller</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. In general</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Electronic commerce and telecommunication services rendered by nonresidents</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Auctions</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Other sales by nonowners</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Local government services</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Tax Collectible from Third Persons</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
x  Contents

IV. Business Activity Subject to VAT 98
A. Taxable Activity 98
B. Personal Sales 102
C. When Does a Business Begin? 106
D. Employee Not Engaged in Taxable Activity 108

V. Discussion Questions 109

5 Taxable Supplies of Goods and Services, and Tax Invoices 111
I. Introduction 111

II. Sales of Goods and Services 111
A. What Is a Sale or Supply? 112
   1. Nonsupplies or supplies other than in the course of taxable activity 113
   2. Sales for consideration 116
   3. Transactions or transfers deemed to be supplies for VAT purposes 122
      a. Cease to conduct taxable transactions 122
      b. Diversion of business assets to personal or employee use 123
      c. Change in the use of goods or services 124
      d. Repossession of goods sold in a taxable transaction 124
   B. Goods or Services 124
   C. Supply of Goods 125
   D. Supply of Services 126
   E. What Is “the” Supply for VAT Purposes? – Single, Mixed, and Composite Supplies 130
   F. Vouchers 137

III. The Tax or VAT Invoice 138
A. Role of VAT Invoice 138
B. Who Receives VAT Invoices? 139
C. Contents of Required VAT Invoices 139
D. Waiver of Required VAT Invoices 140

IV. Discussion Questions 140

6 The Tax Credit Mechanism 141
I. Tax Credit for Purchases 141
A. Basic Input Tax Credit Rules 141
   1. Allowance of credit – general rules 141
   2. Credit for input VAT on capital goods 143
   3. Conditions to claim credit for input VAT 144
   4. Credit denied on purchases for exempt and other nontaxable transactions 149
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B. Impact of Subsidies on Allowable Input Credits</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Pre-opening Expenses and Posteconomic Activity</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. De Minimis Rule</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Transactions Involving Shares and Debt</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Bad Debts</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Treatment of Excess Input Credits – Carry Forward, Offset, or Refund</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Impact of Change from Exempt to Taxable Status</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Used Property</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Business-to-Business Sales of Used Property</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Sales of Used Property in Nontaxable Transactions</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Postsale Price Adjustments and Refunds</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. In General</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Returns and Allowances – Credit and Debit Notes</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Postsale Rebate by Pre-retail Registered Business to Final Consumer</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Casual Sales by Consumers</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Japan’s System to Calculate Input Credits</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Calculation of Tax Liability and Special Schemes</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Discussion Questions</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 INTRODUCTION TO CROSS-BORDER ASPECTS OF VAT</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction to International Trade</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Vocabulary of Interjurisdictional (Cross-Border) Aspects of VAT</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Taxonomy of Broad-Based Sales Taxes on International Trade</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Origin Versus Destination Principle</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. In General</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Double Taxation of Consumer-to-Consumer Imports</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Place of Supply Rules in International Trade</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Basic Rules on the Place of a Supply of Goods and Services</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Recent Developments in the EU on the Place of Supply</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Territorial Versus Global Reach of a VAT</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Imports</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Imports of Goods</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Imports of Services</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VII. Exports 205
A. Exports of Goods 205
B. Exports of Services 205

VIII. Telecommunications, Electronically Supplied Services, and E-Commerce 209
A. Introduction 209
B. Place of Supply of Services Involving Telecommunications, Electronically Supplied Services, and E-Commerce 210
   1. Telecommunications services 210
   2. Radio, television, and electronically supplied services 212
   3. Electronic commerce 216

IX. International Transportation Services 219

X. Proposals to Fund Relief of Disaster Victims or Poverty with an International Tax 220
A. Introduction 220
B. Professor Kaneko’s Proposal to Fund Disaster Relief with an International Humanitarian Tax 220
C. Proposals by President Chirac and Others to Fund Poverty Relief Efforts, the Fight against AIDS, or Development Projects with a Dedicated Tax 222

