

## THE ANCIENT CRITIC AT WORK

The large but underrated corpus of Greek scholia, the marginal and interlinear notes found in manuscripts, is a very important source for ancient literary criticism. The evidence of the scholia significantly adds to and enhances the picture that can be gained from studying the relevant treatises (such as Aristotle's *Poetics*): scholia also contain concepts that are not found in the treatises, and they are indicative of how the concepts are actually put to use in the progressive interpretation of texts. The book also demonstrates that it is vital to study both ancient terminology and the cases where a particular phenomenon is simply paraphrased. Nineteen thematic chapters provide a repertoire of the various terms and concepts of ancient literary criticism. The relevant witnesses are extensively quoted in Greek and English translation. A glossary of Greek terms (with translation) and several indices enable the book also to be used for reference.

RENÉ NUNLIST is Associate Professor of Classics at Brown University, Rhode Island. Publications include *Poetologische Bildersprache in der frühgriechischen Dichtung* (1998) and a new co-authored commentary on Homer's *Iliad* (2000–).



## THE ANCIENT CRITIC AT WORK

Terms and Concepts of Literary Criticism in Greek Scholia

RENÉ NÜNLIST

Brown University





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

> > Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521850582

© Cambridge University Press 2009

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2009

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data Nünlist, René.

The ancient critic at work: terms and concepts of literary criticism in Greek scholia / René Nünlist.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-0-521-85058-2 (hardback)

1. Scholia. 2. Greek literature - Criticism, Textual. 3. Transmission of texts. I. Title.

PA3520.N86 2009

880.9 - dc22 2008041966

ISBN 978-0-521-85058-2 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## Contents

Acknowledgments		page ix
	Introduction	I
	The presentation of the material and its methodological implications	2
	The material and its characteristics	7
	Characteristics of scholia	8
	Topics other than literary criticism	14
	The sources of the scholia	17
	Translation	19
	Note on quotations and references	19
PAR	T I	21
I.	Plot	23
	Motivation and narrative coherence	27
	Excursus: a special type of narrative coherence	33
	Prolepsis	34
	Excursus: the terms προαναφώνησις and ἀναφώνησις	43
	Analepsis	45
	Narratorial choice: save for later	49
	Introduction of characters	51
	Transitions and changes of scene	57
	Digressions	64
	Not to destroy the story	66
	Conclusion	68
2.	Time	69
	Day structure	69
	Story time vs. narrative time	74
	Simultaneous events	79
	Fill-in technique	83
	Anachronies	87
	Conclusion	92

v



More information

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-85058-2 - The Ancient Critic at Work: Terms and Concepts of Literary Criticism in Greek Scholia Rene Nunlist Frontmatter

vi	Contents	
3.	Narrative and speech The three principal forms of literary art: narrative, dramatic and mixed Transition from narrator-text to speech Other applications of the terms for 'narrative' and 'dramatic' Other classifications Excursus: the various applications of the term ἀποστροφή ('apostrophe') Conclusion	94 94 102 107 109
4.	Focalisation Excursus: ancient literary criticism and the narrative voice Conclusion	116 132 133
5.	Effects on the reader Attention Emotional effects Expectation Relaxation The reader as spectator Conclusion	135 137 139 149 151 153
6.	Gaps and omissions The cooperation of the reader Other applications of the expression κατὰ τὸ σιωπώμενον Excursus: Seleucus and the meaning of κατὰ τὸ σιωπώμενον Other narratorial omissions Conclusion	157 164 167 169 170
7.	Poetic licence Conclusion	174 183
8.	Authentication Conclusion	185 192
9.	Style Graphic quality (enargeia) Variation and avoidance of monotony Explanation (epexegesis) Elaboration (epexergasia) Brevity Indirect presentation Irony Iconic relation between form and content Stylistic differences between genres The three styles Minor stylistic phenomena	194 194 198 202 204 208 209 212 215 218 219

Conclusion

223



More information

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-85058-2 - The Ancient Critic at Work: Terms and Concepts of Literary Criticism in Greek Scholia Rene Nunlist Frontmatter

