

PITY AND POWER IN ANCIENT ATHENS

One way Ancient Athenians resembled modern Americans was their moral discomfort with empire. Athenians had power and used it ruthlessly, but the infliction of suffering did not mesh well with their civic self-image. Embracing the concepts of democracy and freedom, they proudly pitted themselves against tyranny and oppression, but in practice they often acted tyrannically. *Pity and Power in Ancient Athens* argues that the exercise of power in democratic Athens, especially during its brief fifth-century empire, raised troubling questions about the alleviation and infliction of suffering, and pity emerged as a topic in Athenian culture at this time. The ten chapters collectively examine the role of pity in the literature, art, and society of Classical Athens by analyzing evidence from tragedy, philosophy, historiography, epic, oratory, vase painting, sculpture, and medical writings.

Rachel Hall Sternberg is assistant professor of Classics at Case Western Reserve University.



PITY AND POWER IN ANCIENT ATHENS

EDITED BY RACHEL HALL STERNBERG

Case Western Reserve University







> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

> > Cambridge University Press 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521845526

© Cambridge University Press 2005

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005

Printed in Hong Kong by Golden Cup

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Pity and power in ancient Athens / edited by Rachel Hall Sternberg.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-84552-1 (hardback)

1. Sympathy – Greece – Athens – History – To 1500. 2. Athens (Greece) – Civilization.

I. Sternberg, Rachel Hall. II. Title.

DF289.P56 2005

177'.7 - dc22 2005006324

ISBN-13 978-0-521-84552-6 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-84552-1 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this book and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION 1

THE NATURE OF PITY © 15
RACHEL HALL STERNBERG

PITY AND POLITICS © 48

DAVID KONSTAN

THE PITIERS AND THE PITIED

IN HERODOTUS AND THUCYDIDES © 67

DONALD LATEINER

A GENEROUS CITY:

PITY IN ATHENIAN ORATORY AND TRAGEDY

ANGELIKI TZANETOU

ORATORY STATEMENT ST

ATHENIAN TRACEDY: AN EDUCATION IN PITY

JAMES F. JOHNSON AND DOUGLAS C. CLAPP

ENGENDERING THE TRACIC *THEATÊS*:

PITY, POWER, AND SPECTACLE IN SOPHOCLES' *TRACHINIAE* 165

THOMAS M. FALKNER

PITY IN CLASSICAL ATHENIAN VASE PAINTING © 193

THE CIVIC ART OF PITY © 223



vi CONTENTS

A CRYING SHAME: PITYING THE SICK
IN THE HIPPOCRATIC CORPUS AND GREEK TRAGEDY © 253
JENNIFER CLARKE KOSAK

PITY IN PLUTARCH © 277
CHRISTOPHER PELLING

Works Cited 313

Index of Ancient Passages 337

Subject Index 345



ILLUSTRATIONS

1.	Danae Perseus, and Akrisios, Attic red-figure lekythos attributed to the Providence Painter, c. 470 BCE.	195
2.	Warrior and father at tomb, Attic white-ground lekythos attributed to the Achilles Painter, c. 450–445 BCE.	199
3.	Woman mourning at tomb and youth, Attic white-ground lekythos attributed to the Sabouroff Painter, c. 450–440 BCE.	201
4.	Woman and youth at tomb, Attic white-ground lekythos attributed to the Achilles Painter, c. 440–435 BCE.	202
5.	Charon with boy and mother, Attic white-ground lekythos attributed to the Painter of Munich 2335, c. 430 BCE.	203
6.	Prothesis, Attic red-figure loutrophoros, c. 430–420 BCE.	204
7.	Achilles and Penthesilea, Attic red-figure cup attributed to the Penthesilea Painter, c. 460 BCE.	205
8.	Suicide of Ajax, Attic red-figure lekythos attributed to the Alkimachos Painter, c. 460 BCE.	208
9.	Blinding of Thamyras, Attic red-figure hydria attributed to the Group of Polygnotos, c. 440–430 BCE.	209
10.	Odysseus and Circe, Attic red-figure calyx krater attributed to the Phiale Painter, c. 445–440 BCE.	210
11.	Odysseus and the Suitors, Attic red-figure skyphos attributed to the Penelope Painter, c. 430 BCE.	211
12.	Achilles and Memnon, Attic red-figure cup attributed to the Penthesilea Painter, c. 460–450 BCE.	212
13.	Ransom of Hector, Attic red-figure hydria attributed to the Pioneer Group, c. 510 BCE.	213
14.	Orestes and the Furies at Delphi, Attic red-figure column krater attributed to the Naples Painter, c. 440–430 BCE.	215
15.	Old man, women, and girl mourning, black-figure bail-handle oinochoe attributed to the Sappho Painter, c. 500–490 BCE.	216
16.	Man and woman mourning at a tomb (Orestes and Elektra?), Attic red-figure oinochoe, c. 430 BCE.	217
17.	Prokne and Itys with Philomela, Attic red-figure kylix attributed to Makron, c. 500 BCE.	227