XI. Discussion Questions 223

Ⅸ. Timing and Valuation Rules 224
Ⅰ. The Timing Rules 224
A. Accrual, Invoice, and Cash Methods – in General 224
   1. Imports 226
   2. Accrual method 227
   3. Invoice method 234
   4. Cash method 235
B. Effects of Length of Taxable Period 236
   1. Taxable period – in general 236
   2. Variations in length of period 237
   3. Time to file returns and pay tax 238
   4. Cash-flow effects 238
C. Special Rules for Certain Sales 239
   1. Installment or deferred payment sales 239
   2. Goods diverted to personal use 241
   3. Other special cases 241

Ⅱ. Transition Rules 241
A. Introduction 241
VII. Special Treatment for Diplomats, Embassies, and International Organizations 298

VIII. Discussion Questions 299

10 GAMBLING AND FINANCIAL SERVICES (OTHER THAN INSURANCE) 301

I. General Introduction 301

II. Gambling, Lotteries, and Other Games of Chance 301

III. Financial Services Involving Money and Financial Products (Other than Insurance) 304
   A. Introduction 304
   B. Variety of Transactions Involving Financial Services 305
   C. Financial Intermediation Services 306
   D. Principles to Guide the Taxation of Financial Services 313
   E. Interest Paid on Credit Sales to Consumers 314
   F. Exemption for Financial Intermediation Services as Implemented in the EU 314
      1. Introduction 314
      2. Exemption for financial services in the EU followed elsewhere 315
      3. Effects of exemption at an intermediate or retail stage 317
   G. Vertical Integration and Outsourcing 317
   H. Input Tax Credits and the Allocation of the Credits Between Taxable and Exempt Activities 324
      1. Introduction 324
      2. Methods of allocating disallowed credits 325
      3. Credit denied for VAT on purchases by consumers: credit when purchase is made for investment 327
   I. Departures from EU in the Taxation of Financial Services 327
      1. Introduction 327
      2. Israel and Argentina 328
      3. South Africa 329
      4. Singapore, New Zealand, and Australia 331
         a. Singapore’s zero rating of financial services rendered to taxable customers 331
         b. New Zealand zero rates some financial services rendered by financial service providers 331
         c. Australia’s treatment of financial services 333
      5. Italy’s subtraction-method IRAP imposed at the subnational level 335
Contents

IV. Proposals to Tax Financial Intermediation Services 335
   A. Introduction 335
   B. Canadian Flirtation with Taxation of Intermediation Services 335
   C. Proposals in the United States 336
   D. The Poddar–English Proposal 337
   E. Zee’s Modified Reverse-Charging Approach 339
V. Discussion Questions 341

11 Insurance 343
   I. Introduction 343
      A. International Insurance Services 344
      B. Domestic Insurance Services 344
   II. Broad-Based Tax on Casualty Insurance 345
   III. Exemption for Insurance Other than Life Insurance 346
   IV. New Zealand Taxation of Insurance 348
      A. Application of the N.Z. Taxation of Casualty Insurance to Policyholders in Business 351
      B. Application of the N.Z. Taxation of Casualty Insurance to Policyholders Who Are Consumers 353
      C. Are Warranties “Insurance” in New Zealand? 354
   V. Australia’s Taxation of Insurance 355
   VI. A U.S. Proposal – The Nunn–Domenici USA Tax System 356
   VII. Discussion Questions 356