	Contents	vii
IO.	Allusions, hints, hidden meanings	225
	Allusions	225
	Hints	231
	Hidden meanings	237
	Conclusion	237
II.	Characters	238
	Cast	238
	Characterisation	246
	Excursus: the meaning of ἐν ἤθει and ἦθικός	254
	Conclusion	256
12.	Mythography	257
	Mythological exempla	261
	Conclusion	264
PAR	тп	265
13.	The gods in Homer	267
	Divine interventions	267
	Gods like you and me	278
	Excursus: Zenodorus on divine scenes in Homer Conclusion	279 281
14.	Homeric similes	282
-4.	Interpretations of Homeric similes	286
	Conclusion	298
15.	Epithets	299
	Conclusion	305
16.	Type scenes	307
	Ârming	307
	Battle scenes	309
	Deliberation scenes	312
	Messenger reports	312
	Typical numbers	314
	Conclusion	315
17.	Homeric speeches	316
	Speech introductions and their function	316
	No rapid dialogue in Homer	318
	Ring-composition in speeches	319
	Other structural analyses of speeches	320
	Three-way conversation Interior monologue	32I 322
	interior monorogue	322



Speech within speech	323 324 325 26 336
	325 26
Conclusion 3:	26
18. Reverse order 32	336
Conclusion 33	
19. Staging, performance and dramaturgy 33	38
71 10 1 0 1 1 1 1	338
Entrances and exits 3.	343
Delivery 32	349
Acting 3	351
Masks, costumes and props 3	353
Décor 3	355
•	356
	358
1 1 11	361
Excursus: the meaning of παρεπιγραφή	362
Conclusion 30	365
Epilogue 36	66
	68
	87
	90
Bibliography 39	92
	07
T 1 1	,  12



## Acknowledgments

This book fulfils a promise that was made in the course of developing and writing what is now commonly referred to as the *Basler Kommentar* on the *Iliad*. Though my main focus was on other questions, I was nevertheless able to do more than just preliminary studies for the present book. It is therefore a pleasant duty to acknowledge the financial support that I received at the time from the Swiss National Foundation and the Max-Geldner Foundation (Basel). The actual basis for the book was laid during a junior sabbatical leave from Brown University, which I had the privilege to spend at the University of Cologne as a fellow of the Alexander-von-Humboldt Foundation. I am grateful to all these institutions.

Several friends and colleagues have read and made useful comments on various parts of the book. While I will hopefully be forgiven for not mentioning them all, credit must go to Pat Easterling, Bas van der Mije, Martin Schmidt and to the members of the *Hellenistenclub* in Amsterdam, in particular, Jan Maarten Bremer, Irene de Jong, Albert Rijksbaron, Cees Ruijgh,† Siem Slings† and Ineke Sluiter. My hosts in Cologne, especially Rudolf Kassel and Helmut van Thiel, made my time there particularly productive and pleasant. Ever since I became interested in the subject, John Lundon has been a permanent and reliable source of wisdom *in scholiis*. Finally, I wish to thank Eleanor Dickey, Rudolf Führer, Richard Janko and my colleague David Konstan for reading and commenting on the entire manuscript at a late stage. As always, none of them should be held responsible for the errors that remain.

Few of us will ever be able to write in more than one language with equal ease and confidence. I am therefore all the more grateful to several of the scholars mentioned above and, in particular, to Ela Harrison for correcting my English and making suggestions of style. Blunders and infelicities no doubt remain, and I take full responsibility for them. Exasperated readers will, surely, take into account that the only real alternative would have been to write this book in my native language.



X

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-85058-2 - The Ancient Critic at Work: Terms and Concepts of Literary Criticism in Greek Scholia
Rene Nunlist
Frontmatter
More information

Acknowledgments

The laborious burden of checking references and compiling the index was shared with me by Carrie Thomas.

I am very happy that Cambridge University Press and Michael Sharp (assisted by Liz Noden and Joanna Breeze) have taken this book under their wings and am indebted to Chris Jackson for his meticulous copy-editing.

My final thanks must go to Jessica Wißmann for her wisdom, support and love.

Providence, Rhode Island

René Nünlist