

THEOLOGICAL HERMENEUTICS AND 1 THESSALONIANS

This book proposes a theological reading of 1 Thessalonians, making an important response to the increasing demand within Biblical scholarship to relate more closely to theological concerns. Paddison's interpretation adheres very closely to the text and is divided into three parts. Part I offers a theological critique of dominant historical-critical readings of 1 Thessalonians. Part II examines the history of interpretation of 1 Thessalonians, focusing on the pre-modern exegesis of Thomas Aquinas and John Calvin. Paddison explores what theological exegetes can learn from Thomas Aquinas' *Lectura* and John Calvin's commentary on 1 Thessalonians. Aided by the insights of these neglected pre-modern commentators, Part III presents a theologically driven interpretation of the letter. Theological exegesis is practised as a dialogue with Paul, the canon and a plethora of theological voices to elucidate Paddison's central argument that the astonishing subject matter of 1 Thessalonians is God's all-powerful hold over death.

ANGUS PADDISON is Postdoctoral Research Assistant in New Testament Studies at the University of Gloucestershire.



SOCIETY FOR NEW TESTAMENT STUDIES MONOGRAPH SERIES

General Editor: John Court

133

THEOLOGICAL HERMENEUTICS AND 1 THESSALONIANS



SOCIETY FOR NEW TESTAMENT STUDIES

MONOGRAPH SERIES

Recent titles in the series

- 120. Belly and Body in the Pauline Epistles KARL OLAV SANDNES 0 521 81535 5
- 121. The First Christian Historian DANIEL MARGUERAT 0 521 81650 5
- 122. An Aramaic Approach to Q
 MAURICE CASEY
 0 521 81723 4
- 123. Isaiah's Christ in Matthew's Gospel RICHARD BEATON 0 521 81888 5
- 124. God and History in the Book of Revelation MICHAEL GILBERSTON 0 521 82466 4
- 125. Jesus' Defeat of Death PETER G. BOLT 0 521 83036 2
- 126. From Hope to Despair in Thessalonica COLIN R. NICHOLL 0 521 83142 3
- 127. Matthew's Trilogy of Parables WESLEY G. OLMSTEAD 0 521 83154 7
- 128. The People of God in the Apocalypse STEPHEN PATTEMORE 0 521 83698 0
- 129. The Exorcism Stories in Luke–Acts TODD KLUTZ 0 521 83804 5
- 130. Jews, Gentiles and Ethnic Reconciliation TET-LIM N. YEE 0 521 83831 2
- 131. Ancient Rhetoric and Paul's Apology FREDRICK J. LONG 0 521 84233 6
- 132. Reconstructing Honor in Roman Philippi JOSEPH H. HELLERMAN 0 521 84909 8



Theological Hermeneutics and 1 Thessalonians

ANGUS PADDISON





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521849837

© Angus Paddison 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Paddison, Angus, 1979–

Theological hermeneutics and 1 Thessalonians / Angus Paddison.

p. cm. – (Monograph series / Society for New Testament Studies; 133)

Revision of the author's thesis (Ph.D.) - University of Glasgow, 2004.

Includes bibliographical references (p. 197) and index.

ISBN 0 521 84983 7

1. Bible. N. T. Thessalonians, 1st – Criticism, interpretation, etc. – History. 2. Bible.

N. T. Thessalonians, 1st – Theology. 3. Thomas, Aquinas, Saint, 1225?–1274.

4. Calvin, Jean, 1509–1564. I. Title. II. Series: Monograph series (Society for New Testament Studies); 133.

BS2725.52.P34 2005

227'.8106 - dc22 2004061768

ISBN 0 521 84983 7 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To R. P. and L. A. P.



CONTENTS

Foreword	page x1
Preface	xiii
List of abbreviations and notes about citation	xiv
Introduction	1
Part I The critical task	
1 Thessalonians and the historical-critical printheological perspective	oject 17
Part II An exploration of some pre-modern of 1 Thessalonians	readings
2 Thomas Aquinas and 1 Thessalonians	69
3 John Calvin and 1 Thessalonians	100
Excursus 1 – Calvin as a pre-modern exegete Excursus 2 – Augustine on the tension between	
1 Thess. 4:16–17 and 1 Corinthians 15	129
4 Conclusion to Part II	131
Part III A proposed reading of 1 Thessaloni	ans
5 Death and resurrection in 1 Thessalonians	139
Excursus $3 - a$ note on 1 Thess. $5:1-11$	186
Conclusion	187
Bibliography	197
Index of Biblical references	223
Index of authors	226
Index of subjects	229
	ix



FOREWORD

It is as great a pleasure to introduce this important monograph to the reader as it was to watch, advise and encourage the research which forms its basis. In the diversifying world of New Testament scholarship, Dr Angus Paddison is positioned at the cutting edge of one of its most exciting developments – the rediscovery of the dialogue with theology about the *subject matter* of the New Testament. Several voices in recent years have called for this dialogue to be reopened, but there are still too few scholars able or willing to immerse themselves as deeply in theology as in exegesis, or vice versa. With freshness, boldness and prodigious industry, Paddison here explores not only why but also how such a dialogue should take place, and makes a distinct contribution in at least three areas.