12 Interjurisdictional Aspects of VAT in Federal Countries and Common Markets 358
   I. Introduction 358
   II. EU’s Commitment to Intra-Union Borderless Trade 361
      A. Introduction 361
      B. Selected Provisions of the Treaty Establishing the European Community 362
      C. Timetable to Move Toward a Definitive VAT Regime 364
      D. EU Required Exchange of Tax Information 364
   III. EU Member States Limited to One VAT 365
   Letter to the President of the European Court of Justice Concerning the Italian IRAP and the European VAT 367
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>EU Commitment to an Origin VAT: Its Problems and Proposals</td>
<td>373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. In general and early proposals</td>
<td>373</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. The Keen and Smith VIVAT for intra-EU trade</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>Canadian VATs and the Bird/Gendron Dual VAT</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Variety of Canadian Sales and Value Added Taxes</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Bird and Gendron Dual VAT Proposal</td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Application of Dual VAT Concept to the EU</td>
<td>380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>Brazil and the Varsano “Little Boat Model”</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Brazil’s Tax Structure in General</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Varsano’s “Little Boat Model”</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. McLure’s CVAT Modification of Varsano Proposal</td>
<td>384</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Comparison of the Features of the CVAT, VIVAT, and Dual VAT Proposals</td>
<td>388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>Subnational VATs in India</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Enacted State-Level VATs</td>
<td>390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Prepaid VAT Proposed for India by Poddar and Hutton</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>Origin-Based Business Value Tax (BVT) to Finance Subnational Government</td>
<td>393</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX</td>
<td>Reform of Subnational Taxes in the United States</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. Coexistence of Federal VAT and State Retail Sales Tax</td>
<td>397</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Subnational VATs in Use and Proposed for the United States</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Michigan single business tax</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. West Virginia’s proposed single business tax</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. New Hampshire business enterprise tax</td>
<td>403</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Streamlined Sales and Use Tax</td>
<td>404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>D. Ainsworth’s Digital VAT</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>Discussion Questions</td>
<td>406</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 13 Real Property

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>Array of VAT Treatment of Real (or Immovable) Property</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>EU Approach to the Taxation of Real (or Immovable) Property</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A. In General</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. Exemption for Leasing and Terminating a Lease</td>
<td>412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. What is a “lease” or “letting” of immovable property?</td>
<td>412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Disposition or transfer of a lease</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C. Mixed Business–Personal Use</td>
<td>425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Tax-Motivated Transactions</td>
<td>428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Proposals for the Taxation of Real Property</td>
<td>429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Discussion Questions</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 Proposals for U.S. Tax on Consumption</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Introduction</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. President Bush’s Advisory Panel on Tax Reform</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Value Added Tax Considered</td>
<td>436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The Growth and Investment Tax Plan</td>
<td>437</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Gibbons and Graetz VATs Replacing Most Income Tax</td>
<td>440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. The USA Tax System: Coordinated Consumption-Based Individual and Business Taxes</td>
<td>442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The Business Tax</td>
<td>443</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The Income Tax</td>
<td>445</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. The Flat Tax</td>
<td>448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Hall-Rabushka Flat Tax</td>
<td>449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Shelby Flat Tax</td>
<td>449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. National Retail Sales Tax</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Introduction</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The Chambliss Bill</td>
<td>452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Basic framework and scope of the tax base</td>
<td>452</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Special treatment for government entities and nonprofit organizations</td>
<td>453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. RST credits</td>
<td>454</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Rebate to low-income households</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Taxation of financial intermediation services</td>
<td>455</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Timing rules</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. State authority to collect tax and federal support</td>
<td>456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Elective Flat Rate Income Taxes</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Discussion Question</td>
<td>458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIXES</td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Appendix A VATs Worldwide

#### Appendix B Commonwealth of New Vatopia Value Added Tax Act

Part I. Preliminary
## Contents

Part IV. Registration 481

20. Registration 481
21. Registration Procedure 482
22. Cancellation of Registration 483

Part V. Tax Period, Returns, and Calculation of Tax Payable 484

23. Tax Period 484
24. Returns 484
25. Extension of Time 485
26. Calculation of Tax Payable for Tax Period 485
27. Input Tax Deduction 485
28. Input Tax Deduction Allocation and Disallowance Rules 487
29. Post-sale Adjustments 488
30. Bad Debt 489
31. Interest on Unpaid Tax 490
32. Tax Invoices and Sales Invoices 490
33. Tax Credit and Debit Notes 491

