

The Invention of Art History in Ancient Greece

The ancient Greeks developed their own very specific ethos of art appreciation, advocating a rational involvement with art. This book explores why the ancient Greeks started to write art history and how the writing of art history transformed the social functions of art in the Greek world. It looks at the invention of the genre of portraiture, and the social uses to which portraits were put in the city state. Later chapters explore how artists sought to enhance their status by writing theoretical treatises and producing works of art intended for purely aesthetic contemplation, which ultimately gave rise to the writing of art history and to the development of art collecting. The study, which is illustrated throughout and draws on contemporary perspectives in the sociology of art, will prompt the student of classical art to rethink fundamental assumptions about Greek art and its cultural and social implications.

JEREMY TANNER is Lecturer in Greek and Roman Art at the Institute of Archaeology, University College London. He is the author of *The Sociology of Art: A Reader* (2003).



CAMBRIDGE CLASSICAL STUDIES

General editors

R. L. HUNTER, R. G. OSBORNE, M. D. REEVE, P. D. A. GARNSEY, M. MILLETT, D. N. SEDLEY, G. C. HORROCKS



THE INVENTION OF ART HISTORY IN ANCIENT GREECE

Religion, society and artistic rationalisation

JEREMY TANNER





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

 $\begin{array}{c} {\tt CAMBRIDGE\ UNIVERSITY\ PRESS} \\ {\tt The\ Edinburgh\ Building,\ Cambridge\ CB2\ 2RU,\ UK} \end{array}$

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521846141

© Faculty of Classics, University of Cambridge 2006

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-84614-1 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-84614-5 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this book, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my father



CONTENTS

Li	st of illustrations	<i>page</i> ix
Αc	knowledgements	xiii
Li	st of abbreviations	XV
Ι	Introduction: art and society in classical art history	I
	Greek art, the idea of freedom, and the creation of modern high culture Greek art <i>sans miracle</i> : Max Weber, Talcott Parsons and the historical	I
	sociology of Greek art	Ι2
	Summary	29
2	Rethinking the Greek revolution: art and aura in an age	
	of enchantment	31
	The Greek revolution	31
	Viewing and religious experience in ancient Greece	40
	Art and aura in archaic Greece: aristocratic elites and the appropriation	
	of the sacred	55
	Art and aura in classical Greece: naturalism, ritual	
	interaction and aesthetic experience	67
3	Portraits and society in classical Greece	97
	Introduction: forms and concepts of portraiture	97
	Portraits and exchange in classical Athens	109
	Evaluating portraits: social structure, aesthetic judgement and the civic body	116
	Portraits and society: some causes and consequences of artistic change	134
4	Culture, social structure and artistic agency in classical Greece	141
	Introduction: primitivists, modernisers and the problem of the artist in	
	classical art history	141
	The artist and the polis	149
	Art and cultural rationalisation in classical Greece	158
	Tradition, innovation and artistic agency in classical Greece	182
	Art and intellect in classical Greece	191
	Culture, social structure and the limits of artistic rationalisation in	
	classical Greece	201



CONTENTS

5	Reasonable ways of looking at pictures: high culture in		
	Hellenistic Greece and the Roman empire	205	
	Introduction: art as an autonomous province of meaning	205	
	Courts, cultural organisations and collecting: Pergamon, Alexandria and the invention of art history	212	
	A natural history: Pliny's story of Greek art Reasonable ways of looking at pictures	235 246	
	The rhetoric of display Conclusion	264 276	
6	Epilogue: art after art history	277	
	Introduction: copying and creation in post-classical art	277	
	Art and agency in post-classical Greece	279	
	Conclusion: the ancient system of the arts	301	
Re	ferences	303	
Index		325	



