

Cambridge University Press
0521845025 - Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson: Contesting Diversity in the
Enlightenment and Beyond
Daniel Carey
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

LOCKE, SHAFTESBURY, AND HUTCHESON

Daniel Carey examines the fundamental debate within the Enlightenment about human diversity. Three central figures – Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson – questioned whether human nature was fragmented by diverse and incommensurable customs and beliefs or unified by shared moral and religious principles. Locke's critique of innate ideas initiated the argument, claiming that no consensus existed in the world about morality or God's existence. Testimony of human difference established this point. His position was disputed by the third Earl of Shaftesbury who reinstated a Stoic account of mankind as inspired by common ethical convictions and an impulse toward the divine. Hutcheson attempted a difficult synthesis of these two opposing figures, respecting Locke's critique while articulating a moral sense that structured human nature. Daniel Carey concludes with an investigation of the relationship between these arguments and contemporary theories, and shows that current conflicting positions reflect long-standing differences that first emerged during the Enlightenment.

DANIEL CAREY is Lecturer at the National University of Ireland, Galway.

Cambridge University Press
0521845025 - Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson: Contesting Diversity in the
Enlightenment and Beyond
Daniel Carey
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

IDEAS IN CONTEX 74

Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson

Cambridge University Press
0521845025 - Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson: Contesting Diversity in the
Enlightenment and Beyond
Daniel Carey
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

IDEAS IN CONTEXT

Edited by Quentin Skinner and James Tully

The books in this series will discuss the emergence of intellectual traditions and of related new disciplines. The procedures, aims and vocabularies that were generated will be set in the context of the alternatives available within the contemporary frameworks of ideas and institutions. Through detailed studies of the evolution of such traditions, and their modification by different audiences, it is hoped that a new picture will form of the development of ideas in their concrete contexts. By this means, artificial distinctions between the history of philosophy, of the various sciences, of society and politics, and of literature may be seen to dissolve.

The series is published with the support of the Exxon Foundation.

A list of books in the series will be found at the end of the volume.

Cambridge University Press

0521845025 - Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson: Contesting Diversity in the Enlightenment and Beyond

Daniel Carey

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

LOCKE, SHAFTESBURY,
AND HUTCHESON

Contesting Diversity in the Enlightenment and Beyond

DANIEL CAREY

National University of Ireland, Galway



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
0521845025 - Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson: Contesting Diversity in the
Enlightenment and Beyond
Daniel Carey
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK
Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521845021

© Daniel Carey 2006

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2006

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-84502-1 hardback
ISBN-10 0-521-84502-5 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for
the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or
third-party internet websites referred to in this book,
and does not guarantee that any content on such
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
 0521845025 - Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson: Contesting Diversity in the
 Enlightenment and Beyond
 Daniel Carey
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	x
Introduction	I
1 Locke, diversity, and the natural history of man	14
2 The uses of diversity: Locke's sceptical critique of Stoicism	34
3 Locke's anthropology: travel, innateness, and the exercise of reason	69
4 Contesting diversity: Shaftesbury's reply to Locke	98
5 Method, moral sense, and the problem of diversity: Francis Hutcheson and the Scottish Enlightenment	150
6 Conclusion: the future of diversity	200
<i>Bibliography</i>	231
<i>Index</i>	253

Cambridge University Press
0521845025 - Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson: Contesting Diversity in the
Enlightenment and Beyond
Daniel Carey
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

I have many institutions, granting bodies, and individuals to thank for sustaining this investigation, which represents, as such projects usually do, the result of many years' work. I am indebted to the University of Glasgow for electing me to a Newlands Visitorship at an early stage of research and revision; to the National University of Ireland, Galway, for sabbatical leave and grants from the Millennium Fund; to Columbia University for granting me visiting scholar status at a crucial time; and to the Irish Research Council for the Humanities and Social Sciences for a Government of Ireland fellowship which made it possible to conclude the writing and research. During long periods spent in Oxford, where most of the research was carried out, Hertford College and Worcester College provided sources of enduring support and stimulation.