Part VI. Payment, Collection, and Recovery 491

34. Due Date for Payment of Tax 491
35. Allocation of Payments among Tax, Interest, and Penalties 492
36. Recovery of Tax as Debt Due 492
37. Recovery of Tax from Persons Leaving Vatopia 493
38. Security 493
39. Preferential Claim to Assets 493
40. Seizure of Goods and Vehicles 494
41. Distress Proceedings 495
42. Recovery of Tax from Recipient of Supply 495
43. Recovery of Tax from Third Parties 496
44. Duties of Receivers 496

Part VII. Refund of Tax and Tax Relief 497

45. Carry Forward of Excess Deductions and Refund of Tax 497
46. Interest on Overpayment 499
47. Others Eligible for Tax Refund 499

Part VIII. Assessments 500

48. Assessments 500
49. General Provisions Relating to Assessments 501

Part IX. Objections and Appeals 501

50. Objections 501
51. Appeal to Commissioner of Appeals 502
52. Appeal to High Court 503
53. Burden of Proof 503
Contents

Part X. Special Cases 503
  54. Persons Acting in a Representative Capacity 503
  55. Power to Appoint Representatives 504
  56. Branches 504
  57. Bodies of Persons (Other than Incorporated Companies) 505
  58. Death or Insolvency of Taxable Person; Mortgagee in Possession 505
  59. Trustee 505

Part XI. Records and Investigation Powers 506
  60. Meaning of “Records” 506
  61. Record-keeping 506
  63. Records Not in Vatopian Language 507
  64. Notice to Obtain Information or Evidence 507

Part XII. Offences and Penalties 508
  Division I: Criminal Offenses 508
    65. Power to Bring Criminal Charges 508
    66. Time Limits for Proceedings to Be Taken 508
    67. Tax Evasion 508
    68. False or Misleading Statements 508
    69. Obstructing Taxation Officers 509
    70. Offences by Taxation Officers 509
    71. Offences by Companies, Aiders, and Abetters 509
    72. General Penalty 510
    73. Compounding of Offences 510
  Division II: Civil Penalties 510
    74. General Provisions 510
    75. Penalty for Making False or Misleading Statements 511
    76. Recovery or Remission of Penalties 511
    77. Temporary Closure of Business Premises 511

Part XIII. Miscellaneous 512
  78. VAT Registration Number 512
  79. Forms and Notices; Authentication of Documents 512
  80. Service of Notices 513
  81. Tax-Inclusive Pricing 513
  82. Schemes for Obtaining Tax Benefits 513
  83. Currency Conversion 514
  84. International Agreements 514
  85. Registration of Certain Goods Prohibited in Certain Circumstances 514
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>86.</td>
<td>Auctioneer and Agent</td>
<td>515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87.</td>
<td>Regulations</td>
<td>515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88.</td>
<td>Variation of Consideration on a Change in Rate</td>
<td>516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89.</td>
<td>Application of Increased or Reduced Rate</td>
<td>516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90.</td>
<td>Orders to Amend Schedules or Change Amounts or Tax Rate</td>
<td>517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91.</td>
<td>Repeal of Laws and Interpretation</td>
<td>517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>92.</td>
<td>Transitional</td>
<td>517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule I</td>
<td>Zero-Rated Supplies for Purposes of Section 15</td>
<td>519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule II</td>
<td>Exempt Supplies for Purposes of Section 16</td>
<td>521</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule III</td>
<td>Exempt Imports for Purposes of Section 17</td>
<td>523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule IV</td>
<td>Tax Invoices, Tax Credit Notes, and Tax Debit Notes for Purposes of Sections 32 and 33</td>
<td>523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule V</td>
<td>Registration Threshold, Interest Rates, and Other Amounts for Purposes of Various Sections of the Act</td>
<td>524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schedule VI</td>
<td>Repeal of Laws and Interpretation for Purposes of Section 91</td>
<td>524</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Index**