ILLUSTRATIONS

I.I	L. Alma Tadema. Pheidias Showing the Frieze of the Parthenon	
	to his Friends. 1868. Photo: Birmingham Museums and Art	
	Gallery. p	age 2
I.2	L. Alma Tadema. Un Amateur Romain. 1868. Photo: Glasgow	
	Museums: Art Gallery and Museum, Kelvingrove.	4
1.3	Apollo Belvedere. Roman Copy. Original c. 330 BC. Vatican	
	Museum. Photo: Alinari 6502.	7
2.I	Tenea 'Apollo'. Munich, Glyptothek, c. 550 BC. After von	
	Reber and Bayersdorfer, 1898, pl. 457.	32
2.2	Apollo from the Piraeus, c. 530–510. Bronze. Photo: Hirmer 654.1835.	33
2.3	Apollo Patroos, by Euphranor. Roman copy, original	
	c. 340–330. Vatican. Photo: Alinari 26936.	34
2.4	Statuette of Athena Alea from Tegea, c. 525–500. Possibly	
	after the cult statue by Endoios. Photo: DAI, Athens. Neg.	
	NM 6121.	35
2.5	Antenor's Kore. Kore 681, from the Athenian Akropolis,	
	c. 520 BC. Photo: Alinari 24654.	36
2.6	Velletri Athena. Roman copy of a Greek cult statue by Alkamenes,	
	c. 420–410 BC. Paris 464. Photo: © RMN, Hervé Lewandowski.	37
2.7	Cult group by Alkamenes from the Hephaisteion in Athens:	
	Athena and Hephaistos, c. 420–410 BC. Harrison's reconstruction.	
	After E. B. Harrison (1977) 140, illus. 2.	38
2.8a	Artemis Laphria from Kalydon, by Menaichmos and Soidas,	
	mid fifth century BC. BMC Patrae 38. Date of coin second	
	century AD. Photo: Copyright The British Museum.	44
2.8b	Dionysos of Methymna, coin from Antissa, third century BC.	
	BMC Antissa 1. Photo: Copyright The British Museum.	44
2.8c	Zeus of Aigion, by Hageladas, c. 500 BC, on a coin of the mid	
	second century AD. BMC Aegium 1. Photo: Copyright The	
	British Museum.	44
2.8d	Hermes Kriophoros (Ram-bearer) from Tanagra, by Kalamis,	
	on coin of the Roman Imperial Period. BM 1975.5-198-1.	
	Photo: Copyright The British Museum.	44



LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

2.9	Bronze statuette, possibly after the Ismenian Apollo from	
	Thebes, by Kanachos, original c. 500 BC. Photo: Copyright	
	The British Museum.	59
2.10	Moschophoros (Calf-bearer), dedicated by [Rh]onbos, from	
	the Athenian Akropolis, c. 560 BC. Photo: Alison Frantz	
	Archive, American School of Classical Studies, Athens:	
	AT 131.	61
2.11	Kleobis and Biton, kouroi, c. 580 BC; Delphi Museum. Photo:	
	DAI, Athens. Neg. 81.639/40.	64
2.12	Bronze mirror-handle, Aphrodite flanked by Erotes, possibly	
	from Aigina, c. 500 BC. Boston Museum of Fine Arts. Henry	
	Lillie Pierce Fund. Photo: Museum of Fine Arts, Boston. All	
	rights reserved.	73
2.13	Artemis from Gabii. Roman copy, after Greek statue c. 340 BC.	
	Photo: Alinari: 22583.	76
2.14	Small Piraeus Artemis, c. 340–320 BC. Piraeus Museum 4648.	
	Photo: 2nd Ephoreia of Prehistoric and Classical Antiquities,	
	Athens.	77
2.15	Aphrodite of Fréjus, Roman copy after Greek statue of c. 410 BC,	
_	possibly by Alkamenes. Louvre. Alinari 22752.	78
2.16	Votive relief from Brauron, offerings to Leto and Artemis,	
	second half of fourth century BC. Brauron Museum 1152.	79
2.17	Artemis of Versailles. Louvre, MA 589. Roman copy after a	
	fourth-century Greek statue attributed to Leochares. Photo:	
	Alinari 22584.	80
2.18	Aphrodite of Daphni. Roman copy after Greek original of late	
	fifth century BC, by Agorakritos. Louvre MA 414. © RMN,	
	Gérard Blot.	81
2.19	Great Eleusis Relief: Demeter, Triptolemos and Persephone,	
	c. 420 BC. Athens, National Museum. Photo: Alinari 24263.	82
2.20	Votive relief from Eleusis, sacrifice to Demeter and Kore,	
	fourth century BC. Louvre, MA 752. Photo: after Rizzo	
	Prassitele (1932) plate CLI.	83
2.21	Drawing of votive relief, dedicated by the son of Theagenes,	2
	from Daphni. After Antike Plastik 8 (1969) 24, fig. 1.	86
3.I	Herm of Themistokles, Roman copy after Greek statue,	
	c. 470 BC. Ostia. Photos: (a) DAI, Rome. Neg. 66.2295;	
	(b) DAI, Rome. Neg. 63.2356.	98
3.2	Pindar. Roman herm, copy after Greek statue of <i>c</i> . 450 BC.	
~	Museo Capitolino, Rome. Archivio Fotographico dei Musei	
	Capitolini.	99



LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

3.3	The Tyrannicides, Harmodios and Aristogeiton, Roman copy	
	after bronze statues by Kritios and Nesiotes, c. 477/76 BC. Naples. Photo: Alinari 44825.	101
2.4	Bust of Perikles after statue probably by Kresilas, c. 425 BC.	101
3.4	Photo: Copyright British Museum.	102
3.5	Athenian General (the 'Pastoret' head), probably Konon.	102
3.3	Roman copy after Greek statue <i>c</i> . 400–375 BC. Copenhagen.	
	Photo: Glyptothek, Copenhagen.	102
3.6	Portrait of a general, 'Berlin-Ephesos type', Roman copy after	102
3.0	Greek statue of c . 390–370 BC. Photo: Berlin, Pergamon Museum.	103
3.7	Athlete crowning himself. 'The Westmacott boy'. Roman	103
3.1	copy after Greek statue c. 450–20 BC, probably by Polykleitos.	
	London, British Museum. Photo: Copyright The British Museum.	118
3.8	Attic funerary stele of Chairedemos and Lykeas, from Salamis,	110
3	c. 410 BC. Photo: DAI, Athens. Neg. 204.	119
3.9	Bronze statuette, possibly after a classical statue of a general	
5.7	of the late fifth/early fourth century BC. Wadsworth Athenaeum,	
	Hartford. Gift of J. Pierpoint Morgan. Photo: Museum.	120
3.10	Left-face of base of Chabrias portrait statue, c. 370 BC. After	
5	Burnett and Edmondson, in <i>Hesperia</i> 30 (1961) 77, fig. 1.	123
3.11	Roman portrait bust of Philip of Macedon, after Greek statue	
	of the late fourth century BC. Ny Carlsberg Glyptothek,	
	Copenhagen. Photo: Museum.	130
3.12	Portrait bust of Plato, Roman copy after Greek statue dated	
	c. 360 BC. Vatican, Sale delle Muse. Photo: Anderson/Alinari	
	23856.	132
4. I	Base for statue of the athlete Pythokles, with the signature of	
	Polykleitos. Late fifth century BC. Black limestone. After IVO,	
	p. 282, nos. 162–3.	154
4.2	Drawing after statue base signed by Praxiteles, c. 350 BC. After	
	Hesperia 6 (1937) 340, fig. 6.	155
4.3	Doryphoros. Roman copy after Greek statue by Polykleitos,	
	c. 440 BC. Naples. Photo: DAI, Rome. Neg. 69.635.	163
4.4	Stag-hunt mosaic, Pella. Late fourth century BC. Photo:	
	© Archaeological Receipts Fund.	171
4.5	Roman marble relief after bronze statue of Kairos by Lysippos,	
	original second half of fourth century BC. Source: DAI,	
	Rome. Neg. 1930.236.	181
4.6	Attic red-figure cup by the Codros painter; deeds of Theseus;	
	c. 450–440 BC. British Museum, GR 1850–3.2–3, vase E84.	
	Photo: Copyright The British Museum.	185



LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

4.7a	Friezes from the Hephaisteion: (a) East frieze – Theseus	
and b	against the Pallantids; (b) West frieze – Theseus against the	
	centaurs; c. 430 BC. Photo: Agora Excavations LXII.4 (Slab 4),	
	xxxviii.24 (Slab 3). American School of Classical Studies, Athens.	186
4.8	Apollo Sauroktonos, Roman copy after statue by Praxiteles;	
	date of original c. 350 BC. Paris, Louvre. Photo: Alinari 22548.	189
5.I	Statue bases from the Villa Matthaei, Rome; after <i>IGB</i> 481–5.	207
5.2	Bases for portrait statues by Lysikles, Phradmon and Phyromachos;	
	from Ostia, c. first century BC. Photo: Archivio Fotographico della	
	Soprintendenza per i beni archeologici di Ostia.	208
5.3	Base for statue of Pythokles by Polykleitos, from Rome, c. first	
	century AD. Photo: after <i>Bulletino Communale</i> (1891), tav. x.1.	209
5.4	Statue bases from the sanctuary of Athena Nikephoros,	
	Pergamon, late third/early second century BC – for statues by	
	Onatas, Theron and Silanion, captured as booty from Aigina and	
	Oreos. Drawing: after <i>Inschriften von Pergamon</i> (1890), nos. 48–50.	223
5.5a	Statue bases from the sanctuary of Athena Nikephoros,	_
and b	Pergamon, early second century BC, for statues by Myron,	
	Praxiteles and another (<i>IVP</i> 135–7), and by Xenokrates (<i>IVP</i> 138).	
	Drawings: after <i>Inschriften von Pergamon</i> (1890), nos. 135–8.	225
5.6	Reconstruction of the Propylon to the sanctuary of Athena	
	Nikephoros, Pergamon, c. 170 BC. Pergamon Museum, Berlin.	
	Photo: Museum.	227
5.7	Plan of the sanctuary of Athena Nikephoros, Pergamon. After	
	Altertümer von Pergamon, vol. II: Das Heiligtum der Athena	
	Polias Nikephoros, taf. xl.	229
5.8	Athena Parthenos, from the sanctuary of Athena Nikephoros,	
	Pergamon. Hellenistic copy after Pheidias' Athena Parthenos.	
	Date of copy, c. 190 BC. Berlin. Photo: Bildarchiv Preussischer	
	Kulturbesitz, 2004.	230
5.9	'Cubiculum' of the Villa Farnesina, pinakothekē. Late first	
	century BC. Photo: Anderson/Alinari 2937.	268
5.10	Detail of figure 5.9. White-ground painting. Photo: DAI,	
	Rome. Neg. 77.1380	269
6. I	San Ildefonso Group, late first century BC. Photo: Hirmer	
	644.1053.	290
6.2	'Orestes and Electra', group made up from Stephanos Athlete and	
	Aphrodite of Fréjus, c. 50–25 BC. Photo: Anderson/Alinari 23083.	291
6.3	Sarcophagus, Phaidra and Hippolytos. Louvre, Paris. Photo:	
	DAI, Rome. Neg. 72.1327.	293

