

Economics and Social Interaction

Economics and Social Interaction is a fresh attempt to overcome the traditional inability of economics to deal with interpersonal phenomena that occur within the sphere of markets and productive organisations. It makes use of traditional economic concepts for understanding interpersonal events, while venturing beyond those concepts to give a better account of personalised interactions. In contrast to other books, Economics and Social Interaction offers the reader a rigorous effort at extending economic analysis to a notoriously slippery field in a consistent manner, sensitive to insights from other behavioural and social sciences. This collection represents an important contribution to a growing research agenda in the social sciences.

BENEDETTO GUI is Professor of Economics at the Università di Padova, Italy.

ROBERT SUGDEN is Professor of Economics at the University of East Anglia, Norwich.



Economics and Social Interaction

Accounting for Interpersonal Relations

Edited By

Benedetto Gui and Robert Sugden





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521848848

© Cambridge University Press 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-84884-8 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-84884-9 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To our wives, Marina and Christine, who tolerantly accept the discrepancies between righteous theorising about social interaction and its domestic practice.



Contents

	st of illustrations	page	ix
	otes on contributors eface		x xiv
1	Why interpersonal relations matter for economics BENEDETTO GUI AND ROBERT SUGDEN		1
2	From transactions to encounters: the joint generation of relational goods and conventional values BENEDETTO GUI		23
3	Fellow-feeling ROBERT SUGDEN		52
4	Interpersonal interaction and economic theory: the case of public goods NICHOLAS BARDSLEY	:	76
5	Under trusting eyes: the responsive nature of trust VITTORIO PELLIGRA		105
6	Interpersonal relations and job satisfaction: some empirical results in social and community care services CARLO BORZAGA AND SARA DEPEDRI		125
7	On the possible conflict between economic growth and social development ANGELO ANTOCI, PIER LUIGI SACCO AND PAOLO VANIN		150
8	The logic of good social relations SERGE-CHRISTOPHE KOLM		174
9	The mutual validation of ends SHAUN HARGREAVES HEAP		190

vii



viii	Contents	
10	Hic sunt leones: interpersonal relations as unexplored territory in the tradition of economics LUIGINO BRUNI	206
11	Authority and power in economic and sociological approaches to interpersonal relations: from interactions to embeddedness BERNARD GAZIER AND ISABELLE THIS SAINT-JEAN	229
12	Interpersonal relations and economics: comments from a feminist perspective JULIE A. NELSON	250
13	Economics and interpersonal relations: ruling the social back in LOUIS PUTTERMAN	262
Envoi References Index		270 271 295



Illustrations

2.1 The encounter as a productive process

Figures

5.1	Two games	107
6.1	Preferences for wages and relational goods	128
7.1	A graphic representation of cases (a) and (b) of proposition 4	161
Tabl	les	
6.1	Main characteristics of organisations (percentage values)	129
6.2	Main characteristics of employees (percentage values)	130
6.3	Attitudes to work (average scores)	131
6.4	The importance of working activity in commencing new	
	relationships (average scores)	132
6.5	Areas of satisfaction (average scores)	133
6.6	Workers' satisfaction by individual and organisational	
	characteristics	135
	Satisfaction with the job as a whole (ordered probit)	136
6.8	Satisfaction with relational aspects of the job, by wage	
	level (average scores)	138
	Satisfaction with relational aspects of the job (ordered probit) Satisfaction with relational aspects, by type of organisation	139
0.10	(average scores)	140
6.11	Future intentions of workers	141
	Loyalty to the organisation with regard to attitudes	
	(logit estimation)	142
6.13	Loyalty to the organisation with regards to satisfaction	
	(logit estimation)	144
6.14	Willingness to quit, by the level of satisfaction with	
	wages and relations (percentage values)	147
6.15	Intentions to stay with the organisation and satisfaction	
	with wages and relations (percentage values)	147
		iv

page 44



Notes on contributors

ANGELO ANTOCI holds a Ph.D. in political economy from the University of Siena, Italy (1993), and is currently Associate Professor of Mathematics for Economic Decision Making at the University of Sassari, Italy. His main research interests are economic growth, environmental economics, evolutionary game theory and its applications. He has published in international journals on partnership formation, corruption in public contracting in an evolutionary framework, and the dynamics of cooperative strategies.

NICHOLAS BARDSLEY is a research fellow at the School of Economics in the University of Nottingham. His fields of interest comprise experimental economics, methodology, and philosophy of economics. He currently researches artificiality arguments against experimental economics and is conducting a meta-analysis of preference reversal experiments. His most recent publication is, with Robert Sugden, 'Human nature and sociality', in *The Handbook of the Economics of Gift-Giving, Altruism and Reciprocity* (forthcoming).