525
List of Tables, Figures, and Charts

Chapter 1
Table 1 Turnover Tax Nonintegrated and Vertically Integrated Business
Table 2 Improved Turnover Tax Nonintegrated and Vertically Integrated Business
Figure 1 Income and Product Flows Under Income and Consumption Tax Bases
Table 3 Flows of Factor Payments to Households and Tax Bases of Firms
Table 4 Select OECD Countries – 2002
Table 5 U.S. Federal Tax Receipts as Percentage of GDP
Table 6 Total Taxes as % of GDP
Table 7 Total Tax on Goods and Services as Percentage of GDP (the date in parenthesis is the date VAT was introduced or became effective)

Chapter 2
Table 1 Gross Domestic Product and Personal Consumption Data for 2004 (in billions)
Table 2 Output Tax/Input Credits (Net VAT)
Table 3 Output Tax/Input Credits (Net CT liability)
Table 4 Taxable Sales (Purchases allowable as deductions)
Table 5 Taxable Sales (Expenses for VAT purposes)
Table 6 Wages, Interest, and Rent Expenses
Table 7 Data Set
Table 7 Calculation of Base under Gross Product, Income, and Consumption VAT
Table 8 Illustration of Car Rental Firm Renting Only for Personal Consumption
Table 9 Possible Sales Tax Bases and Tax Payments (10% rate)
Table 10 Adapted from “The Value-Added Tax in Developing Countries”
List of Tables, Figures, and Charts

Chapter 4
Table 1 Illustration of the Problem of Small Business Under a Credit-Method VAT 80

Chapter 6
Figure 1 Excess Input VATs 168

Chapter 7
Table 1 Options for the Taxation of Domestic and International Trade 182
Table 2 Example of Destination and Origin Principles 184

Chapter 9
Table 1 Wholesale Stage/Retail Stage Zero Rating Scale 264
Table 2 Wholesale Stage/Retail Stage Exemption Scale 269

Chapter 10
Table 1 Percent Value Added Tax with Financial Intermediaries Excluded from the Tax Base 311

Chapter 11
Table 1 Ideal Casualty Insurance Co. Pro Forma Profit Statement for VAT Purposes for the Year Ending December 31, 2005 350
Table 2 VAT Return Ideal Casualty Insurance Co. for the Year 2005 351
Table 3 New Zealand Casualty Insurance Co. Pro Forma Profit Statement for GST Purposes for the Year Ending December 31, 2005 352
Table 4 GST Return New Zealand Casualty Co. for the Year 2005 353

Chapter 12
Chart 1 A Corporation Sale to Domestic B Corporation 375
Chart 2 A Corporation Intraprovince Sale to B Corporation 379
Chart 3 A Corporation Intrastate Sale to B Corporation 385

Chapter 13
Chart 1 Summary of Tax Treatment of Real Property under the Model Act 430
List of Cases

Cases listed by name of the taxpayer or, for action by the European Commission, the country. Highlighted cases are main textual cases.

Addidas New Zealand Ltd v. Collector of Customs
Alan Ridley v. Commissioners of Custom and Excise
Edmond Michael Alexander v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise
Apple and Pear Development Council v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise
Argos Distributors Ltd v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
Armbrecht, Finanzamt Uelzen v.
Arthur Andersen & Co. Accountants, Staatssecretaris van Financien v.
ASBL Office des Produits Wallons v. Belgium State
Assurandor-Societet, acting on behalf of Taksatorringen v. Skatteministeriet
Atlas Marketing v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise
Aubrett Holdings Ltd. v. H.M. The Queen
Auckland Institute of Studies Ltd v. Commissioner of Inland Revenue
A-Z Electrical v. The Commissioners of Customs & Excise
Banca Popolare di Cremona v. Agenzia Entrate Ufficio Cremona
Barclays Bank PLC v. The Commissioners
BAZ Bausystem AG v. Finanzamt München fur Körperschaften
Bay Ferries Ltd. v. The Queen
Bebenhams Retail plc v. Revenue and Customs
List of Cases