In the first place, this volume analyses and critiques current historical criticism, as practised on 1 Thessalonians, for its failure to take sufficiently seriously the meaning-potential of the text, and for its focus on 'archaeological' features of the text to the exclusion of engagement with its subject matter. Not all readers will accept every element of this critique, but any reader with an ounce of theological interest in the New Testament will recognise the problem here exposed and the challenge here issued. Drawing on Barth's reaction to the historical critics of his day, Paddison asks us to focus attention again on what the text is talking about and pointing towards. If a contemporary philosopher (for instance, Martha Nussbaum) can wrestle with the works of Plato or Seneca, not as historical curiosities but as serious contributors to our own philosophical problems, why does New Testament scholarship so rarely get beyond historical contextualisation of its texts to constructive engagement with their theological content? And why is this so rare even among those who believe that the New Testament is in some sense revelatory? Thus simply formulated (and Paddison's formulation is far more sophisticated), the point may sound obvious; but it is extraordinary how rarely it is heard or heeded in mainstream New Testament scholarship, and Paddison's challenge is truly welcome.

xi



xii Foreword

Secondly, Paddison here shows, through two fine case-studies, the value of the history of interpretation in exploring the meanings of a New Testament text. In line with trends across the humanities, Biblical scholars are waking up to the significance of the Bible's extraordinarily rich history of effects. What historical criticism brackets out – in the pretence that we are the first readers of these texts – is here shown to be not only historically interesting, but also theologically vital, if we are to appreciate the power of these texts to generate new meanings in the process of interpretation. Eschewing a 'stamp-collecting' approach, which would catalogue every usage of his text, Paddison chooses to examine just two influential and indicative readings of 1 Thessalonians – by Thomas Aquinas and John Calvin. The depth and perceptiveness with which he analyses this material are, to my mind, a model of research in the history of interpretation, and should inspire and encourage other New Testament researchers to undertake similar ventures.

Finally, in the third part of this volume, Paddison puts his method into practice, in a theologically engaged reading of the eschatology of 1 Thessalonians. In a deliberately eclectic conversation across the ages (from the third to the twenty-first century) and inclusive of diverse theological traditions, the text of 1 Thessalonians is here plumbed for its theological potential in ways which greatly illumine Pauline theology and its contribution to Christian thought. Readers will notice the dynamic metaphors Paddison chooses (he aims to 'explore', 'unfold' and 'plumb' the truths which the text 'points towards'), since he regards the text not as a static repository of a single meaning, but as a ceaselessly productive source of meaning in the continuing process of interpretation. And for this purpose 1 Thessalonians and its eschatology are not just a conveniently circumscribed case-study: in its subject matter this text is also a paradigm of the process of interpretation, as it offers a present grace which is always incomplete, stretching towards the future in the mystery of God.

This monograph is thus in every respect timely, instructive and provocative. I hope that it will provoke New Testament scholars to further reflection on the nature and aims of our discipline, and lead some to develop similarly passionate dialogues with the text, with our theological heritage and with contemporary theologians – and with equally fruitful results.

JOHN M. G. BARCLAY University of Durham



PREFACE

An earlier version of this work was produced as a Ph.D. thesis for the University of Glasgow. I appreciate greatly the rigorous questioning of my examiners, Professors John Riches and John Webster, and indeed their subsequent support. As this work moved to its present format Dr John Court was of great assistance, and Dr Katharina Brett a source of much patience.

Over the course of my studies I received financial support from the University of Glasgow, the Cross Trust (Perth) and my parents, Ronan and Lesley Paddison. To all these individuals and committees I am very grateful. My current post at the University of Gloucestershire has afforded me much-appreciated time to prepare this monograph and continue thinking about theological hermeneutics.

A host of people, far too many to mention, have been willing to talk theology and hermeneutics with me, and have been a constant source of provocation. Postgraduate friends – especially Marije Altorf, Mark Brummitt and Karen Wenell – broadened my reading and knowledge immeasurably, and assuaged the isolation of Ph.D. research. My supervisor, Professor John M. G. Barclay, was an endlessly generous source of scholarship, patience, guidance and enthusiasm. It is very fitting that he should be writing the foreword to this monograph.