CARLO BORZAGA is Professor of Economic Policy and Director of ISSAN (Institute for the Development of Non-profit Organisations) at the University of Trento, Italy. He has published extensively – in Italian, English and French – theoretical and empirical research on the economics of labour, welfare services, and non-profit organisations. He has recently edited *The Emergence of Social Enterprises* (2001), with Jacques Defourny, and *Capitale umano e qualità del lavoro nei servizi sociali: un'analisi comparata tra modelli di gestione* (2000).

LUIGINO BRUNI is Assistant Professor of Economics at the University of Milano Bicocca. His principal fields of interest are the history of economic thought, the ethical and anthropological foundations of economic discourse, and social and non-profit economy. His publications include several articles in international journals, chapters of



Notes on contributors

хi

edited volumes, and several books. Among these are Vilfredo Pareto and the Birth of the Modern Microeconomics (2002) and Economics and the Paradoxes of Happiness (edited with Pier Luigi Porta, 2004).

SARA DEPEDRI is a Ph.D. student in law and economics at the University of Siena. She lectures in political economy at the University of Bolzano, and is a researcher in non-profit organisations at ISSAN, University of Trento.

BERNARD GAZIER is Professor of Economics at the University of Paris 1 (Panthéon–Sorbonne). His fields of interest comprise labour economics and policy, social justice and non-market-oriented behaviour. He currently explores 'transitional labour markets', a European perspective on the reform of labour market policies aiming at reintegrating the long-term unemployed and promoting full employment. Recent publications are *Tous 'Sublimes': vers un nouveau plein emploi* (2003) and *The Dynamics of Full Employment: Social Integration through Transitional Labour Markets* (2002).

BENEDETTO GUI is Professor of Economics at the University of Padova. His research has mostly focused on labour economics, and the economics of self-managed and non-profit organisations. He has authored a book in Italian on marginal employment subsidies (which received the Tarantelli Award in 1990) and a number of book chapters and articles in international journals. He has co-edited with Avner Ben-Ner *The Nonprofit Sector in the Mixed Economy* (1993). More recently, he has concentrated on the new field of economics and interpersonal relations.

SHAUN HARGREAVES HEAP is Professor of Economics at the University of East Anglia. His current research is on rationality in a historical and social context, and on the economics of television and film. Recent publications are, with Yanis Varoufakis, in *The Economic Journal* (2002) on the evolution of cooperation and discrimination in an experimental setting, in *The Cambridge Journal of Economics* (2004) on participatory decision making and, with Yanis Varoufakis, the second edition of *Game Theory: A Critical Text* (2004).

SERGE-CHRISTOPHE KOLM, formerly Director and Professor at EHESS (Institute for Advanced Studies in the Social Sciences) in Paris, has made important contributions in several branches of economics and the social sciences, including welfare economics, economics and ethics,



xii Notes on contributors

economic philosophy and the theory of justice. He is the author of several hundred scientific articles and over thirty books, including *The Good Economy*, *Justice and Equity*, *Modern Theories of Justice* and, most recently, *Macrojustice: The Political Economy of Fairness*.

JULIE A. NELSON is a Senior Research Associate with the Global Development and Environment Institute at Tufts University, Massachusetts. Her writings on household behaviour and on feminist theory have appeared in many leading journals, including *Econometrica*, *The American Economic Review*, *The Journal of Political Economy* and *The Journal of Economic Perspectives*. Nelson is the author of *Feminism*, *Objectivity*, and *Economics* (1996) and has recently co-edited *Feminist Economics Today: Beyond Economic Man* (2003).

VITTORIO PELLIGRA is Assistant Professor at the University of Cagliari, Italy, where he teaches economics, game theory and behavioural finance. His research, theoretical and experimental, is focused on the role of trust in strategic interaction and its consequences for institutional design. He has published on trust and happiness, social economy, intrinsic and extrinsic motivations, consequentialism and path dependency. He has edited, with Luigino Bruni, *Economia come scienza sociale* (2002).

LOUIS PUTTERMAN, Professor of Economics at Brown University (Providence, Rhode Island), is the author of numerous articles and books on economic systems (including those of Africa and China), organisations, incentives, economic behaviour and the historical roots of economic growth. Among these are *Economics, Values and Organization* (edited with Avner Ben-Ner, 1998), and *Dollars and Change: Economics in Context* (2001). Recently he has conducted experimental research on reciprocity and cooperation, and at present he is investigating trust, communication and costly contracting, as well as distribution preferences.