Gunter Berkholz v. Finanzamt Hamburg-Mitte-Altstadt
Beynon (Dr.) and Partners v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
BLP Group plc v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
The Boots Company plc v. Commissioners of Customs & Excise
British Airways plc v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise
British Telecommunications plc, Commissioners of Customs and Excise v.
Canadian Airlines International Ltd v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise
Cantor Fitzgerald International v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise
Card Protection Plan Ltd v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
(Careda SA) Federacion nacional de operadores de maquinas recreativas y de azar, (Femara) and Asociacion Espanola de empresarios de maquinas recreativas, (Facomare) v. Administracion General del Estado
Carlton Lodge Club v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
Carpaneto Piacentino (Comune di) and Others v. Ufficio Provinciale Imposta Sul Valore Aggiunto di Piacenza (Provincial VAT Office, Piacenza)
Case 38,253 (Hoge Road, Netherlands)
Case N23 (N.Z. 1991)
Case N46 (N.Z. 1991)
Case P22 (N.Z. 1992)
Case T2 (N.Z. 1997)
Case T35 (N.Z. 1996)
Chef on the Run Franchise Division Ltd. v. The Queen
Ch’elle Properties (NZ) Ltd v. Commissioner of Inland Revenue
College of Estate Management v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
Colour Offset Ltd, Customs and Excise Commissioners v.
Complete Cuisine & Fine Foods to Go (1988) Ltd. v. The Queen
Containers Ltd v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
Co-operative Aadappelenbewarplaats G.A., Staatssecretaris van Financiën v.
Co-operative Retail Services Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise
List of Cases

CSR Ltd. v. Hornsby Shire Council
d’Ambrumenil (Peter) and Dispute Resolution Services Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs & Excise
Debenhams Retail plc v. Revenue and Customs Commissioners
Debouche (Etienne) v. Inspecteur der Invoerrechten en Accijnzen
Empire Stores Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise
Faxworld Worgrundungsgesellschaft Peter Hunninghausen und Wolfgang Klein Gbr, Finanzamt Offenback am Main-Land v.
Fazenda Publica and Solisnor-Estaleiros Navais SA
FDR Ltd, Customs and Excise Commissioners v.
Fine Art Developments plc v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
ISt internationale Sprach- und Studienreisen GmbH, Finanzamt Heidelberg v.
First National Bank of Chicago, Commissioners of Customs and Excise v.
Fonden Marselisborg Lystbadehavn v. Skatteministeriet
Förvaltnings AB Stenholmen v. Riksskatteverket
French Republic, Commission of the European Communities v. (Case C-40/00)
French Republic, Commission of the European Communities v. (Case C-429/97)
Gabalfrisa SL and Others v. Agencia Estatel de Administración Tributaria, joined cases
Gaston Schul Douane-Expéditeur BV, Staatssecretaris van Financiën v.
Ghent Coal Terminal NV, Belgium v.

Germany, Re VAT on Postal Transport: EC Commission v. Germany

Germany (Federal Republic of), Commission of the European Communities v. (Case C-287/00)
Germany (Federal Republic of), Commission of the European Communities v. (Case C-427/98)
GIL Insurance Ltd and Others v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise
Gold Star Publications Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise
Goods and Services Tax (Reference re)
Greenall
Glassborow and Another, Commissioners of Customs and Excise v.
List of Cases

Gulf Harbour Development Ltd, Commissioner of Inland Revenue v.


Halifax plc, Leeds Permanent Development Services Ltd, County Wide Property

Halifax plc and others v. Customs and Excise Commissioners

Hans V. Hundt-Eßwein, Case C-25/03, Finanzamt Bergisch Gladbach v.

