### Knowledge and Inquiry

Isaac Levi, John Dewey Professor of Philosophy emeritus at Columbia University, has explored the principles of American pragmatism in greater depth and more consistency than others before him. The result is a sophisticated and powerful philosophical system whose key elements stand in stark opposition not only to current mainstream epistemology, but also to the positions of other contemporary authors writing in the same pragmatist tradition. The essays in this timely volume, written by some of philosophy's finest scholars, contribute substantially to the understanding and appraisal of Levi's work. Included in this volume are Levi's extensive and provocative replies to his critics, which offer unique access to his current thinking on a wide range of topics. The introduction provides a concise, systematic presentation of the cornerstone of Levi's pragmatism. Suitable for students and scholars who are interested in American pragmatism in general and Isaac Levi's work in particular, this book is an ideal companion to Levi's own writings.

Erik J. Olsson is senior lecturer in the department of philosophy at Lund University, Sweden. He has published extensively on epistemology, philosophy of science, and logic, and he is the author of *Against Coherence*.

### Cambridge Studies in Probability, Induction, and Decision Theory

General editor: Brian Skyrms

Advisory editors: Ernest W. Adams, Ken Binmore, Jeremy Butterfield, Persi Diaconis, William L. Harper, John Harsanyi, James M. Joyce, Wlodek Rabinowicz, Wolfgang Spohn, Patrick Suppes, Sandy Zabell

Ellery Eells, *Probabilistic Causality* Richard Jeffrey, Probability and the Art of Judgment Robert C. Koons, Paradoxes of Belief and Strategic Rationality Cristina Bicchieri and Maria Luisa Dalla Chiara (eds.), Knowledge, Belief, and Strategic Interactions Patrick Maher, Betting on Theories Cristina Bicchieri, Rationality and Coordination J. Howard Sobel, Taking Chances Jan von Plato, Creating Modern Probability: Its Mathematics, Physics, and Philosophy in Historical Perspective Ellery Eells and Brian Skyrms (eds.), Probability and Conditionals Cristina Bicchieri, Richard Jeffrey, and Brian Skyrms (eds.), The Dynamics of Norms Patrick Suppes and Mario Zanotti, Foundations of Probability with Applications Paul Weirich, Equilibrium and Rationality Daniel Hausman, Causal Asymmetries William A. Dembski, The Design Inference James M. Joyce, The Foundations of Causal Decision Theory Yair Guttmann, The Concept of Probability in Statistical Physics Joseph B. Kadane, Mark B. Schervish, and Teddy Seidenfeld (eds.), Rethinking the Foundations of Statistics Phil Dowe, Physical Causation

# Knowledge and Inquiry

Essays on the Pragmatism of Isaac Levi

Edited by

ERIK J. OLSSON Lund University



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521845564 - Knowledge and Inquiry: Essays on the Pragmatism of Isaac Levi Edited by Erik J. Olsson Frontmatter More information

> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

> > Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521845564

© Cambridge University Press 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Knowledge and inquiry : essays on the pragmatism of Isaac Levi / edited by Erik J. Olsson. p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in probability, induction, and decision theory) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN-0-521-84556-4 1. Pragmatism – History – 20th century. 2. Levi, Isaac, 1930– I. Olsson, Erik J. II. Series. B944.P72K56 2006 191–dc22 2005010532

> ISBN-13 978-0-521-84556-4 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-84556-4 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

I dedicate this book to my mother, Mary Olsson.

## Contents

List of Contributors		<i>page</i> xi
Pre	face	xiii
	Introduction: The Pragmatism of Isaac Levi Erik J. Olsson	1
1.	Isaac Levi and His Pragmatist Lineage Cheryl Misak	18
2.	Is Pragmatist Truth Irrelevant to Inquiry? André Fuhrmann	32
3.	The Knowledge Business Philip Kitcher	50
4.	Infallibility and Incorrigibility Bengt Hansson	65
5.	Why Inconsistency Is Not Hell: Making Room for Inconsistency in Science <i>Otávio Bueno</i>	70
6.	Levi on Risk Nils-Eric Sahlin	87
7.	Vexed Convexity Henry E. Kyburg, Jr.	97
8.	Levi's Chances D. H. Mellor	111
9.	Isaac Levi's Potentially Surprising Epistemological Picture <i>Wolfgang Spohn</i>	125
10.	Isaac Levi on Abduction Maurice Pagnucco	143