vii



viii illustrations

18.	Prokne and Itys, Attic red-figure kylix attributed to Onesimos,	
	c. 500 BCE.	229
19a	-c. Sculpture group of Prokne and Itys, attributed to Alkamenes,	
	c. 430–420 BCE.	230
20.	Artemis and Apollo slaying the Niobids, Attic red-figure krater by	
	the Niobid Painter, c. 475–450 BCE.	239
21.	Sculpture of collapsing Niobid, c. 430 BCE.	241
22.	Birth of Dionysus from the thigh of Zeus, Attic red-figure	
	lekythos attributed to the Alkimachos Painter, c. 460 BCE.	243
23.	Hermes bringing the infant Dionysus to Ino, Attic red-figure	
	hydria attributed to Hermonax, c. 460 BCE.	244
24.	Hermes handing the infant Dionysus to Silenus, Attic red-figure	
	calyx krater attributed to the Phiale Painter, c. 460 BCE.	244
25.	Hermes handing the infant Dionysus to Silenus, Attic red-figure	
	phiale, Barclay Painter, c. 450 BCE.	245
26.	Votive relief with Hermes and the infant Dionysus, c. 330 BCE.	247
27.	Hermes handing the infant Dionysus to Ariadne (?), Attic	
	red-figure pelike attributed to the Chicago Painter C 440 BCE	2.48





LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

AILEEN AJOOTIAN is an associate professor of Classics and Art at the University of Mississippi and has published extensively on topics in sculpture, mythical iconography, and Mediterranean archaeology.

DOUGLAS C. CLAPP is an assistant professor of Classics at Samford University in Birmingham, Alabama, and investigates pity in the plays of Sophocles.

THOMAS M. FALKNER, who taught Classics at The College of Wooster for twenty-seven years, is now provost and dean of the faculty at McDaniel College. He is the author of *The Poetics of Old Age in Greek Epic, Lyric, and Tragedy* (1995).

JAMES F. JOHNSON is a professor of Classics at Austin College in Sherman, Texas. He is working on a comprehensive study of compassion in Greek tragedy.

DAVID KONSTAN is the John Rowe Workman Distinguished Professor of Classics and the Humanistic Tradition at Brown University. His many books include *Pity Transformed* (2001).

JENNIFER CLARKE KOSAK is an assistant professor of Classics at Bowdoin College. She is the author of *Heroic Measures: Hippocratic Medicine in the Making of Euripidean Tragedy* (2004).

DONALD LATEINER is the John R. Wright Professor of Greek and Humanities at Ohio Wesleyan University. His publications include *The Historical Method of Herodotus* (1989).



x LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

JOHN H. OAKLEY is the Forrest D. Murden, Jr., Professor of Classical Studies at the College of William & Mary. His latest book, *Picturing Death in Classical Athens: The Evidence of the White Lekythoi*, was published by Cambridge University Press.

CHRISTOPHER PELLING is Regius Professor of Greek at Oxford University. His numerous publications include *Plutarch and History* (2002).

RACHEL HALL STERNBERG is an assistant professor of Classics at Case Western Reserve University. She is completing a book entitled *Tragedy Offstage: Responses to Suffering in Everyday Ancient Athens.*

ANGELIKI TZANETOU is an assistant professor of Classics at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. She is working on a book about exile, democracy, and empire in Athenian tragedy.



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

HAVING BEEN FOREWARNED BY A WISE ADVISOR, IN THE BEST Herodotean fashion, that an edited volume was a fool's errand and would prove a tremendous headache, I was all the more pleased to discover the deep and genuine rewards of collaborating with the colleagues whose work is represented here.

The central concerns of this volume crystallized at Bryn Mawr College during my graduate studies and began to take shape as I wrote my dissertation under the direction of T. Corey Brennan and Richard Hamilton. Thanks are owed them both. In particular, I can never thank Corey enough for the unflagging support, logistical genius, and sheer conviviality that set the present work in motion. Next, I wish to acknowledge gratefully the Gladys Krieble Delmas Foundation in New York, as well as The College of Wooster and Rutgers University, for the generous funding that allowed us to hold in March 2002 the conference Pity in Ancient Athenian Life & Letters, upon which this volume is based. David Konstan graciously promised to serve as keynote speaker, and then kept that promise at considerable inconvenience to himself. Angeliki Tzanetou furnished the linchpin of the argument. John Oakley was extraordinarily helpful with the illustrations. I am grateful, as well, to the other distinguished scholars who signed on to Pity and Power in Ancient Athens and whose hard work and intellectual camaraderie made the project flourish. I learned more from all of them than I could possibly have imagined. Over the past months, I have keenly appreciated the encouragement, dry wit, and perspicacity of Beatrice Rehl, our editor at Cambridge. I shall be indebted to those readers who imperturbably accept certain inconsistencies in the transliteration of Greek proper nouns. And finally, I would like to thank my family for all their patience and support.

- Rachel Hall Sternberg, Case Western Reserve University