Haydon-Baillie (W. G.) v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Hellenic Republic, Commission of the European Communities v.

Hotel Scandic Gasaback AB (Scandi’) v. Riksskatteverket

Howard v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Huddersfield Higher Education Corporation (University of) v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Ian Flockton Developments Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Intercommunale voor zeewaterontzilting (Inzo), in liquidation v. Belgian State

International Bible Students Association v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Investments Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs & Excise, Case C-255/02

I/S Fini H v. Skatteministeriet (Danish Ministry of Taxation)

Italian Republic, Commission of the European Communities v. (Case C-78/00)

Italian Republic, Commission of the European Communities v. [1990]

Itel Containers Int’l Corp. v. Huddleston

Kandawala v. The Queen


Keeping Newcastle Warm Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs & Excise

Kingcrest Associates Ltd, Montecello Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs & Excise

Köhler, Antje v. Finanzamt Dusseldorf-Nord

KPMG Peat Marwick McLintock v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise
List of Cases

Kommanditgesellschaft in Firma KG HJ Glawe Spiel-und Unterhaltungsgerate Augststellungsge MbH & Co v. Finanzamt Hamburg-Barmbek-Uhlenhorst

Kretztechnik AG v. Finanzamt Linz

Edith Linneweber, Finanzamt Gladbeck v.; and Finanzamt Herne-West v. Savvas Akritidis

Lubbock Fine & Co. v. Commissioner of Customs and Excise

Luxembourg (Grand Duchy of), Commission of the European Communities v. (Case C-90/05)

Lipjes (D.), Staatssecretaris van Financiën v.

Maierhofer (Rudolf) v. Finanzamt Augsburg-Land

Maritime Life Assurance Company (The) v. HM The Queen

Mazet (SA Etablissements Louis) et autres v. Ministere d’Economie, Finances, et de l’Industrie

Mohr (Jurgen) v. Finanzamt Bad Segeberg

Marner and Marner, Commissioners of Customs and Excise v.

Marshall v. C & E Commissioners, 1975 VATTR 98

Mirror Group plc v. Commissioners of Customs & Excise

Mitchell Verification Services Group Inc. v. HM The Queen

MKG-Kraftfahrzeuge-Factoring GmbH, Finanzamt Groß-Gerau v.

Montgomery (Jane) Ltd, Customs and Excise Commissioners v.

Moonrakers Guest House Ltd., Customs & Excise Commissioners v.

Multi-Choice (U) Ltd. v. Uganda Revenue Authority

Muys’ en DeWinter’s Bouw – en Aannemingsbedrijf BV v. Staatssecretaris van Financiën

National Bellas Hess, Inc. v. Department of Revenue of Illinois

National Educare Forum v. Commissioner, South African Revenue Service

National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children (The) v. Customs and Excise Commissioners

Naturally Yours Cosmetics Ltd v. Customs and Excise

NDP Co. Ltd v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Notaries and Bailiffs (Re): EC Commission v. Netherlands

Oliver, Customs and Excise Commissioners v.

O’Meara v. Commissioner of Taxation, [2003] FCA 217
List of Cases

Open University v. The Commissioners

Optigen Ltd, Fulcrum Electronics Ltd and Bond House Systems Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs & Excise

Pelleted Casehardening Salts Ltd v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Pennystar Ltd., Customs & Excise Commissioners v.

Polysar Investments Netherlands BV v. Inspecteur der Invveerchten en Accijnzen, Arnhem

Portland College v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Potters Lodge Restaurant Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Primback Ltd, Customs and Excise Commissioners v.

Professional Footballers’ Association (Enterprises) Ltd, Customs and Excise Commissioners v.

Prokofiew (No. 1), R. v.

Quill Corp. v. North Dakota

Recaudadores de Tributos de la Zona Primera y Segunda, Ayuntamiento de Sevilla v.

