VALUE AND VIRTUE IN A GODLESS UNIVERSE

Suppose there is no God. Would the implication be that human life is meaningless, that the notions of right and wrong, virtue and vice, good and evil have no place, and that there are no moral obligations – hence people can do whatever they want? Erik J. Wielenberg believes this view to be utterly mistaken and in this book he explains why. He argues that even if God does not exist, human life can have meaning, we do have moral obligations, and virtue is possible. Naturally, the author sees virtue in a Godless universe as significantly different from virtue in a Christian universe, and he develops naturalistic accounts of humility, charity, and hope. The moral landscape in a Godless universe is different from the moral landscape in a Christian universe, but it does indeed exist. *Value and Virtue in a Godless Universe* is a tour of some of the central landmarks of this underexplored territory.

Erik J. Wielenberg is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at DePauw University. He has written articles in such journals as *Religious Studies, Faith and Philosophy, Pacific Philosophical Quarterly, Synthese,* and *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy.*

VALUE AND VIRTUE IN A GODLESS UNIVERSE

ERIK J. WIELENBERG

DePauw University



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
0521845653 - Value and Virtue in a Godless Universe
Erik J. Wielenberg
Frontmatter
Moreinformation

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011–4211, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521845656

© Cambridge University Press 2005

The Scripture quotations contained herein are from the New Revised Standard Version Bible, copyright © 1989 by the Division of Christian Education of the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the United States of America. Used by permission. All rights reserved.

The epigraph for chapter three is from Plato's *Republic,* translated by G. M. A. Grube, copyright © 1992, Hackett Publishing Company. Used by permission.

Some of the material in chapter four is from "Pleasure, Pain, and Moral Character and Development," *Pacific Philosophical Quarterly* 83:3 (September 2002), 282–99. This material is copyright © 2002 Blackwell Publishers. Used by permission.

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

```
Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Wielenberg, Erik J. (Erik Joseph), 1972–

Value and virtue in a godless universe / Erik J. Wielenberg.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-84565-3 – ISBN 0-521-60784-1 (pbk.)

1. Religion and ethics. 2. Atheism. 3. Values. I. Title.

BJ47.W54 2005

170 – dc22 2004018633

ISBN-13 978-0-521-84565-6 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-84565-3 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-60784-1 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-60784-1 paperback
```

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this book and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For Margaret, a group number one person

> "Many a man has borne himself proudly on the scaffold; surely the same pride should teach us to think truly about man's place in the world."

> > - Bertrand Russell, What I Believe (1925)

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments		<i>page</i> ix
	Introduction	1
1.	God and the Meaning of Life	14
	1.1 The Meanings of Life	14
	1.2 Four Arguments that Life Lacks Internal Meaning	
	Without God	15
	1.3 Richard Taylor's Way Out: Creating Your Own	
	Meaning	18
	1.4 Peter Singer's Way Out: Meaning Through	
	Eliminating Pain	23
	1.5 Aristotle's Way Out: Intrinsically Good Activity	31
2.	God and Morality	38
	2.1 God as the Omnipotent Creator of Ethics	38
	2.2 Criticism of the Strong Position	41
	2.3 Criticism of the Weak Position	48
	2.4 An Alternative Account	51
	2.5 God as Divine Commander	53
3.	The Divine Guarantee of Perfect Justice	68
	3.1 Why Be Moral?	68
	3.2 First Answer: Because Morality and Self-Interest	
	Coincide	70
	3.3 Second Answer: Because You Ought To	77

Contents

	3.4 The Divine Guarantee of Perfect Justice and Kant's	
	Moral Argument	80
	3.5 Divine Justice, Self-Sacrifice, and Moral Absurdity	89
	3.6 Absolute Evil and Moral Faith	94
	3.7 Where We Are Now	97
4.	Ethical Character in a Godless Universe	98
	4.1 A New Assumption	98
	4.2 The Fall of Man: Pride and Disobedience	98
	4.3 Humility, Christian and Naturalistic	102
	4.4 From Humility to Charity	112
	4.5 Hope and Heroism	116
	4.6 Moral Education and Science	127
5.	Creeds to Live By	143
	5.1 To Believe or Not to Believe?	143
	5.2 A Creed We Can Live By?	152
No	Notes	
Rej	References	
Inc	Index	

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

No accomplishment, no matter how modest, is entirely the result of a single person's efforts. This modest book is no exception. In writing this book, I have benefited from many happy turns of chance and from the presence and assistance of a variety of persons and institutions. I attempt to acknowledge them here and ask the forgiveness of any I may have omitted.

Several people read parts of the various earlier versions of the manuscript, and many of these people gave helpful comments and advice. I would like to thank Noah Lemos, Keith Nightenhelser, William Placher, Aaron Wielenberg, Margaret Dewey Wielenberg, and the Cambridge University Press editors and readers for their assistance. I would also like to thank Scott Senn for his assistance in the translation of various works written in ancient Greek, including the epigraph for Chapter 2.

I am grateful to my colleagues in the philosophy department and the students who have taken my courses at DePauw University. The former provided a congenial and supportive atmosphere and the opportunity to develop new courses, which in turn allowed me to develop many of the ideas found in this book. The latter provided feedback concerning those ideas and, in some cases, the motivation to explore certain strands of thought further. I am particularly grateful to the first-year students who took my seminar on the philosophical works of C. S. Lewis in the fall of 2002 and the students in my upperlevel courses on moral character and the philosophy of religion.

John Pardee, my high school English teacher, once told the immature and erratic student I was in high school that "you can only

Acknowledgments

get by on potential for so long." Though a few years passed before these words began to take effect, John Pardee was the first of several persons who crucially influenced my academic career. John Dreher, Ned Markosian, and Tim Spurgin introduced me to philosophy at Lawrence University, and Tom Ryckman saw that the immature and still fairly erratic student I was in college might have the potential to study philosophy at the graduate level. I did my graduate work at the University of Massachusetts-Amherst, where I was lucky to fall under the influence of several excellent teachers, none more so than my dissertation director, Fred Feldman, under whose guidance and penetrating criticism I finally managed to produce work in philosophy that I would not be embarrassed by today. While finishing my dissertation, I spent a year as a graduate student Fellow at the Center for Philosophy of Religion at the University of Notre Dame, where I benefited tremendously from my interaction with the other members of the Center, particularly Alvin Plantinga and Tom Flint.

Tradition dictates that the most important acknowledgments come last, and I will follow tradition in this case. This book surely would not exist were it not for the contributions of two people in particular. The first is my mother, Peggy Wielenberg, whom I thank for her unwavering support, her belief in the value of education, and what surely must have been her superhuman restraint in allowing me to find my own path. The second is my wife, Margaret, whom I thank for her continuous love, the emotional framework that made the writing of this book possible, and her faith that I really was writing a book as she went off to work each day during the summer of 2003.

I am confident that the majority of the people I have listed here would disagree with much of what I have to say in the book. Some of them, moreover, would find parts of the book to be at odds with deeply held beliefs. I hope that they will take the book in the spirit of inquiry in which it was intended. Of course the responsibility for the errors that the book undoubtedly contains is mine alone.

> Plainfield, Indiana March 2004