PIER LUIGI SACCO is Professor of Economics at the IUAV (University Institute of Architecture) in Venice. He has published widely in international refereed journals and books, mainly on the evolution of game theoretic models, the dynamics of norms, bounded rationality and learning issues, the economics of crime and corruption and the economics of art and culture. Recently he has co-edited with Stefano Zamagni a book in Italian on relational complexity and economic behaviour.



Notes on contributors

xiii

ROBERT SUGDEN is Professor of Economics at the University of East Anglia, Norwich. His research uses theoretical, experimental and philosophical methods to investigate issues in welfare economics, social choice, choice under uncertainty, the foundations of decision and game theory, the methodology of economics and the evolution of social conventions. Among his numerous publications, especially well-known is *The Economics of Rights, Cooperation and Welfare* (1986). His recent work includes explorations of ways in which sociality can be represented in economic theory.

ISABELLE THIS SAINT-JEAN is Lecturer in Economics at the University of Paris 1 (Panthéon–Sorbonne). She has published in refereed journals on economic epistemology and methodology (especially the frontiers between economics and its sister social sciences), self-fulfilling and rational expectations, empirical validation in economics, and rationality.

PAOLO VANIN received a doctorate in political economy from the University of Pavia, Italy, in 2002 and is currently a Ph.D. student in economics at the Pompeu Fabra University of Barcelona. His research interests include social capital, growth, social interaction and network dynamics, and are now extending to the relationship between trade policy, regulation and innovation. He has published 'Network interaction with material and relational goods: an exploratory simulation' (2000), with Pier Luigi Sacco.



Preface

While searching for a suitable example for this preface one of the editors of this book had the opportunity of hearing a senior manager reporting on an executives' training course, and was particularly struck by one image. Participants in their forties and fifties were asked to engage in groups in a game. At one point they had to pass through a network of cords without touching them. After a while they were playing so excitedly that, in order to ease the passing, not only was everybody's clothing reduced practically to underwear but somebody's protrusive stomach was pressed by mates' hands during the most crucial phases. Interestingly, this unconventional session ignited a fruitful communication among participants that contributed positively to the course's educational outcome.

We are not advocating that our readers should be involved in similar learning procedures. What we claim is that invisible and hardly definable interpersonal elements – such as those that made training more effective after that bizarre game than before it – do matter in economic life, even though this is usually viewed as the province of the material, the measurable, the objective. And, secondly, that this has momentous consequences for how we depict, conceptualise and manage economic life.

According to conventional interpretations of the thematic and methodological boundaries of economics, interpersonal relations seem not to be the business of economists at all. However, we feel supported by evidence such as the example above, and by considerations that we present in the introduction below, in thinking that a book on economics and interpersonal relations need not trespass unduly beyond the competence of our discipline. We hope to convince our readers of this statement, and of the significance of the 'relational' domain for both economic facts and ideas.

The project of this book began in April 2001 in the quiet atmosphere of Praglia's abbey conference centre, at the foot of the Euganean hills, not far from Padova. The British editor had been invited there by the

xiv



Preface xv

native to comment on the special issue the latter had edited the year before for *Annals of Public and Cooperative Economics*, devoted to economics and interpersonal relations (issue 2 of 2000). The dialogue was fruitful. The result is that two of the chapters of this book, by Bardsley and Kolm, come directly from that special issue; two more, by Bruni and Gui, have their roots there, but have been heavily revised; one is a new piece of work by contributors to the special issue (Sacco and Vanin, with co-author Antoci); three are by other invited speakers at that conference (Borzaga and Depedri, Gazier and This Saint-Jean, Sugden); another two are by authors whose research has intersected with the editors' (Pelligra, Hargreaves Heap); and, last, the two commentaries at the end are by American scholars who have reacted from the other side of the Atlantic to this otherwise strictly European book. Wait a moment; we were forgetting the introductory chapter, which has forced us actually to confront each other's views, in the spirit of the book's title.

Many people gave moral support and useful suggestions for the completion of this book. Some are mentioned in individual chapters. Many others are collectively thanked here.

Furthermore, we cannot help expressing our gratitude to: Luca Clerici and Chiara Possia, who provided precious editorial aid; Mary Gabriel Walton, who took care of the final revision of the English style of some chapters; Blackwell Publishing, which allowed us to reprint previously published material; and, finally, the Italian Ministry for University and Research, for financial support.