

Age Discrimination

Age discrimination is a highly topical issue in all industrialised societies, against a background of concerns about shortening working lives and ageing populations in the future. Based upon detailed research, and adopting an interdisciplinary approach, this unique study traces the history of the age discrimination debate in Britain and the USA since the 1930s. It critically analyses the concepts of ageism in social relations and age discrimination in employment. Case-studies on generational equity and health care rationing by age are followed by an analysis of the British government's initiatives against age discrimination in employment. The book then traces in detail the history of the debate on health status and old age, addressing the question of whether working capacity has improved sufficiently to justify calls to delay retirement and extend working lives. It concludes with a detailed examination of the origins and subsequent working of the USA's 1967 Age Discrimination in Employment Act.

JOHN MACNICOL is Visiting Professor in Social Policy at the London School of Economics. He has published extensively on current social policy and the history of social policy, including *The Politics of Retirement in Britain*, 1878–1948 (Cambridge University Press, 1998).



Age Discrimination

An Historical and Contemporary Analysis

John Macnicol





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521847773

© John Macnicol 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-84777-3 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-84777-X hardback ISBN-13 978-0-521-61260-9 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-61260-8 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of figures		page vi	
	List of tables		
Ack	knowledgements	ix	
Par	rt I Ageism and Age Discrimination	1	
1	Analysing ageism and age discrimination	3	
2	Justice between generations	48	
Par	et II The Current Revival of Interest in Britain	69	
3	New Labour and age discrimination	71	
Par	rt III Retirement, health status and work-disability	119	
4	Health status and old age	121	
5	From the late nineteenth century to the 1940s	133	
6	The 1950s and 1960s in Britain	151	
7	The recent debate	177	
Par	rt IV America's Age Discrimination in Employment Act	207	
8	The age discrimination debate, from the 1920s to 1967	209	
9	From 1967 to the present	234	
10	Conclusion	263	
Bibliography		268	
Index		299	

V



Figures

3.1	Economic activity rates: by gender and age, 1971		
	and 1997	page	86
7.1	The mortality (observed), morbidity (hypothetical)		
	and disability (hypothetical) survival curves for		
	US females in 1980		179



Tables

3.1	Employment and economic activity rates by age; men		
	and women	page	88
3.2	Number per 100 people of working age		93
8.1	The labour force participation of men aged 65+ in		
	the USA		210
9.1	US labour force participation rates by age: percentages		
	and numbers		2.57

vii



Acknowledgements

This book began life as a research project funded by a Leverhulme Fellowship. My first and considerable debt of gratitude is therefore to the Leverhulme Trust. I am most grateful to the two referees for the original application, Hilary Land and Alan Deacon, who have always been so generous with their advice and encouragement.

The research would have been impossible without the generosity of numerous academic libraries, and I would particularly like to thank the following: the British Library of Political and Economic Science; the Wellcome Medical Library, London; Age Concern England; New York Public Library; the main library of the University of Southern California, and that of the Andrus Gerontology Center; the American Association for Retired Persons, Washington, DC; the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, Washington, DC; the National Archives, Kew (formerly the Public Record Office). Transcripts of Crown Copyright material in the National Archives appear by permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

Most of the research on the American age discrimination debate was conducted during a two-month research visit to the USA, where I enjoyed a warm welcome and much intellectual stimulation. My special thanks go to many people at the Andrus Gerontology Center, University of Southern California: Vern Bengtson (who acted as my host, and whose kindness, erudition and good humour were much appreciated); Eileen Crimmins (who generously allowed me to attend her graduate classes in ageing, demography and health care, and effortlessly demonstrated to me what really good teaching is like); Linda Hall (who looked after my everyday needs); and others who gave of their time so generously. At the Andrus Center, I was also privileged to be part of a lively and happy academic community, and to meet an impressive cadre of graduate students (among whom I should specially like to thank Joe Angelelli and Maria Schmeekle). Two weeks of my US visit were spent in Washington DC, at the American Association for Retired Persons. There, my main helper was Sara Rix, who has been a good friend and whose erudite advice was much appreciated.



x Acknowledgements

My thanks go to other AARP staff, including Clare Hushbeck, Helen Dennis, Sally Dunaway and Michelle Pollak.

I am grateful to my previous institution (Royal Holloway, University of London) for supporting this research. At my new home (the Department of Social Policy, London School of Economics) I should like to thank those who advised me on difficult problems (in some cases, reading extracts of this book) or helped in other ways: Howard Glennerster, Julian Le Grand, David Piachaud, John Hills, Tania Burchart, Anne West and John Wilkes. I am most grateful to two London School of Economics students, Hester Barsham and Amir Akhrif, for their invaluable help in checking the bibliography.

During the research for this book, I was privileged to spend periods of time as a visiting researcher at the Institute for the Study of Ageing and Later Life, University of Linkoping, Norrkoping, Sweden, enjoying a most stimulating intellectual atmosphere. My thanks go to Elisabet Cedersund, Britt-Marie Oberg, Lars Andersson, Anna Olaison, Bengt Sandin and others.

A large number of people discussed aspects of this book with me, and/or provided invaluable support when the going got tough. Chris Phillipson has been a source of excellent advice, and always so generous with his time. I also owe a great debt of gratitude to Andy Achenbaum. Among the many others, my particular thanks go to Andrew Blaikie, Howard Davies, Keith Frost, Emily Grundy, Kim Harris, Harry Hendrick, Chris Holden, George Lawson, Martin Lyon Levine, John Mattausch, Roger Middleton, Grace Rose, Marc Rosenblum, Adrian Sinfield, David Smith, John Stewart, Jim Tomlinson, Jonathan Wadsworth and John Welshman (who provided me with some very helpful research assistance for a part of chapter 5). Aspects of this work were presented at various seminars and conferences, and I am grateful to the participants for their comments.

Needless to say, these friends and advisers are completely absolved from responsibility for any inaccuracies or speculative ideas that are inevitable if one is trying to pull aside the dead weight of a prevailing political culture and apply rigorous analysis to a very complex topic. Originally intended to be much shorter, this book expanded as the complexities of age discrimination became increasingly apparent. Hopefully readers will find these complexities interesting in the pages that follow.

JOHN MACNICOL

J.Macnicol@lse.ac.uk