11. Potential Answers – To What Question? Erik J. Olsson	157
12. Levi and the Lottery Erik J. Olsson	167
<ol> <li>The Value of Truth and the Value of Information: On Isaac Levi's Epistemology Hans Rott</li> </ol>	179
14. Decision-Theoretic Contraction and Sequential Change Horacio Arló Costa	201
15. Deciding What You Know Mark Kaplan	225
16. Levi's Ideals Sven Ove Hansson	241
17. The Mind We do Not Change Wolfram Hinzen	248
18. Psychoanalysis as Technology Akeel Bilgrami	266
19. Levi on Money Pumps and Diachronic Dutch Books <i>Wlodek Rabinowicz</i>	289
20. Levi on the Reality of Dispositions Johannes Persson	313
21. Replies Isaac Levi	327
Index	381

## Contributors

Horacio Arló Costa Department of Philosophy Carnegie Mellon University Pittsburgh

Akeel Bilgrami Department of Philosophy Columbia University New York

**Otávio Bueno** Department of Philosophy University of South Carolina Columbia

André Fuhrmann Department of Philosophy University of São Paulo

**Bengt Hansson** Department of Philosophy Lund University

Sven Ove Hansson Philosophy Unit Royal Institute of Technology Stockholm

**Wolfram Hinzen** Department of Philosophy University of Amsterdam Mark Kaplan Department of Philosophy Indiana University Bloomington

Philip Kitcher Department of Philosophy Columbia University New York

Henry E. Kyburg, Jr. University of Rochester and The Institute of Human and Machine Cognition University of West Florida Pensacola

Isaac Levi Department of Philosophy Columbia University New York

**D. H. Mellor** Faculty of Philosophy Cambridge University

**Cheryl Misak** Department of Philosophy University of Toronto

Erik J. Olsson Department of Philosophy Lund University

### CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521845564 - Knowledge and Inquiry: Essays on the Pragmatism of Isaac Levi Edited by Erik J. Olsson Frontmatter More information

#### **Maurice Pagnucco**

School of Computer Science and Engineering The University of New South Wales Sydney

Johannes Persson Department of Philosophy Lund University

#### Włodek Rabinowicz

Department of Philosophy Lund University

### Hans Rott Institute for Philosophy Regensburg University

Nils-Eric Sahlin Department of Philosophy Lund University

**Wolfgang Spohn** Department of Philosophy Constance University

## Preface

Isaac Levi has retired from his academic position as prestigious John Dewey Professor of Philosophy at Columbia University, and yet there is no sign that he has retired from philosophy. On the contrary, he just published a new book entitled *Mild Contraction* with Oxford University Press, and he continues to write papers and participate in conferences and workshops. This collection is dedicated to Isaac on the occasion of his retirement, in celebration of his exceptional contribution to philosophy in general and to the great tradition of American pragmatism in particular. It is far more than a Festschrift in the usual sense; all the papers included are substantial contributions to the understanding and appraisal of Isaac's pragmatist philosophy by leading experts on his work. They were all written specifically for this volume and appear here for the first time. I am greatly indebted to all authors for their dedication and commitment to this project, and especially to Isaac for his extensive replies to all the papers.

My own intellectual debt to Isaac is great. My first internationally published paper, written jointly with Sven Ove Hansson, who was my thesis adviser back then, addressed Isaac's theory of belief contraction. In this connection, reading his book *The Fixation of Belief and Its Undoing* was especially rewarding, although some of his more intricate arguments were beyond my grasp at the time. Only gradually, on reading and rereading his books and articles, have I come to appreciate fully the extraordinary coherence and stringency of his thinking. I first encountered Isaac in Uppsala, Sweden, where he gave a lecture in the mid-1990s. Since then we have met and discussed philosophy on numerous occasions in the United States and in Europe, often attending the same conferences. He has always been extremely generous with his time and philosophical insight. As for personal qualities, I admire him above all for his intellectual honesty and integrity.

While the chapters in this book were being written, *Mild Contraction* had not yet appeared in print. I would like to thank Peter Momtchiloff and Rupert Cousens at Oxford University Press for making a preliminary electronic

> version available to the authors. The chapters in this volume are very much up to date, as they take Isaac's most recent work into account. It can be read as a companion volume to *Mild Contraction* or indeed to any other of Isaac's books. While some of the chapters contribute to technical aspects of Isaac's work, the overwhelming majority address more general philosophical issues, such as the nature of pragmatism and the role of truth in inquiry. Isaac's replies give unique access to his current thinking on a wide range of topics.

> I speak for all the authors when I wish Isaac many more productive years in philosophy. For a start, the criticisms and constructive proposals in this book should keep him busy for a while. Having said this, I hasten to add that I consider the eventuality that Isaac should run out of interesting new ideas when left to his own devices not seriously possible.

> > E.J.O.