xii



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I have incurred a great many debts in the course of doing the research for this book and preparing it for publication. Anthony Snodgrass and Geoffrey Hawthorn were generous with their time, unerringly perceptive in their criticisms and always enthusiastic and encouraging as supervisors of my PhD thesis. Gordon Fyfe and Robin Osborne not only contributed greatly to the improvement of the book by their stimulating thoughts and suggestions on the occasion of the examination of the thesis, but since then have also gone far beyond their duty as examiners in providing advice and practical help in seeing the project through to publication.

Mary Beard, Harold Bershady, Richard Brilliant, Paul Cartledge, Robin Cormack, Barbara Graziosi, Keith Hopkins, Christopher Kelly, David Konstan, Michael Koortbojian, Victor Lidz, Paul Millett, Ariadne Staples and Rosalind Thomas have all at one time or another commented on substantial parts of my text, which is much the better for their insights and criticisms. Jas Elsner and Peter Stewart have read the entire text more than once. In addition to improving the substance and clarity of my arguments, they have been unfailingly supportive as friends and colleagues in Cambridge and London.

My students at the Institute of Archaeology, particularly those who have taken the course 'Magic, Religion and Reason in Greek Art and Architecture', have been a constant source of stimulation; so also have my colleagues in the Institute of Archaeology, and the wider classical art history community in London. Cyprian Broodbank has not only contributed much to the development of my thought in innumerable discussions over the twelve years we have both been at the Institute of Archaeology but also made the intellectual journey represented by that period a lot more fun. I am grateful to Peter Ucko for generous grants of research leave, which allowed the completion of this book, and to Stephen Shennan, not least for Peter Ucko's patience at the time of the last research-assessment exercise.

A number of institutions have provided financial support without which my research would not have been possible, and it is a pleasure to be able, finally, to



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

acknowledge my gratitude to them here. The Thouron Foundation and the Department of Sociology at the University of Pennsylvania generously supported three years of study as a graduate student in Philadelphia. My postgraduate work at Cambridge was funded by the British Academy, the Cambridge Faculty of Classics, and a Research fellowship at Queens' College. The British Academy, the Cambridge Faculty of Classics, the Dean's Travel Fund of University College London, and the Institute of Archaeology made possible visits to Germany, Greece and Italy.

This book is based on my PhD dissertation of the same title, submitted at the University of Cambridge in 1996. Elements of the text have already appeared in rather different versions, as acknowledged in the notes and reference list.



ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviations in references to primary sources and standard works of reference for classical studies follow *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 3rd edition, 1996, ed. Simon Hornblower and Antony Spawforth, Clarendon Press, Oxford. The following abbreviations are also used:

- IGB E. Loewy, Inschriften griechischer Bildhauer. Leipzig, B. G. Teubner, 1985.
- IVP M. Fränkel (ed.), *Die Inschriften von Pergamum*. Altertümer von Pergamon viii. 2 vols. Berlin, W. Spemann, 1890.
- SQ J. Overbeck, Die antiken Schriftquellen zur Geschichte der bildenden Künste bie den Griechen. Leipzig, Wilhelm Engemann, 1868.