I am grateful to the Bodleian Library and Duke Humphrey's, and to their staff, especially Vera Ryhajlo, Helen Rogers, and William Hodges. I am also indebted to the resources and staff of the libraries of the University of Glasgow, Columbia University, the British Library, and the James Hardiman Library in Galway.

Earlier versions of some of the chapters and sections appeared in *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, *The Seventeenth Century*, *Locke Studies*, *British Journal for the History of Philosophy*, and the *Archiv für Geschichte der Philosophie*. I am grateful to the editors and publishers for allowing me to draw on this material.

In developing this study I was fortunate to benefit from the instruction and advice of Anthony Pagden, Richard Tuck, and Charles Taylor, successive Carlyle lecturers in Oxford. Numerous friends and scholars supplied help and valuable information, among them Michael Ayers, Jane Conroy, Hannah Dawson, Nicholas Dew, John Dillon, Roger Fechner, Christoph Fehige, John Finamore, Doris Garraway, Mark Goldie, Loïc Guyon, James Harris, Peter Hulme, Michael Hunter, the late Oliver Impey, Doreen Innes, Margaret Jacob, Michael Khodarkovsky, Lawrence

Cambridge University Press

0521845025 - Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson: Contesting Diversity in the Enlightenment and Beyond

Daniel Carey

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

ix

Klein, Helen Knight, Anthony Long, the late David Lovejoy, Gordon Marce, James McLellan, Michel Mervaud, Philip Milton, Philip Mitsis, Ken Parker, Jean-Paul Pittion, the late Richard Popkin, Graham Rees, Isabel Rivers, John Rogers, Helen Rountree, Joan-Pau Rubiés, Henry Schankula, Dominic Scott, Kerry Sinanan, Nigel Smith, Mark Stansbury, M. A. Stewart, Margarita Stocker, Ronald Grigor Suny, Amy Talbot, Sven Trakulhun, Friedrich A. Uehlein, Claudia von Collani, Cyril White, David Womersley, and Richard Yeo.

My colleagues in Galway have been a tremendous source of encouragement and camaraderie. My family has provided every kind of support – thank you to my parents, Jim and Bette, and to my brothers Bill, Tim, and Matt, and also to Dora.

I owe a special debt to friends and colleagues who generously read drafts of chapters and saved me from many errors while sharpening my thinking – Peter Anstey, Clíodhna Carney, Adrian Frazier, Roland Hall, Victor Nuovo, Laurent Jaffro, Susan Jones, John Milton, James Moore, Anne Mulhall, Richard Sher, Shirley Stacey, John Stephens, and James Tully.

For crucial support at various stages I am immensely grateful to David Armitage, Anthony Pagden, and James Tully.

At Cambridge University Press, I want to thank Jo Breeze, Mary Leighton, Joanne Hill, and my editor Richard Fisher for many efforts on my behalf and the courtesy and forbearance with which they have carried them out.

The errors that remain I must acknowledge mine.

I dedicate this work to Sue with love, affection, and gratitude.

Cambridge University Press
 0521845025 - Locke, Shaftesbury, and Hutcheson: Contesting Diversity in the
 Enlightenment and Beyond
 Daniel Carey
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Abbreviations

- Ep. mor.* Seneca, *Ad Lucilium epistulae morales*, trans. Richard M. Gummere, Loeb Classical Library, 3 vols. (London, 1917–25).
- Essay* *An Essay concerning Human Understanding*, ed. Peter H. Nidditch, corrected edn (Oxford, 1979).
- L *An Inquiry into the Original of Our Ideas of Beauty and Virtue*, ed. Wolfgang Leidhold (Indianapolis, 2004).
- LL John Harrison and Peter Laslett, *The Library of John Locke*, 2nd edn (Oxford, 1971).
- Rand *The Life, Unpublished Letters, and Philosophical Regimen of Anthony, Earl of Shaftesbury*, ed. Benjamin Rand (London, 1900).

Note: original orthography has been preserved in all quotations, including the use of accents in French.