Robertson v. The Queen

Rogers v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Rompelman & Another v. Minister van Financiën

Royal Academy of Music v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Scottish Solicitors’ Discipline Tribunal v. The Commissioners of Customs & Excise

Seeling (Wolfgang) v. Finanzamt Starnberg

Shipping and Forwarding Enterprise Safe BV (Safe Rekencentrum BV), Staatssecretaris van Financien (Secretary of State for Finance) v.

Sinclair Collis Ltd v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise

Solieveld (H.) and J.E. van den Hout-van Eijnsbergen v. Staatssecretaris van Financiën


Spain (Kingdom of), Commission of the European Communities v. (Case C-204/03)

Sparekassernes Datacenter (SDC) v. Skatteministeriet

Stirling v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise
List of Cases

Sutter Salmon Club Ltd. v. Her Majesty The Queen
Suzuki New Zealand Ltd v. CIR
Telewest Communications plc and anor. v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
Temco Europe SA, Belgium State v.
Terra Baubedarf-Handel GmbH v. Finanzamt Osterholz-Scharmbeck
Tolsma v. Inspecteur der Omzetbelasting
Trinity Mirror plc (formerly Mirror Group Newspapers Ltd) v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
Trustco Mortgage Co. v. The Queen
Tulliasiamies (In) and Antti Siilin
Turner v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise
Turpin v. Burgess
UFD Limited v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise
United Biscuits (UK) Ltd. v. The Commissioners of Customs and Excise
United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, Commission of the European Communities v. (Case C-33/02)

United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, Commission of the European Communities v. (Case C-353/85)
Unterpertinger (Margarete) v. Pensionsversicherungsanstalt der Arbeiter

Velker International Oil Company Ltd NV, Staatssecretaris van Financiën v.
Wairakei Court Ltd v. Commissioner of Inland Revenue
Wellington Private Hospital Ltd, Customs and Excise Commissioners v.
Westminster, Lord Mayor and Citizens of the City of v. Commissioners of Customs and Excise
Wilson & Horton Ltd v. Commissioner of Inland Revenue

Yoga for Health Foundation v. Customs and Excise Commissioners
Zinn and Another, Customs and Excise Commissioners v.
Zita Modes SARL v. Administration de l-enregistrement et des domaines
Zurich Insurance Company v. H.M. Revenue and Customs
Preface to the Revised Edition

Thanks to our students at Wayne State, Harvard, and Michigan law schools for their contributions to the revision of this book. Thanks to Dean Frank Wu and Wayne State University Law School, and to Georgia Clark, Director of the Wayne Law Library, and her staff for the support that made this revision possible. Thanks to our colleague Richard Ainsworth and the two anonymous readers who made helpful suggestions on how we could improve our first attempt at comparative value added tax. Thanks to Karen Kissinger for her very helpful research assistance. Thanks to our faculty assistants, Olive Hyman and Lise Berg, for their assistance with various aspects of the manuscript. Thanks to John Berger, our editor at Cambridge University Press, and Peggy Rote, Laura Lawrie, and Dianne Scent for their help in the process of converting our manuscript to final text.

The cutoff date for this book generally was March 31, 2006, although we have included some material published after that date. In particular, we included some European Court of Justice cases, including those covering the Italian subnational tax (IRAP) and some VAT-abusive transactions. This book is not intended to be exhaustive. It therefore does not include all significant cases in all countries or even all English-speaking countries. It is designed to illustrate, analyze, and explain the principal theoretical and operating features of value added taxes, including their adoption and implementation.

The European Union is in the process of revising its Sixth Directive that includes the principles that all member countries must adopt as part of their value added taxes. The Recast of the Sixth Directive, to enter into force, must be adopted by the EU Council of Ministers by unanimity. That action was not taken by this date. In some parts of the book, we included references not only to the Sixth Directive in its present form but also to the Recast.

Alan Schenk, Detroit, Michigan
Oliver Oldman, Cambridge, Massachusetts
June 1, 2006