There are, thankfully, people outside the ranks of New Testament studies and hermeneutics. Three in particular – Lesley Paddison, Dimitri Vastardis and Ben Leney – proved themselves to be superbly diligent and interested readers of the typescript, for which I am extremely thankful.

xiii



ABBREVIATIONS AND NOTES ABOUT CITATION

AB Anchor Bible

AJT Asia Journal of Theology ATR Anglican Theological Review

BJRL Bulletin of the John Rylands Library
BNTC Black's New Testament Commentaries

BTB Biblical Theology Bulletin
CBQ Catholic Biblical Quarterly
CD Karl Barth, Church Dogmatics

CH Church History
CO Calvini Opera

Comm. Ex. Calvin's Commentary on Exodus Calvin's Commentary on Galatians Comm. Gal. Calvin's Commentary on Genesis Comm. Gen. Comm. Heb. Calvin's Commentary on Hebrews Calvin's Commentary on Isaiah Comm. Isa. Comm. Jer. Calvin's Commentary on Jeremiah Comm. Jn. Calvin's Commentary on John Comm. 1 Peter Calvin's Commentary on 1 Peter Calvin's Commentary on 2 Peter Comm. 2 Peter Calvin's Commentary on Philippians Comm. Phil. Comm. Psalms Calvin's Commentary on the Psalms Comm. Rom. Calvin's Commentary on Romans Comm. 1 Cor. Calvin's Commentary on 1 Corinthians Comm. 2 Cor. Calvin's Commentary on 2 Corinthians Comm. 1 Thess. Calvin's Commentary on 1 Thessalonians

Comm. 2 Tim. Calvin's Commentary on 2 Timothy

Comp. Theol. Compendium of Theology
CTJ Calvin Theological Journal
ELR English Literary Renaissance

EQ Evangelical Quarterly
FOC Fathers of the Church Series

xiv



List of abbreviations

xv

GOTR	Greek Orthodox Theological Review
HBT	Horizons in Biblical Theology
HTR	Harvard Theological Review
ICC	International Critical Commentary
JBL	Journal of Biblical Literature
<i>JECH</i>	Journal of Ecclesiastical History

JETS Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society

JPT Journal of Pentecostal Theology

JR Journal of Religion

JSNT Journal for the Study of the New Testament JSNTSup Journal for the Study of the New Testament,

Supplement Series

JSOT Journal for the Study of the Old Testament JSOTSup Journal for the Study of the Old Testament,

Supplement Series

JTS NS Journal of Theological Studies, New Series

LCL Loeb Classical Library

MT Modern Theology

NICNT New International Commentary on the New

Testament

NIGTC New International Greek Testament Commentary

NLH New Literary History NovT Novum Testamentum

*NPNF*² A Select Library of Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers

of the Christian Church. Ed. P. Schaff and H. Wace,

second series.

NTS New Testament Studies

PG Patrologia Graeca. Ed. J.-P. Migne.

RS Religious Studies

RTR Reformed Theological Review SBL Society of Biblical Literature

SBLDS Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series

SCG Summa Contra Gentiles
SJT Scottish Journal of Theology

SP Studia Patristica

SP Sacra Pagina (commentary series)
ST Thomas Aquinas, Summa Theologiae
SVSQ Saint Vladimir's Seminary Quarterly
SVTQ Saint Vladimir's Theological Quarterly

TB Tyndale Bulletin

TI Theological Investigations



xvi List of abbreviations

TS Theological Studies

USQR Union Seminary Quarterly Review
WBC Word Biblical Commentary
WTJ Westminster Theological Journal

Where I cite the Biblical text in Greek, the translation supplied is my own; other Biblical quotations are from the NRSV. Quotations and citations from 1 Thessalonians usually lack '1 Thess.' before the chapter and verse number, except where this might cause confusion.

In the course of chapter 2, the study on Thomas Aquinas, we shall be reading from both the critical edition of the text, as found in the Marietti edition of 1953, and Michael Duffy's 1969 translation of the Thessalonians *Lectura* in the Aquinas Scripture Series. Citations will take the form of *Lectio* chapter number, lecture number and lecture division, followed by references to the translation.

In the course of chapter 3, the study on John Calvin, we shall be substantially reading from Ross Mackenzie's translation, published in 1961 (and republished in 1972) in the Calvin's Commentaries series (hereafter cited as *Comm. 1 Thess.*, followed by chapter and verse). References to Calvin's other commentaries published in this Calvin's Commentaries series and by the Calvin Translation Society also follow this format. Occasional reference will also be made to the critical text of the commentary as found in *Ioannis Calvini Opera quae Supersunt Omnia*, volume 52 of the Corpus Reformatorum series. Citations will follow the form *CO*, followed by volume and column.